HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN THE PHILIPPINES: VICTIM ACQUISITION AND EXIT

STRATEGIES

By

Sarah Gross

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

Master of Criminal Justice Administration

Middle Tennessee State University

December 2017

Thesis Committee:

Dr. Elizabeth Wright, Chair

Dr. Carter F. Smith

Dr. Robert Rogers

I dedicate this research to the 13 young Filipina women who shared their stories, and to the Philippine Department of Social Welfare and Development. Thank you for bestowing me this wonderful opportunity to conduct my dream study.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

ABSTRACT

Extensive research has been conducted on the prevalence of human trafficking. However, research neglects to find exit strategy solutions for survivors of human trafficking. Exploring exit strategies is important for the purpose of developing programs targeted at earlier removal from human trafficking environments. In this qualitative exploratory study, a semi-structured interview was conducted with 13 Filipina human trafficking survivors to explore how they entered and exited human trafficking. From the experiences of female human trafficking survivors from the Philippine's Department of Social Welfare and Development, the study concluded law enforcement does play a significant role in the exiting of human trafficking survivors. Moreover, revictimization was significantly reduced with law enforcement intervention. Findings of the study could lead to potential exiting solutions for victims of human trafficking.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES

PAGE

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Despite the advances in human rights in many countries, slavery still plagues the world today. The International Labor Organization (ILO) (2012) claims 20.9 million people worldwide were coerced, deceived, or forced into labor, also known as human trafficking. Out of the 20.9 million victims, 4.9 million are victims of sexual exploitation. While sex trafficking constitutes slightly less than 25 percent of forced labor, it is the most lucrative. Annually, human sex trafficking profits are roughly $99 billion worldwide (ILO, 2014). Per victim, the average annual profit is $21,800 in American dollars. It is four times more profitable than the next highest form of human trafficking-construction, manufacturing, mining, and utilities. Victims of those type of trafficking profit on average $4,800 dollars annually (ILO, 2014). It is no surprise criminals are drawn to this criminal enterprise for its profitability (Graycar & McCusker, 2007; Jordan, Patel & Rapp, 2013). Organizations are becoming more aware of this terrible epidemic. The United Nations (2000) was the first to define human trafficking. Their definition is as follows:

> Trafficking in persons' shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation (United Nations, 2000, p. 42).

Globally, the population of forced laborers is not equally distributed. Human trafficking occurs predominantly in the Asia-Pacific region, embodying 56% of the

world's forced labor population (ILO, 2012). Globalization and an insufficient amount of work opportunities in third-world countries play an integral role in human trafficking. Developing countries, such as the Philippines, have to outsource their labor to keep the economy afloat. Many migrant workers come from small towns and villages where migrant work looks appealing through mass media. In 2003, there were approximately 7 million overseas workers. Individuals, who hear family members or friends' successful migrant stories, are inspired and encouraged to work abroad (Graycar & McCusker, 2007). Offshore contract work from 1975 to 1994 alone has boosted the Philippine economy by $18 million. While male migrant workers may have been more common in the past, there is a growing number of female migrant workers. Women and children are typically the victims traffickers seek because of their vulnerability (Graycar & McCusker, 2007).

According to Hefty (2003) treatment of males and females is vastly different; migrant female workers encounter more adversity and danger than men. Filipino migrant women are viewed as inferior in other developed countries, therefore, they may be isolated or abused. Migrant Philippine women often accept low paying and tedious work abroad (Hefty, 2003). Additionally, women may become deceived in allowing false promised opportunities elsewhere and find themselves, being trafficked victims of domestic servitude, labor, and sex trafficking. Not only are they likely to be victims of human trafficking, they may also encounter other forms of abuse such as sexual harassment, rape, and physical abuse.

Graycar and McCusker (2007) suggest that criminals capitalize on their opportunity to prey on the vulnerable Philippine needs of labor by trying to fulfill victims' desire by offering false promises of employment, marriage, education, or the opportunity to leave the victim's homeland countries. The Philippines is not only a source or transit country for human trafficking but a destination country as well. The most common forms of human trafficking occurring in the country are commercial sex exploitation, domestic kidnapping, and forced labor. Victims who come from the following countries- Singapore, Hong Kong, Malaysia, Thailand, Macau, Australia, US, UK, and the Middle East- are trafficked to the Philippines. Filipino victims are often trafficked from their home country to Japan, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Malaysia, Singapore, and Australia. Traffickers are often successful in deceiving, coercing, and forcing victims into human trafficking due to the lack of enforcement of inadequate laws in countries in East and Pacific Asia. Since many high trafficking countries have weak legislation, law enforcement has a difficult time to enforce insubstantial laws; thus making it difficult to prosecute traffickers.

Furthermore, prosecuting traffickers may be more problematic due to the victims' violations of labor and immigration laws in another country, thus, resulting in traffickers encouraging their victims to fear law authorities. Not only are victims indoctrinated to be apprehensive of legal authorities for possible detainment for law violations, but they are also warned about the dangerous magnitude of repercussions the victim and their family may face if they testify against their trafficker (Graycar & McCusker, 2007). Therefore,

many victims do not identify themselves as being victims and are reluctant to seek law enforcement for multiple reasons: <u>corrupt law enforcement</u> in other countries, <u>adverse experiences</u> with law enforcement, and manipulation by their trafficker to fear the police. Not only will victims be hesitant to disclose victimization due to their fear of law enforcement, but also because of trauma and shame. Victims' unwillingness to divulge their involvement with human trafficking makes it difficult for social workers, healthcare providers, and law enforcement to effectively give them the treatment they require (Jordan, Patel & Rap, 2013).

Women and children are typically the types of victims that traffickers seek because of their vulnerability (Graycar & McCusker, 2007). The Philippine culture encourages sexual exploitation of children and females because young girls and women are sexualized and objectified in the Philippines (Graycar & McCusker, 2007). Their negative societal image and role as a domestic caregiver, servant, and sex object is portrayed through mass media outlets. Combine their image and social status with poverty, globalization, foreign military presence, labor exportation, mail bride orders, online pornography and chat-rooms, and it results in a flourishing sex tourism industry in the Philippines (Graycar & McCusker, 2007).

Human trafficking is systemic. Although efforts to police human trafficking should continue to be vigilant, research should address the reactive processes for survivors escaping human trafficking in addition to better categorization of human trafficking victims. In the past, there have been issues with nongovernmental

organizations collecting data (Graycar & McCusker, 2007). The most problematic issue with the data is the lack of definitions and differentiating human trafficking and smuggling. Many agencies intermingle their data collection on migration and human smuggling with human trafficking. Therefore, there remains an absence of accurate numbers of trafficked victims depicted in studies. The convoluted data makes it impossible to conduct longitudinal studies and find patterns and trends in human trafficking. Additionally, innovative and necessary data are not being researched and gathered. The method of collecting the data, and the type of data being collected remain the same. The stagnancy in research, weak methodologies, and lack of data sharing both regionally and internationally inhibits any progress toward eradicating human trafficking (Graycar & McCusker, 2007). One area that seems to be missing in the literature is a thorough discussion of exit strategies for trafficking victims. Discovering how and why survivors of human trafficking escaped is crucial to identifying and promoting exit strategies so potential victims are aware of agencies or persons who can remove them from their current situation in a safe manner. This study explores how human trafficking victims can escape from their environment.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

Prevalence of Human Trafficking

Global epidemic

Prevalence of trafficking around the globe

Human trafficking has always been an issue, however, the prevalence of human trafficking began to gain global awareness in the mid-1990's due to globalization, migration, and women's rights (Chuang, 2010; Chuang, 2017). Human trafficking is a product of globalization (Chuang, 2010; Chuang, 2017; Graycar & McCusker, 2007; Hefty, 2003). Due to the demand for cheap labor from lower socioeconomic countries, migrant workers are easily accessible and available. Individuals from poorer countries, source countries, seek work and opportunities in more industrial countries. Traffickers recognize the opportunity to profit from migrant workers and act as a third party to transport migrant workers to destination countries (Chuang, 2010; Graycar & McCusker, 2007; Hefty, 2003; Kiss et al., 2016; Seballos-Llena, & Castellano-Datta, 2017; Tsai, 2017; U.S. Department of State, 2016). Destination countries are countries where there is a demand and market for various types of trafficking (i.e., commercial sex and labor). Countries can also be transit countries- countries which hold victims of human trafficking until they reach their final destination country. It is possible for countries to be a combination of two or three of the types of the countries mentioned above: source, transit, and destination. In Southeast Asia, countries that are a combination of all three are the Philippines, South Korea, and Thailand (Graycar & McCusker, 2007).

Statistics on the number of victims

In a study conducted by Kiss et al. (2016), involving 1102 participants from 15 post-trafficking services, it was determined that 86% of trafficked victims were trafficked internationally. Trafficked men were exploited primarily for factory work or fishing. Women were primarily trafficked for sex work, bride orders, or factory work. Depending on the gender, children were trafficked for different purposes. Approximately 72% of girls were trafficked for sex work, while boys were trafficked primarily for labor (factory work, fishing, and construction) and begging. Although women and children are more commonly perceived as victims of human trafficking, men are also victims. Survivors of human trafficking derive from a variety of backgrounds. They differ with respect to ethnicity, sex, race, religion, socioeconomic status, and country of origin; however, there are common identifiers that survivors and victims' share (English, 2015).

Earlier international laws failed to address the trafficking epidemic. Moreover, an effective infrastructure was not in place to facilitate prosecution of trafficking crimes and cooperation among governments (Chuang, 2010; Chuang, 2014). In 1998, the Clinton Administration was the first to hold an international law conference in 50 years addressing human trafficking, which resulted in the United Nations Trafficking Protocol (U.N. Protocol). From the beginning of the first U.N. Protocol in 2000, the United States has been a forerunner of model international anti-trafficking policies and laws. The country's influence encourages and urges other countries to follow its aggressive response to human trafficking crimes (Chuang, 2010).

Definition of trafficking

In 2000, the United Nations was the first international body to define human

trafficking. Their definition is as follows:

> Trafficking in persons' shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer,
> harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other
> forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or
> of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits
> to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the
> purpose of exploitation (United Nations, 2000, p. 42).

Although the U.N. protocol defined trafficking, significant differences concerning

trafficking still exist among activists, interest groups, and media outlets. Different legal

definitions still abound in countries around the world. Many groups mistakenly believe

all forms of prostitution are forced or coerced and not by choice; however, it is important

not to equate sex workers with victims of human trafficking (Chuang, 2010; Jackson,

2016; Lerum & Brents, 2016). Nonetheless, there is a marked divide in the perception of

choice in prostitution. The two polarized groups who have vastly opposing ideologies on

prostitution are neo-abolitionists and non-abolitionists (Chuang, 2010; Lerum & Brents,

2016).

Neo-abolitionists are against prostitution, and believe it degrades and exploits

women. Feminists, evangelical Christians, and conservatives are groups who are

considered to be neo-abolitionists. These groups tend to be in favor of categorizing

prostitution as trafficking, because women are perceived as ignorant and unaware of their

oppression by dominant males. Thus, women in third-world countries are seen as putative

victims of poverty and cultural oppression, and are constrained by their limited choices of

employment opportunities; therefore, they are left with no other option than to participate in the commercial sex trade. Neo-abolitionists perpetuate the focus on the image of women and children being trafficked, and neglect to highlight male trafficking victims, thus creating a gender-biased image of human trafficking. On the other hand, non-abolitionists, reject criminalizing prostitution because in their belief, banning prostitution would increase the victims' susceptibility and vulnerability of being exploited. However, there is a disagreement among the groups regarding whether legalization or decriminalization is a better solution. Those who oppose legalization argue that it will stigmatize women as workers in red-light districts and carriers of sexually transmitted diseases, and suggest that legalization will increase the risk of the state overregulating legalized prostitution. For those in favor, legalizing prostitution will allow government regulation and an employment option for women (Chuang, 2016).

