

INFORMATION TO USERS

This material was produced from a microfilm copy of the original document. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or patterns which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or "target" for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is "Missing Page(s)". If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting thru an image and duplicating adjacent pages to insure you complete continuity.
2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a large round black mark, it is an indication that the photographer suspected that the copy may have moved during exposure and thus cause a blurred image. You will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame.
3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., was part of the material being photographed the photographer followed a definite method in "sectioning" the material. It is customary to begin photoing at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue photoing from left to right in equal sections with a small overlap. If necessary, sectioning is continued again — beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.
4. The majority of users indicate that the textual content is of greatest value, however, a somewhat higher quality reproduction could be made from "photographs" if essential to the understanding of the dissertation. Silver prints of "photographs" may be ordered at additional charge by writing the Order Department, giving the catalog number, title, author and specific pages you wish reproduced.
5. PLEASE NOTE: Some pages may have indistinct print. Filmed as received.

Xerox University Microfilms

300 North Zeeb Road
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106

75-21,513

EDMUNDSON, Louie Jones, 1938-
THEME AND COUNTERTHEME: THE FUNCTION OF CHILD
BALLAD 155, "SIR HUGH, OR THE JEW'S DAUGHTER,"
IN JAMES JOYCE'S ULYSSES.

Middle Tennessee State University, D.A., 1975
Language and Literature, modern

Xerox University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106

© 1975

LOUIE JONES EDMUNDSON

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

THIS DISSERTATION HAS BEEN MICROFILMED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED.

THEME AND COUNTERTHEME: THE FUNCTION OF
CHILD BALLAD 155, "SIR HUGH, OR THE
JEW'S DAUGHTER," IN JAMES JOYCE'S
ULYSSES

Louie J. Edmundson

A dissertation presented to the
Graduate Faculty of Middle Tennessee State University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree Doctor of Arts

May, 1975

THEME AND COUNTERTHEME: THE FUNCTION OF
CHILD BALLAD 155, "SIR HUGH, OR THE
JEW'S DAUGHTER," IN JAMES JOYCE'S
ULYSSES

APPROVED:

Graduate Committee:

William J. Conully, Jr.
Major Professor

David M. Howell
Committee Member

C. Edwin Howard
Committee Member

William W. Holland, Jr.
Committee Member

Wallace R. Staples
Committee Member

William M. Beaseley
Chairman of the Department of English

Robert C. Allen
Dean of the Graduate School

ABSTRACT

THEME AND COUNTERTHEME: THE FUNCTION OF
CHILD BALLAD 155, "SIR HUGH, OR THE
JEW'S DAUGHTER," IN JAMES JOYCE'S
ULYSSES

by Louie J. Edmundson

The purpose of this study is to explore and define in as precise a manner as possible Joyce's motives for the inclusion of the ballad "Little Harry Hughes" in the "Ithaca" episode of Ulysses. This ballad, accompanied in the text of "Ithaca" by its musical notation, is a variant of No. 155 in Francis J. Child's compilation of British traditional ballads. It tells the story, frequently encountered in traditional lore and found in numerous literary analogues, of a Christian child murdered by Jews for ritual or other reasons. The point at which Joyce places "Little Harry Hughes" in Ulysses, the circumstances of its occurrence within the developing action, and the content of the ballad legend itself are such as to indicate that definite structural and thematic relationships exist between the ballad and Ulysses in its entirety.

Five aspects of this relationship are considered basic and necessary to the understanding of Joyce's use of the ballad. The initial problem to be examined is that of the peculiarly abbreviated form of Joyce's variant, which may have been the result of a characteristic Irish evolution or of a deliberate alteration on Joyce's part. In either case, but especially if the latter is true, the form of the ballad has definite and highly significant thematic implications.

The nature of Joyce's awareness of the traditional background and of the historical realities of the Sir Hugh legend type, involving as they do centuries of Christian-Jew animosity, persecution, and reprisals, is the subject of a second portion of the study. Evidence is reviewed which shows that Joyce was not only interested in the periodic outbreaks of the so-called "blood accusation" against the Jews, but that he was actually researching the phenomenon during the period in which he was working on "Ithaca."

The musical component of "Little Harry Hughes," largely overlooked by critics in spite of its being quite emphatically inserted by Joyce into the text, presents a further subject for inquiry. The tonal structure of the ballad music is identified as "mixolydian," a designation which applies to specific modal structures in both the Greek and medieval ecclesiastical musical systems. Reference to the mixolydian is made prior to "Ithaca" in a scene of "Circe" concerned

Louie J. Edmundson

thematically with the problem of completing the metaphorical circle of the octave. Modality in its musical sense is suggested as a factor in the complex concept of Stephen's "ineluctable modality" as it appears in the "Proteus" episode and elsewhere.

The modality theme is taken a step further in the fourth part of the analysis, which deals in part with the cyclical or "modal" pattern of historical recurrence inherent in Giambattista Vico's "ideal universal" history. It is maintained that Vico, a dominant philosophical influence in Finnegans Wake, is, in a possibly more abstract but no less real manner, present in Ulysses. Vico's ideas regarding the origins of poetry and the special qualities of the creations of the first poets are also analyzed as elements contributing to Joyce's interest in the ballad genre.

Finally, "Little Harry Hughes" is considered as part of a "Hugh Motif," general throughout Ulysses, in which is contained most of the thematic substance of the book--the themes of sacrifice and resurrection, of the modes of the individual personality and of historical circularity, and of artistic creation as a function of a static, as opposed to a kinetic, perception of beauty.

It is concluded that Joyce's version of "Sir Hugh, or The Jew's Daughter" has an identifiable function in Ulysses. This function derives from related aspects of the organization

Louie J. Edmundson

and thematic content of the book for which the ballad serves as a point of focus. Bloom and Stephen, if they are ever in any sense united as father and son in Ulysses, are so in the "Ithaca" episode and precisely at the place where Stephen sings the ballad. Equally as significant is the fact that fundamental constituents of Ulysses such as cyclic movement and the reconciliation of antithetical identities are restated in various ways in both text and music of the ballad.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF APPENDICES	iii
 Chapter	
I. ANALOGUES AND SOURCES OF "LITTLE HARRY HUGHES"	1
II. "SIR HUGH" AND THE TRADITIONAL BACKGROUND	47
III. INELUCTABLE MODALITY: "LITTLE HARRY HUGHES" AND THE MUSICAL COMPONENT	84
IV. HISTORY, MYTH, AND THE VICHIAN CONNECTION: AN EXAMINATION OF THE THEMATIC SIGNIFICANCE OF THE "LITTLE HARRY HUGHES" BALLAD IN "ITHACA"	151
VICO AND THE CYCLE OF HISTORY	153
VICO AND MYTH	185
V. THE HUGH MOTIF AND RELATED THEMES IN <u>ULYSSES</u>	207
VI. CONCLUSION	299
 APPENDICES	 312
REFERENCES CITED	317

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX	Page
A. "Sir Hugh, or The Jew's Daughter" (Child No. 155, Variant A)	312
B. "Little Harry Hughes" (Joyce, Ulysses, p. 675)	314
C. Comparative Analysis of Child A and Irish-Type Analogues	315
D. Statistical Summary of Occurrences of Variant Motifs	316

Chapter I

ANALOGUES AND SOURCES OF "LITTLE HARRY HUGHES"

In the course of the discussion of comparative Greek and Hebrew linguistics and culture between Stephen Dedalus and Leopold Bloom in "Ithaca," the penultimate episode of James Joyce's Ulysses, the author has the young man sing "in a modulated voice a strange legend." This "strange legend" concerns one "Little Harry Hughes," who is lured away from his playfellows and murdered by the daughter of a Jew.

Stephen's song is, in fact, an abridged and otherwise altered version of a traditional folk ballad of wide distribution and ancient origins known more generally as "Sir Hugh, or The Jew's Daughter." "Sir Hugh" is number 155 of the three hundred and five popular ballads collected prior to 1893 by the Harvard scholar Francis J. Child and published in his five-volume English and Scottish Popular Ballads. (See texts of ballad in Appendices A and B.)

The ballad was found by Child in twenty-one variant forms in England, Scotland, and--significantly for this project--Ireland, and subsequently many more variants and fragments, a number of them of Irish origin, have been

discovered in the United States, Canada, and elsewhere. One of the earliest and best known appearances of the "Sir Hugh" legend type is that version of the story told by Chaucer's Prioress in The Canterbury Tales.

Much of Ulysses is constructed out of certain recurring motifs which appear and reappear throughout the work. Though a few scholars have noted the presence of "Little Harry Hughes," precise examination of the ballad in terms of its function and meaning in its "Ithacan" and other possible contexts has been cursory at best, and no one seems to have recognized Stephen's song for what it actually is--the climactic and most visible part of a substantial series of "Hugh" and "Hughes" occurrences located throughout Ulysses and making up collectively what may be called a "Hugh motif." In the light of the stringent critical analysis applied to other aspects of the book, this failure of application seems somewhat strange, and all the more so in that the thematic ideas visibly embodied or implicit in "Little Harry Hughes," that is, seduction, ritual murder, blood sacrifice, miraculous revivication, and reunion, are among the most basic and pervasive elements of Ulysses.

Richard E. Madtes, in his 1961 unpublished dissertation analyzing the text of "Ithaca," speculates on the origins of the ballad variant used by Joyce and indicates that further investigation from a folkloristic point of view would be of

value. This suggestion has much to recommend it. Madtes' conclusion relative to the intentions of Joyce in using the ballad--that the murder of Little Harry Hughes introduces an "emasculatation motif" implying the artistic impotence of Stephen as a poet--is unconvincing, however (though a step in the right direction), because it is based on a too immediate and restricted perception of what the ballad is and what it represents in Ulysses.

The critical value of the investigation undertaken in writing this paper lies in what should be an increased understanding of the "Ithaca" episode and of the book as a whole as a result of elucidation of a number of problems associated with the somewhat cryptic appearance of "Little Harry Hughes." These problems serve as the points of departure for the five developmental sections of the study.

One fundamental question is that of where Joyce found the ballad and to what extent, if any, he may have altered it. Here one part of the answer may be derived from a detailed analysis of the history and the textual variants of Child 155 in which are employed statistical and other data which verify the existence of a characteristically Irish form of the ballad by identification of certain typical motifs. A second aspect of this preliminary stage of the analysis has to do with the relationship of the ultimate form of the ballad as it is found in Ulysses with the thematic

content of the work as a whole. The organic quality of the ballad and the ballad idea as actual functional details are of central concern at this point. The general impression generated by close examination of the various features of the ballad is that Joyce drew it from an Irish and continental tradition which he knew well, and then adapted it to his own purposes in Ulysses. This adaptation, moreover, may have involved making certain changes in the form of the original of such a character as to allow him to use the reader's knowledge of this traditional form as a thematic counterpart to his own re-creation of the ballad.

The second problem to be attacked is that of the nature of Joyce's understanding of the traditional background of his "Little Harry Hughes" and the degree to which the tradition of the folk artifact injects itself into the overall thematic development of Ulysses. Since Joyce continued to exhibit an interest in the work of Chaucer, his motives for the choice of this particular ballad may be at least partially explained by looking at the similarities or differences between folk and art versions of the Hugh of Lincoln story type. Primarily, however, emphasis will be given here to various anti-Semitic legends of "blood accusation," concerning charges against Jews of ritual murder of children--a subject Joyce investigated at some length and developed extensively as an important constituent of his Hugh motif.

The folk ballad as a genre is not only story but song as well, a fact of which Joyce pointedly reminds the reader by his inclusion of the musical notation of Stephen's ballad in the text of "Ithaca." What is the actual purpose of this inclusion, and how does it relate to the use of other musical concepts in the book? This question will be examined in the third division of the study, primarily in terms of the meaning of Stephen's ambiguous expression of the "Proteus" episode, "ineluctable modality."

This phrase has been examined from numerous points of view by scholars who, ignoring the obviously intentional ambiguity invested in it, attempt to establish a definition exclusively in terms of one or another philosophical school or system. In the process, the very important musical sense of modality, involving concepts such as circularity, separate but related tonal states, and departure and return within the tonal scale, has been overlooked. Since modality as Joyce uses it is recognized to be a complex rather than a simple idea, no attempt will be made to negate the efforts of those who have already written on the subject. The purpose of the chapter on "ineluctable modality" will be rather to qualify and supplement their analyses by suggesting the existence of a musical component appearing in concrete form in the notation of the "Ithacan" ballad and prior related uses of "mode," "modality," "modulated," and other words of similar meaning.

The fourth part of the analysis of Joyce's use of "Little Harry Hughes" deals with those features of the ballad and its associated pattern of motif repetitions which seem to connect the traditional stories of folk origin, religious themes, and musical concepts such as modality with the theme of history as it appears in Ulysses. The question to be answered at this point is whether the specific presence of the ballad itself and the widely dispersed recurrence of the Hugh motif actually serve any sort of unifying function. It will be maintained that the ballad and the motif do indeed serve to synthesize the various themes and that the proof of such an assumption lies at least in part in the influence in Ulysses of the historical theories of Giambattista Vico.

Joyce is known to have been deeply impressed with the ideas of this eighteenth-century Neapolitan scholar, who attempted to create the outlines of a universal science of history based on the ancient notion of a pattern of cyclically recurring (or "modal") epochs. Since Vico thought of these stages of societal evolution as growing out of and existing analogously to prevailing states of mental or intellectual development in individual members of society, he was also much concerned with the expression of ideas in the language and myth of specific periods as being a necessary adjunct to the understanding of his model of historical progression.

Though the greater part of existing scholarship identifies Vico more clearly with Finnegans Wake, elements of the Vichian philosophy appear again and again in Ulysses. Ultimately, both works must be considered as being "about history," which is to say, about the universal human experience as interpreted from Joyce's conception of Vico's principles. "Ithaca," as the final segment of that part of Ulysses which corresponds to the structure of Homer's Odyssey, is crucial not only with respect to the organization of the book, but also to its philosophical development. "Little Harry Hughes," in the "Sir Hugh" tradition of ritual murder and as a product of a stage of intellectual growth which the Neapolitan would identify with the earliest stages of his circular historical pattern, preceding even that of Homer, provides Joyce with a suitable mechanism for the projection of a view of history clearly influenced if not totally determined by Vico. The ballad as a literary device is centralized and particular, but the Vichian concept is general, as is the Hugh motif. Analysis of the relationship of ballad and motif to historical theme is thus regarded as being a major aspect of this study, and, as the project is conceived, an all-inclusive one.

The fifth and final segment of the analysis is an attempt to define and describe the Hugh motif itself in terms of textual references to Stephen's ballad and to the name "Hugh" or "Hughes." Forms of the motif are identified as

they occur and are evaluated with respect to their thematic implications. With a regularity which bears the clear imprint of premeditation, the appearances of the ballad and the motif involve the themes of parenthood (or "paternity"), modality (implying circularity in the musical absolute or Vichian historical sense) as Stephen's "sundering" and "reconciliation," and what may be called the theme of the victim of history.

In proceeding through an examination of the sources, forms, and associated themes of the "Sir Hugh" analogues of Joyce's ballad, one sees certain thematic ideas appear as common features in a large number of variants from different historical periods and widely scattered geographical points. These include: (a) ritual murder and blood sacrifice, (b) a miracle or the search for a miracle, (c) temporary or lasting reanimation (or in a more explicitly religious context, resurrection), (d) the loss of a son by a parent (with related motif of intent of parent to correct or chastise the lost son for his truancy), (e) the finding of a son by a parent, (f) singing, or "attunement," (g) involvement of a third party in the person of a woman of miraculous or at least heightened powers or attributes, and (h) the destruction or punishment of enemies and evildoers.

The most persuasive evidence of Joyce's sensitivity to these motifs of the Sir Hugh legends is that not only are

they substantially present in the Homeric prototype, the Odyssey, but they are incorporated point for point, in precise, distinct form, into the structural and thematic organization of Ulysses. The Vichian historical hypothesis serves to justify the presence of the ballad as a type of fable or myth; these and similar motif entities provide another kind of rationale, establishing between Ulysses and the Sir Hugh ballad a many-sided correspondence based on specific conceptual details.

The research effort recorded in this paper consists of a detailed examination of James Joyce's use of the folk ballad, "Sir Hugh, or The Jew's Daughter," in the "Ithaca" episode of his book Ulysses. Although the study was conceived as a limited research problem in the field of English, it is also intended for use in actual pedagogical situations.

This study, while focussing on the form and immediate context of "Little Harry Hughes" in "Ithaca," also concerns itself with larger problems of theme and artistic method. It is maintained that the ballad is thematically related to the overall development of the book. Joyce's use of the stream of consciousness technique and of recurring motifs as primary structural elements necessitates a study of the entire work in order to understand fully the use of "Little Harry Hughes." This approach could be profitably used as a model for the reading and study of Ulysses and other works in the classroom setting.

No attempt has been made to demonstrate or justify any special teaching technique, and no systematic effort to quantify data has been carried out, though certain statistical compilations have been created on a purely arithmetic basis for purposes of comparison of numbers of motif recurrences and the like. A more appropriate way to characterize the pedagogical philosophy and intention of the analysis is to describe it in its practical dimension as a representative of a strategy--a flexible strategy of exploiting teaching possibilities inherent in the subject itself.

Though neither technical nor method-oriented, the study is intended to embody what may realistically be called a program for teaching Ulysses as a whole or in part, or perhaps simply for understanding or appreciating the book. This program would call for the critical examination of Ulysses beginning from a fixed point of a high degree of visibility and intelligibility (the "Little Harry Hughes" ballad) which also has the quality of embodying thematic ideas objectified as motifs which extend throughout the entirety of the text.

This characteristic of the subject itself--that of being both localized and widely distributed--is the key to the study. It makes it possible to direct the student's attention to a number of diverse critical problems which demonstrate various kinds of textual ambiguities and at the same time to maintain his awareness of the ultimate coherence and unity of all parts of the work. Joyce's Ulysses is a subject

ideally suited to demonstrate the value of a specific piece of literary art as an intellectual object having both a significant degree of complexity and a strictly controlled and coherent pattern of organization.

A legitimate concern of present-day teachers is that many of their students seem to be rejecting large segments of the traditional curriculum as lacking in relevance and utility. As a result, some fear, quite justifiably, that much of the literature of classical antiquity and of the older native tradition may be lost at a time when cultural knowledge and the sense of historical continuity have already seriously deteriorated. This study brings together a consideration of several literary traditions: classical (the Odyssey), Middle English (The Prioresses Tale), and folk ("Sir Hugh") within the outlines of a modern literary masterpiece--Ulysses. Its subject is a twentieth-century writer's creative synthesis of the genres of the epic, the medieval miracle tale, and an art form popular by definition--the folk ballad--in a literary form readily acceptable to the contemporary reader, thus in a sense proving the usefulness and interest inherent in the older forms and works of literature. While including investigation of origins, subjects, general characteristics, and techniques of the genres within the disciplinary confines of literature, the investigation also entails scrutiny of related practical and theoretical aspects of music, history in terms of both theoretical

notions of recurrence and problems of the social dimension, and esthetics. It is thus intra- and interdisciplinary in its overall intent. In the broadest practical sense, then, the analysis of "Little Harry Hughes" and its motif framework is essentially an explication of Ulysses in terms intended to make the work more accessible to the reader and to enhance its teaching possibilities. This can be really the only justification for such an effort.

The text of Ulysses employed in the study is the 1934 Modern Library edition. Though it was recognized that subsequent editions contain certain textual improvements, this version was chosen because so much of the relevant scholarship is keyed to it. To maintain the closest possible correlation between the commentary and the work itself, all quotations are followed by page and line numbers. Miles L. Hanley's Word Index to James Joyce's Ulysses (Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1953), was most useful in establishing and verifying these numbers. Hanley's numeration is followed throughout except on those pages where "Little Harry Hughes" appears in Joyce's handwriting interposed with the musical notation, in which cases the handwritten lines are counted sequentially with lines of the printed text. Episode titles used are those assigned by Stuart Gilbert in his description of the correspondences between Ulysses and the Odyssey. Definitions of terms not.

specifically footnoted are from Webster's New International Dictionary, 2nd ed. (Springfield, Massachusetts: G. and C. Merriam, 1934).

R. E. Madtes, in his unpublished dissertation, "A Textual and Critical Study of the Ithaca Episode," comments at some length on the presence of the "Little Harry Hughes" ballad in Ulysses, describing it as "almost certainly a new and authentically Irish version of the famous Hugh of Lincoln ballad."¹ Madtes is aware of the resemblance of the ballad to Chaucer's Prioresses Tale but chooses to emphasize in his exegesis its folk character and origin. Having consulted Child's compilation of "Sir Hugh" variants, he is able to identify only one version other than that of Joyce which gives the boy-protagonist the name "Harry Hughes."² This evaluation, apparently not based on a complete perusal of ballad types, is nevertheless essentially correct, though as will be seen, at least one other variant of the "Irish line" contains a very similar tune. Madtes' conclusion with respect to the origin of the ballad is that it is "virtually certain that Joyce was recalling a song he knew by heart from Dublin days."³

¹ Richard Eastman Madtes, "A Textual and Critical Study of the Ithaca Episode of James Joyce's Ulysses," Diss. Columbia University 1961, p. 154.

² See William Wells Newell, Games and Songs of American Children, 2nd ed. (1893; rpt. New York: Dover Publications, 1963), p. 75.

³ Madtes, p. 156.

In summarizing the details of his analysis, Madtes comments on the unique form of Joyce's variant and makes a suggestion regarding its possible thematic intent: "Joyce's version reveals two major innovations: the unusual and probably corrupt six-line initial stanza, found neither in the New York version nor in any other, and the decapitation of little Harry (in all other versions he is stabbed with a penknife). These may have been present in the Irish song as Joyce knew it, or may be attributable to a hazy memory or deliberate alteration (Joyce's 'cut off his little head' perhaps introduces an emasculation motif suggesting Stephen's artistic impotence)."⁴ Madtes' comments raise at least two problems concerning the ballad. If it is indeed a song Joyce "knew by heart from Dublin days," why have none of the ballad researchers, many of whom (Percy, Child, Bronson and others) have made painstaking and extensive efforts to identify and classify as many variants as possible within the total ballad corpus, found no occurrence of a "Little Harry Hughes" variant which more closely resembles that used by Joyce? Secondly, if Joyce did deliberately alter the ballad from a more or less "standard" form with which he was acquainted, what was this form and why were the changes made? The suggestion that certain "corruptions" may have been the result of "hazy memory" seems untenable, since Joyce was

⁴ Ibid.

quite precise in his documentation procedures and in any case had a memory which was anything but lacking in retentiveness and clarity.

Stuart Gilbert also notes the presence of the ballad, which he calls "Hugh of Lincoln." He terms it an "abridged variant," because, he says, "we do not hear of the 'apple red and green' nor of the voice from the 'deep drawwell.'"⁵ Such observations are obviously based on familiarity with some specific form of the ballad (other than Child A, in which the drawwell is "Our Lady's"). Is Gilbert then aware of a deliberate "abridgement" by Joyce from some prototypical variant? If he were knowledgeable of such a variant, it seems that in the interest of scholarship he would have identified it. On the other hand, his designation of specific motifs absent from Joyce's version, especially that of the child's speaking or singing from the well, in its pointedness, seems to imply, if not an acquaintance with, at least some conception of Joyce's possible motives for making such revisions.

Joyce's intentions are somewhat clouded by the fact that though "Little Harry Hughes" appears in the Rosenbach fair copy manuscript, no entry giving a clue as to the ballad's form or purpose is to be found in the notesheets as they

⁵ Stuart Gilbert, James Joyce's "Ulysses": A Study (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1952), p. 362.

exist in the British Museum collection. Bloom's "Kalod balejwaw pnimah/ Nefesch, jehudi, homijah" "anthem" which is "partially chanted," in conjunction with Stephen's song (673.15-16), does appear in the notes.⁶ Thus Madtes may be right in his conjecture that Joyce knew the song by heart, since otherwise he might have put it into his notes as he did Bloom's fragment of Hebrew lyric. Whatever the reason for the absence, it is disappointing, since any kind of an entry might have given some further insight into Joyce's purposes.

But motives stemming from special esthetic requirements notwithstanding, the fact is that Joyce's use of the ballad had itself to grow out of an initial knowledge of some more or less definite form. Though such a precise form has not been found in the course of this study, a grouping of certain characteristics or motifs identified as being of Irish provenance has been made, and from this grouping it is believed that a fairly clear conception of a hypothetical Irish type of the Sir Hugh ballad may be achieved. The value of such an effort, essentially that of assembling a coherent body of Irish materials from which Joyce may have drawn, is seen as lying in an increased understanding of the probable changes made by him with respect to motif and detail, and of

⁶ Phillip Floyd Herring, "A Critical Edition of James Joyce's Notesheets for Ulysses in the British Museum," Diss. University of Texas 1966, p. 454. (See "Ithaca" 14, p. 1.)

the larger thematic purposes which may have prompted him to make these changes.

The likelihood of the existence of a real basis for such a grouping, as opposed to its being merely an artificially or arbitrarily contrived supposition, is enhanced by evidence that an "Irish line" may be identified in the ballad's musical development, as separate from similar English and Scottish "lines."⁷ According to Bertrand Harris Bronson, in his Traditional Tunes of the Child Ballads, "the Scottish tunes recorded in the early nineteenth century seem somewhat apart, as do the English ones of the same time and Irish tunes of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century."⁸ This information is enlightening in two somewhat if not altogether distinct ways. First, the "late nineteenth and early twentieth century" would have been that period during which Joyce would have encountered the ballad and have become interested in it. Secondly, if there occurred at this time a clearly separate evolutionary state in the ballad's musical component, it is most likely that changes, also of a characteristically Irish nature, appeared in its textual composition as well. Such a pattern of changes seems actually to appear as the result of an anatomization of Sir Hugh

⁷ Bertrand Harris Bronson, The Traditional Tunes of the Child Ballads, III (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1959), 72.

⁸ Ibid., p. 73. Underlining is that of the author.

variants, a pattern which seems to have clear implications for thematic developments involving the ballad in Ulysses.

In a review of more than eighty-five variants and fragments, seven ballad versions were isolated as being, for one reason or another, capable of identification with this Irish grouping.⁹ Criteria for inclusion in the group included not only documented information regarding the sources of the ballads, several of which were identified by their collectors as being of Irish origin, but also the presence of Irish detail (such as the substitution of "Boyne Water" for "draw-well" in Child T) and the presence of motif content which conspicuously related to or expanded upon the motif content of the developing "cluster." Additionally, of course, there was the evidence provided by the names "Little Harry Hughes" and "Little Harry Huston" in Child N (Newell's variant) and Bronson 66, respectively. These criteria are obviously by no means categorical, since a great deal of overlapping is present. Thus Child F, designated by the compiler as being "obtained by recitation in Ireland,"¹⁰ is seen to contain the Irish "punishment motif" and the articulate corpse, both

⁹ For details of the analysis of the Irish group, see Appendix C, "Comparative Analysis of Child A and Irish-Type Analogues," p. 315. Also provided for purposes of comparison is a statistical review of the contents of all variants, Attachment B, "Statistical Summary of Variant Motifs," p. 314.

¹⁰ Francis James Child, ed., The English and Scottish Popular Ballads, III, Part I (Boston and New York: Houghton, Mifflin, 1888), 247.

characteristic of the Irish group. The pattern of Irish relationships thus tends to reinforce itself as continued associations emerge.

In the Appendix C referred to above, which gives details of what is being called the "Irish line," Child A is included as a relatively standard form with which Irish versions may be compared or contrasted. Moreover, certain aspects of Child A, which are peculiar to it, are especially interesting as having certain affinities with important thematic conceptions in Ulysses. "Water Birch," an American variant, of which Joyce could have had no direct acquaintance due to circumstances of geography and time,¹¹ is also included because it too has peculiar and seemingly relevant motif content. The nature of this content as well as its relevance will be the subject of subsequent commentary.

Eight motifs which are basic to the content of "Sir Hugh" and which relate in a more or less direct manner to some of Joyce's most visible thematic preoccupations in Ulysses may be extracted from the substance of the "Irish line." These motifs, reflected with one addition in Appendix C, cannot be considered as exhausting the possibilities of the ballad's connection with the novel, but they do, as

¹¹ "Water Birch" was recorded in Littcarr, Kentucky, on December 30, 1955. See Francis C. Stamper and William Hugh Jansen, "Water Birch: An American Variant of Hugh of Lincoln," Journal of American Folklore, 71 (1958), 16-22.

identifiable and objective factors of the Irish cultural or folk awareness of "Sir Hugh," establish in terms rather more specific than general a framework for meaningful inquiry.