The definition of trafficking varies among activists, interest groups, media outlets, and the like, and many studies have data which are hard to compare and contrast with one another because of the shifting definitions of trafficking (Graycar & McCusker, 2007; Lerum & Brents, 2016). Many U.S. policies reflect an anti-sex work bias, and American human trafficking statistics are driven more by ideology than reliable empirical evidence (Lerum & Brents, 2016). Fedina (2015) reported that 78 percent of forty-two recently published sex trafficking books incorrectly cited the prevalence of human trafficking using a flawed source without disclaiming its limitations. Currently, the International Labour Organization is recognized as the most reputable source for forced labor statistics.

Moreover, evidence-based policies on human trafficking will be the most effective in understanding the true prevalence of human trafficking (Lerum & Brents, 2016).

Trafficking vs. sex work

With the increasing focus on human trafficking, sex workers are often mistaken as victims of human trafficking and are becoming increasingly marginalized and stigmatized as criminals or victims. Jackson (2016) interviewed 17 current or former sex workers who all identified themselves as activists or advocates of sex work. Interviewees were irate when they were stigmatized as victims. The general public has equated sex work with sex trafficking; however, not all sex workers are deceived, forced, and/or coerced into sex work. This misguided view can impact the sex workers economically, socially, and legally (Jackson, 2016). Additionally, the Neo-abolitionists support of equating prostitution with sex trafficking is detrimental to sex workers because it results in numerous organizations using inaccurate phrases in their materials, and refusing services to sex workers for fear of showing any support for them (Chuang, 2010). In addition to limited health services, sex workers lose autonomy and agency when they are labeled as victims. It is also belittling to the sex workers and actual victims of human trafficking, because their experiences do not equate on any level. Furthermore, classifying victims of human trafficking and sex workers makes it more difficult to accurately estimate the actual prevalence of victims of human trafficking (Jackson, 2016).

An anti-sex work bias exists not only in academia, but in media and political outlets as well. Numerous anti-human trafficking advocates equate sex work, coerced or

willing, with sex trafficking. This ideology instills a bias and potentially influences the process of acquiring and processing data, thus inhibiting effective policy changes. Other critiques of human trafficking research suggest that some scholars play on feminist anxieties (men exploiting women, gender roles and sexual morality) and argue that assertive policing infringes upon the rights of willing workers in the sex industry. Evidence-based policies on human trafficking will help us understand the prevalence of the crime and end the epidemic (Lerum & Brents, 2016).

The Philippines

When discussing human trafficking, it is important to identify the differences among countries from which human trafficking victims are taken, routes by which they are transported, and places where they end up. A source country is a place where victims are found and taken from; a transit country is one through which victims are transported, and a destination country is where the victims are placed and then trafficked for profit. The Philippines is a source, transit, and destination country for human trafficking of children, women, and men who are exploited for commercial sex exploitation, domestic work, hospitality, agriculture, construction, and other industries (Graycar & McCusker, 2007; Tsai, Seballos-Llena, & Castellano-Datta, 2017; Tsai, 2017; U.S. Department of State, 2016). Before broaching the topic of human trafficking in the Philippines, it is important to discuss the sociopolitical situation of the country at present day. Millions of Filipinos migrate from the Philippines in hopes of finding better employment opportunities; however, their aspirations of finding better job opportunities increase their

vulnerability and susceptibility of becoming trafficking victims (Hefty, 2003; Graycar &

McCusker, 2007). In recent years, the Philippine government has fought harder to combat

human trafficking (Republic of the Philippines Department of Justice, 2016; Reuters,

2016). The Filipino Expanded Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2012 defines human

trafficking as:

> ...the recruitment, transportation, transfer or harboring, or receipt of persons with
> or without the victim's consent or knowledge, within or across national borders by
> means of threat or use of force, or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud,
> deception, abuse of power or of position, taking advantage of the vulnerability of
> the person, or, the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the
> consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of
> exploitation which includes at minimum, the exploitation or the prostitution of
> others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery,
> servitude or the removal or sale of organs. The recruitment, transportation,
> transfer, harboring, adoption or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation or
> when the adoption is induced by any form of consideration for exploitative
> purposes shall also be considered as 'trafficking in persons' even if it does not
> involve any of the means set forth in the preceding paragraph (p.1).

It has been argued that, although the Philippine government recently improved its efforts

in combating trafficking, the Filipino administration still neglects its responsibility to

protect its citizens by failing to target recruiting agencies that profit from forced labor

(Chuang, 2014). Filipinas are trafficked to many destination countries, and scouts &

recruiters fly in to recruit victims. In one particular destination country, South Korea,

South Korean scouts fly to the Philippines to recruit Filipinas for entertainer clubs. If a

woman is selected, she is trafficked to Korea and employed in a foreigners' only

entertainment club as a hostess. Trafficked Filipina workers arrive in the destination

country with E-6 visas, an entertainer visa; Filipina women dominate the E-6 visas in

Korea. Upon arrival, the club owner takes the newly employed hostess's passport, houses

her close to the club, provides meal stipends, and restricts her from leaving the site. It is

also required that hostesses reach a certain quota of juice sales to customers or they will

be penalized (Shin, 2015).

The Philippine culture encourages sexual exploitation by perpetuating the

demeaning portrayal of Filipina women and young girls. Society sexually objectifies

Filipinas in the Philippine culture, thus increasing their vulnerability to becoming victims

of human trafficking (Graycar & McCusker, 2007). In the Philippines, similar to the

United States, a child is considered to be a person under the age of 18. The Philippine

Republic Act No. 9208 (2003) defines a child as:

> (b) *Child* - refers to a person below eighteen (18) years of age or one who is over
> eighteen (18) but is unable to fully take care of or protect himself/herself from
> abuse, neglect, cruelty, exploitation, or discrimination because of a physical or
> mental disability or condition (p.1).

Yet, further down in the clause in part d, the law states that the age of sexual consent is

12 years old. "When the offended party is under twelve (12) years of age or is demented,

even though none of the circumstances mentioned above be present" [Republic Act No.

9208, 2003, p.1]). The government's tolerance of granting twelve-year-olds with the right

to give sexual consent encourages child sex exploitation.

Recently, however, the Philippines government has made progress with its efforts

at combatting human trafficking. In 2016, the US State Department recognized the

Philippines as a Tier 1 country. Previously, the Philippines was ranked as a Tier 2

country and was at risk of becoming a Tier 3 country; however, the government

intensified its efforts of combatting human trafficking after being threatened with losing 700 million dollars in non-humanitarian assistance (Republic of the Philippines Department of Justice, 2016; Reuters, 2016). Although the Philippines received its new ranking as a tier 1 country, it does not signify that the war against human trafficking in the Philippines is over. Clearly, there is much more work to be done in the Philippines. The country still carries its notorious reputation for its sex industry and its millions of migrant workers who often serve as domestic servants (Mogato & Pomfret, 2016).

Why Does It Occur?

Difficult to detect and convict

Traffickers instill fear in their victims to ensure they comply with their demands. Perpetrators of human trafficking can also silence their victims by coercing them through verbal threats (e.g., deportation, fines, and a penalty fine upon the family), physical abuse, drugs, withhold their passports or visas, and rape (Haynes, 2004; Shin, 2015). Family is the most fundamental element in Philippine culture, and Filipina women are trafficked primarily due to family poverty. Since victims work to alleviate their family's financial burdens, they are more likely to continue trafficking to avoid family penalties (Tsai, 2017). Additionally, Filipina women who are trafficked to a new country face difficulties such as geography, language, and culture, thus reinforcing their constrained lives and their dependency on the trafficker (Shin, 2015).

Many countries have legislation prohibiting human trafficking, however, sanctions placed upon traffickers are rarely enforced (Haynes, 2004). It is difficult to

prosecute traffickers because clients/customers are reluctant to cooperate with law enforcement because it would be self-incriminating (Chuang, 2010). Convictions of traffickers are not only rare, but their sentencing is not punitive enough for deterrence. Traffickers also have the ability to remain hidden because of their connections with police and government officials. Moreover, protection for victims is limited when they testify against their trafficker; thus, victims are unwilling to testify against their trafficker because of the potential repercussions they may encounter with their trafficker. In many cases, victims do not receive the protective services they need and are also prosecuted for prostitution (Haynes, 2004). Thus, there is a lack of trust between victims of human trafficking and law enforcement and the courts. Some law enforcement and government officials are patrons of trafficking venues, such as nightclubs and brothels; therefore, victims are less likely to seek help from law enforcement officials (Hayes, 2004).

Lucrative

Human trafficking is a lucrative criminal enterprise (Graycar & McCusker, 2007; ILO, 2014; Jordan, Patel & Rap, 2013; Newby & McGuinness, 2012). Out of all the various forms of human trafficking, sex trafficking is by far the most profitable. The International Labor Organization (2014) claimed sex trafficking alone brings in $99 billion worldwide, and the average profit per victim is $21,800 annually. There is never a shortage of supply and victims can be resold and reused unlike other criminal enterprises such as drugs and weapons. Trafficked women are expected to sell themselves several times a day and rarely receive compensation for their services. In fact, traffickers tell

their victims they owe them money for travel documents, their own purchase prices, and
their accommodations (Haynes, 2004).

Socio-economic issues

Poverty is a significant risk factor for human trafficking (Haynes, 2004; Tsai,
2017). However, not all the women come from poverty-stricken families. Liu (2012)
found in her study that some of the survivors described their families as "affluent," but
lacked education due to their poor performance in school. Additionally, the majority of
the survivors, (95%) in the study, worked in legitimate sectors in the workforce prior to
their involvement in prostitution; however, due to their skills and education the jobs
available to the women were limited, informal, tedious, and low paying. Jobs available to
the women were mostly in the restaurant, factory, and entertainment industries. Thus, the
majority worked in the workforce for at least a year before engaging in prostitution (Liu,
2017).

Family financial needs are a common factor for someone to become involved in
human trafficking in Southeast Asia. In Filipino society, the family unit is the most
fundamental aspect, and it is expected for family members to provide for one another if
necessary (Medina 2001; Tsai, 2017). Even when survivors return to their homes after
exiting trafficking, they encounter the same factors making them susceptible to human
trafficking. In fact, Filipina survivors of commercial sex trafficking expressed greater
concern over financial difficulties than personal trauma. Moreover, skill and vocational

training provided to survivors are all too often not beneficial or geared for sustainable employment; thus, the survivors remain in their financial predicament (Tsai, 2017).

After community reentry, Filipino-trafficked survivors often encounter insurmountable financial challenges to provide for their families. Most recently, Tsai (2017) explored the financial pressures Filipina women endure. Her study revealed that her sample, 22 former Filipina sex trafficking survivors, implemented various survival strategies depending on their role- mothers, daughters, or partners. Mothers exerted the most effort in providing for their children, daughters provided for their parents yet set boundaries, and partners attempted to monitor their partners' expenses. Tsai (2017) also conducted the first study to explore financial records from sex trafficking survivors. Approximately, 60 % of survivors of trafficking served as the primary financial manager in the family household.

The financial manager was responsible for managing debt and controlling income and expenses. Survivors' average income was significantly higher compared to the parents' who assumed the role as the financial manager- $81 U.S. Dollars (USD) vs. $26.9 USD. Yet, survivors had difficulty finding employment due to their lack of education and skills. Survivors who did not have employment were vulnerable to domestic violence and controlling behaviors. One participant disclosed her boyfriend, with whom she had been living, hindered her from obtaining employment. The survivor was too embarrassed to seek help from the non-governmental organization (NGO) that sponsored her to complete her high school diploma seeing as she dropped out of their

program due to pressure from her boyfriend. Although NGO's provide survivors with opportunities to complete their GED and vocational training, survivors still have difficulty finding sustainable career opportunities; thus, it results in them relying on their partners and parents. The financial dependency increases the survivor's susceptibility to violence and controlling behaviors (Tsai, 2017).

Who Is Involved?

Perpetrators

Most human traffickers are male, but females comprise a larger proportion of traffickers than one might suspect. Reid (2016) found that 33% of non-relative traffickers and 21% of relative traffickers in her study were female. Women victims can move up in ranks and begin to recruit other female victims and/or start their own criminal enterprise (Haynes, 2004). Regardless of gender, traffickers are often crafty and cunning in their criminal trade and recruit their victims tactfully. In many instances, the trafficker had a type of a relationship with the victim. Le's (2015) study revealed most survivors were trafficked by someone they knew- five were trafficked by family members and six were trafficked by friends/acquaintances; only four were trafficked by strangers. However, not all traffickers have a relationship with their victim prior to entrapment. Reid (2016), explored methods of entrapment utilized by sex traffickers. The five top entrapment schemes employed by sex traffickers are listed below.

1. Romance or flattery
2. Befriending /gaining trust

3. Normalizing sex

4. Isolation

5. Targeting vulnerable youth

Despite the common misbelief, traffickers do not have to physically abuse or threaten their victims into participating in sexual activity, but they can deceive them through buying gifts, giving them attention, pampering, and words of flattery. Traffickers also gain their trust by aiding them in times of need, such as providing shelter for the homeless (Reid, 2016).

Victims are sometimes devoted to their perpetrators and will lie to protect them. Newby and McGuinness (2012) claim young survivors, teens and children will lie about their identity and age to protect their traffickers. Victims are also disciplined by their perpetrators to not confide to healthcare providers that they are victims of human trafficking. Some victims will not identify as a victim because they have an emotional connection with their traffickers, such as being in love with their traffickers (Newby & McGuinness, 2012; Reid, 2016). Sex may be normalized by traffickers through training other victims to be recruiters who are similar in age to prospective victims, and recruiters may normalize sex by joking or glorifying prostitution. Perpetrators may also isolate their victims by moving to a different city and state from their origin and travel frequently. Another isolation technique perpetrators employ is to have complete control over their social media and phones. Lastly, victims sometimes do not have the mental capacity to differentiate between johns, customers for commercial sex, and boyfriends (Reid, 2016).

Once the traffickers lure and entrap their victims, there are at least three methods used to control the victims. Ioannou and Oostinga (2017) conducted a study of 137 sexually-exploited victims from 37 completed Dutch criminal investigations in a four-year time-span, from 2007-2011. Survivors were transnational and originated from an assortment of countries. Based on Canter's Victim Role model of offending style, the study found three typologies of control methods the offender uses on a victim: victim as a vehicle, victim as a person, and victim as an object.

1. Victim as a vehicle- the trafficker exhibits no empathy or concern for the victim(s) and uses the victim for their own personal desires. (e.g., sexual abuse, psychological abuse, witnessing physical abuse, real debt, threats against victim (against family and the victim's child), posting pictures of the victim on the Internet as a prostitute.)

2. Victim as a person- traffickers control the victim through treating the individual as a person and coercion (e.g., limiting and monitoring social interaction, presents, and having a personal/intimate relationship with the trafficker.)

3. Victim as an object- The perpetrator fails to identify the victim as a human being and treats the individual as a personal object. (e.g., the victim is accompanied to and from the work site, confiscation of passport and travel documents, the victim is unable to speak the language of the country where they live, the victim is unaware of his/her rights, physical violence, threats of

abuse, the trafficker controls the earnings, and the victim is housed in the

trafficker's property.)

The researchers concluded that the most common typology traffickers employed was

victim as an object (74.4 percent), followed by victim as a person (8.8 percent), and

victim as a vehicle (2.2 percent). The most frequently used method of control that the

traffickers or members of the criminal enterprise used to control their victims was to have

the victims reside in their personally-owned or -rented dwelling (86 percent). Choosing

victims who were not able to speak the native language of the country to which they were

trafficked, was also an effective method of control (78 percent) (Ioannou & Oostinga,

2017).

Victims

Who are they?

Victims who are most vulnerable to human trafficking are women and children

who originate from a home with low socioeconomic status, and who are unemployed,

lacking family support, and have poor academic performance (Haynes, 2004; Le, 2015).

In the United States, youth survivors of human trafficking tend to: come from

dysfunctional families, substance-abusing homes, have been previously sexually abused,

live in poverty, have been involved in the juvenile justice system, and spent time in foster

homes (English, 2015). Runaways and the homeless are easy targets for traffickers

because they are more likely to have a negative experience with law authorities (Newby

& McGuinness, 2012). However, in Southeast Asia, the types of individuals who are

drawn into human trafficking tend to be people seeking to escape violence in their homes or people mired in poverty (English, 2015). Liu (2012) found in her study that the average age of women in prostitution is 23.6, the majority of prostitutes lack much formal education, they are raised in poverty, and they are single (not married). Consequently, marriage is a significant life event for Southeast Asian women living in poor, rural communities. The girl becomes less of a financial burden and is able to be taken care of by her new family (Le, 2015).

There is a common misconception about the link between prostitution and trafficking (Haynes, 2004; Jackson, 2016). Although not all prostitutes are coerced into prostitution, some victims are trafficked into prostitution. In a study conducted by Liu (2012), she explored women's paths to prostitution in Shenzhen, China; prostitution is prevalent and is a flourishing industry in Shenzhen. Liu concluded Chinese women end up in prostitution due to five various typologies:

1. Self-initiation
2. Force/deceit/coercion
3. Persuasion by relatives
4. Influence of friends/coworkers
5. Specific family or personal events.

Participants self-initiated themselves into prostitution due to a fear of poverty or discontent with their current occupations. Some of the participants in the study were trafficked into the commercial sex industry. They were deceived into accepting jobs

where no sex services were involved, however, upon or shortly after arrival, sex was demanded. Survivors could not run away because they had no money or a place to live. However, not all women were forced, deceived, and/or coerced into prostitution; many participants had relatives, friends, or coworkers who persuaded them to participate in prostitution. Lastly, some participants got involved in prostitution due to certain events- family injuries, illnesses, and/or other tragedies. While the extant literature suggests a positive correlation between sexual abuse and women who end up in the sex industry, a history of sexual abuse was not found among most of the participants in the afore- mentioned study. Regardless, situational factors, such as sex venues, locations where victims are purchased for their services, and peer and family influences, and force/deception/coercion are all significant (Liu, 2012). Nonetheless, poverty is a driving force and integral factor in the lives of potential trafficking victims.

Physical & mental trauma

Trafficked women are expected to sell, exploit, themselves several times a day with limited days off; thus, the toll of human trafficking has a detrimental impact upon survivors' health (Dovydaitis, 2010; English, 2015; Haynes, 2004; Newby & McGuinness, 2012). Victims of human trafficking can experience numerous adverse health effects from sex trafficking, including: insufficient nutritional intake, physical abuse, emotional trauma, and sexual trauma (e.g., pelvic and vaginal pain, sexually transmitted diseases, urinary tract infections, and complications from numerous or unsafe abortions) (Dovydaitis, 2010; Newby & McGuinness; 2012). In a recent Southeast Asian

study, men were more likely to experience physical abuse than women (49.1 percent vs.

41.3 percent), and women were more likely to experience sexual abuse (43.9 percent vs.

1.3 percent). Approximately 70 percent of trafficked victims did not have a day off, 68

percent lived in bad conditions, and 22 percent of victims received a serious injury on the

job. The repercussions of the conditions the survivors endured resulted in 38.9 percent of

them experiencing post-traumatic stress disorder, 42.8 percent suffered anxiety, and 61.2

percent endured depression (Kiss et. al., 2016).

Le (2015) was the first to explore and analyze Vietnamese human trafficking

victims' trauma and post-trafficking adjustment. Fifteen Vietnamese female trafficking

survivors were interviewed and studied for a period of 10 months. During their

trafficking, the survivors encountered physical abuse and trauma; the survivors were

treated inhumanely. One survivor was beaten because she tried to runaway and one

witnessed a girl die in front of other trafficked victims as a method of coercing the

victims. After trafficking, the survivors lost trust in others and felt like outsiders because

many of them were tricked and deceived by someone they knew-family, a romantic

interest, or a friend. In addition to coping with the trauma they endured during the time

they were trafficked, the survivors had to cope with the same issues they had prior to

trafficking, such as poverty.

Traffickers leave not only deep emotional and mental scars, but can leave visible

ones, too. Dovydaitis (2010) claimed traffickers may exhibit physical force to control

their victims that may result in physical indicators of human trafficking: bite marks, bald

spots, cigarette burns. Victims may also experience physical chronic pain from muscle overuse (e.g., jaw problems from excessive oral sex). Thus, healthcare providers are essential in aiding survivors; they provide the mental and physical assistance to victims' needs (Dovydaitis, 2010; English, 2015; Newby & McGuinness; 2012). Although psychiatric nurses are excellent at screening and assessing vulnerable youth, victims may still falsely answer their skilled interview questions. Regardless, suspicions of trafficking should be reported to the National Human Trafficking Resource Center (Dovydaitis, 2010; Newby & McGuinness; 2012).

Methods of Exiting

Safe Houses

Elements for an effective safe house

While prosecution needed to prevent and reduce human trafficking, the victims must be protected so that the perpetrators can be successfully prosecuted. Survivors require witness protection, sanctions from repatriation, legal services, and housing (Chuang, 2010). Haynes (2004) lists five elements that could make human trafficking programs more effective:

> 1) protect victims by providing immediate shelter as well as psychological and medical care;
> 2) pursue prosecution of traffickers by providing a safe space for victims to recuperate while freely deciding whether to aid prosecutors;
> 3) increase the feasibility of prosecuting traffickers by looking at the intent of the trafficker to profit from moving people;
> 4) empower trafficked persons by creating labor training programs to mitigate gender-based economic inequity; and

5) increase both the likelihood of victims providing testimony and the level of protection given to victims by offering them permanent residency or asylum in the country of destination or in a third country (p. 255).

Trafficked survivors are in need of mental and physical health services for their recovery and overall well-being; thus, the aftercare services must not be offered at shelters (Haynes, 2004; Kiss et. al., 2016). Chuang (2010) suggests modern day slavery abolitionists heavily invest their efforts in protection of survivors and prosecution of traffickers. Survivors may be reluctant to testify against their traffickers; yet, empowering survivors will give them the confidence and encouragement needed to leave the human trafficking cycle and testify against their traffickers (Hayes, 2004). It has been argued that a community-orientated approach just like the Eastern collective culture is the most beneficial for the rehabilitation of trafficked survivors (Le, 2015).

Survivors also need to feel financially independent and stable and have better employment opportunities (Chuang, 2010; Hayes, 2004; Tsai, 2017a; Tsai, 2017b). The opportunities in third-world countries such as the Philippines are limited. Although there is a notable dark side of globalization, an organization named Walk Free argued that globalization can be a cure. The founder believed companies could impact the lives of millions of people living in third-world countries by investing and growing developed countries' companies in underdeveloped nations would reduce the people's vulnerability to labor trafficking, and improve their overall lives (Chuang, 2014).