Of these motifs, that of the victim's name is probably the most obvious means of establishing kinship among the analogues. A great deal of variation is apparent in this detail, but it is a revealing kind of variation. Of the ballads in this grouping, only one, Child F, gives the boy the name "Sir Hugh." This is important, nevertheless, since it establishes the presence of the name on Irish soil and thus provides an undeniably direct link with the English and Scottish traditions. The "Little Harry Hughes" of Child N, a variant discovered in New York City in 1855 and traced back to its Irish origins,¹² on the other hand, is the only documented version other than that of Joyce which contains this precise name. "Little Harry Huston," in Bronson 66, a late (1953) recovery from County Limerick,¹³ is close enough in form to be recognized as essentially identical. A group of three variants is thus established, related with respect to source and name motif. Furthermore, since neither "Harry Hughes" nor "Harry Huston" appears in any known variant other than these of verifiable Irish origin, it is clear that this particular evolution of the name is an Irish innovation.

¹² See Newell, p. 75, and Bronson, p. 72.

¹³ Bronson, p. 103.

The name "Little Sir William" of Child T is, like "Harry Hughes," quite rare. Its existence in three variants may be a recall of the murder of William of Norwich in 1137, an event which not only preceded that of Hugh of Lincoln but possibly even set the pattern for it. The existence of "Sir William" and "Willie" variants (Child T, Bronson 45 [American]) in the Sir Hugh tradition suggests the possibility of a connection with Mr. Best's allusion in "Scylla and Charybdis" to Oscar Wilde's theory regarding Shakespeare's sonnets: "The most brilliant theory of all is that story of Wilde's, Mr. Best said . . . where he proves that the sonnets were written by a Willie Hughes . . . I mean for Willie Hughes. . ." (196.13-19). Mr. Best's slip of the tongue confusing author and object of inspiration introduces a kind of "gratuitous" parallel to the idea of the effacement of the distinction between father and son inherent in Stephen's Shakespearean hypothesis--a thematic current reaching its crest in the "Ithaca" communion and "Little Harry Hughes" scene.

The "day motif," which, when present, attributes a special character to the day of the incident which is the subject of the ballad, is less definitive than that of the name of the central character. Though it, too, occurs in three of the six textual variants termed Irish, it is not restricted to those ballad forms, but also appears with

relative frequency in non-Irish versions. Even so, there seems to be some justification for assuming that this motif may be a part of the Irish prototype, since the statistical summary indicates that of a total of eighty-five versions from all sources, including Irish ones, only ten describe the day as being special in any way. Obviously, three of six represent a much higher percentage than do ten of eighty.

There is no reason to press this point, however. It is enough to say that Joyce may have been aware of such an element in the ballad. It is, of course, notably absent from his own version, but this does not necessarily mean that he was unacquainted with it. It is, to the contrary, intriguing to assume that he was. What is then perhaps more important for understanding the function of the ballad in Ulysses is the nature of the motif itself. Bronson 66, one of the central Irish group as established by its near-use of the Joycean name-motif, describes the day as "a very fine day,/ The finest day in the year" (ll. 1-2). The Irish-American variant, "Water Birch," is somewhat more explicit with its foreboding "dark and holiday." Finally, Child T, a Lincolnshire recovery, linked, perhaps tenuously but nevertheless distinctly with Ireland with its "Boyne Water" reference, states, in altogether unequivocal terms, "Easter day was a holiday,/ Of all the days in the year" (ll. 1-2).

In the many forms of the ballad the day motif and other details which would impute a special religious or sacramental quality to the day of the events of the story are inconstant--but nonetheless undeniably present. In Ulysses, on the other hand, sacramental and sacrificial images and symbols associated with death and resurrection abound, reappearing and interweaving constantly from the beginning to the end of the book. The development of this imagery and symbolism reaches a culmination in the scene of "Ithaca" enacted in Bloom's kitchen in the pre-dawn hours of Friday, June 17, 1904. It is in this scene that Bloom and Stephen commune with "Epps's massproduct, the creature cocoa" (661.11), and the guest sings to the host "Little Harry Hughes," a ballad which has as its traditional and perhaps its immediate subject ritual death and resurrection.

The violation committed by Sir Hugh or Little Harry, as indicated in the summary attachment, is usually that of propelling (by kicking, knocking, or throwing) a ball into a Jew's garden or through his windows. Such a detail is explicit in three of the six Irish variants and in Child A. A slight variation in the motif as contained in Joyce's ballad and Bronson 60 ("Little Harry Huston") further demonstrates the closeness of these two forms. This variation, which does not appear elsewhere, is that of a repeated offense--two balls "played" or "tipped" over into the Jew's

premises. The implications of this repetition are eminently useful to Joyce because they carry a hint of malicious and mocking contempt of gentile toward Jew and the Jew's silent resentment and revengeful brooding which are inherent in the "nightmare of history" so distasteful to both Stephen and Bloom--or as Bloom says in the Cyclops' den of Barney Kiernan's pub, "Force, hatred, history, all that" (327.12). Stephen expresses something of this overtly in his commentary on his ballad when he has his victim challenge his destiny "once by inadvertence, twice by design" (676.11-12). The intent of the passage is not simply to comment on the course of history, since Stephen may also be talking about himself, but its message is clear.

Though Child's "Little Harry Hughes," the other variant using the same name as that of Joyce, does not have the offense repeated, it seems to come close to it, since a good bit of "knocking" of the ball takes place before Little Harry's first kick sends it through the Jew's windows. These three variants, Joyce's, Child N, and Bronson 66, though already shown to be very closely associated, exhibit yet another common feature having to do with the violation in that all require that it be a matter of the boy's breaking "the jew's (or duke's) window(s) all." Since this difference is evident in no other analogues, it, as the repeated violation, is assumed to be another totally Irish characteristic.

The second principal character of the ballad story is widely depicted in variants from all sources as a "Jew's daughter dressed in green." Irish-type analogues follow this pattern closely, though with some variation. Both American versions localize by eliminating the anti-Semitic implication and replacing it with more thematically natural concepts, Child N keeping its distance with an assonant royal substitution, "the youngest duke's daughter . . . dressed in green," and "Water Birch" with the conventional "lady gay."¹⁴ Bronson's "Little Harry Huston" retains the Jewish content, but in less specific form, presenting "a Jewess . . . all dressed in green." Child T, the "Little Sir William" ballad, offers an interesting variation with "the Jew's wife." This feature seems to afford an ideal bit of parallelism, calling up images of Molly as seductress and exactor of sacrifice, richly ruminating on the futures of her "suitors": Stephen ("I'm sure it'll be grand if I can only get a handsome young poet at my age. . . .") (761.13-14), Boylan ("no that's no way for him he has no manners nor no refinement nor no nothing in his nature slapping us behind like that on my bottom because I didn't

¹⁴ In the case of Child N, it is not immediately obvious where this change may have occurred. Newell states that his respondent, a woman born in New York City of a native Irish mother, claimed that she had learned it from that parent. (See Newell, p. 75.) The alteration may thus have taken place in the ballad's original setting or may have been the result of a reconditioning in the new locality.

call him Hugh the ignoramus that doesn't know poetry from a cabbage. . . .") (761.24-27), and others (but holding all the while in the back of her mind the impulse of the earth-goddess, "I'm always like that in the spring I'd like a new fellow every year. . . .") (745.1-2).

In the Rosenbach manuscript as given by Madtes, there is evidence that Joyce made a minor change in the form of this motif. The first line of the second part of the "legend" appears in the fair copy as "Then came out the jew's daughter" with the word "old" inserted before "jew's" and stricken out,¹⁵ and in the printed text the line occurs with the deletion made. Joyce perhaps felt that the word would somehow interfere with a free association of "jew" and Bloom, "the father of Millicent," in the reading of the ballad and Stephen's commentary on it. Such an association is clearly intended, and "old" would be a slightly inaccurate adjective to describe Bloom, who at thirty-eight is decidedly only middle-aged.¹⁶ The phrase "old Jew" does appear in some Sir Hugh variants, Bronson 10a, which resembles the Irish versions in having the punishment motif well developed with "If my master knew it all/ He'd let my

¹⁵ Madtes, p. 194.

¹⁶ Nevertheless: "I. He. Old. Young" (267.11). And: "Hate. Love. Those are Names. Rudy. Soon I am old" (280.25). In this and subsequent quotations from Ulysses, Joyce's original punctuation and grammar, even where unconventional, including italics, have been preserved.

life's blood fall" (ll. 7-8) as well as reference to the mother's birch switch, and two others, Bronson 53 and Child J, in which no direct resemblance is evident. If Joyce's ballad is a pre-existing Irish form cited from memory, as Madtes suggests, "old" may have been a part of the line originally, but the word is conspicuously absent in other clearly Irish forms.

It was mentioned earlier that Child A was connected with the analysis of Irish variants of Sir Hugh not because it was itself thought to be a product of the Irish tradition, but in part because of certain peculiar thematic qualities possessed by it which seem to have a special kind of agreement with Joyce's use of his own form of the ballad in Ulysses. One of these qualities is a matter of an unnamed but obviously injurious act inflicted upon the boy's father by the Jew's daughter at some equally uncertain time in the past. Thus stanzas 4 and 5:

"Throw down the ba, ye Jew's daughter,
 Throw down the ba to me!"
 "Never a bit," says the Jew's daughter,
 "Till up to me come ye."

"How will I come up? How can I come up?
 How can I come to thee?
 For as ye did to my auld father
 The same ye'll do to me."

(One assumes that the "ye" of Stanza 5, line 3, is singular and specific rather than plural and collective, though there is no compelling reason that this be so. If not, it makes

the murder of the boy something other than an individual act of personal viciousness, opening the perspective of the ballad into the gloomy panorama of collective and persistent enmity between gentile and Jew, oppressor and oppressed, which is recognized by the protagonists of Ulysses and is so repellent to them.) If it is to be taken that this deed done to the father was that of murder, a reasonable conclusion in the light of what happens to the son, Child A embodies in miniature, in remarkably precise lineaments, a situational and dramatic equivalent to "Ithaca" itself.

Stephen spends much of his day speculating on the question of the unity or separateness of the essential natures of Father and Son. In his mind this is no simple matter, but resolves itself into a number of different, if parallel, aspects. On one level, it is a problem with theological and metaphysical connotations, insofar as it concerns the idea of a perfect, unitary, and immaculate godhead and the Logos, or Son, which represents the creative principle of the universe; on another, it relates to an artistic counterpart of maker and created object; on yet another, to the human equivalent of Stephen himself, his consubstantial father Simon, and his "assumed" fathers, the fabulous artificer of the myth and, ultimately, Leopold Bloom. The Shakespeare discussion, though set in the framework of a problem of literary criticism, that of identifying

the author himself with the ghost of the father rather than with the living son in Hamlet, is a development of the theme; and finally, in "Ithaca," the end of Bloom's and Stephen's day, the problem of the unity of Father and Son demands resolution. In Child A, father and son apparently share the same fate, death at the hands of a demonic, if alluring, woman; and the son is miraculously "revived" (though not actually restored to life) to be reunited with his surviving parent, who has been seeking him. In "Ithaca," Bloom and Stephen find themselves together and enact a scene filled with the language and symbolism of the Mass. This ceremony requires the symbolic sacrifice of the Son (and if Arius, the arch-heretic Stephen struggles to contradict, is wrong and the Father and Son are consubstantial, the Father also dies) and has as its end a subsequent reanimation of the sacrificial victim and a mystical union of the two parties. In Stephen's words, where there is a reconciliation, there must first have been a sundering.

Another of the Child A motifs, that of "Our Lady's drawwell," conspicuously suggests itself as susceptible of sharing a role in the Sir Hugh-"Ithaca" parallel. "Our Lady," in Chaucer's tale, "Cristes mooder sweete" (l. 656), and "Blisful Mayden free" (l. 664), takes pity on the bereaved mother and brings about a miraculous and joyful reunion of parent and son. Molly Bloom, as a presence in

"Ithaca," though anything but virginal, performs the same function. She is the possessor of the proffered melons of the invitation of Stephen's dream; Stephen, as it is proposed, will teach her proper Italian pronunciation and she will, concomitantly, "inaugurate a course of vocal instruction" (680.22-23) for him. The background of the action is ironic, however. Molly is not the Virgin, nor is cocoa the sacrificial blood. Stephen departs, and it is by no means clear that a meeting of the minds has actually taken place.

"Our Lady" appears in no variant of the ballad other than Child A, though many, including all the Irish versions but that of Joyce, contain references to "little," "deep," or "cold" drawwells or other watery hiding places for the body of the slain child. The "Saint Simon's well" of Bronson 66, the "Little Harry Huston" ballad, is reminiscent of the martyrdom of Simon of Trent, a case of ritual murder similar to that of Hugh of Lincoln. "Boyne Water" in the Lincolnshire variant, Child T, replaces the drawwell motif altogether. This feature, indicative of some measure of Irish influence, is the primary reason for inclusion of the ballad in the Irish group. "Water Birch" retains the well, though assigning it no special qualities other than rather forbidding "cold and deep" waters. The complete absence of the drawwell in "Little Harry Hughes" is unusual in complete versions of the ballad and suggests that Joyce

may have, to use Stuart Gilbert's term, "abridged" it for a particular purpose.

Though quite strong in the general body of the ballad's variant forms, a relatively minor motif in the "Irish line" is that of the tempting objects used by the seductress to entice her prospective victim into her house. The most common of these are apples, both "red and green" (Child A), cherries, many times described with the lurid foreshadowing of phrases such as "red as blood," and gold and silver objects calculated to appeal to greed. The hues red and green seem to have more vitality and importance in the overall tradition than do the colored things themselves. Though neither colors nor objects are present in "Little Harry Hughes," Joyce, student of Chaucer, could not have failed to be knowledgeable of the Prioresses metaphors describing her murdered clergeon: "This gemme of chastite, this emeraude,/ And eek of martirdom the ruby bright. . ." (ll. 609-10). Hues of both emerald and ruby are prominently displayed in the central scene of "Ithaca," in the explicitly named green of the dress of the Jew's daughter, seen in Bloom's imagination "with wonder," and the implied red of the blood of the immolated victim. A reader with a tendency to interpret symbolically should find a happy hunting ground in the red-green identifications to be made in both ballad and novel, recognizing the green of witches'

garb, of Ireland,¹⁷ of living things growing from the earth, and the red of Eve's fruit, which "brought death into the world, and all our woe," the blood of birth, death, and sacrifice, the sacramental wine, and perhaps many more. One remembers the alternating diamond and ruby buttons of Rudy's suit at the end of "Circe," among many other such details. But even without going through a laborious process of symbol hunting, one senses that the colors red and green as they appear in both the ballad and its general context were intended by Joyce to suggest simultaneously numerous related features of symbolic content.

One of the particular qualities common to members of the Irish group is a motif having to do with the boy's expressed fear of punishment for entering the Jew's compound or the mother's intent to punish her son for not returning home at the expected time. Though this is a fairly common aspect of many variants, Irish or otherwise, being found in some twenty of the versions examined (five of six of the Irish), its explicitness and its virtually inevitable presence in the Irish ballads seem worthy of note. Moreover, as is the case with most of the other motifs analyzed, this one can be construed as being intimately involved with the

¹⁷ W. Y. Tindall, A Reader's Guide to James Joyce (New York: Noonday Press, 1959), p. 229. Tindall sees in the green clad Jew's daughter a reference to Milly, Bloom's daughter, and to the Irish church.

themes which surface in "Ithaca." Though the interpretations generated in dealing with certain other of the motifs may seem rather problematical, depending as they may on external circumstances such as Joyce's knowledge of Chaucer or other actual or assumed conditions, this one is, at base, inherently more credible, since Joyce's ballad itself contains the motif, or more properly, the first half of it.

In Bronson 66, "Little Harry Huston," of which the two pertinent stanzas are unfortunately fragmentary, the child at first refuses the Jewess' invitation to come to her, in a speech implying his mother's disapproval and the likelihood of an ensuing castigation:

I'll not go back, and I won't go back
And I'll not go back at all, all,
For if my mother came to know
She would. . . .
(Stanza 4, incomplete)

In Child N, Little Harry will not return to the Duke's house after breaking the windows, because, he says:

. . . If my mother should come in,
She'd make it the bloody ball. . . .
(ll. 15-16)

Later in the ballad, a further development of the punishment theme is introduced, if not fully developed, as the mother is depicted as having missed her son at nightfall and as walking "up and down the street,/ With a little sally rod in her hand. . ." (ll. 45-46). If the mother is intent on whipping her son for what she supposes to be his truancy,

such an intention is decidedly muted, however. Rather than being emphasized in the subsequent stanzas, this feature is completely ignored in the portrayal of the reality of the mother's loss and God's (not the Virgin's) assistance in the search for her lost son.

Child F, which contains no reference to any kind of offense or intrusion on the part of the ball-playing school-boys and thus makes the scene one purely of seduction rather than revenge, has its "Sir Hugh" refuse to approach the wall of the Jew's compound with no mention of any punishment which might ensue. "I will not (come)," he says to the Jew's daughter, "without my playfellows too" (l. 8). In a later stanza, however, the mother expresses overtly her resolve to chastise her son for his failure to return home at the proper time:

She put her mantle about her head,
 Tuk a little rod in her han
 An she says, "Sir Hugh, if I fin you here,
 I will bate you for stayin so long."
 (Stanza 8)

This motif of the mother's intended punishment of her son takes an even more extreme form in the American "Water Birch." This ballad, which, according to Stamper and Jansen, is "obviously Child 155 and, in certain passages, remarkably close in wording and details to two versions

that Child identifies as Irish,"¹⁸ turns the story in a radically different direction. In this instance, that which seems in a sense anomalous and foreign is, however, not only possible but even logical and necessary in terms of what is felt most basically to be the impelling psychological thrust and force of the legend. The outline of the "Water Birch" version of the story is given as follows: "A little boy is called away from a ball game by his mother, with whom he apparently does not live. Knowing her evil intentions (and temper?), he goes reluctantly. She murders her son and disposes of the body in a well in an attempt to protect herself and her reputation. Scheming further to protect herself, she pretends to seek angrily for her overdue son, and is confounded when his corpse miraculously speaks and predicts her damnation."¹⁹

Seven variants among those examined have the murderess call the boy "son" or "son Hugh," but in all instances it is apparent that the word is used as a means of ironic endearment or cajolery rather than to signify kinship.²⁰ The "Water Birch" balladeer obviously took the term in a

¹⁸ Stamper and Jansen, p. 17. The two versions are F and N. Somewhat later these writers comment that their variant "is noteworthy conservative of motifs, diction, and rhymes from older forms, probably being closest to Child's Irish originating versions and Sharp C among the American versions" (p. 21). "Sharp C" is Bronson 21, a form using the name "Little Son Hugh" and emphasizing strongly the punishment motif.

¹⁹ Ibid., p. 17.

²⁰ Ibid., pp. 17-18.

different sense and created a new form of the ballad from his unorthodox interpretation.²¹ The absence of the Jewish element, which may also have been a factor in the re-creation, seems to indicate that the ballad, in spite of the likelihood of its Irish origin, underwent the drastic changes in its form in its Kentucky cultural milieu. The chance that Joyce may have encountered such a form is surely remote and such a probability is in no way suggested. However, the details of the parent's luring her child into a secret place, murdering him, and proceeding through the ritualistic acts encountered in the more conventional variants are significant. They cannot but recall, as do aspects of the other variants, Bloom's smoothly spoken invitation to what Stephen describes as "a strange habitation . . . a secret infidel apartment" (676.17), and the symbolically sacrificial murder of the communion in which Molly as earthmother (demanding victims in her upstairs bedroom) in her own way participates as much as does Bloom himself.

On the other hand, Child's S variant, described as of Kentish origin and as "written down" in April, 1891,²² may well have been known by Joyce and is perhaps the most

²¹ This is not to suggest, however, that the European originals do not contain the seeds of the "mother as murderer" concept, a fact which should be apparent from the presence of the punishment motif.

²² Child, IV, Part II, 497-98.

interesting of the old-world versions encountered (in some ways more so than Bronson's Irish "Little Harry Huston") because of its unique development of some of the ballad's motif content. The antagonist of this version is not "Jewess" but "Jew/ All clothed in green" (ll. 3-4), and though the enticements are the conventional apple, ring, and cherry, the enticer is referred to consistently and with frequent repetition as "he." Stanza 3, which gives the "sweet little boy's" initial response to the Jew's invitation, is even more striking in its references to a brutal mother and to a father with decidedly murderous propensities: "I won't come hither, I shan't come hither,/ Without my schoolfellows all;/ My mother would beat me, my father would kill me/ and Cause my blood to pour." The ballad tradition, then, is seen not to restrict itself exclusively to the figure of the threatening or deadly female, but to include as well, at least in this one instance, a male character performing the same function, and in as overtly bloody a fashion as Joyce could have desired for the development of his functional symbolism.

There is even a hint of this chastisement motif in Ulysses prior to its implied emergence with "Little Harry Hughes." Several lines in "Eumaeus" are devoted to Bloom's mild sermonizing of Stephen on the evils of the dissipated life (598.32ff) and improper companions (604.32ff). Though

the tone of this is much too bland to be considered punishment, Bloom, in the role of parent-surrogate, is clearly going about his self-assumed business of correcting his newly-found wayward son.

Joyce's ballad is unusual among members of the Irish group in deleting any reference to the mother. Little Harry expresses not fear of mother's, but of "master's" retribution. The "master" probably signifies "schoolmaster" since the boys themselves are described in the first line and later named by Little Harry as "schoolfellows," (all of which seems more than casually related to the character of the persona of Chaucer's tale, "A litel clergeon, seven yeer of age,/ That day by day to scole was his wone . . .") [ll. 503-4] and "his felawe" [l. 535] who taught him his "Alma Redemptoris"), but the general impression transmitted is only of a vague and rather non-functional figure.

Another notable, and related, absence, one of those mentioned by Gilbert Stuart, is the motif of the boy's singing or speaking from the drawwell, river, pit, or other place where his body has been hidden. This is a departure which in a way is almost as drastic as that of the "Water Birch" reconstitution, and is especially obvious, since Joyce's is the only ballad variant of those classified as Irish in which the motif does not occur. As Stephen sings the ballad, the story ends definitively and unequivocally

with the murder. His version has no drawwell because its murder has no aftermath. The last two words Stephen sings --"the dead"--ring dully and familiarly on the ear. The boy's mother does not enter the ballad action; there is thus no search, no threat of punishment, and no reunion. In his commentary, Stephen observes that the "predestined" victim's catastrophe comes upon him "when he is abandoned" (676.14), and it seems that he may be referring either to his ballad-protagonist or to himself as he must have found himself at the Westland Row terminus (604.12). While the Irish tradition of Sir Hugh calls for reunion, reconciliation, or at least retribution, as well as sundering, Joyce in his ballad precludes all by his drastic abridgement of its content.

A number of formal differences, of varying degrees of potential thematic importance, have been observed to exist between "Little Harry Hughes" and Chaucer's Prioresses Tale. Others, upon which no comment has been made, may be equally as obvious, or more so. Fundamentally, however, the two versions of the legend of a Christian boy murdered by Jews exhibit a kind of similarity of form which is at least as important to the artistic realization of the works in which they are a part as are even major divergencies of narrative detail and motif substance which may be apparent in them.

W. Y. Tindall, in searching for a possible significance in Joyce's use of the ballad, seems to recognize in it

primarily its relationship with a Chaucerian background. "Stephen's Chaucerian song," he says, "may function in the parody of the mass,"²² thus defining the ballad in terms of whatever connection it may have with Chaucer's story. John O. Lyons, writing in a more general vein and dealing with a different, though not by any means irrelevant, critical problem, characterizes Joyce's use of Chaucer as "more than casual."²³ As proof he offers the existence of Joyce's 1912 essay for his University of Padua degree, "The Good Parson of Chaucer," Joyce's critical view of the prudery of English letters which he regarded as a falling off from Chaucer's time, and obvious parallels between certain of Chaucer's and Joyce's characters such as Dame Alis and Molly Bloom.²⁴

Lyons sees resemblances between the boy of Joyce's story "Araby" and that of The Prioresses Tale. He notes that Chaucer's boy is a fatherless orphan, while the boy of "Araby" lives with an aunt and uncle; that Chaucer's boy attends "a litel schole of cristen folk," while Joyce's pursues his studies at a Christian Brothers' school; that the "clergeon" sings Latin prayers without understanding but with devotion, and Joyce's protagonist, as he is

²² W. Y. Tindall, Guide to James Joyce, p. 229.

²³ John O. Lyons, "James Joyce and Chaucer's Prioress," ELN, 2 (1964-65), 127-32.

²⁴ Ibid., p. 127.

described in the story, "Loves more than he understands."²⁵ Such parallelism does, in fact, seem more than incidental. Moreover, it appears capable of being extended to apply to the character of Stephen, as he appears in either Portrait of the Artist or Ulysses. Stephen's condition, as depicted in either of these works, resembles that of the Chaucerian protagonist. He, too, is an orphan, though isolated to an even more profound and agonizing extent by having witnessed with unbent knee the death of his mother, rejected his ineffectual and improvident father, and with his intractable non serviam cut himself off from church and country. Stephen, in addition, is a university scholar, a fact which provides the second element of the parallel. Finally, in his novitiate as an adorer of the beauty perceived in the encounter with the girl on the beach at the end of Chapter IV of Portrait, he is a kinetic poet searching for stasis in art, hence, "loving better than he understands."²⁶

Prominent in Lyons' comparison of "Araby" and The Prioresses Tale is the idea of song and the child's singing,

²⁵ Ibid., p. 128.

²⁶ It is this "kinetic" quality in Stephen that is recognized by Professor MacHugh in the "Aeolus" episode, when he tells him, "You remind me of Antisthenes. . . . It is said of him that none could tell if he were bitterer against others or against himself" (147.5-7).

which, it is observed, "recurs as a knell"²⁷ in Chaucer's story. The Prioress begins by calling her story a song and then in the tale itself the words song and singing occur twenty-four times in two hundred and two verses. Chaucer also uses the idea of the song issuing from the boy's heart and throat, even though his throat is slit, as he tells the abbot, "unto my nekke boon" (l. 649). Toward the end of The Prioresses Tale, however, human images of singing, heart, and blood, symbolic of mortality, are replaced by gem-imagery symbolizing the immortal.²⁸ Thus when the mother finds her child singing in the pit where he has been thrown, he is described as "emerald" and "ruby." In "Araby" a similar movement of the imagery, away from blood and song to hard precious objects, is apparent.

Lyons is thus able to identify a parallel development of the imagery and, by extension, the symbolic substructures of the two works, and once again, as with the descriptive traits of the boys of the stories, the analogy may be extended to Stephen and Ulysses. As has been seen, Stephen, the sacrificial son of the "Ithacan" communion, sings, but the victim of his song, of whose death the physical circumstances are too irrevocably that of a "sundering," does not. The ironic import of this is all too evident. Stephen, kinetic poet, who in appearance has found a "father" in his

²⁷ Ibid., p. 129. ²⁸ Ibid., p. 132.

host, sings of a fatherless child murdered by an implacable embodiment of a malign destiny. Is his song thus an expression of his own intuition of the meaning of his meeting with Bloom? The line of the ballad "And cut off his little head . . ." does indeed seem to imply, in Madtes' phrase, "an emasculation motif suggesting Stephen's artistic impotence."²⁹ The alternative is to infer that, paradoxically, the object of Stephen's quest in Ulysses, the poetic achievement of the entelechy--the Aristotelian union of form and matter which is the realization of idea in the world--literally depends upon the "unresisting," "consenting," self-sacrificial abandonment of the poetic spirit to the "immolation" of the body, which is to say, union or fusion with it. Such an interpretation would require that the poet, in the manner of Chaucer's boy-martyr, be reconciled with a fate which demands the catastrophic encounter of spirit and flesh, and thus requires, as it were, that he sing with his throat cut. If Stephen associates himself with the Little Harry Hughes of his "chanted legend," this must be the real point of his commentary which follows the song. Though the term "entelechy" does not appear in the book until the library episode, the concept surfaces much earlier. In the "Proteus" episode, the manifestation of form in things is one of the most easily recognized of

²⁹ Madtes, p. 156.

Stephen's philosophical cruxes, and his preoccupation with the problem follows him throughout the day to "Ithaca."