Additionally, survivors need to be taught the financial tools for economic stability. Tsai and her two co-authors, Seballos-Llena and Castellano-Datta, (2017)

reaffirm Tsai's previous claim of the importance of interventions to create financial independency and sustainability. In their study, they implemented a financial independence program, BARUG, designed for survivors to learn and obtain financial stability in the Philippines. Survivors were able to learn how to prioritize their financial obligations, save, and create financial goals; thus, reducing financial anxiety and hopelessness and empowering survivors for financial independence. Successful NGO's would provide legal assistance, protection against traffickers during prosecution, social and psychological services, refuge in safe houses, and employment training and opportunities.

Are rescue missions really saving people?

Rescue missions can have a negative impact on survivors (Chuang, 2010; Shin, 2015). Since trafficked Filipinos are outsourced to numerous destination countries, the undocumented migrant workers are found in rescue missions, which can result in deportation. Repatriation, the return of an individual back to his or her country of origin, can disempower trafficked victims, not only do they lose their means of surviving; they are deported, only to return to their origin and their lamentable situation. Thus, repatriation may not be in their best interest (Shin, 2015). Moreover, various governments may encourage repatriation due to unwanted migration. Political leaders may pursue their hidden agendas of eradicating smuggling, migration, and prostitution by "combatting" human trafficking (Haynes, 2004). Deporting victims back to their home country may expose them again to trafficking rings. It may also hinder prosecution of the

traffickers. Therefore it has been argued that asylum helps victims more, and is indispensable for prosecuting traffickers. Thus asylum may be more useful than repatriation (Haynes, 2004).

Moreover, many rescued victims manage to return to their brothels or trafficker because of the suffering they endure from their involuntary repatriation to their home country. Unfortunately, the victims may find the brothel to be a better environment than their circumstances and conditions back in their country of origin. Shelters are an option, but not all shelters are equipped to fulfill the needs of the survivors. In Thailand, trafficked survivors often refuse to be sheltered, and many would prefer to be deported back to their home country. Thus, the current rescue model requires much more revamping to fully satisfy the complexities of the human trafficking phenomenon (Chuang, 2010).

Issue

Victims will not come forth and seek protection and assistance if they feel law enforcement, the judicial processes, and safe houses will not give them the help that they seek and require (Hayes, 2004). Furthermore, rescue missions may not provide the protections needed by human trafficking survivors (Chuang, 2010; Shin, 2015). Internationally, many survivors face the risk of repatriation and being forced to return back to their undesirable living conditions; their needs and wants may be completely neglected (Shin, 2015). Therefore, many survivors try to escape, although their chances

of surviving were very slim. Even if survivors manage to escape and make it back to their homes, the journey back is strenuous (Le, 2015).

Although there is an increase in awareness of human trafficking, there is still a lack of evidence-based research identifying our best possible responses to human trafficking (English, 2015). Dell, Maynard, Born, Wagner, Atkins and House (2017) conducted a meta-analysis on exit and post-exit intervention programs for human trafficking survivors. Out of the 444 studies that were screened, a total of 6 studies were sufficiently rigorous for systematic review. Most of the participants in the studies were survivors of sex trafficking (83 percent) and the average age of the sample population in the studies was 20.5 years. Half of the studies implemented trauma-focused interventions, two of the studies conducted trauma-focused behavioral therapy, and only one implemented a comprehensive program which utilized the Integrative Treatment of Complex Trauma for Adolescents Model for their counseling services.

However, after Dell et al. (2017) reviewed the study interventions, five of the studies were considered insufficient because they used a pre-experimental study design without critical features addressing risks to internal validity. Nearly all of the researchers who conducted the studies encountered challenges in data collection or research design due to the work settings or the special population. Furthermore, none of the studies sufficiently examined the outcomes of exit interventions. Experts suggest that survivors of human trafficking require special services due to their complex needs from the trauma they endured. Nonetheless, more studies should be conducted on human trafficking

interventions to build evidence-based research for exit and post-exit interventions for human trafficking survivors (Dell et. al., 2017).

Modern-day slavery abolitionists primarily fixate on protection of survivors and prosecution of traffickers, while ignoring other pertinent issues such as exiting strategies. Scholars call for further research pertaining to individuals living in low-socioeconomic conditions, policy development, employment and educational opportunities for improving the understanding and eradication of human trafficking (Chaung, 2010; Haynes, 2004; Kiss et. al., 2016; Monk-Turner & Turner, 2017; Tsai, 2017).

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

Purpose

A major purpose of this study was to discover how survivors can successfully exit the trafficking environment and find shelters. A multidisciplinary approach to study desistance is necessary. "Desistance" has been defined in research literature as abstaining from an activity. However, a conceptualized definition of desistance among researchers is not universally shared (Hearn, 2010; Laub & Sampson, 2001). However, the two criminologists who conducted one of the most comprehensive studies on desistance from crime, Laub and Sampson, (2001) emphasized the importance of differentiating termination and desistance. "Termination is the time at which criminal activity stops. Desistance, by contrast, is the causal process that supports the termination of offending" (Laub & Sampson, 2011, p. 11). Desistance and termination are both integral to understanding the process of offending cessations (Hearn, 2010; Laub & Sampson, 2001). For the purpose of the present study, Laub and Sampson's definition of desistance was used. While desistance generally referred to offending behavior, this study used desistance to assess situations in which exiting the trafficking environment are made possible.

This study addressed the following questions: 1.) Do most survivors find shelters through abstaining or seeking to abstain from commercial sex exploitation? 2.) When do survivors realize that they need to escape human trafficking? 3.) How do victims escape? 4.) How long have they been held captive prior to finding an opportunity to leave? 5.) At

what age do victims typically escape? The goal of this study was to identify factors leading to the ability of a trafficking victim to leave the situation he/she is in. This could assist law enforcement and victim aid organizations in removing other trafficking victims from those deplorable environments.

Sample

The population under investigation in this study was survivors of human trafficking in the Philippines. The Department of Social Welfare and Development provide assistance to trafficking victims and agreed to provide the researcher access to victims within the shelters it operates across the country of the Philippines. They have two shelters for female victims of human trafficking: Marillac Hills and Haven for Women. However, only Haven for Women survivors were used for the study because they were all of the age of 18 and over. Marillac Hills provide shelter for children. A convenience sample of human trafficking survivors from Haven for Women was drawn. One of the goals of this study is to capture as large a variety of opportunities and methods of exit that were actually used by this group.

Design

The study took place in Manila, Philippines during the week of September 27th through the 30th in the year of 2017. A semi-structured questionnaire was utilized to interview all respondents to enable both a structure to the conversation but to also allow for the respondents to highlight information not requested by the researcher (and perhaps not highlighted in the available literature on the topic). The Department of Social Welfare

and Development reviewed all questions to be asked prior to administration. The researcher worked with an interpreter to interview participants. The researcher, interpreter, and participants utilized a conference room within the shelter that was comfortable for the participants, but also allowed for as much privacy as possible so the participants would not feel stifled. DSWD managed 2 human trafficking shelters and the researcher visited 1 of them, Haven for Women, to secure interviews. Thirteen interviews were conducted during a duration of 2 days. The shelters had 24-hour access, however, the interpreter was only accessible during operating hours, 9:00am to 6:00pm.

Survey questions in the study were both open ended and closed ended. Survivors had the option to choose between two different languages: English and Tagalog. Participation in the interview was anonymous and an informed consent form was discussed with the participants prior to asking any questions (See Appendices A & B for Informed Consent form). Each interview lasted between 20- 30 minutes. (See Appendices C & D for the Interview Questionnaire).

Dependent and independent variables

The dependent variable was exit strategy. Exit strategy is defined as a victim's separation from the trafficking environment. The independent variables included amount of time in the environment, interaction with law enforcement, fear of traffickers, number of other victims in the trafficking ring, and resiliency factors. Additionally, demographic information was collected to examine whether age, sex, and geographic origination (home area), contributed to the ability of the victim to leave.

Analysis technique

   A content analysis of interviews was conducted to isolate themes leading to
successful exits from the trafficking environment for victims.

CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS

Demographics

Number

A total of 13 out of 14 human trafficking victims were interviewed for the study; the response rate was 92.9%. The Department of Social Welfare and Development's shelter houses 14 human trafficking victims, however, one survivor was unable to participate in the study because her school schedule conflicted with the times of the scheduled interviews.

Gender & ethnicity

All of the participants in the study were females born and identified as females. The survivors all identified their nationality as Filipino.

Age

Survivors' ages ranged between 18-26 with 46% reporting the age of 18 (n=6), 15.4% reporting the age of 19 (n=2), 15.4% reporting the age of 22 (n=2), 7.7% reporting the age of 23 (n=1), 7.7% reporting the age of 24 (n=1), and 7.7% reporting the age of 26 (n=1). Because of the small sample size, this study will rely on the mode as the best measure of central tendency – the mode of age is 18, representing almost half of the participants.

Region of the Philippines from which they derive

Birthplace.

All the survivors were born and raised in the Philippines. However, most of the survivors did not originate from the same city. Only two cities had more than one survivor come from them: 15.4% originated from Quezon city (n=2) and 15.4% originated from Caloocan (n=2). The list of remaining cities the survivors originated from are listed as the following: 7.7% from Santa Maria (n=1), 7.7% from Bulacan (n=1), 7.7% from Ilocos Norte Laoag (n=1), 7.7% from Makati (n=1), 7.7% from Manila (n=1), 7.7% from Taguig (n=1), 7.7% from Tarlic (n=1), 7.7% from Zamboanga (n=1), 7.7% from Leyte Province (n=1), and 7.7% from Milagros, Masbate (n=1).

Home Region.

Most of the participants, 61.5%, consider the National Capitol Region, NCR, (n=8) as their home. One of each of the five remaining participants came from region 1, 3, 5, 8, and 9.

Figure 1: Regions of the Philippines

Source: thephillippines, Template: Regions of the Philippines Image Map, visited Nov. 7,

2017

Education

Slightly more than half, 53.8%, of the participants in the study, completed their middle school education (n=7), 38.5% completed their high school education (n=5), and 7.7% completed only elementary education (n=1). Approximately 15.4% of the survivors are currently enrolled at university (n=2). The remaining survivors are continuing their middle and high school education at Haven for Women shelter.

Parent occupations

All of the survivors were raised in lower socioeconomic homes, and with one parent or both parents missing, whether it was the result of death or absence, unemployment, or working in a low paying occupation.

Mother.

Most of the mothers were not employed in the workforce (61.5%, 8); 15.4% of the mothers were deceased (n=2), 23% were unknown (n=3), and 23% were unemployed (n=3). Mothers who were employed worked in low-paying industries with 7.7% employed as a beautician (n=1), 7.7% employed as a rice farmer (n=1), 7.7% employed as a domestic helper (n=1), 7.7% employed as a restaurant helper (n=1), and 7.7% employed as a washerwoman (n=1)

Father.

Many of the participants' fathers did not play an active role in their lives (53.8%, 7); 30.8% of the fathers were deceased (n=4), and 23% were unknown (n=3). Of these

fathers who were still in their lives, 23% were unemployed (n=3), 15.4% were employed as carpenters (n=2), and only 7.7% worked as rice farmers (n=1).

<div align="center">Human Trafficking-Specific Related Questions</div>

Entrance into trafficking

Every participant had her own unique story of her entry into human trafficking; however, a variety of elements increased an individual's chances of becoming trafficked. The literature suggests that common factors such as socioeconomic status, family structure, economy, and life events may make an individual more vulnerable to become a victim of human trafficking (Tsai, 2017). Common themes appeared in all the participants' entry into human trafficking, but the two central themes were that each perpetrator had an established type of relationship with the victim and financial instability.

Perpetrator-victim familiarity

In every story, the survivor knew the perpetrator or the individual who solicited her into human trafficking, with 15% indicating a family member solicited her into human trafficking (n=2), 53.8% had a friend who solicited her or introduced her to human trafficking (n=6), and 38.5% were recruited by an acquaintance (n=5). To further illustrate the types of relationships that existed, I will provide some examples from the interviews using pseudonyms for the participants. "Susan" described her aunt as greedy and eager to exploit her for profit. Her aunt attempted to exploit Susan at a pool party but was unsuccessful and arrested by PNP officers. The first time "Martha" entered human

trafficking, her cousin introduced her to her trafficker. Martha's cousin willingly engaged in cybersex for the trafficker. The trafficker successfully recruited Martha for cybersex, but she eventually left because of her pregnancy. However, she reentered into human trafficking shortly after her pregnancy. This time, it was her gay uncle, whom she referred to as her aunt, who exploited her. Six of the survivors' peers, "Thalia," "Pia," "Tatiana," "Macey," "Hannah," and "Jacquelyn" introduced them to their traffickers. Thalia, Macey, Hannah, Jacquelyn, and Tatiana asked their peers for income opportunities; Pia was the only one who had a friend who asked the survivor to accompany her to meet the trafficker. Pia was reluctant to accompany her, but she did not want to leave her friend alone. "Unique", Kia, Kylie, Nancy, and Susie were recruited by acquaintances. Unique and Nancy's neighbors recruited them for sex and mail order bride trafficking. Kia and Nancy were both solicited by family friends: Kia's aunt's friend and Nancy's mother's co-worker introduced them to the Chinese trafficker of the mail-bride order scheme. The owner of the restaurant where Susie worked owned an entertainer bar and recruited her. The mamasan considered Susie to be a prize because she was a virgin, and gave her a selling price of 100,000 pesos ($1,936.86).

Financial instability

The most important reason for the survivors' entry into human trafficking was financial instability. Many of the girls were raised in low-income single parent homes, with 38.4% of mothers absent (n=5) and 53.8% of fathers absent (n=7). If a parent was present in a survivor's life, he or she was either unemployed or employed in a low paying

job. The survivor's family was not financially equipped to support the survivor. Thus, the survivors had to find other opportunities to support themselves. Martha was 12-years-old when she was entered into trafficking. As stated previously, her cousin introduced her to a cybersex trafficker. Martha's cousin told her she could earn 100 pesos by smiling and greeting the video camera.

> "I did not enjoy being naked in front of the camera, but my family could not support me. I needed the money. I would make an alibi and lie and say I was at my cousin's, so my parents did not know what I was doing." (Martha)

Macey's parents passed away when she was a baby, and Macey's aunt raised her and her sister. The aunt and the sister's boyfriend were financially responsible for the family, but it was not enough, and Macey's sister abused her. Macey did not enjoy her living situation and counseled with her friend for potential job opportunities. Her friend informed her of a job opportunity in an entertainment bar located in a different city far from her hometown. When she was 14, she traveled to National Capital Region where she met the trafficker who owned the entertainment bar. Upon arrival, the trafficker entrapped her.

In fact, there were instances where the survivor had taken over the responsibility of being the financial provider for their family. Kia, 22 years old, agreed to be a Chinese mail order bride to assist in paying off a family debt. She was offered 140,000 pesos to become a mail order bride in China. The recruiter took a relatively small portion of 30,000 pesos, and her family kept the remaining balance. Thalia was 14-years-old when she entered into trafficking. She had to search for additional work to support her mother.

Her father was absent her entire life, and she did not have any other family members to rely on for financial support.

> "Since I did not graduate from college, I needed to stay in human trafficking and make a decent income. I had to take care of my mother at the time and be able to pay for her medication. I did not like my work." (Thalia)

Age at entrance and exit and length of time in the trafficking environment

Trafficking survivors were brought into the trafficking world between the ages of 12 to 25 with one participant each entering at the ages of 12, 15, 21, and 24, two participants each brought in at the ages of 14, 16, 17, and 22. Most of the participants entered and exited the trafficking environment within one year (85%, n=11), with a couple participants reporting that they were trafficked for 2 to 3 years (15%, n=2). Trafficking survivors exited trafficking between the ages of 13 and 25 with one participant exiting at each of the following ages: 13, 15, 24 and 25, and three participants exiting at each of the following ages: 16, 17, and 22.

Types of establishments in which they were trafficked

The establishments in which the girls were solicited were grouped into three locations: bars, residences, and service facilities. Service facilities were venues such as restaurants and hotels. Residences included the homes or apartments the trafficker owned or the trafficked survivors were taken into the customer's home. The majority of the trafficking incidences occurred in residences. The four mail-order-bride survivors were housed in the Chinese trafficker's home until their departure date; Martha was also trafficked in her trafficker's home for cybersex. Unique and Susan were in their

trafficked homes, but for commercial sex. Only one survivor was exploited in a multitude

of establishments. In addition to hotels, Macey was trafficked in a wide array of

residential establishments- condominiums, apartments, and houses. Tatiana was the only

one who was trafficked solely at hotels. Susie, Jacquelyn, and Pia were trafficked only at

a restaurant or bar. The establishment where the most arrests occurred was a foreigner's

only bar located in National Capital Region. Twenty girls were rescued during that one

raid. According to Jacquelyn, many of the girls desired to work there because of the

excellent pay and the belief that the foreign men would financially sponsor the Filipinas

employed at the bar. When Jacquelyn was sixteen, a friend of hers who worked at the bar

recruited her to work there. She was trafficked for a total of three months, and during the

time she was trafficked she would have to perform everything but intercourse because

she was a virgin.

> "I was a virgin and was considered to be a prize. My price was set for 100,000 pesos. It took two months for me to be sold. When I was purchased, my buyer had taken me into a bedroom, but I did not want to have sex. Thankfully, he understood my wish not to have sex and stopped his sexual advances. However, he kept returning to the bar and waited for me to give consent eventually. He knew no one could have sex with me because I was a virgin." (Jacquelyn).

Themes

Interactions with law enforcement

In the Philippines, the country has one national police force, the Philippine

National Police (PNP), and the only encounter with law enforcement the survivors

experienced was when they were rescued. All of the participants experienced an

interaction with law enforcement (n=13), and the law enforcement interaction occurred during the raid/rescue. The PNP was proactive as well as reactive to human trafficking. The PNP conducted surveillance by using undercover PNP officers with Susan's aunt before her aunt tried to sell her to undercover officers at a pool party. Another successful PNP operation occurred during a raid in a restaurant before the pimp attempted to exploit Pia. Although four of the participants were forced to act as domestic helpers before their departure to China, PNP saved eight girls including the participants in this study from being trafficked as farm labor.

Only two of the participants escaped their traffickers and sought law enforcement. The two participants, Hannah and Kia, were the only ones who planned and successfully escaped their traffickers to inform authorities of their traffickers' operations. Shortly before their departure to China, Kia received a Facebook message on her phone from the previous group of Filipina women sent to China as mail-order-brides by their Chinese trafficker. The Filipina women informed Kia of how they were deceived, and the trafficker did not fulfill his promise of marrying them to affluent Chinese men. Instead, they were trafficked as farm labor. As soon as Kia realized the mail-order-bride ploy was a fraudulent scheme and they were going to be taken to China for farm labor, she immediately wanted to escape. She informed Hannah of the trafficker's plot, and Hannah devised a plan to escape. Hannah lied to the trafficker and insisted she needed more clothes before departing, and her friend was waiting for her to retrieve her clothing. The

trafficker granted her permission to leave, and both Hannah and Kia left to find law enforcement authorities, i.e., the PNP.

Exiting trafficking

Experiences of others

Most of the survivors did not experience physical force or coercion but remained trafficked due to their financial predicament. Approximately, 61.5% (n=) did not experience any physical abuse or coercion, but 38% did report coercion alone (n=5). Victims were coerced by reduction of pay, threats, isolation, and fear that the traffickers would go after the survivors' families. Before Kia discovered the trafficker's farm labor trafficking operation, she did not want to escape because she feared the trafficker would seek retribution by targeting her aunt. Traffickers were not the only individuals capable of coercing the survivors. The other victims trafficked with the survivor coerced the survivor to remain in trafficking. For example, Macey was coerced by both her trafficker and other victims.

> "When the perpetrator sensed we were trying to escape; we were taken to a new location. We had no idea where we were, and we had nowhere to go. The other girls would threaten me by telling me bad things would happen if I had left." (Macey).

Only one survivor, Hannah, experienced verbal abuse and life-threatening intimidations with a gun by her Chinese Syndicate trafficker. Many of the survivors (76.9%) did not witness other girls trying to escape (n=10). Out of the three survivors who witnessed other girls' attempt to escape, two of them also escaped with the others. Thalia witnessed

other victims held by her trafficker leave because he reduced their income or cheated them in their pay.

Prior attempts to leave

Approximately, 38.5% of survivors (n=5) attempted to leave their trafficking environment prior to their final attempt, with 80% of the survivors being successful in their escape. However, two out the five survivors who initially escaped successfully returned to the trafficking environment. Martha escaped the first time successfully due to her pregnancy; the trafficker permitted her to leave. Thalia left her trafficker because of fiscal misunderstandings; the trafficker kept reducing her pay and increasing his profit.

> "I left because of fiscal misunderstandings. The original agreement was the pimp would keep 20%, and the woman would keep 80%." (Thalia)

The remaining 61.5% of participants (n=8) did not attempt to escape their trafficking environment because PNP officers rescued Susan, Pia, and Unique before they were exploited. Approximately, 25% were too afraid to leave (n=2). Two of the Chinese syndicate mail-order-brides survivors, Nancy and Kylie, confessed they were both too scared to escape from their trafficker because of their trafficker's monitoring and the potential repercussions.

> "I was too scared to leave. There were cameras everywhere." (Kylie)

> "I was scared to leave. I knew they would follow me no matter what." (Nancy)

The remaining survivors either had nowhere else to go (n=1), needed the money (n=1), or did not know it was wrong (n=1). Overall many of the survivors grew up in single-parent

homes with limited financial income. Parents of the survivors failed to provide for their children, let alone themselves adequately. Many girls entered at a young age, and were naïve and did not understand human trafficking. Susan admitted she was naïve and did not know what she was doing was wrong.

 "It was not until I was rescued when I realized I was exploited." (Susan)

Exit that was successful

Due to the PNP, all of the survivors were able to exit successfully. Eleven of the survivors were rescued during a raid while two sought out the assistance of law enforcement. However, other individuals also assisted in the successful exists, including an additional trafficking victim in four cases and a family member in one. In the Chinese Syndicate mail order bride trafficking scheme, two of the trafficked girls, Kia and Hannah, ran away to PNP officials for refuge and assistance. The two girls helped each other escape, thus resulting in aiding and freeing the other two mail order bride survivors who were housed at DSWD. Unique's sister aided Unique in her exit of human trafficking. The sister waited outside the perpetrator's house and informed police of her sister's trafficking incident and her location.

What would have helped to leave earlier

The majority of the participants (76.9%, n=10) claimed they could not imagine a more effective means of exiting the human trafficking.
Unfortunately, many of the survivors were not raised in a supportive and secure family dynamic. A parent or both parents were missing, or family members attempted to exploit

them. Regardless, survivors did not have a home or place to return even if they had exited trafficking earlier.