If any resolution of the problems posed in "Proteus" occurs in Ulysses, it may well be found in Stephen's exegesis of his ballad, though the ironic fabric of "Ithaca" precludes absolute answers of any sort. Nothing is affirmed by the text of the episode, in which opposite alternatives are set against one another in ironic contrast. No judgment is executed; each assertion meets its opposite approaching from a contrary direction, and as though to emphasize this neutral or self-cancelling quality, all the action of the episode is framed by a style which itself dramatizes the absence of subjective judgment on the part of the writer. Joyce himself declared that in "Ithaca" everything was intended to be known "in the boldest and coldest way."³⁰

Stamper and Jansen speak of their "Water Birch" variant as "coldly objective"³¹ in its portrayal of the pathos of the Sir Hugh story. Such objectivity is recognized, with a degree of the sensational in content (involving violence, murder, seduction, etc.) as being a common characteristic of the ballad genre. The effect of such a linking of

³⁰ James Joyce, Letters of James Joyce, I, ed. Stuart Gilbert (New York: Viking Press, 1957), pp. 159-60 (to Frank Budgen, February, 1921).

³¹ Stamper and Jansen, p. 18.

high-pitched emotion content with cold objectivity is often a profound one of muted tragedy. Certainly Stephen's rendition of "Little Harry Hughes" is notable for the impersonality of the tone with which it projects the grim ruefulness of its content--an indication that Joyce was in a precise manner aware of what he was up to. But beyond this there is the development of "Ithaca" itself as a part of the larger entity which is the complete book.

Lyons notes the movement of the imagery of The Prioresses Tale from the human to the hard and gemlike. Stamper and Jansen identify a like hardness in the objectivity of the ballad style. Equally apparent in "Ithaca," in which both The Prioresses Tale and the Irish-American ballad variant (as well as all other Irish analogues and the ballad story in general) are in a sense focussed in the occurrence of "Little Harry Hughes," is emotion-rousing content and a neutralizing coldness of style. In this episode the frustrated humanity and the pathetic loneliness of Bloom encounter Stephen's intellectuality and equally pathetic isolation in his state of aspiring artist. As the seemingly inevitable end of the action of Ulysses, this is a matter of great significance. But what is equally important is that the description of the meeting is done in a stylistic medium that Joyce himself called the "dry rocks" of "Ithaca,"³²

³² Joyce, Letters, I, p. 172 (to Harriet Shaw Weaver, 7 October 1921).

so extreme an objectification of all aspects of human existence that it seems to constitute a kind of ultimate assault on the concept of the personality as a human or subjective entity.

Ultimately, then, "Little Harry Hughes" is to be recognized as a device which both embodies and typifies the peculiar combination of content and form which Joyce was seeking in Ulysses. The ballad, with its definitive textual "sundering" of parent and child and the equivocal "reconciliation" derived not from its immediate form but from the traditional background, is itself a kind of concrete restatement of Stephen's search for the entelechy and for the father-son quests of both Stephen and Bloom. Finally, Joyce, following in the track of Homer, his Ulyssean predecessor, must have seen in the bare objectivity of the ballad style a quality inherent in the nature of the epic. A narrative related impersonally and without moralization or thematic bias, "Little Harry Hughes" possesses an essential feature of Joyce's non-assertive esthetic as it is illustrated in the overall development of Ulysses.

Chapter II

"SIR HUGH" AND THE TRADITIONAL BACKGROUND

In the Reliques of Ancient English Poetry, Thomas Percy, in his headnotes to what he labels "The Jew's Daughter, a Scottish Ballad," states that the tradition on which the ballad is founded, "that the Jews use human blood in their preparation of the Passover, and are in the habit of kidnapping and butchering Christian children for that purpose," is of widespread and very ancient origin.¹ The considerable body of historical and literary scholarship which has grown up around the subject both before and after Percy's time proves the truth of his assertion. Much of this scholarship revolves about the problem of the origin of Chaucer's Prioresses Tale as well as around that of the traditional background of the related Sir Hugh ballad and its variant forms. Jewish writers have expressed interest in the matter, and provide the term "blood accusation" to identify the charge of ritual murder which has been made sporadically against the Jews for a period of hundreds of years. Though Percy himself refers to one occasion of the

¹ Thomas Percy, Reliques of Ancient English Poetry, facsimile ed. (1886; rpt. New York: Dover Publications, 1966), I, 56.

murder of a Christian child by Jews as early as 419 in a city called Inmestar, in Syria,² he goes on to say (and his statement is verified by a Jewish source)³ that the earliest case in Europe in which Jews were actually accused of killing a Christian child for ritual purposes was that of St. William of Norwich, this murder being supposed to have happened during the Easter period in 1144.

Percy quotes this account from the Peterborough Chronicle:

Now we will say something of what happened in King Stephen's time. In his time the Jews of Norwich bought a Christian child before Easter, and tortured him with all the same torturing that our Lord was tortured. And on Good Friday (lang fridaei) they hanged him on a cross, for our Lord's love; and afterwards buried him. They thought (wendan) that it should be concealed, but our Lord showed that he was a holy martyr (m̃r), and the monks took him and buried him solemnly in the monastery (minst). And he maketh through our Lord wonderful and manifold miracles. And he was called Saint William.⁴

On this occasion, as the story goes, a Jewish convert, one Theobald of Cambridge, came forward with the information that it was customary among European Jews to cast lots each year in order to determine where an annual sacrifice of a Christian child should occur.⁵ Many times such information

² Ibid.

³ "Blood Accusation," The Jewish Encyclopedia (New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1911). Hereafter cited as JE.

⁴ Percy, p. 56.

⁵ "Blood Accusation," JE.

was elicited in the form of "confessions" which usually involved coercion and physical torture, and though their unreliability was obvious, these confessions have historically apparently had enough acceptance among certain elements of the Christian population to encourage and abet continued outbreaks of the "blood accusation."

In addition to the case of St. William of Norwich, Montague Summers, in his History of Witchcraft and Demonology, mentions a number of other similar cases, in England and elsewhere, to include those of Harold of Gloucester (1168), Robert of Bury St. Edmunds (1181), "St. Rudolph of Berne" (1294) and St. Simon of Trent (1473).⁶ The incident involving Hugh of Lincoln, referred to by Chaucer as happening "but a litel while ago," is recorded as taking place in 1255.

Details of the accounts of certain of these boy-martyrs are of interest to students of Ulysses because they suggest Joyce's handling of the climactic coming-together of his two heroes. Rudolph of Bern (a victim whose name Bloom's dead Rudy bears) was reputed to have been killed by the Jews at Bern about Easter in 1294.⁷ (Though called "St. Rudolph" by

⁶ Montague Summers, A History of Witchcraft and Demonology (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1926), p. 162. Other sources give this date as 1475.

⁷ F. G. Holweck, A Biographical Dictionary of the Saints (1924; rpt. Detroit: Gale Research, 1969), p. 870.

Summers and venerated in the "Leutkirche" at Bern, Rudolph was never declared a martyr by the Church and his cult was never approved.)⁸ Simon of Trent, whose case is very similar, was supposed to have been tortured and killed at the age of two years and five months by Jews intent on ritual purposes on Maundy Thursday, 23 March 1475. The accusers apparently maintained that blood was extracted from the body of Simon for use in preparations for the Passover feast and, as usual, confessions were educed--under torture.⁹ After some "revision" the results of the trial of the malefactors were approved by Pope Sixtus IV on June 20, 1478.¹⁰ The nine-year-old Hugh of Lincoln (also referred to as Saint Hugh) was said to have been beaten, crowned with thorns, and crucified on July 27, 1235. The body, found in a well, was brought inside the cathedral and buried in a place of honor beside that of Bishop Grossteste.¹¹ As will be seen in the description of the accounts to follow, a number of Jews were accused of the crime and dispatched. Rather ironically, there happens to be another "Saint Hugh of Lincoln," approximately contemporaneous with the boy martyr. This "Saint Hugh," a Carthusian monk who by one report lived from 1140 to 1200,

⁸ Ibid. ⁹ "Blood Accusation," JE.

¹⁰ Holweck, p. 919. ¹¹ Ibid., p. 494.

became Bishop of Lincoln in 1186 and achieved great renown for the charities and protection he extended to disfranchised and oppressed groups such as lepers, children, and especially the Jews. Apparently many of the conditions he strove to alleviate grew out of policies and actions of the English monarchy itself since he is described as having "won the affection and respect of Henry II, Richard I, and John, even when he opposed and rebuked them."¹²

Though the ritual murder accusation may thus be seen to have surfaced frequently in the period of the late middle ages, such occurrences, as has already been briefly indicated, are by no means limited to that period of time. Percy was able to find an example as early as the fifth century, and literally dozens of instances have been cited after the twelfth and thirteenth centuries up to the twentieth. In more recent times central and eastern Europe have been the site of the majority of such events reported. Cases are documented as late as 1882 at Tisza-Eszlar in Hungary,¹³ 1893 at Prague, 1899-1900 at Polna and Nachod, Bulgaria, and at various other places in the Empire,

¹² David Hugh Farmer, "St. Hugh of Lincoln," New Catholic Encyclopedia, 1967. The dates of the birth, accession, and death of Bishop Hugh of Lincoln vary with the sources consulted. K. E. Conway, in her Handbook of Christian Symbols and Stories of the Saints (1886; rpt. Detroit: Gale Research, 1971), claims that the saint came to England in 1126 and died November 17, 1189.

¹³ "Blood Accusation," The Universal Jewish Encyclopedia (New York: The Universal Jewish Encyclopedia, Inc., 1940). Hereafter cited as UJE.

Germany, Russia, and other countries. The topic of ritual murder or blood accusation was thus not only quite prominent in the literature and legend of the Church, which Joyce knew well, but was current in the environment in which he lived and worked for many years. His use of this topic in "Ithaca" shows that he saw its potential for embodying a number of the esthetic and philosophical principles of Ulysses.

The murder of Hugh of Lincoln captured the imagination of a great many people and obviously contributed in a general way to the evolution of the Sir Hugh ballad, while Chaucer, in writing The Prioresses Tale, was aware of it as a verifiable historical event, whether or not he used it as the actual prototype of his story. Details, many of them having the ring of historicity and others obviously more in the realm of belief, are not lacking to describe the crime and many of the circumstances surrounding it. Francis J. Child quotes at length from a number of reports which relate to the incident. From the Annals of Waverly "under the year 1255, by a contemporary writer," Child gives us this narrative:

A boy in Lincoln named Hugh, was crucified by the Jews in contempt of Christ, with various preliminary tortures. To conceal the act from Christians, the body, when taken from the cross, was thrown into a running stream; but the water would not endure the wrong done its maker, and immediately ejected it upon the dry land. The body was then

buried in the earth, but was found above ground the next day. The guilty parties were now very much frightened and quite at their wit's end; as a last resort they threw the corpse into a drinking well. Thereupon the whole place was filled with so brilliant a light and so sweet an odor that it was clear to everybody that there must be something holy and prodigious in the well. The body was seen floating on the water, and, upon its being drawn up, the hands and feet were found to be pierced, the head had, as it were, a crown of bloody points, and there were various other wounds: from all of which it was plain that this was the work of the abominable Jews. A blind woman, touching the bier on which the blessed martyr's corpse was carrying (sic) to the church, received her sight, and many other miracles followed. Eighteen Jews, convicted of the crime, and confessing it with their own mouth, were hanged.¹⁴

Quoting Matthew Paris, another contemporary (and by no means objective) chronicler, Child provides additional information of the historical circumstances of the disposition of the accused murderers. He remarks that Sir John Lexington, a priest of the Cathedral, having carried out a preliminary investigation, made an arrangement with a Jew into whose house the child was seen to go--a man named Copin, or as in other accounts, Jopin--to spare his life if he would identify the perpetrators of the crime. Shortly after Copin, "encouraged and urged" by Sir John, had fulfilled the terms of his part of the agreement, King Henry himself arrived in Lincoln, and being displeased with Sir

¹⁴ Francis James Child, The English and Scottish Popular Ballads, III, Part II (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1882-1889), 235.

John's handling of the affair, ordered Copin and eighteen other of the richer and more considerable Jews of Lincoln hanged. This sentence was carried out on St. Clement's day, while seventy-one other Jews were imprisoned in the Tower of London to face a like fate. These, however, were fortunate enough to escape, either "by the use of money or by the intercession of the Franciscans, or both."¹⁵

The report given in the Annals of Burton, which Child says is perhaps contemporary with the event though most of the manuscript is from the next century, though as the other chronicles strongly biased against the Jews, adds further intelligence which is subject to differing interpretations. The Burton chronicler indicates that it was the Dominicans rather than the Franciscans who made efforts to save the lives of the Jews, but asserts that they were bribed "as some thought" and on the whole "lost favor" by their attempt. He goes on to add that Richard of Cornwall, the brother of Henry III, had been promised actual physical possession of all the Jews of England by the King as security for a loan, and "stimulated also by a huge bribe," acted to stay further executions.¹⁶ Such considerations may have indeed entered the picture. Jewish accounts stress the use of "blood accusation" to extort money from

¹⁵ Child, p. 236, and "Blood Accusation," JE.

¹⁶ Child, pp. 236-37.

Jews by playing on the superstitions and prejudice of the Christian populace. Percy is quite unconditional in his interpretation of the matter, adding further additional documentation to the effect that the King, "being often in want of money" and especially so in the light of the unexpected arrival in the country of Eleanor of Castile, his son Edward's new wife, used the accusation to improve the condition of his deficient treasury.¹⁷

Though Child finds it strange that he should do so,¹⁸ Chaucer seems prudent as well as knowledgeable in setting his Prioresses Tale in "a grete city of Ayse" as he describes its "Jewerye" as being "Sustened by a lord of that contree/ For foule usure and lucre of vileynye" (ll. 3-4).¹⁹ Mr. Deasy, Joyce's "Nestor," tells Stephen that Ireland never persecuted the Jews, "because she never let them in" (37.11); but the more cosmopolitan English did both, as illustrated by the Hugh of Lincoln incident--using the Jews' own prosperity against them and thus confirming their place beside the Irish as victims of history.

In all, some eighty to ninety variant forms of the Sir Hugh ballad have been identified. In these variants certain broad themes persist: seduction, murder with overtones of

¹⁷ Percy, p. 56. ¹⁸ Child, p. 239.

¹⁹ See The Prioresses Tale in F. N. Robinson, ed., The Works of Geoffrey Chaucer, 2nd ed. (1933; rpt. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1957), pp. 161-64.

ritual, and some manner of miraculous resuscitation or revivification being highly visible if not primary among them all. Though in its broad outline the story told by these variants is the same, significant differences do occur, generated by differences of geographical and chronological provenance, rationalization, and other such factors which influence the evolution of folk literature. A generalized summary of the ballad story, encompassing as a common denominator as many of its commonly occurring details and motifs as can be made compatible with each other in rational form, may be developed as follows:

1. Setting varies with geographical origin of the ballad.
2. Scene is that simply of a "day," or in some instances that of a special day, holiday, etc.
3. Some small boys are playing ball: in some versions Sir Hugh is depicted as "oerplaying them all."
4. A ball is thrown or kicked into a Jew's garden or through his window.
5. The Jew's daughter "dressed in green" appears and tells Sir Hugh to come in and retrieve the ball.
6. The boy refuses, indicating fear of punishment by a parent or of something of a more extreme or sinister nature.
7. The Jew's daughter entices him inside, offering apples, cherries, rings, "a finer thing," etc.
8. Sir Hugh goes inside, is led to remote chamber far within the house, is bound and slain.

9. Sometimes his blood is caught in various kinds of containers.
10. The body is disposed of by throwing it in a well, in a river, or into a jakes.
11. Hugh's mother, missing him, searches the town over, finally hears his voice calling.
12. The townspeople gather; the murdered boy miraculously revives and reveals the identity of the malefactors who presumably will be justly punished.
13. Other prodigious events may occur.

Child's A variant, one of the most formally coherent and richest in thematic materials of the Hugh analogues, may, with one or two divergencies--that of the mysterious hint of a deed done to the boy's "auld father" and the motif of the ringing of the bells--be considered also one of the most nearly typical renderings of the ballad. Its narrative element, in somewhat less abstract form than that of the generalized hypothetical common denominator or prototype, appears in Child's own commentary essentially as in this outline:

1. Some boys are playing ball and are joined by Hugh who kicks the projectile through the Jew's window.
2. The Jew's daughter looks out and he asks her to throw down the ball.
3. She tells him to come inside and get it, but he is afraid to do so, referring to something, unnamed, that she did to his father.
4. The Jew's daughter finally entices the boy inside with an apple, leads him through nine dark doors, places him on a table and sticks him "like a swine."

5. After the victim's blood, "thick, thin, and bonny heart's blood," has drained from his body, she rolls him in a cake of lead and throws him in "Our Lady's draw-well," which is fifty fathoms deep.
6. When Hugh does not return home after the evening Mass his mother sets out to find him and, nearing the well, hears her son's voice. He tells her to prepare his winding sheet and to meet him the next morning "at the back o merry Lincoln." At the appointed time the "dead corpse" meets his mother, the bells of Lincoln are rung without men's hands and the books of Lincoln read without men's tongues.²⁰

An Anglo-French ballad of nine hundred ninety-two stanzas, apparently of the same period as the event itself, "Hugues de Lincoln," follows in many respects the account of the Burton chronicler, but offers certain other details which are absent from it and other narratives. The kidnaping and the tortures in mockery of Christ are present, but in this version somewhat greater emphasis is placed on the miraculous reappearances of the body subsequent to the Jews' attempts to conceal it. After the heart of Hugues de Lincoln is split by a Jew named Agim, who has purchased him for thirty pieces of silver in travesty of Judas' purchase of Christ, the Jews bury the body in the earth, but the following morning it is found above ground. Thereupon, the Jews throw it into a privy, from which it likewise emerges. Finally, the body is cast into a well, which also refuses to accept the remains of the innocent victim. On its third

²⁰ Child, p. 234.

"showing forth" the body is discovered, the Jews are revealed as the culprits, and justice is done.²¹

One final analogue of the Hugh story type, also in verse, as given by Child, may relate in a special way to the substance of this study. By Gautier de Coincy, this rhymed version is, according to Child, based on an earlier source of some thirty or forty years prior to the Hugh of Lincoln incident and is "of the same ultimate source as the Prioresses Tale."²² As Gautier recounts the story, a woman in England had a son with a beautiful singing voice. He sang "Gaude Maria" in a style so touching that it moved people to tears. One day on the Jews' street a group of people gathered at an entertainment and the boy was asked to sing. This he did with great effect and much applause. One Jew was so vexed by the song that he would have killed the singer then and there, had he dared to do so. Adopting a more prudent course, however, he waited until the crowd was dispersed, then enticed the child into his house whereupon he killed him with an axe. The mother, missing her son, told the Virgin Mary that she would never have confidence in her again if her son were lost. The Virgin, heedful of the mother's prayer, came to the boy where he was buried and asked him why he no longer sang her praises. Thus "chastened" the boy sang, and soon he was discovered

²¹ Child, pp. 237-38.

²² Ibid., p. 239.

buried under the Jew's door, "perfectly well, and his face as red as a cherry." The Jews, when held responsible, were either massacred or converted.²³

Chaucer's Prioresses Tale, while bearing distinct similarities to Gautier's poem, differs from it in a number of respects both small and large. Chaucer displaces the scene of his story to a city in Asia. His "litel clergeon" angers the Jews by singing "Alma Redemptoris Mater" (not "Gaude Maria") twice a day as he passes through the ghetto. For this his throat is cut and he is thrown into a privy. As in Gautier's story, the Virgin comes to him and urges him to continue singing, but effects her will not by means of a physical reconstitution but by placing a "grain" on the boy's tongue. He sings, with his throat cut, until the grain is removed. The mother, of course, finds her son by hearing his song, as in the other version.

Carleton F. Brown, in an article entitled "Chaucer's Prioresses Tale and Its Analogues,"²⁴ while citing a number of Latin texts, prose and verse, of stories similar to that of Hugh of Lincoln, some of which antedate the Lincoln incident, documents and states definitively a conclusion which should be apparent from the obvious differences

²³ Child, pp. 239-40.

²⁴ Carleton F. Brown, "Chaucer's Prioresses Tale and Its Analogues," PMLA, 21 (1906), 486-518.

between the stories as told by Gautier and by Chaucer and that of the Hugh ballad itself. Brown identifies two story types; one, that of the young "devotee of the Virgin" and the other the Hugh of Lincoln type. As he would have it: "The story of the boy killed for singing anthems belongs to the cycle of miracles of the Virgin. Hugh of Lincoln, on the other hand, is not--at least in its essence--a miracle at all; nor does the Virgin play any part in it."²⁵ Hugh, Brown continues (and this seems to be the case with both accounts of the different annals as well as with the ballad variants themselves), is slain without provocation in accordance with the Jew's alleged practice of ritual sacrifices, is in none of the legends represented as singing anthems, either "Gaude Maria" or "Alma Redemptoris Mater," and is never actually restored in a physical sense after the murder.²⁶ Thus a "happy ending" story type, represented by Gautier's versification, is to be considered distinct from the rendition of the legend created by Chaucer and from the development of "Sir Hugh" in the folk tradition.

The particular form of Chaucer's re-creation of the tale was no doubt a function of the writer's own esthetic purposes, consciously conceived and consciously executed. On the other hand, the effect of time on the form of the

²⁵ Ibid., p. 507.

²⁶ Ibid., p. 508.

story as an object of the popular imagination is not to be minimized. Since the oldest of the English ballads as presently identified were found in the middle of the eighteenth century, some five hundred years after the fact, it is natural that some changes in the folk tradition have occurred.²⁷ In all the ballads, the boy's offense is not that of singing, in a state of innocence of their meaning or otherwise, Christian hymns with anti-Semitic undertones, but the much more prosaic one of breaking a Jew's window. In some of them, such as that of Joyce, the presence of a certain malicious intent is at least hinted at by the fact that the offense is repeated--two balls are "played" or in more specific terms propelled over the Jew's wall or through his window.

In the ballads, death usually comes at the hands of the Jew's daughter, dressed in green, who seduces the boy to immolate him. "Our Lady's draw-well" in Child A may be due to a mixing, limited to this motif, of the Hugh story with that of Chaucer's young devotee of the Virgin.²⁸ This variant is unique in containing this motif, since none of the other folk versions embodies any mention of "Our Lady," usually referring to "the Jew's drawwell," "a deep drawwell," or other less definitely thematic forms. Two renderings of the ballad do retain at least superficial references to

²⁷ Child, p. 239.

²⁸ Ibid.

"saints," Child L, with "St. Mary's well," and Bronson 66, with "St. Simon's well." One feels, however, that in these ballads the religious impulse is very dilute, and that such references--inorganic as they are in their contexts--may be no more than vague recalls of an earlier and more specific religious referent or perhaps may be simply accidental. They certainly seem to embody no especially meaningful sense of reverence for the saints who are named.

A selection of the historical background and literary expressions of the theme of the Christian child immolated by Jews, even if of a selective nature as that presented here, suggests not only the psychological depth and persistence of the idea in itself, but also provides some insight into Joyce's rather puzzling incorporation of "Little Harry Hughes" into his "Ithaca" text. Subsidiary themes, growing out of different forms and developments of the legend, move in contrary directions to conclusions which are sometimes jubilant and sometimes tragic. In the verses of Gautier de Coincy and of Chaucer, the youthful votary of the Virgin is slain for his offense of singing. Gautier restores him miraculously to life while Chaucer, an artist of greater complexity of mind, allows him at least to identify his assassins in an aura of heightened pathos and devotion. Both have him sing before and after the felons work their will. In the Hugh annals and ballad variants, the boy does

not sing, invading the Jew's secret premises by other means, and when the crime has been committed, he speaks only to reveal what has been done and by whom. In Joyce's "Little Harry Hughes," significantly, it seems, the child neither sings nor speaks; his decapitation is unequivocal in its finality. Yet, regardless of source and thematic resolution, all the stories move in a medium of profound psychological realism in which human animosities and aspirations take on the aspect of the archetypal. Moreover, the curious duality of the evolution of the stories, with the child singing and silent, restored to life or merely animated (or not animated as Joyce would have it) in death may be seen as a direct parallel to the evolution of the action and thematic movement of "Ithaca" itself and of Ulysses in its entirety. This is specifically the case with respect to the question of whether Bloom "finds a son" and generally to the larger thematic problem of the essential identify of Father and Son.

Beneath all the many and varied stories of the "devotee of the Virgin" or "Hugh of Lincoln" as generated among the Christian populations of Europe, there runs an obvious, steady undercurrent of anti-Semitic prejudice. One senses hostility and even fear of the strange, the unknown, the different, in the annals and the legends dealing with the murders of these innocent victims. Those reference works

dealing exclusively with Jewish culture and the Jewish experience have labeled this tradition "blood accusation," one of them defining it in specific terms as the charge that: "Jews murder Christians to use their blood in certain rituals, particularly in the Passover ceremonies, where blood is allegedly employed in the preparation of the matzoth and in the four cups of red wine for the Seder service."²⁹ Of the same religious-superstitious strain as the blood accusation is the commonly accepted belief in various physical afflictions involving blood--hemorrhages, topical lesions, etc.--thought to beset Jews, since at the occasion of the judgment of Christ (as described in Matthew 27:25) the Jews called out to Pilate, "His blood be on us, and on our children."³⁰ Percy, who is quite apologetic overall concerning blood accusation in his headnotes to "The Jew's Daughter," supplies the rather ironic piece of information that the Jews had apparently at an early date used the same weapon against the Christians, an indication that prejudice is largely a constant factor in the human condition.

Proof of Joyce's interest in the matter is given by the fact that in 1919, at the time he was working on "Ithaca," he and his friend Ottocaro Weiss attended in

²⁹ "Blood Accusation," UJE.

³⁰ "Blood Accusation," JE.

Zurich a protest meeting concerning such an accusation of ritual murder. Richard Ellman, who makes note of this in his biography of Joyce, asserts that "some information about alleged ritual murders by Jews in the 'Eumaeus' episode came out of this meeting."³¹ Surely it would have been more accurate on Ellman's part to have localized the subject in "Ithaca," which contains the "Little Harry Hughes" ballad rather than in "Eumaeus," although in fact the motif of ritual murder of children is to be found throughout Ulysses. Concrete textual evidence exists that the theme had occurred to Joyce much earlier than 1921 when he was laboring over "Ithaca." In "Hades," which Joyce had sent to Ezra Pound as early as July, 1918,³² we see Bloom ruminating on the sacrificial continuity of life: "Its the blood sinking in the earth gives new life. Same idea those jews they said killed the christian boy" (107.12-14). William York Tindall, furthermore, identifies "child-killing" as being one of the main themes of "Oxen of the Sun,"³³ the

³¹ Richard Ellman, James Joyce (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959), p. 477.

³² James Joyce, Letters of James Joyce, I, ed. Stuart Gilbert (New York: Viking Press, 1957), p. 115 (to Harriet Shaw Weaver, 29 July 1918).

³³ W. Y. Tindall, A Reader's Guide to James Joyce (New York: Noonday Press, 1959), p. 199. See also n. 1.

"anti-fecundity" episode on which Joyce informed Budgen that he was working in mid-March, 1920.³⁴

These and other appearances of the topic reveal it to be of special interest to Joyce as an element of some importance in his ongoing process of composition. His attendance with Weiss of the blood accusation protest must have been a matter not of seeking a new concept but of researching for additional information to develop a theme already firmly fixed in his mind and in the intent and detail of Ulysses.

Such expositions of matters relative to doctrines and beliefs of the Church were commonplaces to the Jesuit-educated Joyce, to whom the symbolic drama of the Mass, in spite of his categorical non serviam, still continued to hold as great a fascination as did the city of Dublin and its inhabitants. On the first page of Ulysses the reader finds himself in attendance of a parodic Mass, and strains and intimations of the Mass, as well as full enactments of it as perceived from the perspectives of different characters, play a large part in the book's growth. Blood imagery with sacrificial and other symbolic overtones permeates the thinking of both Bloom and Stephen during their day in Dublin, and it is not really surprising when in "Circe," the episode of perversions, a

³⁴ Joyce, Letters, I, pp. 138-39 (to Frank Budgen, 13 March 1921).

phantasmagorical perversion of the Mass is enacted. The tradition of such Masses is usually regarded as being essentially a phenomenon of medieval Christian culture, but Montague Summers maintains that similar tradition exists, or was thought to exist, among the Jews as well, many believing it to have originated among them. In his description of practices attributed to the Jews, Summers includes exorcism, black magic, ritual murder, and the use of blood for ritual purposes, any or all of which might to a superstitious mind seem to be quite closely akin to the origin of the Passover rite as described in the Missal. He sees a connection between such rites and the Hugh of Lincoln incident, citing a passage from "the chronicler" (probably Matthew Paris) relating to the crucifixion of Hugh and the collection of his blood for use in magicas artes. Such "arts" are understood to have required the use of blood, brains, and bones for the concoction of "magic philtres" to be used for various purposes.³⁵

The circumstances of the ritualistic quality of the murder of Hugh of Lincoln involving the Jews' supposed mockery of the ordeal of Christ have, of course, already been amply detailed in the survey of the annalists and balladeers. The interest inherent in Summer's scholarly

³⁵ Montague Summers, History of Witchcraft and Demonology (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1926), pp. 194-95.

if oddly uncritical exposition lies in his association of the death of Hugh specifically with black magic and the black Mass. In the background of folk culture, superstition, and archaic belief from which the "Sir Hugh" ballad emerges, such associations are not unnatural, and by presenting themselves as natural outgrowths of the subject, create for the artist who wishes to use such materials possibilities for almost endless resonances of analogy and parallel.

Percy traced the accusation of ritual murder of Christian children made against the Jews as far back in history as the year 419, but evidence shows that such charges appeared in even earlier periods. Flavius Josephus, a Jewish cultural apologist and historian of the first century A. D., provides a record of the indictment which, regardless of the degree of likelihood of its having any direct relationship with Ulysses, is striking to the reader of the book in that it identifies the victims as being not Christian children but Greeks--regardless of their faith. Josephus, in his work commonly known by the title Against Apion, accuses the Alexandrian grammarian of that name of asserting that Jews annually fattened and killed a Greek in their temple, offered his body as sacrifice, ate of his internal organs, and swore an oath of hatred against all

Greeks.³⁶ Stephen Dedalus, of course, is depicted as a spiritual Greek, just as Bloom is depicted as a spiritual, if deculturated, Jew. If Jew and Greek are incompatible to the extent implied by Apion, Stephen's acceptance of Bloom's invitation is a futile gesture--no real reconciliation is possible, only a sundering after a brief encounter. In such a light what happens in the course of the "ceremony" in Bloom's kitchen may be interpreted as altogether in consonance with the nightmare of "force, hatred, history, all that" (327.12) at one level while affirming the imperatives of the clashing Heracleitian metaphysical opposites at another.

Blood accusation, then, insofar as it relates to the "Sir Hugh" ballad, may be described as the charge, made by Christians against Jews, of ritual murder committed in mockery of the crucifixion of Christ. The motives for such crimes are supposed to be to express contempt for Christianity and to obtain blood for Paschal rites. Child also connects with such practices--and his position is supported in detail by Summers--what he calls the "absurd sacrilege" of stabbing, baking, or boiling the Host in the course of parodies of the Mass.³⁷ (In the "Circe" black Mass, the Host is "spurned" and the liturgy recited backwards.) Among

³⁶ "Blood Accusation," JE.

³⁷ Child, p. 240.

members of a Christian population highly indoctrinated in a specific body of belief and ignorant and suspicious of other cults, it is only natural that misconceptions should occur. The unleavened Matzoth and the "four cups" drunk on the first two nights of the Passover festival might "naturally" be equated with Host and sacramental wine, and the unfamiliar and incomprehensible ceremonies attached to their preparation might be regarded as sacrilegious tampering with holy substances, by symbolic extension, the body and blood of Christ himself.³⁸ Because of his Catholic indoctrination and his knowledge of the traditional aspects of the history of the Church, Joyce could appreciate fully the thematic potential of "Sir Hugh." The presence of the ballad in "Ithaca" was no accident, but a calculated and researched exercise in literary method.

In a discussion of what may be termed the psychological motivation of the Hugh ballad,³⁹ James R. Woodall disputes Child's statement that the boy comes to his death for breaking the Jew's window. Chaucer's version, that is, animosity felt by the Jews of the ghetto for the boy's singing of "Alma Redemptoris Mater," is thought to be something of an improvement, but still unsatisfactory. In this analysis,

³⁸ "Blood Accusation," JE.

³⁹ James R. Woodall, "Sir Hugh: A Study in Balladry," Southern Folklore Quarterly, 19 (1955), 77-84.

the fact that the ball falls in the Jew's garden--forbidden ground--"demonstrates the emotions and prejudice involved"--and points to the crucial emotional experience at the heart of the ballad.⁴⁰ Differences of culture and social situation in most variants of the ballad do indeed seem to provide both a sense of fascinated attraction and a barrier of separation. While affirming the strength of the strain of prejudice in "Sir Hugh," Woodall, referring to the evolution of its variants in its original European settings, states that "such a situation as the unattainable lad and the feared girl accounts for the earlier persistence of the Jew's Daughter versus the Good Catholic."⁴¹

Four thematic axes or centers may be isolated in the underlying psychological substance of "Sir Hugh." First, there is the Jew's daughter herself: that she is, in fact, usually Jewish gives witness to the universal anti-Jewish prejudice encountered by Percy, Child, and others. Usually, if not always, she is young, beautiful, elegantly dressed--an object of desire. She is always rather above the boy's social class, or, as Jewess, otherwise separated from it. Further, she is always alone and associated with witchery by the witch's color, green. The second thematic center is that of the temptation put to the boy. This is usually in the form of either a token of sex or witchery, an apple,

⁴⁰ Ibid., p. 78.

⁴¹ Ibid., p. 79.

cherry, etc., or a token of greed, a gold ring, chain, or the like. "A finer thing," it seems, could fit into either category. The third axis, that of place, seems unimportant in terms of specific qualities, but is significant in its vagueness. The setting of the ballad is usually remote, apart, "secret," and many times threatening in unspecified ways. Finally, there is the murder itself, luridly brutal, involving knife and blood, and sometimes unheeded pleas on the part of the victim. Woodall notes that in nine versions the boy's blood is caught in basin or cup. This, he says, "returns us to thoughts of satanism and other orgies" and perhaps even to cannibalism.⁴²

The conclusion of the argument is that the basic elements of the ballad which survive and persist are not, in spite of the continuing presence of the Jew-Catholic animus, religious, but "the mysterious and sexual."⁴³ Prejudice in a universal sense, sex, hatred, and violence "with consequent revenge and fear" are the key factors in the continued vitality of the ballad and its tradition.⁴⁴

Having made some examination of the historical accounts and the various ballad renderings of the Sir Hugh legend and its analogues and of important related themes such as the blood accusation, the parodic Mass, and others, the

⁴² Woodall, pp. 80-81.

⁴³ Ibid., p. 83.

⁴⁴ Ibid.

reader can appreciate the ingenuity of Mr. Woodall's psychological, or perhaps more accurately, emotional, analysis of the ballad. Even though his exegesis is written from the perspective of an American aware of distinctly non-European developments of the ballad's form, it is clear that Joyce would have agreed with the identification of prejudice, sexual attraction, and hatred as the essential emotional qualities involved. What emerges from the abstraction of these elements from the centuries-old matrix which embodies and transmits them is an increasingly more acute awareness of the structural significance and the organized function of Stephen's singing of "Little Harry Hughes" as a focal point in "Ithaca" around which Joyce disposed in complex and thematically resonant patterns his characters, circumstances, and themes.

From the different historical accounts and the ballad form emerge a number of recurring motifs which can be interpreted as actively functional in "Ithaca." These fall into a number of categories, of which five are found to be especially meaningful. Category I is a seduction motif. The boy, devotee or Hugh-surrogate, is abducted either by means of guile or temptation--or occasionally by force. In the "Ithaca" context the figure of the abducted child may be recognized in Stephen (who earlier in the day remembers dreaming of an unctuous and subtly sexual invitation),

beguiled in his weariness by Bloom's insinuating manner, or in Boylan (whose first name it will be recalled is Hugh, this change being made by Joyce from the typescript to the final version),⁴⁵ beguiled by the charms of Molly, not Jew's daughter but Jew's wife.

Category II is the sacrificial murder motif. The at-one-ness of guest and host in Bloom's kitchen, though emphasized in a number of ways, is especially evident in the cocoa (theobroma) communion sequence. It is strongly inferred, though the inference is not without ironic overtones due in part at least to the unorthodox quality of the sacramental liquid, that Bloom and Stephen lose their own identities to merge into one consubstantial "person." The symbolic sacrifice of the Mass is enacted, the "victims" seeking "atonement" being both hypothetical Father and hypothetical Son. In the tightly-contrived symbolic system of "Ithaca," it is significant that Hugh of Lincoln was killed in mockery of Christ by blasphemous Jews--a deeply ironic detail when related to this communion scene. Joyce's Hugh type, Little Harry Hughes, is, of course, not killed specifically for this reason in the surface context, but the fact that he meets his fate at the hands of "a Jew's daughter, all

⁴⁵ Richard Eastman Madtes, "A Textual and Critical Study of the Ithaca Episode of James Joyce's Ulysses," Diss. Columbia University 1961, p. 230.

dressed in green" (676.10) (as depicted luminously in Bloom's imagination), is not without its own significance.

Category III has to do with the disposition of the body of the slain boy. In the annals and variants, a frequent motif is that of the disposition of the corpse in a privy or "jakes" as in the "Hugues de Lincoln" account and as explicitly described in lines 572-73 of The Prioresses Tale:

"I seye that in a wardrobe they him threwe/ Where as thise Jewes purgen hire entraille." Privies, jakes, and water-closets play a quite conspicuous role in Ulysses. Bloom begins his day with a trip to the jakes,⁴⁶ Bella Cohen claims to have buried her husbands (sacrificial victims) "in the shrubbery jakes" (531.21), the heresiarch Arius, proponent of the theory that the Son is forever separate from and inferior to the incommunicable and unique Father, Stephen remembers as having breathed his last "in a Greek water-closet" (39.18), the Greekness of this particular jakes perhaps being akin to Stephen's own rationale Greekness which isolates him from Bloom's world of the actual and the Aristotelian entelechy toward which he yearns. The Aeolian scholar of Roman history with the intriguingly relevant name of Hugh MacHugh, while expounding on the "cloacal obsession"

⁴⁶ Ulysses, 68.19; 69.29. Much later in the day, having heard Stephen's song, but before ushering him to the gate, Bloom considers "the necessity of destruction to procure alimentary sustenance" (681.23), thus linking in a prosaic but altogether natural way the idea of ingestion of food with that of its physical rather than its spiritual by-product.

of the Roman subjects of his studies (masters of a thousand years of history, precursors of the English), ironically attributes to them a declaration made on touching a new shore: "It is meet to be here. Let us construct a water-closet" (130.10). In this single motif category are thus to be found the themes of the destruction, both sacrificial and alimentary, of life to procure new or continued life, of consubstantiality of Father and Son as theological principle, and of history with its masters and victims.

Another type of hiding place or repository for the body of the slain boy of the legends is that of river or well. In Child A, it will be recalled, "Our Lady's draw-well" was the hiding place chosen by the Jews. Consequently, it is not surprising that we should find Zoe in "Circe" complementing Bloom for his relatively sober efforts to assist the drunken Stephen with the descriptive phrase "Deep as a draw-well" (544.26). Bloom, thus, himself becomes "drawwell," and (assuming that Joyce did have a continuing awareness of the Hugh background) that which secretly holds the remains of the sacrificial victim, which, as will be seen, either may or may not be restored to life.⁴⁷

⁴⁷ In the British museum notesheets there occurs in the "Clyclops" section the "unused" entry, "Jews fouled wells of thought." The Jew-well association is interesting, and it does not seem unlikely that such an idea might have been incorporated into the novel in another form and place, for instance, "Circe." See Phillip Floyd Herring, "A Critical Edition of James Joyce's Notesheets for Ulysses in the British Museum," Diss. University of Texas 1966, p. 121.

Category IV is the singing motif. Stephen sings a number of songs in both "Eumaeus" and "Ithaca," but "Little Harry Hughes" is obviously the most significant for a number of reasons: its terminal position in relation to the others sung, its accompanying musical notation, the "commentary" attached to it, and so forth. The fate of Little Harry as the protagonist of the ballad has nothing to do with singing--his transgression, which can readily be seen as a deliberate provocation--is that of violating the privacy of the Jew's garden and of breaking the Jew's windows. Some of the earlier variations of the story, specifically those in which the boy is designated "devotee," have their heroes singing. Chaucer's boy sings twice a day, duplicating the offense, as it were, as does Stephen, though the offense is not the same. Brown has indicated, on the other hand, that in the Hugh-type stories, of which Stephen's is manifestly one, the child does not sing, and in Child A and other variants as well as in the historical accounts of Hugh of Lincoln, we see that this is so. The devotee of the Virgin sings; Sir Hugh and Little Harry do not. Stephen sings--should the inference be made that he too is a devotee, in this instance of the Virgin, lady of miracles, "gate of heaven," asleep in the upstairs bedroom? Bloom in any case would have it so, and Molly herself, on being informed of Stephen's brief presence in the house, does not seem opposed to the idea.

Stephen's song is strongly reminiscent of the "Gaude Maria" and the "Alma Redemptoris Mater" in its anti-Semitic offensiveness to the Jewish listener who in this instance happens to be Bloom. Bloom, master of equanimity, though he has been described as listening in hurt silence to the ballad, does not react as if this were so. His imagination seems rather to be captured by the vision of the green-clad Jew's daughter calling the "pretty little boy" to his doom. Is Bloom thus dealing with Stephen's offense to his Jewish sensibilities in the same way in which he disposes of the suitors of his Penelope--by equanimity?

Category V encompasses variations on the ending of the story relative to the nature of the "reanimation" miracle. The problem here is essentially a matter of whether the murdered child is truly reanimated and physically restored or whether he is merely given the appearance of life long enough to identify his abductors.⁴⁸ As Gautier de Coincy relates the story, the child is fully restored, found beneath the door of his abductor's house, "his face red as a cherry" with brimming good health and not with blood.⁴⁹ In Chaucer's tale, Child A and the other Hugh variants, the boy is depicted as definitely dead. In "Little Harry Hughes" the

⁴⁸ Carleton Brown labels these two types of stories "A" and "C" in his discussion of the analogues already cited.

⁴⁹ Child, p. 240.

miraculous element is totally eliminated--the final lines leave no room for uncertainty: "And now he'll play his ball no more/ For he lies among the dead" (676.3-4). Perhaps it would be more natural to take Stephen's ballad "at its word," literally, without further ado. But the thematic development of "Ithaca" is not such as will enable us to do this. It is too complex, there are too many things going on simultaneously in the episode, too many associations, too many thematic movements as yet unresolved. If the assumption made up to this point in the analysis--that Joyce had some awareness of the legendary background of his ballad--has any validity, we are compelled to speculate further regarding his ultimate purposes concerning "Little Harry Hughes."

Richard Eastman Madtes, in his dissertation study of "Ithaca,"⁵⁰ proposes the thesis that Ulysses is capable of being interpreted two ways, as having both a happy ending, in which Stephen and Bloom are to be regarded as finding in each other the father and son of their respective quests, and an equally demonstrable unhappy ending in which they do not. There is much to be said for this view; a great deal of evidence, in fact, exists which would uphold the view that, at least at certain symbolic levels, this was precisely what Joyce had in mind. The manner in which "Little Harry Hughes" and its supporting themes are handled do much to

⁵⁰ See Chapter II of Madtes' study, "The Theme of Isolation and Community," pp. 130-45.

verify Madtes' thesis. From the beginning of the review of the legendary background of "Little Harry Hughes" and its analogues, it should have been observed that there is a peculiar double quality inherent in virtually the total body of relevant detail. This has been noted by such authorities as Brown who have spent much time in ordering and classifying different story types according to their various modes of thematic organization. In this critic's extensive writings pertaining to the Chaucerian analogues, numbers of them appearing in the period before 1920, much is made of whether or not the child-victim is restored or whether he dies--in other words, whether or not a true miracle takes place. Joyce's interest in Chaucer might well have led him into some contact with and consideration of this problem. Joyce was a master in the acquisition of esoteric and obscure information: he might have been aware of the odd fact that there were actually two Hughs of Lincoln--one the boy martyr whose death Henry III used as a pretext for murdering and robbing the Jews of the vicinity--as much victims of the incident as the boy himself--and a saintly bishop of the same name who came to be renowned for the assistance and protection he extended to these oppressed people.

Assuming that there is some correspondence between the Hugh tradition and the structure and content of "Ithaca,"

either Boylan or Stephen may be considered as the invader of Bloom's "secret infidel apartment." The implications of the "jakes" and "drawwell" motifs, when related to the various forms of the Hugh story, may be seen to involve death and resurrection, physical commonplaces and theological questions of great subtlety. The question of the nature of Stephen's own identity and his potential relationship to Molly Bloom as well as to Milly and Bloom himself is raised by the presence of the singing motif. Stephen may or may not be considered a devotee of the "Virgin." If he is not, he is perhaps only an embodiment of the mischievous if not vicious little boy of whom he sings, whose encounter with the Jew's daughter and by inference with the Jew himself (or with the quintessential Hebrew in opposition to Stephen's Greek) is brief, without issue, and tragic. The sacrificial murder motif, labeled Category II, is equally equivocal. The Mass occurs, celebrating death of a victim and symbolic of atonement. But the "wine" is "Epps's massproduct, the creature cocoa," a bland and perhaps unefficacious mixture. Immediately after the consumption of the massproduct of communion, as though a kind of hymning commentary on it, appears the sequence of Stephen's ballad. The ballad itself is one of death, and grows from a legendary medium involving sacrifice and revivification, but the medium is contradictory; the "Mass" which plays a part in it tends to be a black Mass, and the resurrection possible

but not inevitable. Though in some versions of the legend, the slain child rises, speaks, and even lives, the last line of Stephen's ballad strikes the reader as having a curious finality, and as somehow echoing the title of the last story of Dubliners, by implication indicating the precariousness of the singer's own spiritual posture. In the final analysis, Madtes' argument seems a viable one. Joyce offers no real resolution--only opposite possibilities. Bloom and Stephen may be united as Father and Son, or they may not be. The artist affirms nothing, but he in this instance provides at least an intense and compact correlative in the form of "Little Harry Hughes."

The ballad, together with its analogues and historical background, may thus be viewed as a small world of which the elements repeat and parallel those of the "Ithaca" episode in which it is found and of the whole of Ulysses. As above, so below. Within the confines of this microcosm are to be seen not only the themes of Bloom's "force, hatred, history, all that," but that of the blood ritual with its sacrificial sundering and reconciliation, and that of the Lady of Miracles whose presence revives and restores, and ultimately encompasses all.

Chapter III

INELUCTABLE MODALITY: "LITTLE HARRY HUGHES" AND THE MUSICAL COMPONENT

In the "Proteus" episode of Ulysses, Stephen is depicted as strolling along the Dublin strand, indulging himself in a loosely ordered and freely associative series of meditations concerning a number of philosophical problems. Feeling liberated for the moment for having made the decisions to vacate the Martello Tower and to leave his teaching position at Mr. Deasy's school, he is in an exceptionally light-hearted and whimsical mood, and it is this mood which sets the tone of his speculations. The light tone of the passage, however, should not be allowed to misdirect one's attention from the fundamental seriousness of the ideas passing through Stephen's mind. Like most of Stephen's thoughts in the course of the day, they tend irrevocably in the direction of certain key issues which are central to the nature of Stephen's personal ordeal and to the meaning of Ulysses as a whole. The couching of the ultimately serious content of Stephen's "monologue" in a medium of near-frenetic un-seriousness is one of a number of devices which embody and project the amorphous quality of this episode. As he struggles to find the associative strand

which may serve to connect Stephen's slippery non-sequiturs, the reader finds himself in a situation not unlike that of Menelaus in Homer's Telemachia, who, as he recounts his story, had to grasp and hold elusive and even menacing forms of the old sea-god, Proteus, in order to find the secret of the passage to his homeland and reunion with his companions of the plain of windy Troy.

One of the most protean of the elements of Stephen's monologue is the phrase "ineluctable modality." The expression which appears at the beginning of the first sentence of the episode, "Ineluctable modality of the visible . . ." (38.01), re-surfaces two more times within the chapter as "ineluctable modality of the audible" (38.15) and as "the ineluctable modality of the ineluctable visuality" (49.28). By no means an isolated motif, it occurs later, in "Circe" as "ineluctable modality of the visible" (546.17) in a similar context as Stephen continues his philosophical quest. In addition, "modes" (493.15) also appears in "Circe," and "Mode" (658.02), "modulations" (672.09), and "modulated" (672.21) in "Ithaca." "Ineluctable" occurs twice (49.13; 546.17) and "ineluctably" on four occasions (38.17; 214.35; 494.18; and 682.07) in passages which seem to have a definite conceptual relation to the initial occurrences of the "modality" theme in "Proteus."

The difficulty of the "modality" passages in "Proteus" and throughout Ulysses lies in the critical ambiguity of the term "mode" itself. The complexity of the word must have delighted Joyce as being especially suited to the "Proteus" episode, which was certainly intended to be, in small, as Haines says of the body of Shakespeare's work, "the happy hunting ground of minds which have lost their balance" (245.13-14). The facts are that "modality" does present a crux, a special problem of critical interpretation, that the indeterminate quality of the word seems intentionally exploited by Joyce, and that as a result any "systematic" analysis, however logical it may be, must content itself with being persuasive and illuminating, rather than definitive.

Something of the complexity of the "mode" concept is indicated by the series of definitions given in a standard reference work. Four main categories of definitions appear, the relevant segments of which may be generally summarized as follows:

1. mode (general): manner of doing or being; method; form, fashion.
2. mode (logic): a. the form of the syllogism as determined by the quantity and quality of the propositions which constitute it; b. the form in which the proposition connects the predicate and the subject, whether by simple, contingent, or necessary assertion.
3. mode (metaphysics): condition or state of being, form or manner of arrangement; in a general sense, a particular form or manifestation of some

underlying substance, or of some permanent aspect or attribute of such a substance. (In this category it is noted that Spinoza called particular things "modes of the divine substance," particular ideas or mental states "modes of mind or thought," and particular physical phenomena "modes of matter or extension." For Locke, modes were "such ideas as are distinguished by being attributive." Any specific substance must exist in some mode, but no mode is by its own nature permanent. The distinction between "mode" and "substance" is analogous to that of form and matter. Forms may have independent existence but modes are conditional.)¹

The fourth definitional category for "mode," that of music, is quite extensive, but for reasons which will become obvious in the course of the analysis of the term and its significance in Ulysses, discussion of it will be taken up later.

These dictionary meanings frame the philosophical directions and tendencies of some of the most ingenious of the many widely divergent interpretations of Stephen's "ineluctable modality" phrase. Two of the most outstanding of these are provided in articles by Joseph E. Duncan and John Killham.² Duncan's view grows out of the concept of mode as an aspect of the apparatus of logical method and is

¹ Webster's New International Dictionary, 2nd ed. (Springfield, Massachusetts: G. and C. Merriam, 1934), p. 1576.

² Joseph E. Duncan, "The Modality of the Audible in Joyce's Ulysses," PMLA, 72 (1957), 286-95, and John Killham, "Ineluctable Modality in Joyce's Ulysses," University of Toronto Quarterly, 34 (April, 1965), 269-89.

basically Aristotelian in its orientation. Killham's exegesis is a reaction against the Aristotelian reading of "Proteus," developing the thesis that Stephen's real concern as he strolls along the beach is the problem of inner perceptions of outward reality, to be understood in terms of Berkeleian perceptual theory. A brief overview of these contradictory interpretations should indicate something of their considerable usefulness and interest, as well as of the ultimate shortcomings of the type of approach to the reading of any segment of Ulysses which they exemplify.

The central idea of Mr. Duncan's analysis is that "Stephen is developing implications of Aristotle and his scholastic commentators in associating changing, unpredictable sights and sounds with Aristotelian theories of modal logic which deal with the uncertainty, potentiality, and variability of the sublunary world."³ In the work of Aristotle, it is maintained, modality always involves "the problem of the relative certainty or uncertainty of judgments as events."⁴ Two types of modal propositions are established in logic: apodictic and problematic. The apodictic is a general proposition dealing with necessity or impossibility. The problematic proposition is a particular one relating to possibility in the world of the actual. Both

³ Duncan, p. 288.

⁴ Ibid.

types of modal propositions are to be distinguished from "assertoric" ones dealing with incontrovertible fact. Modality, then, in the field of logic, is "a qualification as to certainty or uncertainty of a statement."⁵

The principle of modality as developed in Aristotle's writings on logic may be considered as representing a pervasive formative influence on the entire body of the philosopher's work. Certain authorities, such as Charles Sanders Peirce and George Grote, assert, in effect, that all Aristotelian thought is modal in the sense employed in the logic. Once this principle is granted, it becomes possible to impute to Aristotle a kind of philosophic dualism, which would equate the "apodictic" proposition with the certainty of the world of sense and mutability. "In a larger sense, then," Duncan summarizes, "the ineluctable modality is the inevitable continuing presence of uncertainty and unpredictable possibility in the changing world of the actual as contrasted with the necessity found in the realm of the universal and eternal."⁶

This seems, overall, to be an intelligent and reasonable gloss of a very difficult passage. Certainly Aristotle's presence is felt in "Proteus" and elsewhere in Ulysses, just as much as is that of Fortinbras who constantly hovers about the periphery of Hamlet and steps in at the end of the

⁵ Ibid., pp. 288-89.

⁶ Ibid., p. 290.

tragedy to re-establish the order and tranquility necessary to a healthy and viable state. However, a specific example of the inadequacy of this interpretation seems to inhere in the examples given by Duncan to prove his point. He cites first the sea, "constant in its change but unpredictable," as the "perfect symbol of the inevitable earthly uncertainty which is the material of the problematic proposition."⁷ Then he suggests the Dublin trams as they clang back and forth across the city as "a kind of symbol of the ineluctable modality of the audible in that they provide the most noticeable of the constant but changing and essentially unpredictable sounds of city life."⁸ These metaphors are good ones, but they remain obscure in their lack of definition. Both may be said to represent not only change but regularity--or perhaps change in regularity. The tramcars move more or less constantly but only within the confines of their pre-conditioned, prescribed, and unchanging courses. The sea is never the same from moment to moment in what Stephen calls the nebeneinander, the "one-thing-beside-another"; yet in terms of its larger movements, those of tides and currents and prevailing winds, it is always the same. It should be remembered that the name of Giambattista Vico, the eighteenth-century Neapolitan scholar who proposed a cyclical theory of history on the model of that of the ancient Greeks, has

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Ibid.

already appeared in the "Nestor" episode, prior to Stephen's meditations on the beach. The concept of the Vichian historical cycles recurring in the course of the continuing human experience has already entered the mainstream of Ulysses and is not easily dismissed. Mr. Duncan's exposition works well, as far as it takes us, but his metaphorical examples do less to prove his theory than to reveal to us something of the larger structure and movement of the book of which his theory can at best explain only a small part.

John Killham, while indicating an awareness of the "invertebrate" quality of the phrase, points to a number of unmistakably Berkeleian references which appear in the stream of Stephen's "Protean" discourse to support his view that "ineluctable modality" is not an Aristotelian notion growing out of the classification of logical categories, but rather a Berkeleian idea having to do with modes of sensible perception.⁹

Killham, having apparently made a systematic review of the philosophical applications of the modality concept, makes, in passing, a brief exposition of the epistemology of Kant, noting that Stephen is, throughout Ulysses, preoccupied with how we know and that Kant's modalität might provide a solution to the problem of "ineluctable modality." In Kant's system modality is "that prior condition of the understanding enabling us to distinguish between 'things' as actual,

⁹ Killham, pp. 270 ff.

possible or necessary."¹⁰ This "modality" is rejected, since, it is asserted, when linked with "ineluctable," it would imply that what we see or hear is ineluctable, which is to say necessary, an implication the validity of which is not borne out by observation since the senses are easily fooled.¹¹

As has already been seen, modality as used in formal logic involves propositions which are recognized as being neither true nor false but problematical, in terms of the possibility, impossibility, contingency, or other uncertain qualities of their content. The Aristotelian logic employs essentially the same sense of the word, with the difference that propositions may be classified as modal if they assert that something is possible or necessary.¹² Killham dismisses both of these out of hand, apparently because when associated with "ineluctable" in the same syntactical manner as was the Kantian concept, they result in a kind of contradiction of terms--a "certain uncertainty" which is a logical absurdity.

Once epistemology and logic have been dismissed as adequate contexts for Stephen's "modality," one possibly acceptable alternative which presents itself is Bishop Berkeley's theory of perception. Berkeley's presence is,

¹⁰ Ibid., p. 270.