> "I had nowhere to go. My parents were deceased, and my sister abused me." (Macey)

> "No one could have helped me. My sister and mom could not stop my aunt from trying to exploit me. The police were the only way." (Susan)

The survivors stated the police raid sufficed in their aid to escape. However, 15% of survivors wished they had had better employment opportunities (n=2) and one survivor confessed she wished she was aware at the time she was being trafficked.

Additional information about trafficking experience

All participants were asked if they wanted to share any additional information regarding their trafficking experience. Most of the participants politely declined to provide additional information but three participants gave additional information regarding their experience of human trafficking on topic not broached during their interview. Martha elaborated further on her reason for reentry into cyber-sex trafficking.

> "I went to my aunt for cyber trafficking because I would receive money. Although I do not like exposing my body, I was happy to receive money. My family could not adequately provide for me, and I needed the money." (Martha)

The last two survivors did not elaborate further on their personal trafficked experiences but expressed their desire to see human trafficking end. One of the survivors expressed gratitude for being at the DWSD shelter, Haven for Women.

"I am thankful that I was rescued and sent to Haven for Women. I hope changes

with human trafficking will come." (Susan)

"She wishes trafficking will stop, so there will be no more victims." (Nancy)

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION

Law enforcement intervention appeared to be the primary method for the Filipina women to exit human trafficking. Without the interference of law enforcement, most of the women interviewed would presumably still be involved in human trafficking today, given the finding that many of the women had expressed no desire to escape. The findings of the study revealed the majority of the Filipina women entered and exited the trafficking environment within a year, with the average age of entry and exit being 18. While clear patterns could not be determined concerning the amount of time in the trafficked environment, the levels of fear of trafficker, and relationships with other victims in the trafficking ring, and resiliency factors, it was clear that there was a relationship between law enforcement intervention and the exiting of the trafficked environment. None of the participants returned to their trafficked situation after they were detained by PNP officials and taken to DSWD's Haven for Women for shelter and rehabilitation. Moreover, the two participants who reentered into human trafficking twice did not return to trafficking after PNP officers detained them. In fact, one of the participants who reentered human trafficking twice admitted she did not realize she was being exploited until PNP officials detained her. Thus, law enforcement intervention was successful in reducing revictimization of trafficked victims. A point needs to be made here as to why the environment in which these participants were living is considered trafficking. It appears that the participants were told they could find a better financial

situation if they joined with the trafficker or acquaintance – whoever recruited them. Upon arriving in that environment it was not what the participants expected, but because of their dire financial circumstances they felt they had no choice but to remain in that world to earn money for themselves and their families. While this may appear as a true "choice", and perhaps more akin to prostitution, the method by which they were brought into the environment is what makes it more of a trafficking environment than a prostitution environment.

Poverty

The literature reveals Filipina women are driven to trafficking primarily because of their extreme poverty (Graycar & McCusker, 2007; Haynes, 2004; Tsai, 2017). This explanation held true for the participants in the current study as well. The majority of Filipina entered human trafficking because of financial concerns. The participants did not come from affluent and supportive families. In fact, these families could be described as one parent missing and the single working parent employed in a low paying occupation. In some cases, the survivors were also being abused by a relative. Thus, many of the participants inquired about job opportunities to aid or escape from their home environments, which often led to exploitation. Furthermore, all of the participants remained in trafficking due to pressing financial concerns, be they for their own personal survival or the survival of their families. After all, none of the participants had another job opportunity that would pay as much as commercial sex.

The Philippine employment opportunities for women were similar to those for women in China. Job choices available to women in Shenzhen, China were mostly in the restaurant and entertainment industry because of their limited education and skill sets (Liu, 2017). None of the survivors had earned a college degree, and less than two-fifths of the participants completed their high school education. The majority of the participants entered human trafficking as minors with no previous work history. The participants who entered human trafficking as an adult were seeking a more prosperous opportunity in life as a bride or a better work opportunity. Susie was the only participant who was employed in another occupation before entering the human trafficking environment at the age of 21. She was employed at a restaurant before her recruitment at an entertainment bar. Susie would earn far more at the entertainment bar than at the restaurant, and her average daily earnings were 2,500 pesos ($48.39).

After removal from the trafficking environment, Filipina survivors encounter the same issues they faced prior to trafficking, thus making them prone to reentry into trafficking (Tsai, 2017). Participants who reentered into trafficking twice reentered for similar reasons from their first reentry. Thalia and Martha both reentered trafficking because of financial issues. Both of the participants had to be able to provide for not only themselves but also a family member. Thalia was financially responsible for her mother's medication until she passed away. Martha became impregnated during her first entry into human trafficking and exited trafficking because of her pregnancy. However, she shortly

returned to the trafficking environment to hide her pregnancy from her parents and to be able to provide for her child and herself financially.

In Southeast Asia, women and children who are raised in low-income homes, lack family support, perform poorly in school, or lack education entirely are most vulnerable to human trafficking victimization (English, 2015; Haynes, 2004; Le, 2015; Liu, 2012). The current study confirms this finding. All participants in the current study come from low-income homes and sought additional income or a better life. The majority of the participants entered trafficking as minors (n=8), lacked family support, and lacked education. Many of the participants were raised in single-parent homes and did not complete their high school education. The participants who entered as adults sought a better life and additional income either through mail-bride-orders or commercial sex. Therefore, a primary conclusion of this study is that situational and socioeconomic factors were pivotal in determining the likelihood of trafficking.

Sex Stigma

The sexual objectification of women and young girls in the Philippine culture not only perpetuates the degradation of Filipinas but also increases their vulnerability of being targets of human trafficking (Graycar & McCusker, 2007). Globally, the Philippines is notoriously known for its sex industry. In fact, one participant was exploited at an entertainment bar catering only to foreigners in Makati; Makati is known as the business district in Manila. Not only do men receive typical sexual services at the bar, but can also purchase virgins. Therefore, the Philippines continues to sexually

objectify women by having foreigners-only bars to fulfill their demand of commercial sex. This increases the vulnerability of Filipinas to satisfy the desire of foreigners.

Foreign countries recognize the vulnerability and profitability of trafficking women in the Philippines. In fact, it has been argued that a presence of foreign recruiting agencies for forced labor exists in the Philippines today due to government neglect (Chuang, 2014). The current study supports this finding, as nearly a third of the sample were trafficked by a trafficker from a foreign country. Four of the participants were victims of an illegal Chinese criminal organization, the Chinese Syndicate, for forced farm labor. The Chinese Syndicate recruited victims by having recruiters and advertising their operation as a mail-order-bride agency to lure and entrap Filipina victims. The participants' mail-order-bride recruiters promised them a handsome compensation to marry an affluent Chinese man. The gang offered a considerable amount of money to the survivors and families in the study. One of the participants, Kia, revealed she was given 140,000 pesos ($2,710.25) as a mail-order-bride. Luckily, the participants were saved two days before departing to China and were never trafficked outside of the Philippines; however, the time they spent in holding before departing was served in domestic servitude for their trafficker.

Perpetrators

While the majority of traffickers were male, women were fulfilled the role of traffickers as well (Reid, 2016; Haynes, 2004). Three participants were trafficked by women: Tatiana was exploited by her friend, Susan's aunt attempted to exploit her at the

pool party and Jacquellyn's mamasan exploited her at the foreigners only bar that she owned. Moreover, the majority of the participants reported being recruited by a female, whether it was a friend or acquaintance. Le (2015) reports that victims are typically recruited or solicited into trafficking by someone they know. The participants may not have known their traffickers themselves, but all were recruited by someone with whom they had an established relationship. Most victims in this current study inquired about additional income or better opportunities with their friends, family members, and acquaintances.

Traffickers typically do have to exert physical or verbal abuse to control their victims but can manipulate them through giving them attention or providing them with shelter (Reid, 2016). The current study partially supports this finding. All participants reported not experiencing physical abuse and the majority did not experience verbal threats or coercion. The traffickers did not necessarily manipulate the victim to stay with them but did provide them with what they needed: money. Newby and McGuinness (2012) claim victims develop an emotional connection with their perpetrators; however, this was not found to be the case in the current study. None of the participants claimed they entered or remained in trafficking because of an emotional attachment to their traffickers. In fact, two participants escaped and sought refuge from their traffickers. Financial instability and limited opportunities and support were the reasons why the participants remained in trafficking.

Rehabilitation

The literature on Filipino survivors of commercial sex trafficking revealed that survivors are generally more concerned with financial instability than personal trauma (Tsai, 2017). In the current study, the majority of the participants voluntarily got involved in trafficking due to poverty and external influences, such as the persuasiveness from family, friends, and acquaintances. Furthermore, many of the participants said they did not experience any force or coercion. In fact, a few of the participants stated their trafficker would let them leave whenever they desired. Therefore, survivors were less likely to experience trauma. Thus, it is essential for Philippine shelters to focus on education and job training to advance in their careers during their rehabilitation at the shelter. Tsai (2017) claimed survivors would remain in their financial predicaments if vocational training provided to survivors were not beneficial or geared for sustainable employment. All of the participants in the study are continuing their education, and two participants have actually enrolled in a university. While none of the survivors indicated that they were enrolled in a job training program, their enrollment in school and continuance of their education bodes well for better career opportunities.

Conclusion

Human trafficking is prevalent in the Philippines (Graycar & McCusker, 2007; Tsai, Seballos-Llena, & Castellano-Datta, 2017; Tsai, 2017; U.S. Department of State, 2016) with poverty cited as the principal threat for these at risk for trafficking (Haynes, 2004; Tsai, 2017). While this is not an issue law enforcement can solve, early

intervention of law enforcement officials seems to be the most effective method of preventing human trafficking of Filipinas. After PNP officials intervened and detained the participants, the current study revealed that none of the survivors returned to a trafficking environment. A strong correlation existed between the governmental detainment of human trafficking survivors and their escape from human trafficking environment. Law enforcement and safe house relationships are pivotal in reducing trafficking and recidivism. It was found that the participants in the current study were vulnerable to exploitation due to poverty, situational factors, lack of family support, and limited opportunities. Shelters can provide the relief survivors of human trafficking require, thus reducing revictimization. Victims remained in trafficking primarily due to their financial circumstances and the fear that they would return to the same conditions before trafficking.

Women living in third-world countries facing limited employment opportunities, poverty, and cultural oppression, often resort to participate in the commercial sex industry (Chuang, 2016). The findings of the current study supported the neo-abolitionists view of categorizing this form of prostitution with trafficking. Although deception, force, and/or coercion by another individual were found in several cases, in a larger sense, all participants were coerced by their environmental conditions into human trafficking. Most of the participants sought better income opportunities and found participating in the commercial sex trade as their only option. Additionally, all the participants who were involved in the commercial sex industry had a pimp/trafficker who

managed their earnings. While the pimps may have not physically abused the survivors or verbally abused them in most cases, the need for income was the bottom line for explaining why participants remained in human trafficking. The participants were victims of their own financial despair and cultural oppression, thereby making them easy targets for coercion into activities that turned out to be trafficking in nature. Thus, a country's socio-economic status and culture are significant factors in determining an individual's susceptibility to involvement in human trafficking.

Policy Implications

The current study strongly suggests law enforcement intervention and partnership with shelters are effective in not only reducing human trafficking but also reducing revictimization. Law enforcement and human trafficking shelters should continue to build and strengthen their relationships. In addition to increasing law enforcement intervention with human trafficking victims, the Philippine government needs to increase its efforts to eradicate its notorious reputation for its sex tourism industry, and vigorously combat activity from foreign criminal enterprises. Targeting both issues could reduce the demand for trafficked victims, and reduce the vulnerability of potential victims to the scourge of human trafficking.