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² Ibid.

indeed, strongly felt in "Proteus" as Stephen experiments with vision and audibility (by closing his eyes), ponders the reality of the visible world unseen by him, and considers the function of the mind in restructuring and transforming "raw" perceptions into the mental patterns of which we are aware. "Rhythm begins . . . ," he says, as he shuts out the "diaphane" and begins to respond to the modality of the audible: "Open your eyes now. I will. One moment. Has all vanished since? If I open and am forever in the black adiphane. Basta! I will see if I can see. See now. There all the time without you: and ever shall be, world without end" (38.28-32). In this instance, Stephen is testing Berkeley's philosophical denial of the existence of matter, a belief growing out of the assumption that all reality is mental, and requiring that material objects exist only in being perceived.¹³

Another Berkeleian tenet touched upon by Stephen is that of the activity of the mind in "spatializing" sense perceptions through the habitual association of earlier experiences. "The good Bishop of Cloyne," he muses, "took the veil of the temple out of his shovel hat; veil of space with colored emblems hatched on its field. Hold hard. Colored on a flat:

¹³ This point is dealt with in succinct and illuminating fashion by Bertrand Russell in A History of Western Philosophy (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1945), p. 649.

yes, that's right. Flat I see, then think distance, near, far, flat I see, east, back. Ah, see now. Falls back suddenly, frozen in stereoscope" (49.16-21). The persistence of this particular Berkeleian theme is demonstrated by the fact that some thirteen hours later, in Bella Cohen's brothel, Stephen is still preoccupied with it: "Brain thinks. Near: far. Ineluctable modality of the visible" (546.17).

Killham uses these and other details from "Proteus" to support his contention that Joyce intends "modality" to function as an element of Berkeley's system. It is obvious, he claims, that Stephen makes quite clearly to himself the Berkeleian points that seeing is distinct from hearing, as each sense mechanism is separate and distinct from all the others, that "each of our principal sense receptors provides distinct information, and [that] it is only habitual experience that makes us forget it."¹⁴ "Mode," he says, has a common and generally accepted meaning for psychologists and physiologists: "a specific and distinguishable department of sense."¹⁵ Duncan's construction to the effect that "Stephen is developing the implications of Aristotle and his scholastic commentators in associating changing, unpredictable sights and sounds with Aristotelian theories of modal

¹⁴ Killham, p. 274.

¹⁵ Ibid.

logic which deal with the uncertainty, potentiality, and variability of the sublunary world"¹⁶ is thus unnecessary, and, indeed, misleading insofar as the true impulse of Aristotle's thought is concerned.

The essence of Killham's "refutation" of Duncan's explanation of "ineluctable modality" seems to be that the evidence in favor of Berkeley's use of the modality concept is strong, and that by minimizing it to stress an Aristotelian relationship, Aristotle's philosophy itself is misconstrued and misrepresented. Duncan's exposition does, in fact, seem to Platonise Aristotle, by apparently inferring that Aristotle emphasized the duality of the ideal and the material worlds, whereas a more realistic view of his philosophy would, it appears, stress just the opposite. In Killham's words, once again: "One may say that Aristotle's philosophy 'consists mainly of a theory of modality' but it should not be inferred that Aristotle emphasizes the changing 'contingent' qualities of life in the world. . . . Aristotle uses terms like possibility, actuality, and necessity as a means of collapsing into a shadowy realm of pure thought what his great forebears had regarded as real . . . disposing of Plato's assertion that only the idea was real by maintaining that reality must be divided between essence and substance."¹⁷

¹⁶ Ibid., citing Duncan, p. 288.

¹⁷ Ibid., p. 284.

Killham's interpretation of "ineluctable modality" is, in the final analysis, very much like that of Duncan, which he is attempting to refute. As an exposition of a puzzling critical problem it is enlightening, rational, and true, without being sufficient or perhaps even necessary. Moreover, it tends to be misleading, in that it apparently is primarily directed toward Berkeley and perceptual modality whereas it is really a commentary on the philosophy of Aristotle, whose philosophy one suspects Killham feels is ultimately at the heart of the matter.

Something of a less specific and more organic concept of modality is hinted at in the closing pages of Killham's article, where with a view toward Aristotle's Posterior Analytics¹⁸ the writer undertakes an explanation of Stephen's real uneasiness concerning Aristotle--at base, the fear that the "entelechy," the fusion of matter and ideal form, may not be real and absolute. Aristotle's "solution" to the problem of the separate natures of matter and form involves the idea that those things which exist must do so always in a state of coming-to-be and that this coming-to-be is cyclic, since "there can be no conceivable end to a chain of which all the links are both necessary cause and effect."¹⁹ But how can

¹⁸ In the present study, reference was made to the Analytica Posteriora, trans. G. R. C. Mure, as it appears in Richard McKeon, ed., The Basic Works of Aristotle (New York: Random House, 1941), pp. 110-186.

¹⁹ Killham, p. 285.

the individual human soul be conceived of as eternally coming-to-be when individual men do not return upon themselves? And how can history be regarded as the experiences of individual men if these separate identities do not partake of and participate in divinity? In his classroom at Mr. Deasy's school earlier in the day, Stephen's pupils ask him to tell them a ghost story. Stephen indulges them in a way they certainly neither apprehend nor appreciate--by having them read "Lycidas." The irony of this is the result of a deep philosophical and spiritual malaise. If history is not the story of individual men and if men do not share in divinity--if the word is not made flesh--"Lycidas" is indeed nothing more than a ghost story. Aristotle maintained that the existence of men--as mankind--cyclic in the generality of its nature, was necessary, but in Ulysses this view more nearly supports the position of Mr. Deasy that "all history moves toward one great goal, the manifestation of God," not that of Stephen, whose God as word-made-flesh exists as "a shout in the street" (35.19-20;24-25).

In addition to those of Duncan and Killham, a number of other critical definitions of "modality" have been put forward, most of them paralleling at least to a degree the Aristotelian or the Berkeleian view. S. L. Goldberg sees the concept as a basically Aristotelian one, though not necessarily growing out of the logic. If Stephen "flirts

with Berkeley," he says, "he is finally content to rest on Aristotle: the modality of the visible and the audible, as he realizes in 'Proteus,' is ineluctable, and the 'diaphane' limited in bodies; space, as he puts it in his unspoken rejoinder to Russell, is 'what you damn well have to see.'"²⁰

Stuart Gilbert, who because of his personal association with Joyce is more than most in a position to understand his purposes, seems to identify himself with the Berkeleyian modalists by a parenthetical comment regarding a passage at the beginning of Stephen's monologue: "Signatures of all things I am here to read, seaspawn and seawrack, the nearing tide, that rusty boot. Snotgreen, bluesilver, rust: colored signs" (38.2-4). "Surely," says Gilbert, "the signature of Bishop Berkeley is on this passage."²¹ It is perhaps significant, however, that this line of thought is not pursued. "This passage" is, after all, only a small segment of the total thematic movement of "Proteus" which is itself one chapter, and a short one, of eighteen.

Gilbert's rendering of this episode is mainly a recapitulation of Stephen's reflections, and he does not

²⁰ S. L. Goldberg, The Classical Temper, A Study of James Joyce's "Ulysses" (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1961), p. 86.

²¹ Stuart Gilbert, James Joyce's "Ulysses": A Study (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1952), p. 121.

dwell on the problem. Moreover, in the larger development of his book he spends much effort in the delineation of mystical principles drawn from the writings of the mermeticists. Yeats, George Russell, and others of the Irish literary movement had immersed themselves in the pursuit of mystical studies, and Joyce himself was conversant with their jargon, though his interest in most aspects of the content of mystical philosophy had a decidedly negative cast. It is not surprising, nevertheless--indeed, it is characteristic--that he should have slipped among the illusive and misleading intricacies of "Proteus" a phrase such as "signatures of all things" (38.2), recognizing it to be the title of a work by the mystic Jacob Boehme, De Rerum Signatura, while imbedding it in a context of Berkeleianism.²²

W. Y. Tindall recognizes the significance of the source of "signatures of all things," identifying in Boehme, "the mystical alchemist," a proponent of the hermetic doctrine of correspondence--the belief in the existence of an organic relationship between physical and spiritual worlds, man and universe, macrocosm and microcosm.²³ The theme of the Emerald Tablet of Hermes Trismegisthus, "As above, so below," is noted by Tindall, Gilbert, and others as having a

²² W. Y. Tindall, James Joyce: His Way of Interpreting the Modern World (New York and London: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1950), p. 111.

²³ Ibid.

relationship to the system of structural correspondence which Joyce worked out for Ulysses.²⁴ Stephen's "heaventree of stars" and "heavenman" of the "Ithaca" episode may be recognized as being to a considerable degree an outgrowth of this component of hermetic philosophy. The basic definition of "mode" or "modality," "manner of doing or being," also obtrudes itself into this context: microcosm and macrocosm are in this sense modal just as are space and time, the visible and the audible, and any other of the philosophical categories which occur to Stephen's mind as he walks the strand. And, as with all the others, there is apparent in his special awareness of them, a sense not only of their separateness, but also of a need and an impulse to unify their distinct natures.

One further critical view of modality which seems worthy of note is that of Richard M. Kain.²⁵ Although he never defines the term, his meaning is clear, in any case. His chapter on "ineluctable modality" deals with the flow of human life in its ever-recurring patterns. His own phrase is "the inevitable conditions of mortality." An interpretation of Kain's view of Ulysses is that it is to be identified with the "Paterian version of the idea that Nature is a

²⁴ Ibid., pp. 111-12.

²⁵ See Kain, "Ineluctable Modality: The Rhythms of Life" in his Fabulous Voyager: A Study of James Joyce's "Ulysses" (New York: Viking Press, 1959), pp. 213-26.

Heraclitean fire . . ." and that "'ineluctable modality' must be construed as the fleetingness of the subjective life."²⁶ Much of the detail of Kain's chapter supports this. He dwells at length on Joycean "formulae" such as the Ulyssean "Bridebed, childbed, bed of death" and the "harry me, marry me, bury me, bind me" of Finnegans Wake (FW 414.31-32), all of which seem to emphasize the transitory and fleeting modes of human life. Whether he realizes it or not, however, such details not only emphasize the evanescence of life, but also its permanence in change. The forms, the modes, of life do not change, though the participants in living do. Though in Ulysses one sees "ineluctable modality" in an almost bewildering variety of different applications involving both physical and intellectual phenomena, this modality should not be defined solely in terms of a universal element fire, or flux, or perpetual becoming. The textual examples chosen by Kain, himself, including (as with Duncan) the Dublin trams, contradict such an interpretation. Modality, as Stephen or as James Joyce perceived it, seems fundamentally a much more complicated philosophical proposition, consisting not only in change, but also in form, in movement and in stability, in kinesis and in stasis, and ultimately, perhaps, in a synthesis of the two opposing elements.

²⁶ Killham, p. 288, n. 18.

In the final analysis, running the gamut of the philosophical "modalities" does little to identify and objectify the "true" character of the term. Applications of the conceptual principles and systems of Aristotle, Berkeley, Kant, Boehme, and others, as variously identified in the text, are no doubt valuable and cannot be ignored by the critic. It would be meaningless to define modality according to any one philosophical system and to insert that definition mechanically into one or more of Stephen's recurring "ineluctable modality" passages in the hope of wresting from it some kind of rigidly logical meaning. This is self-limiting and self-defeating. The impulse of such a process is wrong. It is, in fact, "un-Protean." Killham notes the ironic quality of Stephen's thinking, which, he says, "hovers between philosophic systems with a kind of fascinated sense of their absurdities."²⁷ This is a valid observation and one which readers should bear in mind. Stephen does not get hold of Proteus any more than he does the critic, but at least he is aware of the problem of his elusiveness and approaches it with the proper sense of perspective. Modality may be in a very real sense a matter of a principle of Aristotelian logic projected upon the world's body, or it may be a matter of perceptual mechanics, or it may be both or neither. The fact of the matter is that it cannot be so narrowly classified as

²⁷ Killham, p. 283.

to fit into any of the categories appertaining to philosophical systems. There are a number of other "modalities" of which Stephen is fully aware in Ulysses and which bear upon his problem just as cogently.

Another version of modality has to do with the internal relationships and activities of the three persons of the Trinity. Though this may seem rather tenuous at first glance, when perceived in its full context it will be clearly recognized as a real part of Stephen's understanding of the modality concept, growing out of his interest in a specific problem of Catholic doctrine. In "Telemachus," the first episode of Ulysses, Stephen, talking with Haines on the beach, is prompted to reflect on the arch-heretics Photius, Arius, Valentine, and "the subtle African heresiarch Sabellius" (22.31), envisioning their characteristic heresies as "fleeing with mitres awry" before the aroused militance of the true Church. These heresies have two things in common: they are all representations of the relationship between Father and Son which were at various times ruled theologically unacceptable by the Church, and they do not, at least in the course of Stephen's day, "flee with mitres awry." References to the heresiarchs recur throughout Ulysses as Stephen persists in his attempts to resolve gnawing doubts regarding the mystical identity of Father and Son.

The "subtle African heresiarch Sabellius," moreover, is especially worthy of note in the analysis of the modality theme since one of the designations for his particular set of heretical notions is "modalism." The Sabellian heresy is identified with a movement within the Church known as "Monarchianism," a name derived from the "one-rule" concept which its form embodies. Current during the second and third centuries, Monarchianism was an anti-Trinitarian doctrine, the central tenet of which was that God is one person as well as one being. Two branches of the movement existed. One, "humanitarian" Monarchianism, held that Christ was a mere man, Son of God only by adoption. The other, "modalistic" Monarchianism, with which Sabellius is identified, maintained that Christ was indeed divine, but as such, was indistinguishable from the Father. The Father, Son, and Holy Spirit were not distinct persons, "but rather modes, energies, aspects or phases of the one divine person."²⁸ In the West the modalists were known as "Patripassians" because of the logical consequence of their belief in the unity of Father and Son, this being in effect that the Father himself died in the crucifixion of the Son. In the East, the modalists were grouped together under the name Sabellians. The implications of all this for the interpretation of "ineluctable modality" in Ulysses are considerable. Stephen,

²⁸ P. J. Hamell, "Monarchianism," New Catholic Encyclopedia, (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967).

"inquisitional drunken jew jesuit" (213.34-35) as he is, to use Mulligan's phrase, cannot be considered ignorant of the content of the Sabellian heresy, nor of its terminology. He is fully aware of the theological connotations of this particular type of "modalism"; the essential unity of separate-ness of Father and Son are almost an obsession with him, as the reader gradually discovers in the course of Bloomsday. Phrases such as "ineluctable modality of the visible" and "ineluctable modality of the audible" should not, therefore, be construed as concerning only physical mutability or only the processes of perception in "Proteus," but should rather be woven into the larger and more general thematic fabric which gradually emerges as the full significance of "modality" manifests itself.

Another relatively less obvious materialization of the modality theme involves as well the germ of Stephen's interest in the doctrinal intricacies of the Father-Son disputes of the early Church, this one developing around the figure of the sea-god Mananaan MacLir. Mananaan is the Proteus, the "great shape-shifter" of Irish myth, who can assume whatever form or identity he pleases but whose misfortune is always to give himself away "by the splash of puddlewater in his shoes."²⁹ His province is identified as being that "of all

²⁹ H. E. Rogers, "Irish Myth and the Plot of Ulysses," ELH, 15 (1948), 306-27.

changes, including those between life and death."³⁰ Stephen is reminded of Mananaan early in "Proteus" by the whitecapped waves, which he describes inwardly as the "whitemaned sea-horses, champing, brightwindbridled, the steeds of Mananaan" (39.23-24). Up to this point he has been toying with some of the philosophical applications of modality already identified, and he continues to do so, but now, with the appearance of Mananaan, his thoughts take a new turn. Throughout the remainder of the episode he begins to ponder, though in a no more coherent way than he has done regarding the philosophical modalities, the possibility of transformations of the forms or modalities of self.³¹ These reflections on the part of Stephen find an obvious parallel somewhat later in the "metempsychosis" cogitations of Bloom.

The MacLir motif is by no means restricted to "Oroteus." It reappears later, in the course of Stephen's disquisition on Shakespeare at the library (187.14-16), in "Oxen of the Sun" (405.32) in a farcical but pregnant context involving some unlikely transformations of Haines and the black panther of which he dreams, and finally in "Circe" where the god appears and "with a voice of whistling seawind" announces "I am the light of the homestead, I am the dreamery, creamery butter" (499.23,29-30). The content of each occurrence is

³⁰ Ibid., p. 316.

³¹ Ibid.

the same, touching upon identity, some more or less complicated metamorphosis of that identity, and some aspect, obvious or otherwise, of the relationship between Father and Son. Thus Mananaan, representative of Stephen's version of the metempsychosis theme and transmuter of the modalities of the self, asserts his presence in Stephen's consciousness by revealing himself in thought, conversation, and hallucination throughout the entire course of the day.

Evidence of Stephen's interest in the essential character or form of the self appears closely conjoined with other modality themes. On the beach he considers the quality of his physical being: "I throw this ended shadow from me, manshape, ineluctable, call it back. Endless, would it be mine, form of my form?" (49.12-14). Then, in the library scene, expounding Shakespeare's multiple presences in Hamlet and reciting to himself verses to Mananaan, he ponders the realities of both change and duration: "Molecules all change. I am other I now. . . . But I, entelechy, form of forms, am I by memory because under everchanging forms" (187.34-35). Stephen's search is obviously one for unity in complexity and for continuity in change. His own Shakespearean theory, implying such unity and continuity, in which the playwright emerges as both ghost-father and living son, he flatly and unhesitatingly denies believing. But his mind is obviously working in a complex fashion on a number of

different tracks, and this denial is perhaps not to be taken at face value. That he sees promising figurative parallels everywhere is evidenced by the presence of the verses to Mananaan in the midst of his exposition of his theory:

Flow over them with your waves and with your waters,
Mananaan
Mananaan MacLir. . . .

In Irish legend, the hero called Mongan MacLir was Mananaan's son-by-contract, yet recognized himself as a reincarnation of the hero Finn, of whom it was said that he would return from a hiding place deep underground when his people needed him. H. E. Rogers calls Mongan "the archetype of Stephen's speculative projections of himself into the personalities of others." Mongan, he says, "transcended the ineluctable and knew himself as Finn Again."³² Thus while overtly rejecting the ingenious sophistries of his Shakespearian theory, Stephen is, in the back of his mind, at least halfway affirming his thesis of the unity of Father and Son as it appears in an obscure Celtic myth.

The "modality" of the individual self is then to be seen as yet another element in a complex conceptual entity which includes diverse and contradictory philosophical and mystical principles, religious dogma related to heretical movements of the early Church, and fanciful notions of transformations of physical form as embodied in Irish myth. Yet, despite the

³² Rogers, p. 319.

heterogeneity of these sources, none is really distinct or isolated from the others. Certain common details consistently recur: multiplicity, unity, cyclical movement, continuity. And the picture is not yet complete: another easily identifiable facet of Stephen's "ineluctable modality" significantly parallels and confirms this pattern.

Haines announces this theme in the first episode as he and Mulligan discuss Stephen's Hamlet theory. "I read a theological interpretation of it somewhere," he says. "The Father and the Son idea. The Son striving to be atoned with the Father" (20.16-18). This statement not only serves to foreshadow some of the more obvious factors in the theory and in the general tendency of Stephen's thought, such as the paternity and the sundering and reconciliation motifs, but also ties them in with two others which are both intricately developed and pervasive in Ulysses--that of ritual and that of tonality or music.

"Atonement," like "modality," is a complex word capable of being defined or interpreted in a Joycean sense in a number of ways, some of them distinctly contradictory in nature. It is described as being used in a simple sense to signify reconciliation. At a relatively early date, however, it developed a religious connotation which acquired predominant status as its generally accepted meaning. To it are imputed meanings such as "satisfactory expiation for an

offense" and "an act of divine love that effects a new state of things." The Hebrew concept of atonement is identified as involving or having at one time involved an innocent mediator between parties who serves as a guilt offering or scapegoat.³³ But Joyce, experimental word-man that he was, would have been interested in another dimension, associative rather than strictly etymological, of "atonement." The Greek "atonos" and related forms implied "not stretched, slack, without tone" and "slackness, debility."³⁴ Subsequently "atony," as an English borrowing, took on the figurative significance of the Greek original as "lack of vital energy, decrepitude, impotence. . . ." Thus "a-tone-ment," suggesting not only inharmony but weakness or debility, might be construed as being the morphemic arrangement of the letters of the word as well as might "at-one-ment." A further conceptually related but contrary transformation might be "attunement," in this instance inferring an opposite musically or otherwise harmonious state.

The degree to which Joyce actually performed such an analysis is, of course, problematical, but to perform it

³³ F. K. Dougherty, "Atonement," New Catholic Encyclopedia (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967).

³⁴ "Atony," A Comprehensive Etymological Dictionary of the English Language, ed. Ernest Klein (New York: Elsevier, 1966), pp. 1, 3.

would have been typical rather than atypical for him in his process of composition, and it is unlikely in any case that he would have failed to recognize any possibilities for semantic variation and layering of "atonement." As is always the case with Joyce, the context of a word is revealing. Forms of "atone" actually appear only twice in Ulysses, once adjectivally in Haines' comment regarding Hamlet as already quoted and again, in a substantive sense, as "atonement" in "Ithaca." Here Bloom "recapitulates" his day as ritual as he prepares to go to bed: "The preparation of breakfast (burnt offering): intestinal congestion and premeditative defecation (holy of holies): The bath (rite of John): the funeral (rite of Samuel) . . . etc., to include all events of day . . . nocturnal perambulation to and from the Cabman's shelter, Butt Bridge (atonement)" (713.24-714.02). Both occurrences, "atoned" and "atonement," are rich in metaphorical possibilities. Atonement as mystical reconciliation or "at-one-ment," or in the related, not immediately theological sense, as the "attunement" of finding or establishing a musical key or as harmonic resolution or musically incompatible "a-tonal" entities, have simultaneous and organic applicability to the relationship of Shakespeare and his characters as described by Stephen in his library diatribe, to transcendent Father and Logos-Son of Church dogma, and to Stephen the young intellectual seeking a father and Bloom the ordinary man seeking a son in Dublin.

The theological implications of "atonement" need not be further analyzed here, since the germ of their relevance to "modality" has already been identified in the consideration of the Sabellian heresy. It is the musical aspect of the word which remains to be investigated, and which at this point may be observed to provide a basis for the fourth and final category for the definition of "modality" in Ulysses.³⁵

The importance of music in the novel is an unmistakable quality. Stephen's "ineluctable modality of the audible" is only one detail in a total structure which includes innumerable other details, ranging in complexity from the fuga per canonem of the "Sirens" episode to the clanging and screeching of the tramcars as they proceed through Dublin on their daily rounds. Musical phrases and themes from dozens of songs are used by Joyce to organize and develop both external action and the inward consciousness of his characters. Richard M. Kain refers to the large part the "thematic songs" of Ulysses play in the lives of Stephen and Bloom. "Music is one of the most potent of subconscious recalls," he says: "it rises unexpectedly to mind, and, in turn, leads to appropriate words and associations. Such constant psychological interplay defies detailed analysis; an index of themes will serve to indicate the multitude of musical

³⁵ Final for this study. No category is final in a consideration of Joyce's technique.

references in the text, but the careful reader will take pleasure in discovering for himself Joyce's revelation of how extensive a part sound plays in the operation of the mind--a point never so completely demonstrated in literature as by Ulysses."³⁶ Joyce's interest in music was not limited to weaving fragmentary references to it inextricably into the body of his literary work to provide finger exercises for critics, however. He had himself a very fine tenor voice, and he was not ignorant of certain basic technical principles of music theory. Some of this theoretical knowledge surfaces in Ulysses just as do the musical motifs, and, as might be expected, it serves to express and ramify the thematic content of the work.

In "Circe," Stephen, quite drunk by this time, is depicted as standing at the pianola of Bella Cohen's premises on which with two fingers "he repeats . . . the series of empty fifths" (492.28-29).

(In music, it should be explained, a "fifth" is an interval encompassing five degrees of the diatonic scale, or the fifth tone of a scale, also called the "dominant," moving upward from the first, which is called the "tonic." Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians explains "dominant" as "the note in a mode or scale which . . . most urgently demands resolution upon the tonic." In the major or minor scales,

³⁶ Kain, p. 144.

it continues, "it is the fifth of the scale, and thus the fifth note above the tonic or the fourth below it." It goes on to add that in the harmonic system of tonality the dominant and the chords built upon it play the major part in defining the key: hence the term "dominant."³⁷ Grove's identifies "tonic" as "the name given in harmonic music to the keynote, i.e., the note from which the key of a composition is derived."³⁸ Stephen's "empty fifths" become apparent in the dialogue which follows in this scene.)

Stephen's respondent in this segment of the hallucinatory drunkenness of "Circe" is Lynch's cap. Apparently attempting to put into words the impulse behind his rather cryptic performance at the piano, Stephen exclaims: "Here's another for you. . . . The reason is because the fundamental and the dominant are separated by the greatest possible interval which. . ." (494.1-4). At this point he breaks off, his fuddled mind unable to formulate a satisfactory conclusion to the thought he is trying to express. Finally, taunted by the Cap for his apparent incapacity, he begins again and manages, in halting phrases, to complete another part of his "sentence": "Interval which. Is the greatest possible ellipse. Consistent with. The ultimate return.

³⁷ Eric Blom, "Dominant," Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, 5th ed. (1954; rpt. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1961).

³⁸ George Grove, "Tonic," Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, ed. Eric Blom, 5th ed. (1954; rpt. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1961).

The Octave. Which" (494.8-9). These speeches, and the entirety of the scene in which they occur, have been recognized as a kind of thematic hub in Ulysses. The fundamental and dominant concept, essentially a musical one as introduced by Stephen, has been, quite rightly it seems in most cases, employed as a metaphorical basis for the identification of all sorts of associations and correspondences within the book. Thus earth is identified as the dominant to God's tonic, moon as the dominant to midnight's tonic, London as the dominant to Stratford's tonic, and Bloom's wandering in Dublin to Molly's tonic.³⁹ In another view, Bloom and Stephen are seen as "complimentary counterparts" containing the fundamental and dominant relationship as actuality (Bloom) and potentiality (Stephen). The Father-Son theme is also noted as having metaphorical affinity with the tonic-dominant relationship, as is also the figure of Christ "in whom are expressed the dichotomies of crucified citizen (Man) and crucified artist (God), of action and passion, of involvement and freedom. . . ."⁴⁰ Stuart Gilbert makes a similar point regarding what he terms Stephen's "hollow fifths," extending somewhat the phrase's frame of reference.

³⁹ Harry Blamires, The Bloomsday Book: A Guide Through Joyce's "Ulysses" (London: Methuen, 1966), p. 184. Blamires also observes that Bloom's "one completely satisfying" moment on June 16, 1904, comes with the resolution of dominant into tonic at the end of "M'appari," the aria from Martha rendered by Simon Dedalus in the "Sirens" episode. For a discussion of the special pathos of this scene, see Duncan, p. 295.

⁴⁰ Goldberg, pp. 178-79.

In referring to Mulligan's allusion to "the nine men's morrice with caps of indices" at the end of "Scylla and Charybdis" (214.03), he asserts that the name of this old English game was suggested by the Arabic origin of the decimal system, which superseded "the quinary or five-finger method of calculation." Gilbert believes the "hollow fifths" are connected with a Pythagorean belief in the octave "as the reconciliation of the unlimited and the limiting."⁴¹ The real insight of readings such as these, whether it be realized or overtly expressed, is that beyond the ellipse of the "fifth" lies the octave and the unitary reality of its "ultimate return." In Gilbert's words, which no doubt reflect the general and perhaps the specific outline of Joyce's own conception, "The growth of the soul is a process towards at-onement, a return, the octave."⁴² As the activity of "Circe" grows progressively more frenetic, "The Siamese twins, Philip Drunk and Philip Sober" (507.12) appear, evidently representing alter egos of Stephen, the more credible one inebriated and pointedly non-sequiturish and the other at least theoretically responsible and circumspect. Philip Drunk, among other things, expresses in Deasian phrases his frustration regarding the octave: "Ah bosh, man. Go to hell! I paid my way. If I could only find out about octaves. Reduplication of personality. Who was it told me

⁴¹ Gilbert, p. 68, n. 5.

⁴² Ibid., p. 61.

his name?" (507.22-24). Earlier in the episode, in his conversation with Lynch's Cap concerning "empty fifths," Stephen has attempted to articulate a coherent description of the octave's nature and operation. "Abruptly" he declaims: "What went forth to the ends of the world to traverse not itself. God, the sun, Shakespeare, a commercial traveler, having itself traversed in reality itself, becomes that self. Wait a moment. Wait a second. Damn that fellow's noise in the street. Self which it itself was ineluctably preconditioned to become. Ecco!" (494.14-19). The principle of the octave, he is saying, the departure from the tonic to the dominant and the return in ineluctably preconditioned certainty to the tonic again, is reflected in the journeying of God as Logos in the world, the regular circuit of the sun about the earth, the journey of Shakespeare to London and back to Stratford, the movement of the commercial traveler (in the framework of Ulysses, Bloom) as he goes about Dublin at his work and then returns to Molly,⁴³ and in innumerable other instances, ideally all other instances which may exist. Perhaps the "abruptness" of Stephen's manner reveals some inner uncertainty about the validity of his pronouncement. It may be that he is disturbed by the absence of objective proof of what he is attempting to verify rationally. In any case, Philip Drunk is still unsure, though he, like Stephen,

⁴³ Blamires, p. 184.

in pondering the "reduplication of personality" and searching for the unremembered "name," seems very close to reaching a conclusion, himself completing the cycle by traversing the arc from dominant to tonic.

The principle of the octave is by no means restricted to the perceptive incoherencies of Stephen and Philip Drunk in "Circe," however. Bloom, whose own wanderings, real and hypothetical, are linked with those of Sinbad, Rip van Winkle, and the octave itself,⁴⁴ meditates throughout his day upon the cyclic relationships of the world as he perceives it. Birth and death play a prominent part in his musings, objectified in the pangs of Mina Purefoy and the decease of Paddy Dignam, as do such related notions as "the necessity of destruction to procure alimentary sustenance" (681.23-24), which, though this particular expression of the thought occurs to him late in the day, is present in his mind as early as his feeding of the gulls in the "Lestrygonians" episode (150-51).

His thoughts regarding Milly and Molly take a similar turn. In remarking the "endemic" characteristics in Milly, he considers his daughter's "nasal and frontal formation," which "was derived in a direct line of lineage which, though interrupted, would continue at distant intervals to its most distant intervals" (677.26-28). These repeated

⁴⁴ Gilbert, p. 380.

"intervals" Bloom recognizes as cycles the fundamental of which will partake ineluctably of his and Molly's own genetic identity. In thinking of his relations with Molly in the light of his knowledge of her affair with Boylan, he is able to act with equanimity. He need not be unduly discomfited, he believes, by his condition of cuckold, nor can Boylan take excessive pride in being the seducer, since the state of cuckoldry is constant and that of sexual conquest temporary at best. In the "Ithaca" catechism appears the question "If he had smiled why would he have smiled?" and the answer: "To reflect that each one who enters imagines himself to be the first to enter whereas he is always the last term of a preceding series even if the first term of a succeeding one, each imagining himself to be the first, last, only and alone, whereas he is neither first nor last nor only nor alone in a series originating in and repeated to infinity" (716.10-15). Bloom knows that Molly is fallen and suspects that Milly is soon to fall, but he feels also that this is the way of a world in which every man is both cuckold and seducer, both tonic and dominant in a series of intervals which extends to infinity. Stephen's definition of the octave, "the ultimate return" after "the greatest possible ellipse," would, if stripped of its metaphysical trappings and applied to the actuality of human life, meet with his approval. This is the form, the modality of life in the world. Much earlier in the

day, in the discussion of Shakespeare at the library, Stephen has foretold all in his citation of a passage from Maeterlinck and his subsequent gloss on it. "If Socrates leave his house today he will find the sage seated on his doorsteps" (210.30-31), "If Socrates leave his house today, if Judas go forth tonight. Why? That lies in space which I in time must come to, ineluctably" (214.33-35).

The cyclical structure of the musical octave must be recognized as a major thematic concept in Ulysses, but other dimensions of the term, quite different but in a sense closely akin, were obviously carefully studied by Joyce and incorporated into his text with equal care. In the Catholic liturgical calendar an octave is a feast day, such as Christmas, Easter, or Pentecost, and the seven-day period following it. Thus the birth of Christ, the crucifixion, resurrection, ascension, and other events having special religious significance, are celebrated in a series of interrelated liturgical "dramas" spanning an eight-day period. The importance that Joyce attached to the formal and traditional attributes of the liturgical octave is demonstrated by his handling of the parody of the mass.

Much critical effort has been expended in the examination of the black Mass of "Circe" in which composite figures in which Mulligan and Haines predominate enact a spectacular and highly diverting backward travesty of the ceremony. One

scholar has unearthed the information that Thursday, the day of the week on which Ulysses takes place, was the traditional day for the black Mass and that such affairs, according to the rules of their performance, cannot be held on a feast day of the church nor within the octave of a feast day. Thus, in the year 1904, June 16 was the first free Thursday after Corpus Christi that Joyce could use.⁴⁵ While other reasons have been given for Joyce's selection of this particular day for Bloomsday, it seems likely that the body of lore and custom regarding the Mass and its parody was a contributing factor.

While such astute manipulation of minor detail is typical of Joyce, his interest in the liturgical octave transcended by far the matter of arranging "days" in a certain pattern in the calendar. At least a partial key to Joyce's total vision may lie in the allusions Harry Levin finds hidden in the title of Joyce's final work. He cites the Irish as being notable among modern peoples for the cheerful manner in which they accept death: "but 'wake,' in the brogue, has the additional meaning of 'week.' And that signifies one particular week, combining, for Irish Catholics, the celebration of the profoundest mystery of

⁴⁵ Ruth M. Walsh, "In the Name of the Father and of the Son . . . Joyce's Use of the Mass in Ulysses," James Joyce Quarterly, 6, No. 4 (1969), 321-347. Walsh's conclusions in this article are to a large degree judgments of some of the propositions of A. M. Klein in "The Black Panther," Accent, 10 (1950), 139-155.

their religion with the most stirring event in the recent history of their country. Easter is the Christian ceremony of resurrection. Easter Week, 1916, was the occasion of the bloody uprising that foreshadowed the resurgence of the Irish Free State."⁴⁶ If Levin's statement is accepted at face value, "octave," equated with "week," assumes yet other functions in the apparently endlessly ramified system of correspondences which is Ulysses. Its attribute of unifying the contrary impulses of departure and return, of the centrifugal and the centripetal, provide the basis for a symbolic generalization which embraces metaphysical precept, religious belief, and political and individual actuality.

Joyce did not compose in generalizations, musical or otherwise, and the octave, as profound as it may be proven to be as a thematic and structural device, is, in an immediate and specific sense, rather a clue to the understanding of other musical devices and elements in Ulysses than an end in itself. It is, of course, as a musical construct, inter-related with those aspects of musical theory which have to do with modes and modality and must therefore be treated as an integral part of the problem of "ineluctable modality."

One of the most arresting features of the textual segment describing the dialogue of Bloom and Stephen in "Ithaca"

⁴⁶ Harry Levin, James Joyce: A Critical Introduction, rev. ed. (1941; rpt. Norfolk, Connecticut: New Directions, 1960), p. 201.

is that of the musical notation of the ballad "Little Harry Hughes" which Stephen sings for his companion (675-76). The handwritten text of the ballad, in what has been called Joyce's "epistolary," which is to say his most legible, hand,⁴⁷ appears between the musical staves which bear the notation. This notation itself is known to have been done by Joyce's friend Jacques Benoist-Mechin.⁴⁸ Exactly a month before Bloomsday, on May 16, 1904, Joyce had sung in a music festival called Feis Ceoil and after two songs was evidently on his way to winning first place in the tenor composition. He was barred from that honor, however, when he refused to attempt a third and unfamiliar number from sight. Richard Ellman, in recounting the incident, remarks that Joyce could not read at sight, "then or later."⁴⁹ He must have toyed with the idea of Stephen's being more accomplished than he in this respect, however, because in the notesheets for "Ithaca" there appears the uncanceled entry "S D read music?"⁵⁰ The idea is not developed in the novel itself,

⁴⁷ Richard Eastman Madtes, "A Textual and Critical Study of the Ithaca Episode of James Joyce's Ulysses," Diss. Columbia University 1961, p. 21.

⁴⁸ Richard Ellman, James Joyce (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959), p. 535.

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 157.

⁵⁰ Phillip Floyd Herring, "A Critical Edition of James Joyce's Notesheets for Ulysses in the British Museum," Diss. University of Texas 1966, p. 411, "Ithaca" notes 4, p. 1.

so it was evidently discarded as being unnecessary to his scheme for the characterization of Stephen. Stephen and Philip Drunk are apparently more interested in the philosophic connotations of the octave than they are in its musical notation. The note, though unused, is interesting, however, in that it does serve to establish that Joyce had thoughts of making it obvious that Stephen had some degree of technical proficiency in music, as well as "appreciating" it. Actually, his taste in music, running to "Shakespeare's songs, at least of in or about that period" (654.42-646.1), Dowland, Byrd, Tomkins, and John Bull, is quite sophisticated.⁵¹ (Thomas E. Connolly, in his description of Joyce's library, lists eight titles of works dealing specifically with music and describes some of them as being heavily marked. That Joyce was fond of the Irish balladry in particular is confirmed by Connolly who states that the texts of many ballads of Irish provenance were underlined in various volumes in the collection.)⁵²

⁵¹ John Dowland (1563-1626), of Irish origin, was a noted lutenist and composer. William Byrd (1543-1623) was an English organist and composer of vocal and instrumental music. Thomas Tomkins (1545-1627), another well-known English organist, achieved eminence as a composer of madrigals. John Bull (1562-1628), also an Englishman though not of the "ilk" referred to by Bloom, was a renowned organ virtuoso and contrapuntalist.

⁵² Thomas E. Connolly, The Personal Library of James Joyce: A Descriptive Bibliography, University of Buffalo Studies, Vol. 22, No. 1; Monographs in English No. 6 (Buffalo: University of Buffalo, April, 1955).

Anthony Burgess poses the question of why the musical setting of the ballad is "too low for Stephen's tenor voice."⁵³ The music does, in fact, appear in the f or "bass" clef and, by consequence, seems to be misplaced a full octave toward the bass tonalities. The range of the male tenor is variously described as that of an octave or a seventh above and below the a-note above middle c. Since the highest note of "Little Harry Hughes" as it is written appears to be d above middle c and the lowest the a an octave below "middle a," Stephen's tenor would have negotiated the music only by extending itself far below its defined limits. Richard Ellman provides the intelligence that from the time Joyce was twenty he was himself not able to sing higher than g or a-flat at the most,⁵⁴ and by this he presumably refers to those notes raised an octave from the g and a directly above middle c. This seems to place Joyce's voice in the usual tenor range. Madtes, who insists that the ballad is Joyce's own, believes that the notation was made from Joyce's personal rendition of the music, since otherwise, as he says, he would have copied the notes from a printed source.⁵⁵ No contradiction exists by necessity in any of this. What seems most likely is that no "printed

⁵³ Anthony Burgess, Re Joyce (New York: W. W. Norton, 1965), p. 171, n. 1.

⁵⁴ Ellman, p. 156.

⁵⁵ Madtes, p. 156.

source" actually did exist and that Benoist-Mechin, for reasons of his own, simply transposed the ballad music an octave downward from Stephen's tenor range.

Bertrand Harris Bronson, who lists "Little Harry Hughes" as variant 60 of "Sir Hugh, or The Jew's Daughter" in The Traditional Tunes of the Child Ballads, identifies the scale used by Joyce and describes the structural patterns of the music in a way which serves to reveal some of the reasons for Joyce's interest in the ballad. Joyce, he says, furnishes one of the few "fully Mixolydian" tunes which accompany the variants included in his compilation.⁵⁶ "Mixolydian" is the name of a musical mode of which Joyce shows himself fully cognizant in Ulysses. Bronson continues: "It is a rather florid version, full of repetition, the second and fourth lines repeating, and then the whole second half again, added to which is a second strain, of which the second half reverts to a restatement of the second half of the first strain."⁵⁷ Bronson does not identify the source of the ballad music, but he does observe that Joyce's tune "may be related to another Irish version, Honoria Galwey's, in Old Irish Croonauns, 1910, from Donegal, mid-nineteenth century."⁵⁸ No comparative

⁵⁶ Bertrand Harris Bronson, The Traditional Tunes of the Child Ballads (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1959), III, 72.

⁵⁷ Ibid., pp. 72-73.

⁵⁸ Ibid.

analysis of the musical qualities of the tunes has been attempted. They do sound very similar.

This musical organization, as described by Bronson, is thus seen to have a curious repetitive or cyclic quality, doubling back upon itself as it blends two separate strains together in a single melody. That it is necessary or desirable to make any kind of symbolic interpretation of this structure is a questionable proposition, but it may not be altogether beside the point. Philip Drunk exclaims, rather plaintively it seems, "If I could only find out about octaves" (507.23), and throughout the day Stephen shows himself to be almost obsessed with the sundering and reconciliation-cyclic-octave principle that he perceives within and without himself in a hundred different forms. Furthermore, the fusion of separate identities is the goal toward which the schematic and thematic material of Ulysses irrevocably moves, a goal, which, if it is attained, is attained in the "Ithaca" episode and in the very segment of the episode in which Stephen sings his ballad. Cyclic movement, reconciliation of separate beings--these are the fundamental constituents of Ulysses which are reflected in the music of "Little Harry Hughes." It is not necessary to say that the two musical strains which in their close juxtaposition and interwoven state seem to blend into one are to be equated with Bloom and Stephen, nor to equate the repetitive

movement of the music with that of the cycles of God, Shakespeare, Socrates, a commercial traveler, or anyone or anything else in Ulysses. The apparent correspondence is an interesting, if minor, feature, however, and to note the parallel is not to make Joyce a mechanic, but rather to confirm his integrity as a conscious artist who insisted on making every compositional detail count.

In Joyce's notesheets for "Circe" one discovers the somewhat garbled entry "mixoldyian." This is, of course, a carelessly inexact spelling of "mixolydian," the name of the mode of the "Little Harry Hughes" music as identified by Bronson. The idea contained in the note was used by Joyce in "Circe," in an astonishing speech made by Stephen as he gradually works himself up to his definition of the octave as the ineluctable preconditioning of the self. Stephen (to Lynch's Cap) exclaims: "The rite is the poet's rest. It may be an old hymn to Demeter or also illustrate Coella enarrent gloriam Domini. It is susceptible of modes or modes as far apart as hyperphrygian or mixolydian and of texts so divergent as priests haihooping round David's that is Circe's or what am I saying Ceres' altar and David's tip from the stable to his chief bassoonist about his almightiness" (493:13-19) to which the Cap, manifestly unimpressed and sceptical, retorts: "Bah! It is because it is. Woman's reason. Jewgreek is greekjew. Extremes meet.

Death is the highest form of life. Bah!" (493.24-26). What is worthy of notice in this interchange is the fact that it shows Stephen's mind, now because of his drunkenness working associatively or intuitively rather than consecutively, projecting outward the same pattern of ideas which will later, in the calmer and more reflective state which prevails in Bloom's kitchen, take the form of "Little Harry Hughes."

Here the idea of modality, present in the book from the "Proteus" scene in many shapes, is now transformed to "hyper-phrygian" and "mixolydian," the latter being, as has been indicated above, the mode of Stephen's ballad. Second, the mention of "divergent texts" is interesting not only because of its context but also because of its revelation that Joyce thought about texts diverging. Some textual peculiarities of "Little Harry Hughes" as a variant within the "Hugh tradition" have already been examined as has the possibility of Joyce's deliberate alteration of the ballad text. Whatever the truth of such speculations as have been made, there does seem to be a linkage in this passage between the idea of such variation and certain "Hugh"-related factors.

Third, there is present in Stephen's speech the idea of religious rite of ritual involving miraculous transformations of form or state of existence. The "texts" of such ritual may subsist in widely different variants. They include, among others, the religion of David, and by inference Christ,

as the basis for the Christian Mass (in which bread and wine are sacrificially transformed) and that of the religion of Circe (who changed Odysseus' men to swine and back to men again, better than they were before) as the basis of Mulligan's and Haines' black Mass. Then, containing and reconciling all, is the text of Demeter-Ceres-Gaia-Tellus, and by extension, Penelope-Molly whose sacrificial year-king is the ultimate and archetypal victim of history. Finally, there is another, by no means ironic, point of contact in "David's tip from the stable" (493.18-19). This reference to the race motif looks forward to Bloom's reading in "Eumaeus" of the "Derby of '92 when Captain Marshall's dark horse, Sir Hugo, captured the blue riband at long odds" (631.27-28). Should the tie here seem vague it should be remembered that not only are the names "Hugh" and "Hugo" identical, but that the race motif, a frequently recurring device in Ulysses, has as its object an activity not only ceremonial in many respects but also distinctly modal as the term has been seen to develop in the Joycean sense.

Thus Stephen's "Circe" speech, while introducing a new kind of "modality"--the mixolydian variety--and thus preparing the musically informed reader for its actual appearance in "Little Harry Hughes," also presents the idea of textual variation, another useful device for the appreciation of the ballad. A third and highly significant common element is the

ritual death-and-resurrection motif which can increasingly be interrelated with the octave theme. A final affinity can be detected in the presence of the horse-race feature as a result of the probably other than coincidental "Sir Hugh"- "Sir Hugo" likeness. Stephen's speech demonstrates that, as the reader progressing through Ulysses approaches "Ithaca" more closely, detail and theme become more obvious and converge steadily in the direction of "Little Harry Hughes."

Stephen may or may not have been able to read music, but his obvious acquaintance with the musical modalities as demonstrated by his reference to two of them in his "Circe" speech is worthy of note because it provides an insight into Joyce's understanding of certain basic facts of music theory and history pertaining to the modes. These facts, upon analysis, reveal their ultimate significance as being not only the basis for a number of highly visible and thematically important ideas in Ulysses itself, but also in Finnegans Wake, where modifications, extensions, and parallel or analogous developments of the modality theme abound.

"Mode" in its musical sense is designated "an octave species" and defined as "an arrangement of the eight diatonic tones of the octave according to one of certain fixed schemes of their intervals." In somewhat different terms it is identified as having to do with "scale formation" and is described as "the selection of tones, arranged on a scale,

that form the basic tonal substance of a composition."⁵⁹ A further point made regarding the term is that for any given key, that is, "tonal center" of a composition, a large number of modes is possible.⁶⁰ ("Key," of course, is a word with a very special position in Ulysses, since both Stephen and Bloom are depicted as being "keyless" throughout most of the book.)

Three systems of modes have existed historically in European music, the Greek modes, the Ecclesiastical modes of the Middle Ages, and the modern major and minor modes. Joyce, by virtue of his Jesuit education and his continuing interest in vocal music, may be assumed to have at least passing acquaintance with all three. In the Greek classification, from which the term "mixolydian" originates, seven modes were identified, four "principal" ones and three "subordinate" ones. The principal modes were the Dorian, the Phrygian, the Lydian, and the mixolydian, and the subordinate modes the hypodorian, hypophrygian, and hypolydian. Each of these modes, embodied in scales of about two octaves, was thought of as having its individual emotional qualities or character and thus as appropriate to various types of

⁵⁹ "Mode," Harvard Dictionary of Music, ed. Willi Apel (Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1969), p. 535.

⁶⁰ "Key," Apel, p. 450.

occasions or ceremonies. The Dorian was considered as being bold and grave, the Phrygian brisk and spirited, the Lydian soft and enervating, and so on.

The fact that there were seven of these modes should be of interest to readers of Ulysses and Finnegans Wake because of the tendency of that number to appear and reappear in diverse associative meanings. The cithera, for example, was generally held to have seven strings, the octave itself has seven distinct tones, and roygbiv, mnemonic for the "hues" of the rainbow, has seven elements. Roygbiv, which occurs in Bloom twice in the course of Ulysses (369.42, 477.06), burgeons out in Finnegans Wake into a vast pattern of recurring references and motifs described at length by Adaline Glasheen in her Census under headings such as "Seven," "Mr. W. H.," "Mary Fitton," "Myramy," and others.⁶¹ Inherent in many of these are almost endless variant spellings and combinations of hugh, hue, hew, hu, and other phonetically and conceptually similar forms. Reference has already been made to Stuart Gilbert's recognition of Pythagorean precepts involving numbers in the "hollow fifths" scene in "Circe." Gilbert cites a comment of Aristotle to the effect that "Since of all things numbers are the first;

⁶¹ Adaline Glasheen, A Second Census of "Finnegans Wake": An Index of the Characters and Their Roles (Northwestern University: Northwestern University Press, 1963).

in numbers they [the Pythagoreans] thought they perceived many analogies to things that exist . . . they supposed the elements of numbers to be the elements of all things."⁶² The implication seems to be that Joyce uses numbers as a symbolic device to imply if not affirm a system of correspondences between numbers and things expressive of both multiplicity and unity. The aspect of Joyce's symbolism which is of more immediate interest to this study, however, though by no means unrelated to number symbolism, is the manner in which the modalities of the visible and the audible, rainbow and octave, hue and tone, seem to merge in Joyce's imagination in a kind of idealized conceptual synthesis.

Classical mention of Stephen's mixolydian, in the form of both definition and evaluation, were not lacking to Joyce. Both Plato and Aristotle offer comments regarding it in discussions of the technical and ethical qualities of the modes. Plato, in theorizing about the kinds of music appropriate for his Republic, names six "harmonies" but rejects four of them--including the mixolydian--on ethical grounds as not suited for use in education.⁶³ This rejection

⁶² Gilbert, p. 68, n. 1.

⁶³ Oliver Strunk, ed., Source Readings in Music History: From Classical Antiquity through the Romantic Era (New York: W. W. Norton, 1950), p. 4.

is expressed in the following piece of dialogue between Socrates and Glaucon:

(Socrates asks), "And the melody and rhythm will depend upon the words?"

(Glaucon replies), "Certainly."

"We were saying, when we spoke of the subject-matter, that we had no need of lamentations and strains of sorrow?"

"True."

"And which are the harmonies expressive of sorrow? You are musical, and can tell me."

"The harmonies which you mean are the mixed or tenor Lydian, and the full-toned or bass Lydian, and such like."

"These then, I said, must be banished; even to women who have a character to maintain they are of no use, and much less to men."

"Certainly."⁶⁴

Aristotle's reference to the modes in Book VIII of the Politics, a segment of that work devoted to the education of the young, has, as does that of Plato, a practical motivation and his description of the mixolydian is very similar, but his conclusion takes a more philosophic turn. He says: "On the other hand, even in mere melodies there is an imitation of character, for the musical modes differ essentially from one another, and those who hear them are differently affected by each. Some of them make men sad and grave, like the so-called Mixolydian. . . . The same principles apply to rhythms, some have a character of rest, others of motion. . . . There seems to be in us a sort of affinity to

⁶⁴ Plato, The Republic, trans. Benjamin Jowett, in The Dialogues of Plato (1892; rpt. New York: Random House, 1937), I, 662.

musical modes and rhythms, which makes some philosophers say that the soul is a tuning, others, that it possesses tuning."⁶⁵

Thus, both Plato and Aristotle describe the Greek mixolydian as a mode which is mournful and grave, suitable for "lamentations and strains of sorrow." Joyce, who knew what the mixolydian was and understood its "ethical" attributes, was interested, as he had Stephen referring in "Circe" to "the rite" as "susceptible to modes or modes as far apart as the hyperphrygian or mixolydian" (493.15-16), in the establishment of the polar opposites of jubilation and lamentation under the aspect of one all-inclusive sacrificial process. In the casting of the musical tonality of "Little Harry Hughes" he is perhaps doing the same thing in a more complex way. Though only the sad gravity of the mixolydian is present in the ballad, its opposite is to be inferred. Though the sacrificial victim of the ballad, unlike Chaucer's boy, does not speak or sing, Stephen, the surrogate victim of Bloom's kitchen-altar, may rise from the world of the Dublin dead and, given his ten years, achieve the work of art the "child-killing" Mulligan denies him the ability to create. The happy presence of the brisk and spirited Phrygian is not denied; the possibility of its presence is implied and

⁶⁵ Aristotle, Politics, trans. Benjamin Jowett, in McKeon, The Basic Works of Aristotle, p. 1312.

depends on the identification by cross-reference of Stephen and the victim-protagonist and upon a positive appraisal of Stephen's ability to carry out his plans. Both modes are therefore present, embodied in the music as well as in the text of Stephen's ballad, and in the larger framework of the scene in which the ballad is sung.

Aristotle's final observation about the "tuning" of the soul is especially appropriate to the kind of reading Joyce must have intended for his "Little Harry Hughes" scene. The "affinity" of the soul to "musical modes and rhythms," if an esthetic and spiritual reality in "Ithaca," would serve to identify Stephen and his song, subject and object, the modalities of being and becoming in a manner essential to Joyce's conception of the necessity of esthetic stasis in art.

In addition to the elements of the musical vocabulary which have already been identified as constituting some part of the "ineluctable modality" complex, there is one other which because of its frequent and obvious association with Ulysses' two protagonists and its own clear symbolic content must be recognized as essential to the understanding of the phrase. This is the term "key." "Key," like the complex "mode," itself, is susceptible of multiple definitions, non-musical as well as musical, some of the more pertinent of which (insofar as Ulysses is concerned) may be listed as follows:

1. a symbol of authority, possession, etc.
2. that which affords or prevents entrance or possession
3. that which serves to reveal, disclose, or solve something unknown or difficult; as the key to a riddle
4. a mainstay; a leading individual or principle, as a keystone.

Interpreted in terms of any or all of these definitions, key might well serve to designate that thing which both Stephen and Bloom have given away, forgotten, or have otherwise been dispossessed of in Dublin on June 16, 1904. The word is also, of course, used significantly in a musical sense, and in this sense relates directly to mode and modality as musical concepts. Defined musically, key is the tonal center of a scale and is by extension identified as the entire tonal system or family of tones in relation to this tonal center,⁶⁶ itself called, as has previously been noted, the "keynote" or "tonic." Joyce's evident association of fifths, octaves, and modality itself with the key principle in music is a fact of which the critical importance cannot be ignored.

As a kind of historical corollary to the Ulyssean key symbol, the Latin clavis (key) may be worthy of notice. Clavis, in its original sense, implied literally a key to to open a door. According to one Simon Tunstead, the seven

⁶⁶ "Key," Apel, p. 450.

Latin letters A B C D E F G used to identify specific tones came to be called clavis "because through them all the melody of music is opened."⁶⁷ If, as the philosophers referred to by Aristotle in the Politics say, "the soul is a tuning" or "possesses a tuning" it may itself be opened with the application of the key which is the basis of its proper tonality. Such an idea could not have been incompatible with Joyce's scheme for the key and mode symbolism of Ulysses.

Though much of Joyce's more obvious use of keys as symbolic tokens seems distinctly non-musical, as in the instance of the missing keys of Stephen and Bloom (and Myles Crawford) and the crossed keys of Bloom's advertisement for Alexander Keyes' licensed premises, musical key does appear in Ulysses, overtly and by inference. In "Ithaca," after the departure of Stephen, Bloom notices on the piano Molly's and Boylan's music, "Love's Old Sweet Song," "in the key of G natural" (691.10-11). The notesheets for the episode contain what was probably Joyce's cue for this detail in the form of the entry "scale of g."⁶⁸ "Scale of g," however, might also be a reference to the mixolydian mode of "Little Harry Hughes," since this mode is encompassed by the octave g-g'.⁶⁹

⁶⁷ "Clavis," Apel, p. 179.

⁶⁸ Herring, p. 428.

⁶⁹ In the Greek system the mixolydian designed the octave species b-b', but in the medieval scheme of modalities, on which Joyce's ballad is based, it served to identify the family of tones within the octave g-g'.

In "Proteus" Stephen ponders "signatures of all things I am here to read" (38.2-3), these "signatures" being diversely recognized as those of Bishop Berkeley, Jacob Boehme, "astral influences" evident in the forms of physical objects, and so on. "Key signature," another bit of musical vocabulary, seems quite as relevant as any of these, however, in this episode devoted to the modalities. This "signature" is a sign consisting of one or more sharps or flats placed directly after the clef at the beginning of a staff to designate the musical scale or key to be understood. In short, it is a symbol used to identify the key of a musical composition. "Reading the signatures of all things," seen in this sense, becomes by way of metaphor an expression for the comprehension of all "keys," those fundamental or "tonic" essences called souls which are the basis for the modalities of things. Such modalities, derived by analogy from the concept of keynote and scale, Stephen would then perceive as constituted of motivating and controlling impulse and motivated extension, of content and form, and as thus being identical with the entelechies of his philosophic and esthetic quest. Such a construction of the sense of "signatures" is not thought of as capturing Joyce's intent in its entirety. With him, nothing is so simple. All that can be

said for it is that it is consistent with the tendency of Stephen's thought within "Proteus" and within the larger framework of the musical symbolism of his speculations throughout Ulysses.