Future Research

Since the current study revealed law enforcement interventions can be successful in fostering exiting strategies, more research should be conducted to fine tune the relationship between the police and the shelters. A couple of the participants in this study

admitted they did not realize they were trafficked until they were detained. Furthermore, none of the participants returned to trafficking after being rescued, and only two participants reentered into human trafficking twice. However, they did not return to trafficking after being detained by PNP and taken to DSWD's Haven for Women shelter for refuge. While this study revealed all survivors at Haven for Women did not leave to return to trafficking, more studies- and far larger studies- should be conducted along these lines.

Although the development of successful exiting strategies is imperative, it would also be beneficial to conduct a follow-up study on the same population to see if the victims' lives are improved long-term. In other words, we should examine the outcome of DSWD's rehabilitation program at the shelter. A longitudinal study will show if the shelter's current rehabilitation program is successful. Furthermore, it would be beneficial to compare DSWD's rehabilitation program with another. Unfortunately, there is a lack of literature on evidence-based research for exit and post-exit interventions for human trafficking survivors (Dell et al., 2017). In addition to contributing to the literature regarding the qualities and benefits of a successful trafficking shelter, the Philippine government might benefit from this model, if it can show sustained success for other location throughout the Philippines. Successful rehabilitation programs at shelters may well reduce victim revictimization and improve the survivors' quality of life overall.

Lastly, the current study documented the fact that foreign criminal enterprises were recruiting victims in the Philippines. Out of all the human trafficking survivors at

the shelter, 30.8% of the survivors (n=4) were under the control of a Chinese criminal enterprise. The Chinese Syndicate operated a mail-order-bride scheme to lure and entrap Filipina victims for farm labor trafficking in China. Further research on the presence of the Chinese syndicate and criminal enterprises overall would be beneficial in understanding crime in general in the Philippines.

Limitations

There were several limitations to this study. First, the original non-governmental agency which I intended on working with was unable to support my research during the time I was going to be in the Philippines. Thus, I had to find another agency at the last minute. The agency that graciously permitted me to conduct a study within short notice had a limited number of adult human trafficking survivors; therefore, my sample population was extremely limited. Secondly, a translator was used, and there is a possibility that the survivor's message could have been misinterpreted or misconstrued in translation. Additionally, selection bias is inadvertently affecting my data. There were a couple of survivors who were rescued before actually being trafficked. Lastly, because of the small sample size, the findings from this study are not generalizable. The themes discovered pertain strictly to this sample, and while they provide some good bases to start from to further examine exit strategies of Filipina trafficking victims, it is not safe to conclude that they apply to all Filipina trafficking victims. In short, this study is intended as food for thought. Hopefully it will encourage other researchers to conduct larger, more detailed study of this topic in the Philippines in the future.

REFERENCES

Chuang, Janie. (2010). Rescuing trafficking from ideological capture: Prostitution reform and anti-trafficking law and policy. *University of Pennsylvania Law Review*, *158*(6)*,* 1655–1728.

Chuang, Janie. (2014). Exploitation creep and the unmaking of human trafficking law. *The American Journal of International Law, 108*(4)*,* 609–49.

Dell, N. A., Maynard, B. R., Born, K. R., Wagner, E., Atkins, B., & House, W. (2017). Helping survivors of human trafficking. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse,* 152483801769255

Dovydaitis, T. (2010). Human trafficking: The role of the health care provider. *Journal of Midwifery & Women's Health, 55*, 462-467.

English, A. (2015). Human trafficking of children and adolescents a global phenomenon with horrific health consequences. *JAMA Pediatrics*, *169*(9)*,* 1-2.

Fedina, L. (2015) Use and misuse of research in books on sex trafficking: Implications for interdisciplinary researchers, practitioners, and advocates. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse,16*(2), 188–98.

Graycar, A. and McCusker, R. (2007). Transnational crime and trafficking in persons: Quantifying the nature, extent and facilitation of a growing phenomenon. *International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice, 31*(2), 147-165. DOI: 10.1080/01924036.2007.9678766

Haynes, D. (2004). Used, abused, arrested, and deported: extending immigration benefits to protect the victims of trafficking and to secure the prosecution of traffickers. *Human Rights Quarterly, 26*(2), 221-272.

Hearn, N. (2010). Theory of desistance. *Internet Journal of Criminology*, 1-48.

Hefty, A. (2003). Globalization and migration: Activist responses in the Philippines. *Canadian Woman Studies, 22* (3,4), 200- 203.

Hickle, K. & Roe-Sepowitz (2017). Curiosity and a pimp: Exploring sex trafficking victimization in experiences of entering sex trade industry work among participants in a prostitution diversion program. *Women & Criminal Justice, 27*(2), 122-138.

International Labor Organization. (2012). ILO 2012 global estimate of forced labour executive summary. Geneva, Switzerland: International Labor Organization.

International Labor Organization. (2014). Profits and poverty: The economics of forced labour- executive summary. Geneva, Switzerland: International Labor Organization.

Ioannou, M. & Oostinga, M., S.D. (2014). An empirical framework of control methods of victims of human trafficking for sexual exploitation. *Global Crime, 16*(1), 34-49.

Jackson, C. A. (2016). Framing sex worker rights: How U.S. sex worker rights activists perceive and respond to mainstream anti-sex trafficking advocacy. *Sociological Perspectives, 59*(1), 27-45.

Jordan, J., Patel, B. & Rapp, L. (2013). Domestic minor sex trafficking: A social work perspective on misidentification, victims, buyers, traffickers, treatment, and reform of current practice. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment, 23*(3), 356-369. DOI:10.1080/10911359.2013.764198

Kiss, L., Pocock, N. S., Naisanguansri, V., Suos, S., Dickson, B., Thuy, D., Koehler, J. Sirisup, K., Pongrungsee, N., Nguyen, V. A., Borland, R., Dhavan, P., Zimmerman, C. (2015). Health of men, women, and children in post-trafficking services in Cambodia, Thailand, and Vietnam: An observational cross-sectional study. *Lancet Glob Health, 3*, 154-161.

Laub, J., & Sampson, R. (2001). Understanding desistance from crime. *Crime and Justice, 28*, 1-69.

Le, PhuongThao D. (2017). "Reconstructing a self of self": Trauma and coping among returned women survivors of human trafficking in Vietnam. *Qualitative Health Research, 27*(4), 509-519.

Lerum, K. and Brents, B. (2016). Sociological perspectives on sex work and human trafficking. *Sociological Perspectives, 59*(1)*,* 17-26.

Liu, M. (2012). Chinese migrant women in the sex industry: Exploring their paths to prostitution. *Feminist Criminology, 7*(4), 327-349.

Medina, B. T. G. (2001). *The Filipino family* (2nd ed.). Diliman, Quezon City: University of the Philippines Press.

Mogato, M. and Pomfret, J. (2016, July, 9). US country rankings on human trafficking raise eyebrows in PH. *Reuters.* Retrieved from http://news.abs-cbn.com/news/07/09/16/us-country-rankings-on-human-trafficking-raise-eyebrows-in-ph

Monk-Turner, E. and Turner, C. G. (2017). Thai massage and commercial sex work: A phenomenological study. *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences, 12*(1), 57- 68.

Newby, A. and McGuinness, T. M. (2012). Human trafficking what psychiatric nurses should know to help children and adolescents. *Journal of Psychosocial Nursing, 50*(4), 21-24.

Republic Act Number 8353. (1997). *The Anti-Rape Law of 1997. Republic of the Philippines. Metro Manila: Congress of the Philippines.* Retrieved from http://pcw.gov.ph/law/republic-act-8353

Republic Act Number 9208. (2003). *Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2003. Republic of the Philippines, Metro Manila: Congress of the Philippines Twelfth Congress Second Regular Session. The LAWPHiL Project,* http://www.lawphil.net/statutes/repacts/ra2003/ra_9208_2003.html

Republic Act Number 10364. (2012). *Expanded Anti-trafficking in Persons Act. Republic of the Philippines.* Metro Manila: Congress of the Philippines. Official Gazette, http://www.gov.ph/2013/02/06/republic-act-no-10364.

Republic Of The Philippines Department Of Justice. (2016, July, 1). *RP gets top ranking in the fight against human trafficking.* Republic Of The Philippines Department Of Justice. Retrieved from https://www.doj.gov.ph/news.html?title=RP%20gets%20top%20ranking%20in%20the20fight%20against%20human%20trafficking&newsid=469.

Reid, J. (2016). Entrapment and enmeshment schemes used by sex traffickers. *Sexual Abuse: A Journal of Research and Treatment, 28*(6), 491-511.

Reuters. (2016, July, 1). U.S. raises Philippines' status in human trafficking report. *ABS-CBN News.* Retrieved from http://news.abs-cbn.com/news/07/29/16/ph-agencies-pledge-to- fight-human-trafficking

Shin, Y. J. (2015). Human trafficking and labor migration: The dichotomous law and complex realities of Filipina entertainers in South Korea and suggestions for integrated and contextualized legal responses. *Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law, 48*(753), 753-812.

Tsai, L. (2017). Family financial roles assumed by sex trafficking survivors upon community re-entry: Findings from a financial diaries study in the Philippines. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment, 27*(4), 334-345.

Tsai, L. C., Seballos-Llena, I. F., and Castellano-Datta, R. A. (2017). Participatory assessment of a matched savings program for human trafficking survivors and their family members in the Philippines. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research Sozialforschung, 18*(2), Article 11.

Tsai, L. C. (2017). The process of managing family financial pressures upon community

re-entry among survivors of sex trafficking in the Philippines: A grounded theory

study. *Journal of Human Trafficking, 3*(3), 211-230.

doi:10.1080/23322705.2016.119918

United Nations. (2000). *United Nations: Optional protocol to prevent, suppress and

punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children, supplementing the

united nations convention against transnational organized crime, G.A. Res.* New

York: United Nations General Assembly

U.S. Department of State. (2016). *Trafficking in persons report.* Washington, DC: U.S.

Department of State, https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/258876.pdf

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: INFORMED CONSENT FOR INTERVIEWS FOR S.K.G. STUDY (ENGLISH)

The purpose of this study is to gain a better understanding of the actions involved in in the overall scheme of human trafficking. Specifically, I am interested in better understanding how people get brought in/taken and how they get out. You were selected because you are a resident/have received services from Department of Social Welfare and Development. Your participation in the study is completely CONFIDENTIAL, and no personal information will be shared without further consent from you.

The researchers who designed this study have been very careful to remove any foreseeable harm to you, the participant. Nevertheless, some of the questions I will ask may be psychologically uncomfortable, agitating, or distressing. So, if you agree to participate in this study, it is important that you know that you can stop participating at any time without any consequences. The staff here at the shelter are aware of the interviews that are taking place and have agreed to assist you in the event our discussion causes you distress.

Finally, as a participant in this study, you have a right to receive information as to the findings of this research. I, Ms. Sarah Gross, will be providing the shelters with my overall conclusions – leaving out names and any other identifying information. You are welcome to read this document and contact me with any questions you have. My hope is that the world can benefit from the information you provide so that we might be able to stop traffickers from bringing people into the trafficking environment and that assistance agencies and public agencies can understand what might help a person be able to exit that environment more quickly and safely.

If you agree to participate in the study, can you please sign the page below with your first name and last name initial only? (Ex. Sarah G.). You will find my name and my faculty mentor's name and contact information at the bottom of this page. Please contact with any questions about the study itself.