Harry Levin, in his analysis of the thematic function of the crossed keys of Bloom's Alexander Keyes' ad, points out that the keys are Saint Peter's symbol and also that of the Isle of Man. He sees them as being identifiable at one level of punning intent as "twin emblems of human isolation," indicative of the common state and the ultimate encounter (if not "meeting") of the keyless pair, Dedalus and Bloom.⁷⁰ Harry Blamires, while affirming with Levin that the two keys crossed in a circle relate to the meeting of Stephen and Bloom, insists that "the key is throughout the instrument of entry which ends exclusion and alienation."⁷¹

For the protagonists of Ulysses, the key, crossed or solitary, may well be considered either or both. Both are keyless, and both spend a major portion of their day seeking keys, Bloom in the form of his advertisement, and Stephen as the philosophical basis of his "modality." As one of the many disappointments of his day Bloom fails to get his crossed keys for Keyes, yet he does find a companion attractive to him and achieve entry, if by stealth, into his

⁷⁰ Levin, p. 66.

⁷¹ Blamires, p. 45.

kitchen. Stephen gives up the key to the Martello tower but does find the mixolydian of the ballad he sings to Bloom.

But Joyce asserts nothing. Typical of his treatment of the key motif, as others, is the thought which he has to occur to Stephen in "Proteus": "He has the key. I will not sleep there when night comes. A shut door of a silent tower enclosing their dead bodies. . ." (45.20-21). This, of course, refers to his relinquishing the key to the tower to Mulligan in the first episode. H. E. Rogers, demonstrating the affinities of Joyce's work to Irish myth, maintains that Stephen's tower-abode is to be related to one described in the Irish Book of Nennius. In a story recounted therein, the Sons of Mile, in sailing from Spain, come upon a tower of glass set in the sea and inhabited by shadowmen. They call out, but receive no answer from these silent figures. Later, as they attempt to make a landing, all the Milesians but thirty are drowned and these survivors become the ancestors of the Irish race. Rogers represents this tower, as other such towers in Irish myth, as being "a tower of death which is at the same time a tower of birth"⁷² and thus as thematically linked with Ulysses. There is no doubt some substance in all this, but one recalls with more facility as he listens to the grimly ironic sibilance and sonority of "A shut door of a silent tower entombing their dead bodies . . ." Count

⁷² Rogers, pp. 310-11.

Ugolino's "Tower of Famine" of Canto XXXIII of the Inferno, a tower symbolic of death-dealing treachery and political vengeance. Mulligan and Haines, after all, will be the sole inhabitants after Stephen's departure.

An earlier occurrence of the prison-room image is found in "Nestor" as Stephen reflects on the meaning of history. Of a successful Pyrrhus and an unassassinated Caesar he thinks: "They are not to be thought away. Time has branded them and fettered they are lodged in the room of the infinite possibilities they have ousted. But can these have been possible seeing that they never were?" (26.15-18). Time and the living realization of history have fettered these unliving possibilities which come to Stephen's mind. Pyrrhus and Caesar died and are thus victims of history. Stephen does not possess the key which might unfetter them.

The keyless, silent tower of Stephen's imagination, if indeed it may be associated with Ugolino's Tower of Famine and the Nestorian prison-room of history, serves to illuminate Stephen's appraisal of his own situation. In brief, he refuses to identify himself with the Dublin dead, with the personal crassness of Mulligan and what he sees as the patronizing superciliousness of Haines, representative of the imperial British state. He refuses to accept as inevitable the historical actuality of the past and present, the "nightmare of history" which oppresses him, the aspiring artist,

Ireland, and all mankind. As he tells Cranley in his non serviam speech in the Portrait: "I will not serve that in which I no longer believe, whether it call itself my home, my fatherland, or my church: and I will try to express myself in some mode of life or art as freely as I can and as wholly as I can, using for defence the only arms I allow myself to use--silence, exile, and cunning."⁷³

But evidence to the contrary notwithstanding, Rogers' theory linking the Martello tower with life-in-death towers of Celtic myth cannot be summarily dismissed. The Martello tower is situated near the shore at Sandycove: Mulligan, for a very brief moment almost serious, looks out from its top to see "our great sweet mother" (7.2-3), the sea, that same entity referred to by Stephen later as "Old Father Ocean" (51.10). The tower itself Mulligan calls "the omphalos" (19.8), the navel or center, while Stephen a little later muses "The cords of all link back . . . will you be as gods? Gaze in your omphalos" (39.2-3). Thus tower and sea are together associated strongly with parenthood and the beginnings of physical life. The life of all flesh is tied by "strandentwinding cable" to its origin in the sea, father and mother, which is also end and goal of the cycle of its existence. Stephen, in the chapter on changes, perceives the

⁷³ James Joyce, A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man (1916; rpt. New York: Viking Press, 1958), p. 246.

sea as a symbolic medium of both life and death, and, as Bloom in later episodes, understands something of the sacrificial imperative requisite to the renewal of the life of the flesh. "Full fathom five thy father lies," he recollects, and "sunk . . . beneath the watery floor" (50.36,41). Then, as though in summary, he adds, "God becomes man becomes fish becomes goose becomes featherbed mountain" (51.3-4), an ironic but not unfeeling phrase.

Birth from death, the stirring of new life in the corruption of the rotting corpse, and the affirmation of both life and death in the supreme moment when opposites meet in the continuum are therefore to be seen in the imagery of tower and sea as they appear in Ulysses. If Stephen, having given up access to home, church, country, and tower, is keyless in Dublin, it is perhaps because he, still very much the artist as a young man, must yet meet head-on the experience which will enable him to link symbol--tower and sea--with the living realities of death and birth.

The key motif, as it appears in musical and other figurative symbolic settings in Ulysses, can be recognized as playing a necessary part in the evolution of the larger theme of modality. The true extent of the associations involved and the degree of complication which the key idea assumed in Joyce's mind cannot, however, be fully appreciated so long as the investigation of it is limited to Ulysses

itself. The motif also appears numbers of times in Finnegans Wake, in forms and situations which perhaps reveal more of Joyce's esthetic intent and at the least serve to reinforce those impressions received from its appearances in the earlier work. Four occurrences of key in Finnegans Wake, out of the many which are found scattered throughout it, may be cited as being typical of Joyce's use of the concept and as possibly providing some further insight into its total significance as he himself formulated it in his own mind.

In Book II, Chapter 2 of Finnegans Wake, in which is enacted the "study period" of the children of Earwicker, Kev's method of doing his sums is described. Kev, who is good at "manual arithmetic," has attached the names of his favorite cardinals to four fingers. The forms of these names are such as to indicate the four Vichian ages. There are "his enement curdinal numen" (when God's name [numen] was heard), "his enement curdinal marrying" (the age of the patriarchal family [marrying]), "his epulent curdinal weisswasch" (the age of disintegration--theme of burial [weisswasch--white winding sheets]), and "his eminent curdinal Kay O'Kay" (the age of return). The name of the last "curdinal," interpreted by Joseph Campbell and Henry Morton Robinson in their Skeleton Key on a letter-by-letter basis, appears as: "k, eleventh letter of the alphabet, i.e., beginning of the new mystical decade . . . O, the circle of

return; then k repeated; also Kay, key of knowledge . . . now in our possession, hence, o.k."⁷⁴

Though in somewhat different form in a different metaphorical setting here from those of Ulysses, some common "key" principles are immediately obvious. Vico's view of history was one of identifiable stages repeated in a cyclical pattern, the terminal stage of each cycle being of catastrophic nature and uniting, as it were, end and beginning. The octave metaphor of Ulysses, musical modality, and unifying tonic or keynote are all encompassed in the cardinals' names, the "cycle" of which is ended (or begun) with "Kay O'Kay," not to mention the "key of knowledge" suggestion which may identify the real object of Stephen's search.

In Book III, Chapter 3 of Finnegans Wake, Shaun (now "Yawn") is under inquest by the four old men. When accused by one of the inquisitors of having "606 words in your national vocabulary describing secular kingship (but) not a single vocable for spiritual majesty and no clue of a road leading to salvation,"⁷⁵ he replies in demotic French: "Je M'incline mais Moy joy trovay la clee dang les champs."⁷⁶

⁷⁴ See Finnegans Wake (New York: Viking, 1966), p. 282. The identifications which follow are made by Joseph Campbell and Henry Morton Robinson in A Skeleton Key to "Finnegans Wake" (New York: Harcourt Brace, 1944), p. 178, n. 28.

⁷⁵ Campbell and Morton, p. 291.

⁷⁶ Finnegans Wake, p. 478.

This phrase in its entirety constitutes a reference to the tradition of Saint Patrick's conversion of the Irish to a belief in the Trinity by exhibiting as proof a shamrock plucked from the old sod.⁷⁷ The use of the French in this passage may seem rather puzzling until one notes the possibilities for punning which it provides. The German word for clover is "klee," a form blended with the French "clé" (key) to produce a meaning rendered as "clover-key" by Campbell and Robinson. This punning statement is made by Yawn as he begins to develop his claim to being Saint Patrick himself and the representative of the one true faith.⁷⁸ Patrick's key was instrumental in opening the hearts of the Irish to the doctrines of the true Church. Both Stephen and Bloom lack this particular key, Stephen by conscious rejection and Bloom by ignorance or contrary belief. Stephen, however, would at least recognize in the saint as poet-priest the type of visionary mastery and practical power which sees into the mysteries of the occult and embodies them into the visible forms of the world accessible to the uninitiate. In his present state he himself has much insight into the nature of the formal principles of things but has yet to make the discovery of Saint Patrick, to find the key which will enable him to actualize the forms.

⁷⁷ Campbell and Morton, p. 291.

⁷⁸ Ibid., p. 291, n. 2.

Some of the occasions on which "key" appears in Finnegans Wake seem almost incidental in nature, yet all of them seem to echo or emphasize some essential quality of the term as it is observed in Ulysses. In Stage III of the inquest of Yawn,⁷⁹ the "Exagmination," a voice exclaims: "But there's leps of flam in Funnycoon's Wick. The keyn has passed. Lung lift the keying."⁸⁰ In this brief passage, deceptively simple at first sight, there exists a distant encompassing of death, life, continuity, and a certain impulsive vigor in direct concatenation with the title of the work itself. There is, furthermore, a clearly visible hint of the Vichian cycles and of their synthesizing point of union. "Keying," moreover, is a form of the motif-word hitherto unencountered. It is interesting in itself because it is indicative of a realization of key (or tonality) as process, expansion, movement away from the tonal center into the variations which are natural and requisite to it; in other words, of the octave, and of the possible modalities.

Finally, there is the passage at the end--or the beginning of Finnegans Wake: "Us then. Finn again! Take. Bussoftthee, mememormee! Till thousensthee. Lps. The keys to. Given! A way a lone a last a loved a long the."⁸¹

⁷⁹ The section is identified in the Skeleton Key, pp. 306-08.

⁸⁰ Finnegans Wake, p. 449.

⁸¹ Ibid., p. 628.

Here the key motif is fully a part of Joyce's final, climactic statement, be it taken as "affirmative" or otherwise, of the continuity of things expressed in cyclical modes of being. The endless circularity of the "sentence" with which the book ends is itself the ultimate avatar of Stephen Dedalus' "ineluctable modality."

Chapter IV

HISTORY, MYTH, AND THE VICHIAN CONNECTION: AN EXAMINATION OF THE THEMATIC SIGNIFICANCE OF THE "LITTLE HARRY HUGHES" BALLAD IN "ITHACA"

Giambattista Vico was an eighteenth-century Neapolitan jurisconsult and rhetorician whose major work, The New Science (La Scienza Nuova), was published in three separate editions in the period 1725-1744. Vico bases The New Science on the premise that though the world of nature, created as it is by God, is ultimately unintelligible to man, the world of human society with its laws and the mechanics of its evolution, since it is created by man himself, may be systematically analyzed and understood. From this assumption Vico goes on to develop a complex study of language, literature, philosophy, and history and of the relationships between them. Largely ignored or completely unknown in his own day, Vico came into his own with subsequent generations of scholars who by degrees have recognized in him one of the most brilliant and original philosophic thinkers of his time.

James Joyce encountered Vico at least as early as his Trieste period when he is known to have been reading materials related to the philosopher and his work. It is quite probable, however, that he had some earlier acquaintance with Vico from his studies at University College which required, in part, the reading of various Italian authors. Joyce was especially attracted to two elements of Vico's work. The most prominent of these, especially as it appears in Finnegans Wake, is Vico's cyclic theory of history. The second, less spectacularly obvious but no less pervasive in both Finnegans Wake and Ulysses, is the Vichian idea that myth is essentially a poetic expression of historical reality evolving out of the medium of a folk-like or "vulgar" culture. Such myth-poetry assumes a universal character because it emerges from a collective group awareness of historical fact as perceived by all members of a common culture. Vico is the originator of the so-called "Homeric Question," insisting as he does that Homer was not an actual individual "maker," but rather an idealized repository of the collective historical experience and "popular wisdom" of his society and age.

In the following pages, an attempt has been made to identify and analyze both Vico's cyclic theory of history and his theory of poetic myth as Joyce uses them in Ulysses. It is believed that a coherent pattern of motif and association

relating to these themes exists--a pattern with identifiable beginnings and culmination--the culmination being especially apparent as Stephen's ballad-history "Little Harry Hughes."

VICO AND THE CYCLE OF HISTORY

Vico described history in terms of a cyclical model in the progression of human affairs not unlike that apparent in the stars. Societies, he claimed, are born, live, and die according to immutable laws. Every nation passes through three stages of growth: the divine or theocratic, the heroic, and the human. At the end of each cycle occurs a transitional period of chaos and social disintegration brought about by a "democratic" insistence on individual freedom and an accompanying lack of social discipline. In this fourth historical stage, called by Vico the ricorso (from the Latin currere, "to run"), the learning and civilization of the preceding periods are almost destroyed as men return to a state of near-brutishness. The historical process by no means ends here, however. At this low point of the cycle, upward movement begins again as men hear the voice of God in the incomprehensible and threatening rumbling of the thunder and again feel the impulse to learn and build.¹

¹ Stuart Gilbert, James Joyce's "Ulysses": A Study (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1952), p. 40.

Though Vico describes this societal movement of growth and degeneration as circular, he implies that some portion of the culture achieved previously is preserved, so that an overall upward tendency is apparent.²

The historiographer R. G. Collingwood describes Vico's philosophy of history as one in which certain periods have a "general character" coloring every detail. This general character may reappear in other periods so that it becomes possible to argue analogically from one to the other. Similar epochs tend to occur in the same order. Thus, after the seminal divine or theocratic age appears the heroic period, characterized by government by warrior-aristocracy, an agricultural economy, a ballad literature, and a morality based on personal prowess and loyalty. In the classical period which follows, thought prevails over imagination, prose over poetry, industry over agriculture, and morality comes to be based on peace rather than war. Then appears a so-called "barbarism of reflection"--a new barbarism in which thought still rules, but without creative power, only constructing meaningless networks of artificial and pedantic distinction.

Though the general character of periods persists from cycle to cycle, history never precisely repeats itself; the

² Ibid.

proper symbolic geometrical equivalent of the life of a nation is not the circle but rather a rising spiral. Consequently, the historian observes and analyzes, but does not predict. The Christian barbarism of the Middle Ages, though similar in many respects to the pagan barbarism of the Homeric Age, differs from it in those things which make it "distinctively an expression of the Christian mind."³ This aspect of non-recurrence in Vico's theory is thus in explicit contrast to the old Graeco-Roman idea of a strictly circular movement in history as expressed in the works of Plato, Polybius, and Renaissance historians such as Machiavelli and Campanella.⁴

Thus, according to Vico's theory, the historical cycles occur and recur, impelled by the demands of human nature, not as a mechanically repetitive process, but rather as perpetual variation in the framework of a fundamental regularity.

Samuel Beckett, who calls Vico "that practical round-headed Neapolitan,"⁵ apparently because of the empirical basis for his historical theory, observes that "his exposition

³ R. G. Collingwood, The Idea of History (1946; rpt. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1951), p. 68.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Samuel Beckett, ed., Our Exagmination Round His Factification for Incamination of Work in Progress, 2nd ed. (New York: New Directions, 1962), p. 5.

of the ineluctable circular progression of Society was completely new, although the germ of it was contained in Giordano Bruno's treatment of identified contraries."⁶ This statement is doubly interesting, first by virtue of the coupling of the word "ineluctable," the companion of "modality" in Ulysses, with another kind of circular movement--in this instance, the Vichian historical cycles. "Ineluctable" is not a particularly common word, and though Beckett may have been referring to it independently of Joyce's use of it in Ulysses, such a possibility seems unlikely. To the contrary, what seems much more probable is that he is implying some more than casual relationship between Stephen's "ineluctable modality" in "Proteus" and Vico's circular history. The second point of interest has to do with the mention of the "identified contraries" of Giordano Bruno, which seems to strike a familiar chord with respect to the development of the "Ithaca" episode. Though it is recognized that reference is being made to a specific body of philosophic thought, one cannot help but be reminded of the two "Ithacan" opposites, Stephen and Bloom, who are "identified" or at least in some sense appear to be so, in the course of the action of "Ithaca." Though Beckett, when he makes this statement, is participating in the "exagmination" of Work in Progress, he is still using the vocabulary of Ulysses and is

⁶ Ibid.

obviously still very much concerned with the principles and problems of the earlier work.

Beckett summarizes the Vichian basis for Finnegans Wake, duly cataloguing political and social phenomena detailed in Vico's theory, but visibly emphasizing by means of the phoenix metaphor the cyclical configuration of the growth of historical actuality and the catastrophic nature of its destruction and regeneration:

In the beginning was the thunder: the thunder set free Religion, in its most objective and unphilosophical form--idolatrous animism: Religion produced Society, and the first social men were the cave-dwellers, taking refuge from a passionate Nature: this primitive family life receives its impulse toward development from the arrival of terrified vagabonds: admitted, they are the first slaves: growing stronger, they exact agrarian concessions, and a despotism has evolved into a primitive feudalism: the cave became a city, and the feudal system a democracy: then an anarchy: this is corrected by a return to monarchy: the last stage is a tendency towards interdestruction: the nations are dispersed, and the Phoenix of Society arises out of their ashes.⁷

The ends of Vico's historical process, while being recognized as providential in an ultimate sense, are interpreted differently by different observers. Thomas J. Fitzmorris emphasizes Vico's reliance on Providence as a guiding force in human affairs, observing that he argues that "just as there was in the Divine Mind an idea of the world before its real existence, so there must be an idea of human

⁷ Ibid.

history down to its close."⁸ Vico, asserts this Catholic writer, saw perfectibility as a possible goal, but capable only of being achieved by the direction of God. Vico is described as an "ameliorist," who, with Dante, could agree that "the hypothesis of Providence is the condition of intelligible history."⁹ Fitzmorris also emphasizes the point that Vico did not think of history as rigorously circular or as repeating itself in any exact manner. The cyclic aspect as well as the idea of providential growth are linked together with the principle that since nations have a common nature and go through comparable experiences, each cycle succeeding upon its predecessor gives man a chance to improve himself in the light of history.¹⁰

Whether Joyce would have agreed with or otherwise accepted this sort of interpretation of Vico is problematical. Fitzmorris believes that he would not. For Joyce's purposes, at least in some respects, the Vichian metaphor of the cycle may have been sufficient as well as necessary. In any case, the interplay of historical concepts in Ulysses is quite complex, with widely varying attitudes and views being expressed by the characters. Among the personae of Ulysses who articulate historical "theories," Mr. Deasy is obviously a confirmed ameliorist. Bloom, however, who in "Ithaca" can

⁸ Thomas J. Fitzmorris, "Vico Adamant and Some Pillars of Salt," Catholic World, 156 (February, 1943), 568-77.

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid.

detect no way from the "known" to the "unknown" and Stephen, obsessed with a kaleidoscopic array of philosophical problems growing out of the division between the spirit and the body, seem to accept the thesis of an unalterable, if modulated, consistency in the affairs of men.

The extent to which Joyce made his acquaintance with Vico a personal affair is illustrated in a statement he wrote to Harriet Weaver: "I would not pay overmuch attention to these theories, beyond using them for what they are worth, but they have gradually forced themselves upon me through circumstances of my own life. I wonder where Vico got his fear of thunderstorms. It is almost unknown to all of the male Italians I have met."¹¹ This reference to a fear of thunder is of special interest in that Joyce was himself a victim of this particular phobia. The thunder motif appears conspicuously in both Ulysses and Finnegans Wake, in the "Oxen" episode when the rainstorm comes to break Dublin's drought and to warn the "child-killing" blasphemers of Horne's house of the consequences of their blasphemy, and in the Wake at the end and beginning of each cycle. Strongly reminiscent of the thunderous hundred-letter words of Finnegans Wake is the assonant and alliterative sentence in

¹¹ Richard Ellman, James Joyce (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959), p. 565. The letter from which Ellman is quoting is addressed to Harriet Weaver and is dated May 21, 1926. For the full text see Stuart Gilbert, Letters of James Joyce, I (New York: Viking Press, 1957), p. 241.

the "Oxen" describing the thunderclap: "A black crack of noise in the street here, alack, bawled, back" (388.14).

In this central episode of Ulysses the thunderclap operates in the same way as do those of Finnegans Wake, concluding one "cycle" with the face-to-face encounter of putative father and son and beginning another in which the relationship of the two characters will be further probed and tested. Linked in "oxen," the Odyssean prototype of which has to do with the slaughter of the sacred cattle on Helios' isle and the "technic" of which is "Embryonic development," are cattle and children. The Oxen of the Sun were killed for food by Odysseus' men, who were themselves subsequently destroyed by a thunderbolt for their impiety; cattle are slaughtered, as Bloom would say, "to procure alimentary sustenance" (681.23-24). Children in this episode are "killed" in numerous ways. Contraception is suggested by "Killchild," that "stout shield of oxengut," "cloak," "umbrella," the "Child's murder" case, "French letters," and the mysterious brownmacintosh.¹² A keynote of the section is sounded by the phrase, expressing a feature of orthodox Catholic doctrine, ". . . what of those Godpossibled souls that we nightly impossibilize, which is the sin against the Holy Ghost. . . ?" (383.13-14). In the Christian tradition

¹² W. Y. Tindall, A Reader's Guide to James Joyce (New York: Noonday Press, 1959), p. 199, n. 1.

the child, as son, is the central figure of the sacrificial drama, but the end of this drama is not sterility and death, but renewed life. The thunderclap of the episode serves as a turning point, an end and a beginning, metaphorically in terms of the Odyssean parallel slaying the mockers of fecundity and making possible the union of father and son which the movements of Bloom and Stephen have presaged in earlier episodes, all in a framework of drought ended by rain, new life brought to the waste land by a reviving washing and cleansing.

Joyce's attitude toward the use of Vico is similar to his attitude toward the Homeric substructure of Ulysses. The basic correspondence between the events of Bloomsday and those of the Homeric epic is not between incidents per se but rather between similar situations.¹³ Joyce is concerned not so much with re-creating adventures of Odysseus in contemporary style as he is with depicting, in a modern setting, those elements of human experience which persist from age to age.

Though Vico's name does not appear in Ulysses as insistently as in Finnegans Wake, it does occur in unmistakable form on a few occasions. Significantly, the first explicit mention of the name is in the history lesson of "Nestor" where the mention of "Vico Road, Dalkey" (25.31)

¹³ Hugh Kenner, Dublin's Joyce (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1956), p. 181.

serves to establish the relationship of the concept "history" with Vico's name and by extension with the philosophy of history expounded by him. Another functional aspect of the use of the name is the connection of a geographical feature of the city of Dublin with the idea of history as circular-- a theme otherwise developed in Joyce's frequent references to the Dublin tramcars with their cyclical rounds.

The thunderclap in the "Oxen of the Sun" episode, while not linked with any overt reference to Vico's name itself, is so similar to those of Finnegans Wake in its form and in its crucial placement in the action of Ulysses that Joyce's purpose in including it emerges, at one level at least, as clearly based on Vichian principles. Certain critics¹⁴ have identified the climax of Ulysses as Stephen's smashing of the lamp in "Circe," with its "Time's livid final flame . . . ruin of all space, shattered glass and toppling masonry" (567.28, 568.1), but if this is indeed some kind of termination or turning point, it must surely be that of a final impulse, borne of the frustration of intellectual attempts to reconcile form and matter (as implied in the "octave" sequences preceding), to strike out at the perversely unreconcilable physical substance of the world. To interpret

¹⁴ Notably Harry Levin. See Levin, James Joyce: A Critical Introduction (1941; rpt. Norfolk, Connecticut: New Directions, 1960), p. 73.

this action as the climax of Ulysses is to recognize only partially what the work is really about, to stress Stephen's intellectual crisis as budding artist and to ignore the monolithic presence of Bloom as mature and knowledgeable man of the world. If the primary thematic burden of the work has to do with the coming together of Stephen and Bloom, whatever they may represent in a symbolic sense, the thunderclap, as distinctly Vichian as in any of its contexts in Finnegans Wake, must be recognized as that point at which their meeting becomes possible and as providing the motivation which enables the Ulyssean cycle of history to complete itself, the sundered "tonalities" of Father and Son to return from most distant fifth to reconciliatory keynote in the octave. Mulligan and his friends mock paternity, but Bloom's patient, watchful, and magnetic presence confirms it, or at least affirms its possibility. Such an affirmation, it may be observed, is about as positive as any the ironic fabric of Ulysses at any place supplies.

In his essay "Vico and Joyce," A. Walton Litz points out the fact that Bloom, toward the end of his day in the "Eumaeus" episode, thinks of "the vogue of Dr. Tibble's Vi-Cocoa." This, he feels, indicates that Joyce had at least a conceptual alertness to Vico in the composition of Ulysses, though he may not at this time have had in mind any

systematic symbolic application of Vico's historical principles.¹⁵ The locations in the work of the three references to Vico, however, early, in "Nestor," central, in "Oxen," and late, in "Eumaeus," seem to have an inherent organizational autonomy, indicating a constant preoccupation at a structural level and hence certainly at a thematic one, with Vico and his philosophy. Also of interest is the fact that in the first instance, Stephen is the central figure, in the second, Bloom and Stephen appear and are involved together, and in the third, when again both characters are present, "Vi-Cocoa" and its vogue occur to Bloom, who has already given chocolate to Zoe in the brothel and who will offer "Epps's massproduct" to Stephen somewhat later, in "Ithaca."¹⁶

The presence in the text and the specific location of these three unmistakable allusions to Vico, whatever the total pattern of their usefulness may be, structural, thematic, or both, serve as cues to establish an awareness

¹⁵ See A. Walton Litz, "Vico and Joyce" in Giambattista Vico, An International Symposium, ed. Giorgio Tagliacozzo and Hayden V. White (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1969), p. 249.

¹⁶ These three occurrences are identified by both Litz and W. Y. Tindall. S. L. Goldberg makes note of the first two, but to complete the triad adds rather the general concept of circularity which he finds throughout Ulysses as well as in Finnegans Wake. This critic, objecting to what he considers Tindall's too particular and mechanical exegesis of much of the symbolism in Ulysses, ignores "Vi-Cocoa," apparently believing it either unessential or disproportionately emphasized by Tindall.

in the reader's mind of an idea which "frames" Ulysses and which is repeated continuously in the situations, imagery, and symbolism of the book.¹⁷ The line of Finnegans Wake which so explicitly embodies Joyce's fictional use of Vico, "The Vico road goes round and round to meet where terms begin" (FW 452.21-22) thus finds its germ, as a kind of developmental imperative, in the events of Bloomsday.

To confirm the importance of any relationship between Ulysses and the historical theories of Vico it is necessary to determine the extent to which Joyce was actually concerned with history and its problems in the work. The Vico motif, though its appearances are strategically placed, is encountered less often in its overt forms than are many (for example, the Don Giovanni motif which relates to the characterization of Bloom, the "assumed dongiovannist") the serious thematic possibilities of which are dramatically more limited. Gilbert says that Vico wanted to write a universal "ideal and timeless history," and as has already been noted, suggests that Joyce was attempting to objectify that desire in Finnegans Wake.¹⁸ Ulysses, of course, is another matter, and to assume a Vichian or any other historical preoccupation on

¹⁷ Litz maintains that these and other identifiable uses of Vico are part of a kind of private "rehearsal" of themes and techniques which Joyce was to use later in Finnegans Wake and not necessarily directed toward the reader's perceptions.