Signature:
_____

Sarah Gross, Principal Investigator. Email: sarahgross2010@gmail.com
Elizabeth Quinn, Faculty Mentor. Email: Elizabeth.Quinn@mtsu.edu

APPENDIX B: INFORMED CONSENT FOR INTERVIEWS FOR S.K.G. STUDY (TAGALOG)

Ang layunin ng pag-aaral na ito ay upang makakuha ng mas mahusay na pag-unawa sa mga aksyon na kasangkot sa pangkalahatang pamamaraan ng human trafficking. Partikular, ako ay interesado sa mas mahusay na pag-unawa kung paano ang mga tao makakuha ng nagdala sa / kinuha at kung paano sila lumabas. Ikaw ay pinili dahil ikaw ay residente / nakatanggap ng mga serbisyo mula sa Department of Social Welfare and Development. Ang iyong paglahok sa pag-aaral ay ganap na KINALAMAN, at walang personal na impormasyon ang ibabahagi nang walang karagdagang pahintulot mula sa iyo.

Ang mga mananaliksik na nagdidisenyo ng pag-aaral na ito ay maingat na maalis ang anumang nakikilalang pinsala sa iyo, ang kalahok. Gayunpaman, ang ilan sa mga tanong na aking hihilingin ay maaaring maging hindi komportable, nakakagulat, o nakakadismaya. Kaya, kung sumasang-ayon kang sumali sa pag-aaral na ito, mahalaga na malaman mo na maaari kang tumigil sa pagsali sa anumang oras nang walang anumang mga kahihinatnan. Ang mga kawani dito sa kanlungan ay alam ang mga panayam na nagaganap at sumang-ayon na tulungan ka sa kaganapan na ang aming diskusyon ay nagdudulot sa iyo ng pagkabalisaAng mga mananaliksik na nagdidisenyo ng pag-aaral na ito ay maingat na maalis ang anumang nakikilalang pinsala sa iyo, ang kalahok. Gayunpaman, ang ilan sa mga tanong na aking hihilingin ay maaaring maging hindi komportable, nakakagulat, o nakakadismaya. Kaya, kung sumasang-ayon kang sumali sa pag-aaral na ito, mahalaga na malaman mo na maaari kang tumigil sa pagsali sa anumang oras nang walang anumang mga kahihinatnan. Ang mga kawani dito sa kanlungan ay alam ang mga panayam na nagaganap at sumang-ayon na tulungan ka sa kaganapan na ang aming diskusyon ay nagdudulot sa iyo ng pagkabalisa

Sa wakas, bilang isang kalahok sa pag-aaral na ito, mayroon kang karapatan na makatanggap ng impormasyon tungkol sa mga natuklasan ng pananaliksik na ito. Ako, si Ms. Sarah Gross, ay magkakaloob ng mga shelter sa aking pangkalahatang mga konklusyon - pag-iiwan ng mga pangalan at anumang iba pang impormasyon sa pagtukoy. Malugod kang basahin ang dokumentong ito at makipag-ugnay sa akin sa anumang mga tanong na mayroon ka. Ang aking pag-asa ay ang mundo ay maaaring makinabang mula sa impormasyong iyong ibinibigay upang maaari naming ihinto ang mga tagabebelde mula sa pagdadala ng mga tao sa kapaligiran ng trafficking at ang mga ahensya ng tulong at mga pampublikong ahensya ay maaaring maunawaan kung ano ang maaaring makatulong sa isang tao na makakalabas sa kapaligiran na mas mabilis at ligtas.

Kung sumasang-ayon ka na lumahok sa pag-aaral, maaari ka bang lagdaan ang pahina sa ibaba sa iyong unang pangalan at paunang pangalan lamang? (Ex. Sarah G.). Makikita mo ang pangalan ng aking pangalan at ang aking tagapag turo ng guro at impormasyon sa

pakikipag-ugnay sa ibaba ng pahinang ito. Mangyaring makipag-ugnay sa anumang mga katanungan tungkol sa pag-aaral mismo.

Signature:

_____

Sarah Gross, Principal Investigator. Email: sarahgross2010@gmail.com
Elizabeth Quinn, Faculty Mentor. Email: Elizabeth.Quinn@mtsu.edu

APPENDIX C: INTERVIEW INSTRUMENT (ENGLISH)

1) What was your age when you were brought into human trafficking?

2) How were you brought into human trafficking?

3) How long were you in that environment?

4) Did you ever have any interactions with law enforcement while you were under the control of the trafficker? Can you talk about them?

5) Were you the only one that was arrested/detained?

    (a) Yes

    (b) No

    (c) If no, how many were arrested with you?

6) What types of establishments were you taken to while you were trafficked?

    (a) Hotels

    (b) Brothels

    (c) Massage parlors

    (d) Streets

    (e) Other

7) Where were you taken the most (rank order)?

    (a) Hotels

    (b) Brothels

    (c) Massage parlors

    (d) Streets

(e) Other

8) What did you see regarding other people trying to leave?

9) What may that have been told to other victims/survivors about if they decided to escape?

10) Did you try to leave before? What happened?

11) What happened that allowed you to get out this time?

12) Did you have any help from anyone when you left?

Demographic Questions

1) What is your gender?

      (a) Male

      (b) Female

2) What is your age?

3) What is your birthplace?

4) What is your ethnicity?

5) What region of the Philippines do you call home?

6) What is the highest level of education you have completed?

7) What is your parent(s) occupation?

APPENDIX D – INTERVIEW INSTRUMENT (TAGALOG)

1) Ano ang iyong edad noong ikaw ay dinala sa human trafficking?

2) Paano kayo dinala sa trafficking ng tao?

3) Ano ang edad mo ng lumabas ka sa trafficking ng tao?

4) Mayroon ka bang anumang mga pakikipag-ugnayan sa pagpapatupad ng batas habang ikaw ay nasa ilalim ng kontrol ng trafficker? Maaari mo bang pag-usapan ang mga ito?

5) Ikaw ba ay naaresto o pinigil?

 a) Ikaw ba ang tanging isang naaresto / pinigil?

 b) oo

 c) Hindi

 d) Kung hindi, gaano karami ang naaresto sa iyo?

6) Anong mga uri ng mga establisimiyento ang kinuha mo habang ikaw ay trafficked?

 a) Mga Hotel

 b) bahay aliwan

 c) Massage parlors

 d) Mga kalye

 e) Iba pa

7) Saan mo kinuha ang pinaka (ranggo order)?

 a) Mga Hotel

 b) Bahay aliwan

 c) Massage parlors

 d) Mga kalye

e) Iba pa

8) Ano ang nakita mo tungkol sa ibang tao na gustong umalis?

9) Ano ang maaaring sinabi sa iba pang mga biktima / mga nakaligtas tungkol sa kung nagpasya silang makatakas?

10) Sinubukan mo bang umalis? Anong nangyari?

11) Ano ang nangyari na nagpahintulot sa iyo na lumabas sa oras na ito?

12) Mayroon kang anumang tulong mula sa sinuman kapag umalis ka?

13) Anong sa palagay mo ang nakatulong sa iyo na makalabas na maaga sa pangangalakal ng tao ?

14) Mayroong ka bang gustong sabihin tungkol sa iyong karanasan na hindi ku pa naitanong Mga

Demograpikong Tanong:

1) Ano ang iyong kasarian?

    a) Lalake

    b) Babae

2) Ano ang iyong edad?

3) Ano ang lugar ng iyong kapanganakan?

4) Ano ang iyong etniko?

5) Anong rehiyon ng Pilipinas ang tinatawag mong tahanan?

6) Ano ang pinakamataas na edukasyon ang nakumpleto mo?

7) Ano ang trabaho nng iyong mga magulang?

APPENDIX E: IRB APPROVAL NOTICE

IRB
INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD
Office of Research Compliance,
010A Sam Ingram Building,
2269 Middle Tennessee Blvd
Murfreesboro, TN 37129

MIDDLE TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY

IRBN001 - EXPEDITED PROTOCOL APPROVAL NOTICE

Wednesday, September 20, 2017

Principal Investigator	**Sarah Gross** (Student)
Faculty Advisor	Elizabeth Quinn
Co-Investigators	NONE
Investigator Email(s)	*skg2x@mtmail.mtsu.edu; elizabeth.quinn@mtsu.edu*
Department	Criminal Justice Administration
Protocol Title	***Human trafficking in the Philippines: Victim acquisition and exit strategies***
Protocol ID	**18-2018**

Dear Investigator(s),

The above identified research proposal has been reviewed by the MTSU Institutional Review Board (IRB) through the **EXPEDITED** mechanism under 45 CFR 46.110 and 21 CFR 56.110 within the category *(7) Research on individual or group characteristics or behavior* A summary of the IRB action and other particulars in regard to this protocol application is tabulated as shown below:

IRB Action	APPROVED for one year from the date of this notification
Date of expiration	**9/30/2018**
Participant Size	50 (FIFTY)
Participant Pool	Adult residents of the Department of Social Welfare and Development shelters (Philippines) - Potentially vulnerable individuals who may be victims of human trafficking.
Exceptions	1. Permitted to audio tape the participant responses with restrictions. 2. Allowed to compensate the subjects as desribed in the protocol. 3. The proposed non-English informed consent is permitted. 4. The social worker(s) from Philippines is/are permitted assist the investigator with translation and other research-related tasks.
Restrictions	**1. Mandatory informed consent; The PI must provide a signed copy of the informed consent document to each participant.** **2. Voice recordings must be stored, analyzed and destroyed as described in the protocol.** **3. Identifiable information must be destroyed after data analysis.** **4. Data storage, analysis and subsequent post-analysis procedures must be followed in a manner such that the identity of the subjects is protected.**
Comments	NONE

Institutional Review Board   Office of Compliance   Middle Tennessee State University

This protocol can be continued for up to THREE years (9/30/2020) by obtaining a continuation approval prior to 9/1/3018.   Refer to the following schedule to plan your annual project reports and be aware that you may not receive a separate reminder to complete your continuing reviews. Failure in obtaining an approval for continuation will automatically result in cancellation of this protocol. Moreover, the completion of this study MUST be notified to the Office of Compliance by filing a final report in order to close-out the protocol.

Continuing Review Schedule:

Reporting Period	Requisition Deadline	IRB Comments
First year report	8/31/2018	TO BE COMPLETED
Second year report	8/31/2019	TO BE COMPLETED
Final report	8/31/2020	TO BE COMPLETED

Post-approval Protocol Amendments:

Date	Amendment(s)	IRB Comments
NONE	NONE	NONE

The investigator(s) indicated in this notification should read and abide by all of the post-approval conditions imposed with this approval. Refer to the post-approval guidelines posted in the MTSU IRB's website. Any unanticipated harms to participants or adverse events must be reported to the Office of Compliance at (615) 494-8918 within 48 hours of the incident. Amendments to this protocol must be approved by the IRB. Inclusion of new researchers must also be approved by the Office of Compliance before they begin to work on the project.

All of the research-related records, which include signed consent forms, investigator information and other documents related to the study, must be retained by the PI or the faculty advisor (if the PI is a student) at the secure location mentioned in the protocol application. The data storage must be maintained for at least three (3) years after study completion. Subsequently, the researcher may destroy the data in a manner that maintains confidentiality and anonymity. IRB reserves the right to modify, change or cancel the terms of this letter without prior notice. Be advised that IRB also reserves the right to inspect or audit your records if needed.

Sincerely,

Institutional Review Board
Middle Tennessee State University