¹⁸ Gilbert, p. 40.

the statistically slight grounds to be detected seems rather foolhardy at best.

But concrete evidence of a fundamental and organic thematic undergirding involving history is not, in fact, at all hard to come by in Ulysses; the theme of history is well-developed and pervasive and seems to lie at the heart of the most basic motivations of the work. In "Telemachus," the first episode, Haines introduces the idea of the tyranny of history in his reaction to Stephen's identification of his two "masters," Roman church and English state. "I can understand that," he says. "An Irishman must think like that, I daresay. We feel in England that we have treated you rather unfairly. It seems history is to blame" (22.17-19). Later, in "Oxen of the Sun," in the scene conjured up before the convives (in a style identified as that of the Gothic novel)¹⁹ by "Malachias" Mulligan, Haines reappears, announcing "with an eldritch laugh," "I anticipated some such reception . . . for which it seems, history is to blame" (405.15-17). Stephen, backsliding Irishman as he is, still is Irish enough to feel an antipathy for the English, and this antipathy is signally reinforced by Haines' rather unsettling nightmares involving a black panther. [Ironically, Haines, even though English and somewhat condescending in his

¹⁹ Harry Blamires, The Bloomsday Book: A Guide Through Joyce's "Ulysses" (London: Methuen, 1966), p. 160.

pursuit of all things Celtic--besides being anti-Semitic--is actually quite amiable, and in the "wandering Rocks" segment, demonstrates more confidence than does Mulligan in Stephen's ability to produce a work of art by the end of his self-allotted ten-year period (246). Moreover, whatever Stephen's feeling towards Haines, he feels no apparent compunction against smoking his cigarettes (21).]

A view of history more cosmic in its scope than that of Haines, though strongly tinged with irony due to the circumstances of its exposition, is that proposed by one of the revelers in Horne's hall, "Mr. V. Lynch (Bacc. Arith.)," in the form of "An ingenious suggestion . . . that both nativity and mortality, as well as all other phenomena of evolution, tidal movements, lunar phases . . . everything, in fine . . . is subject to a law of numeration as yet unascertained" (412.13-20). But though the symbolism of "Oxen," including especially the Homeric parallel, gives the appearance of militating against the drunken and sacrilegious mockers of whom Lynch is one, his "ingenious suggestion" should not be taken too lightly, but rather incorporated into the body of historical viewpoints carefully assembled by Joyce as his book develops. Stuart Gilbert finds evidence of Pythagorean elements in Ulysses, and Joyce was indeed known to have displayed considerable interest in Pythagorean theories of

numerology.²⁰ A numerological theory as expounded by Lynch, with its providential connotations for human history, would have probably been seen by Joyce as a matter worthy of serious consideration. That he puts it in the mouth of Lynch is consonant with the ironic method of the episode and of the entirety of Ulysses. Hardly is there any assertion made anywhere in the work but that it is somehow in the same breath diminished, ridiculed, and met with its polar opposite. But though the reader's judgment of the content of Lynch's theory is no doubt influenced by his opinion of the theorizer himself, numerology as a basis for the interpretation of historical phenomena, being neither a new nor original idea, must be evaluated outside the medium provided by the "Oxen" episode. The presence of the theory is evidence that Joyce had already done so, but as required by his esthetic, he is careful to restrict himself to the proposal and to avoid "disposition" of whatever issues his characters may raise.²¹

²⁰ Gilbert, p. 68.

²¹ The method of Ulysses, in its largest and truest sense, is one of total irony, the end result of a process apparent in the earlier works. One of the most oddly ambiguous sentences of A Portrait of the Artist appears after Stephen's "conversation," when he asks himself, "I have amended my life, have I not?" (PA 153.28). In Ulysses, a syntactic counterpart of this is placed in the mouth of Lynch, who in quite a different vein, in Aeolus, asks the rhetorical question, "We will sternly refuse to partake of strong waters, will we not?"; then provides the answer, "Yes, we will not. By no manner of means" (142.16-17). The irony of A Portrait is a powerful undercurrent, but it is muted; in Ulysses, irony becomes more than technique, having by this time taken on as well the aspect of theme.

Where judgment is obviously withheld by Joyce himself, the reader, bound by the logical demands of the text, feels intellectually compelled to follow the path laid out for him. But there is an emotional undercurrent in Ulysses which seems to demand resolution in more positive terms than those afforded by a non-assertive esthetic. Thus Bloom, rebuffed and despised for his obvious absurdities, grows in the course of the day because of his sense of justice and inherent awareness of the way of the world into a figure of almost heroic, if flawed, stature. Haines, in large measure, is an idle dilettante, and Lynch, one of Mulligan's circle and ilk, is essentially shallow and vicious. The historical conceptions of these two characters share the quality of an unfelt abstraction, imposed mechanically on those qualities of experience which fall most readily into their limited ken. Their "theories" are both incidental and commonplace and therein serve as foils to the deliberate and even agonizing speculations of Stephen and the heartfelt and reasonable effusions of Bloom. Though this be true, however, history as seen by Haines and Lynch cannot be dismissed as totally inconsequential. "History is to blame," regardless of its source, or perhaps because of it, and the nature of providential reality loom ever larger during the advancing hours of June 16, 1904, as Stephen and Bloom pursue their courses toward the goal of their fateful encounter.

For Stephen and Bloom, the influence of history is felt as well as thought. In Mr. Deasy's study, as he is receiving his month's wages, Stephen in his mind's eye sees the sovereigns, crowns, and shillings counted out before him as part of "An old pilgrim's hoard, dead treasure, hollow shells" (30.35-36). Each element of this interior description serves to depict something of Stephen's private vision of history as embodied in the "Nestorian" money, school, and study. The modifiers "old," "dead," and "hollow" are not simply tone-words, but emphasize a deep disillusionment with history as defined and accepted by the pragmatic Ulsterman. Such history is only a collection of hollow shells,²² shells "whorled as an emir's turban," rigidly encircling and encasing a hollow emptiness. This is the cyclical history which critics such as Fitzmorris would have Joyce impute to Vico. Such an interpretation, however, vastly oversimplifies Joyce's position in Ulysses, since Stephen, as one of the work's two chief exponents of thematic material, while recognizing this concept of history, in the most explicit and pointed terms reacts against it.

²² It is interesting that when Stuart Gilbert analyzes the "empty fifths" played by Stephen on the piano in "Circe," he affixes to "fifths" the adjective "hollow," which does not, in fact, appear in the text. It is easy to see, however, how Gilbert may have transposed the two words, since "hollow shells" and "empty fifths" both have a "modal" significance, and since the circularity implied in each may be either directly or indirectly related to Vico's history.

Though obviously much concerned with the problem of observing history in terms of a coherent and meaningful pattern, Joyce, as author, nowhere intrudes with a personal interpretation autonomous to Ulysses itself. In "Nestor," as elsewhere, he is content to allow the philosophical meaning of the work, the esthetic element of which demands a static unassertiveness, to reveal itself symbolically through the speeches and actions of the characters. He remains aloof here, maintaining his Homeric non-involvement in anticipation of whatever negations or syntheses of the various historical theories are to be discerned in "Ithaca" at the end of the Bloomsday cycle.

The Deasian version of historical truth and Stephen's contrary view are neatly and amply demonstrated by a segment of dialogue which follows Stephen's acceptance of his "whelks and money cowries and leopard shells," reference to parts of which has already been made:

"History," Stephen said, "is a nightmare from which I am trying to awake."

From the playfield the boys raised a shout. A whirring whistle: goal. "What if the nightmare gave you a back kick?"

"The ways of the Creator are not our ways," Mr. Deasy said. "All history moves toward one great goal, the manifestation of God."

Stephen jerked his thumb toward the window, saying: "That is God."

"Hooray! Ay! Whrrwhee!"

"What?" Mr. Deasy asked.

"A shout in the street," Stephen answered.

(35.19-25)

Mr. Deasy's statement about history moving toward the manifestation of God is based on a premise that Stephen feels bound to reject--that God and history, spirit and substance, are essentially separate and discrete, that they exist as a duality in which one has only minimal, or perhaps only theoretical, interaction with the other, though tending toward some, possibly an apocalyptic, unity. This explanation of history, as seen through Stephen's eyes, has much in common with the view of the heresiarch Arius, who denied the consubstantiality of Father and Son. Its implications are far-reaching in Ulysses. If the Father, or Spirit, is not made immanent in His creation through the agency of the Logos, or Son, paternity may indeed be, as Stephen observes in the library, "a legal fiction" (205.6-7), matter must forever be formless and inert, history must remain a pile of hollow shells "heaped in [a] cold stone mortar" (30.33). Without the presence of the Father in the Son, the artistic goal of fusing content and form is an impossibility, the skill of the "fabulous artificer" is a delusion, the artist must resign himself to being a "lapwing" Icarus, falling to an inevitable doom, and the communion of Bloom and Stephen at the end of the day must be an empty and meaningless parody, submerged in the dreary futility of a world of the dead.

Stephen's idea of God as "a shout in the street," not at all a bit of facetious whimsy, represents a thoughtful and

serious intellectual effort to unify the Creator and His creation, to infuse matter with soul and in doing so to make the position of the aspiring artist a tenable one. It is the need to establish this spiritual-physical connection which provokes the philosophical speculations on "modality" in "Proteus" and elsewhere, with their persistent references to Aristotle and the concept of the entelechy, the Aristotelian combination of form and content by which the philosopher sought to counteract the idealistic dualism of Plato. When, in "Eumaeus," Stephen, meeting Bloom's gaze, perceives in his companion Christus and secundum carnem, he seems to recognize both Bloom's humanity²³ and the divinity therein. A little later, unresisting, he allows himself to be led to his companion's "strange habitation" and to the altar of his hearthstone.

Bloom, though he, as Lenehan admits to M'Coy (232.2), has "a touch of the artist" about him, would probably be bemused rather than enlightened by the metaphysical puzzles of Stephen's philosophizing concerning history. In his own way, however, he feels as acutely as does Stephen the oppressiveness of a history which tyrannizes rather than liberates. He seems, moreover, to be aware of history as in actuality operating on one level while possessing a potential for functioning at another, higher level. Man of the commonplace

²³ W. Y. Tindall, Reader's Guide to James Joyce, p. 217.

as he is, Bloom's perceptions are quite close to the natural phenomena of the human body and the earth, and it is not surprising to see him interpret history in terms of the cyclical patterns of the seasons and of human life. In "Nausicaa," after Gerty McDowell's limping departure, he muses, "The year returns. History repeats itself. Ye crags and peaks I'm with you once again. . . . All quiet on Howth now. The distant hills seem. Where we. The rhododendrons. . . . All that old hill has seen. Names change: that's all" (370.21-28). Later in the same passage the influence of the cyclical outlines of human experience falls into a personal context as he continues to think of Molly and himself: "She kissed me. My youth. Never again. . . . Curious she an only child, I an only child. So it returns. Think you're escaping and run into yourself. Longest way round is the shortest way home" (370.30,38-40).

Bloom's conception of the basis of history, as might be expected, takes an odd turn in "Circe," the episode of odd turns, however, where rather than reiterating his cyclical theme, he utters in fragmentary and inverted phrases of uncertain or multiple tense what amounts to an effacement of all temporal distinctions: "I wanted to have now concluded. Nightdress was never. Hence this. But tomorrow a new day will be. Past was is today. What now is will then tomorrow

as now was be past yester" (504.5-7). Much of the action of "Circe" occurs as masks are methodically stripped away to reveal the interior reality of character and situation. What Bloom seems to be trying to express is a deeper perception of reality, a kind of reality in which phenomena are not experienced in perpetual circularity, in risings and fallings and departures from and returns to the self, but simultaneously. This brief and garbled speech thus brings him into a yet closer relationship with Stephen, to whom the esthetic stasis is the artistic equivalent of God's view of creation. Bloom does indeed have "a touch of the artist about him." This quality, which grows from the impulse to "escape" history, provides the real bond between Bloom and Stephen and leads to the communion of Bloom's kitchen.

Perhaps the most fundamental aspect of Bloom's understanding of history is a function of his status as common man. He yearns for a "revision" of history based on human and social considerations. "But it's no use," he exclaims to the Citizen and John Wyse Nolan in Barney Kiernan's pub. "Force, hatred, history, all that. That's not life for men and women, insult and hatred. And everybody knows that it's the very opposite of that that's really life. . . . Love. . . . I mean the opposite of hatred" (327.12-17).

Where Stephen would spiritualize history Bloom would humanize it. The insight of these two consummately

dissimilar characters is thus seen to be very similar indeed; perhaps Joyce wishes to imply that it is ultimately the same. Both reach out for a revivification of the dead, Stephen the metaphysician and esthete in metaphysical terms with the entelechy, Bloom, the competent, if keyless, citizen, in human terms with love. Intellect and emotion are thus depicted as seeking the same end--to give life to the lifeless. The degree to which they are compatible is certainly one of the chief problems of Ulysses. Whatever the outcome of the kitchen scene of "Ithaca" with its imagery of communion and sacrificial "Little Harry Hughes" ballad, its meaning must be interpreted as a matter of the relationship of these two opposites. Paternity may be a "legal fiction," or the creator, as Shakespeare, God, or Joyce himself may be "all in all." Either possibility presents itself as an equally reasonable alternative, depending upon the degree of reality with which the "Ithacan" communion is invested by the reader.

Litz, citing Clive Hart in a symposium on Vico, observes of Joyce's use of the philosopher in Finnegans Wake that "Joyce alters Vico's tripartite cycle and exalts the brief Vichian ricorso until it becomes the crucial moment in history."²⁴ The same tendency is apparent in Ulysses, which

²⁴ Litz, "Vico and Joyce," p. 251. Here Litz is referring to Clive Hart, Structure and Motif in "Finnegans Wake" (Northwestern University: Northwestern University Press, 1962), pp. 50-53.

also has its ricorsi, instances occurring at the points of juncture of the dramatic and philosophical contraries of the work, in which the onrushing progression of events is momentarily suspended in a convulsive and cataclysmic violence which both destroys and creates, in which are contained simultaneously the inevitability of death and the conception of new life. These moments in Ulysses, specifically, the thunder scene in "Oxen of the Sun" and the "Little Harry Hughes" sequence in "Ithaca," may, in fact, be considered as turning points in the work. This is true of the one in that it shows (as previously indicated) the mockers of fertility being symbolically destroyed for their impiety while Bloom's and Stephen's closer acquaintance is made possible, and of the second in that while it is being enacted whatever communal interaction or mingling which may be possible between the two protagonists is consummated.

Bloom and Stephen have been described as united by "the figure of the Sufferer, the victim of history,"²⁵ and this, it seems, is precisely the case, as established by the sacrificial imagery and symbolism "uniting" them in "Ithaca." They are the same by virtue of their attempts to free themselves from the imperatives of history--violence, unreason, kinetic reactions to forces outside themselves--and to live

²⁵ S. L. Goldberg, The Classical Temper: A Study of James Joyce's "Ulysses" (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1961), p. 169.

as nearly as possible on their own terms.²⁶ The special difficulty of Stephen's situation is revealed by the contrasts his state offers to the condition of Bloom. Contrasted with the actuality of Bloom's freedom and maturity is Stephen's mere potentiality; with Bloom's wisdom, Stephen's knowledge; with Bloom's love, Stephen's bitterness; with Bloom's acceptance of life and "equanimity," Stephen's "uneasy division"; with Bloom's waking, Stephen's nightmare.²⁷ Yet Stephen's goal is a worthy and noble one: as a true artist, to create a static art, a vision of reality which would impose stasis on history, which would locate the still point of the turning world. Much of his agony derives from his awareness of history as kinetic, but also from the understanding that he is himself caught up in kinesis--is himself kinetic. History is kinesis, as Stephen defines the terms, and he demonstrates a willingness to give up a great deal to achieve a superior, static condition of insight. But the act of freedom is a sacrificial act to which he does not in Ulysses openly demonstrate willingness to go "consenting" until perhaps in his commentary on the ballad he sings to Bloom.

The ironic counterpart of Stephen's "consenting," with its implicit acceptance of the humanity of Bloom, is Bloom's own apprehension of the duality of things. Caught up as he

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ Ibid.

is in the relentless periodicity of the flesh, he is not hopeful, either in terms of his possible future relationship with Stephen or of the larger pattern of all humanity in the world. The clown of Albert Henger's circus was not Bloom's son (680), and the florin marked "for circulation on the waters of civic finance" (681.9-10) did not return. The octaves they entail were not completed. Incidental as these events may seem, it is significant that they should occur to Bloom in relation to the events of "Ithaca," for they seem to correspond to a feeling on Bloom's part that paternity for him is impossible, and to use Stephen's term, "modality" (implying the existence of a "key") as well. Perhaps understanding, and certainly feeling more acutely than Stephen "the generic conditions imposed by human law, as integral parts of the human whole" (681.21-23), Bloom understands the human condition as one in which historical circumstance is bound by "the irreparability of the past" (680.36) and "the imprevidability of the future" (681.5). The universe of his perception is not Stephen's "heaventree," nor "heavengrot," "heavenbeast," nor "heavenman" (686). It is not susceptible of being "formed"; no metaphor stands in any organic relation to it. It is summed up and epitomized by the immutable cycle of "the fact of vital growth, through convulsions of metamorphosis, from infancy through maturity to decay" (681.33-35). Lacking Stephen's idealism, he regards paternity

as a condition of physical continuity which, affirming the consequence of the individual in time and space, links past to present. Like Stephen, however, Bloom perceives the sacrificial quality of the states of fatherhood and son-hood. He would understand Stephen's "Bridebed, childbed, bed of death" in "Proteus" (48.33) not only as an expression of the cycle of human life, but also in terms of a universal blood ritual by which all men are born, live, and die.

Samuel Beckett, contrasting in the Exagmination the providence of Vico with that of the seventeenth-century historian Bossuet, makes the distinction that Bossuet's providence was "transcendental and miraculous" while that of Vico was "immanent and the stuff of human life itself." For Vico, the individual and the universal were not to be considered distinct; history, therefore, was not a formless structure, but was due to the actions of individuals and possessed no reality apart from them.²⁸ Stephen, in his quest for the entelechy, is reaching out for the identical conclusion. This is the key to his relationship with Bloom. When he describes "Little Harry Hughes," the protagonist and the victim of his ballad, as challenged and held "unresisting" by "an apparition of hope and youth" and as led to a strange habitation where, "consenting," he is immolated, he is describing, in language scarcely veiled, his own

²⁸ Beckett, pp. 6-7.

experience as well as that of his Jewess' victim. Stephen's own "consent" may reside in a simple abandonment of self due to a fatigue-induced indifference, or it may be a matter of his discerning in Bloom the physical part required for the objectification of the animating spirit residing in things. As is the case throughout Ulysses, the situation is an equivocal one. That Stephen is singing about himself in the ballad, as well as about the ballad's textual persona, is suggested so strongly in the situation of "Ithaca" that the possibility cannot be ignored.

This view of Ulysses requires that the book be not about paternity, but rather about the unification of contraries. Thus Stephen and Bloom, symbolic contraries, are observed to meet, sunder, and go their way again. Beckett pursues this theme further in considering the differences between Dante's Purgatory and what he sees as a Joycean Purgatory in Ulysses and Finnegans Wake. Dante's, he says, is conical and "implies culmination," whereas Joyce's is spherical and "excludes culmination." In the one is present both progression and a "guaranteed consummation"; in the other, flux, "progression or retrogression," and a consummation only "apparent." Movement in Dante's Purgatory is forward movement, representing advance; movement in Joyce's may be considered either non- or multi-directional, "and a step forward is, by definition, a step back." The

point of this argument is summarized in the following rhetorical question and answer: "In what sense, then, is Mr. Joyce's work Purgatorial? In the absolute sense of the absolute. Hell is the static lifelessness of unrelieved viciousness. Paradise the static lifelessness of unrelieved immaculation. Purgatory is a flood of movement and vitality released by the conjunction of these two elements."²⁹

The conditions necessary to the depiction of this "flood of movement and vitality" in art were understood by Joyce--drawing from Vico--to be, paradoxically, those of the static artifact. Hugh Kenner observes: "For Vico as for Joyce, human events obeyed the contours of human situations, the static artifact educes intelligible form from an almost infinite number of particular cases; Stephen and Bloom act according as they are, and they are as all confrontations of action and passion, pride and virtue, rebellion and orthodoxy, or tradition and the individual talent: these are not identical but analogous relationships."³⁰

Critics have decried what they perceive as a casuistic or even anti-thematic quality in Joyce's work. Such criticism, while based on perceptible and real characteristics, however, actually falls quite wide of the mark. While it is true that Joyce, as Sidney's poet, "nothing affirmeth," his reticence is esthetically as well as philosophically

²⁹ Ibid., p. 22.

³⁰ Kenner, p. 335.

motivated. In "Ithaca," Stephen affirms "his significance as a conscious rational animal proceeding from the known to the unknown" (683.4-5); later he perceives the "heaventree" which symbolically unites micro- and macrocosm. His view is, after all, not altogether unlike that of Mr. Deasy, for whom history is a movement toward the manifestation of God, except that he demands of history the Aristotelian entelechy rather than the Platonic separation of real and ideal. For Stephen, history is not a movement toward the manifestation of God-- God is immanent in things, manifesting Himself from moment to moment in so gratuitous an event as a shout in the street. Soul, the ideal, can realize itself only in a world of becoming, in which that which is formless undergoes a process of being informed. Bloom, who is the real polar opposite of both Stephen and Mr. Deasy, though committed to the principle of "improvement all round" (627.24), is firmly linked to the realities of earth, rejecting the heaventree as a utopia and, alone, perceiving rather the "cold of interstellar space, thousands of degrees below freezing point or the absolute zero of Fahrenheit, Centigrade or Reaumur. . ." (689.14-16). For him there is "no known method from the known to the unknown" (686.3-4).

Mr. Deasy's theory of history is one of a straight line, implying a dichotomy of spirit and matter which makes Lycidas a "ghost story" to Stephen. Bloom rejects "force, hatred,

history, all that" but seems to accept the cyclical inevitability of "generic conditions imposed by natural, as distinct from human law . . . the agonies of birth and death . . . the fact of vital growth, through convulsions of metamorphosis, from infancy through maturity to decay" (681.25-35). Geometrical analogies are limited in their usefulness, however, and can be deceptive in the analysis of Ulysses. Stephen in a sense rejects both father-figures in his demand that God be in the world, that history be a unitary composite of both matter and spirit. But he has learned much in the course of the day and is now aware of the sacrificial imperative of history. In the morning of Bloomsday he thinks of Pyrrhus and Caesar, victims of history, whose suppositional living counterparts "are not to be thought away" (26.15-16), but to Bloom, in the early hours of a new day, he sings "Little Harry Hughes." The appearance of the ballad with its sacrificial overtones indicates a new awareness on Stephen's part that history demands, and must have its victim, that it is through the sacrificial death that history in its physical reality encounters spirit, is united with it, and is revitalized.

Stephen's Aquinian esthetic demands stasis in art, and it is stasis that Joyce seeks in Ulysses. He sees the goal of the artistic process and the essence of the esthetic experience as a condition of emotional and intellectual

suspension in a non-dimensional state between opposite assertions. Artistic and esthetic truth "goes" nowhere; it is non-assertive, exists both outside of space and time and within all space and time--as Browne's Hermetic Circle (and Bruno's infinite universe)--whose center is everywhere and whose circumference nowhere.³¹ As Stephen the guest explicates his ballad to Bloom the host, it seems that the "consenting" of his ballad-victim may denote an equanimity similar to that of Bloom within the explicator himself, and that both host and guest may share in the larger assent implicit in Molly's "yes," a word which unifies all and moves all in the immemorial dance of the "Convoy wheeling encircling about the gigantig's lifetree."

VICO AND MYTH

In his book The Classical Temper, S. L. Goldberg, while admitting the influence of Vico on Ulysses, raises a question regarding the chief form that influence assumes. Disputing the thesis that there is a direct link between The New Science and Ulysses, Goldberg insists to the contrary that if there were such an influence, it would more likely be that of Vico's theories of Homeric myth and his teleology rather

³¹ Browne attributes to Hermes: Sphaera, cujus centrum ubique, circum, ferentia nullibi. For a detailed discussion of Bruno's cosmology see Antoinette Mann Paterson, The Infinite Worlds of Giordano Bruno (Springfield, Illinois: Charles C. Thomas, 1970), pp. 9-50.

than his "less important and original theory of historical cycles," which it is claimed may be more relevant to Finnegans Wake.³² While questioning the importance of the concept of historical cycles in Ulysses, Goldberg goes on to insist that this idea plays, as well, "a much less obvious part" in the work of Vico himself than would be apparent from the mass of critical comment relating to it--that, in fact, Vico (as Mr. Deasy in "Nestor") saw history as moving "to one great goal of historical understanding."³³

Benedetto Croce, in the "Giambattista Vico" chapter of his Aesthetic, establishes a kind of rationale for Goldberg's position regarding Joyce's presumed use of Vichian ideas. Vico, he says, may be credited with having "actually discovered the true nature of poetry and art and, so to speak, invented the science of Aesthetic. . . ."³⁴ Ulysses, a book dealing in some way with just about everything, is about nothing if not "the true nature of poetry and art," a matter with which Vico is thus identified as being profoundly concerned.

The Vico chapter of the Aesthetic, the early pages of which read almost like a theoretical handbook for the

³² Goldberg, pp. 327-28, n. 13.

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ Benedetto Croce, Aesthetic as Science of Expression and General Linguistic, tr. Douglas Ainslie (London: Macmillan, 1922), p. 220.

composition of Ulysses, was certainly a tract with which Joyce was intimately familiar. Richard Ellman states that Joyce had once borrowed the Aesthetic from one Dario de Tuoni,³⁵ and that in conversations pursued in the course of English lessons given to the Triestine lawyer Paolo Cuzzi in the period from 1911 to 1913, Joyce revealed himself to be "passionately interested" in Vico.³⁶ A remark of Joyce from these conversations as recalled by Cuzzi that "Freud had been anticipated by Vico"³⁷ indicates an understanding on Joyce's part of one aspect of Vico's theories--the existence of an evolutionary development of psychic or intellectual levels or stages--which though not capable of being divorced from the theory of cycles, tends more in the direction of esthetic considerations.

Vico's basic three ages, as described by Samuel Beckett, are the Theocratic, the Heroic, and the Human, and are paralleled by a corresponding classification of the developmental stages of language. This classification consists of the "Hieroglyphic" (sacred), the "Metaphorical" (poetic), and the "Philosophical" (capable of abstraction and generalization)³⁸ and is based on the notion of an intellectual movement from primitive emotionalism toward

³⁵ Ellman, p. 351, n. 4.

³⁶ Ibid., p. 351.

³⁷ Ibid., p. 351, n. 2.

³⁸ Beckett, p. 4.

abstraction and rationalism. According to Vico, poetry is a product of the Metaphorical stage of linguistic development, and is to be identified with a low (but not the lowest) level of intellectual development. Poetry is not "an ingenious popular expression of philosophical conceptions or an amusing social diversion or an exact science in reach of everyone in possession of the recipe"; it is rather "born of curiosity, daughter of ignorance."³⁹

The first men, as envisaged by Vico, had to create poetry as an act of imagination; the barbarous mind, incapable of analysis and abstraction, must use fantasy to explain the phenomena of the world.⁴⁰ Poetry is a function of the senses and finds its true opposite in the rational. The nature of this antithetical state of poetry and metaphysics is described in specific terms by Vico in The New Science: "By the very nature of poetry it is impossible for anyone to be at the same time a sublime poet and a sublime metaphysician, for metaphysics attracts the mind from the senses, and the poetic faculty must submerge the whole mind in the senses; metaphysics soars up to universals, and the poetic faculty must plunge deep into particulars."⁴¹

³⁹ Ibid., p. 9. ⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹ Giambattista Vico, The New Science of Giambattista Vico, trans., abr., and rev. Thomas Goddard Bergin and Max Harold Fisch (Garden City, New York: Anchor Books, 1961), p. 261.

Other passages from The New Science are enlightening in that they may be seen almost certainly to have figured in Joyce's formulation and delineation of the characters and plot of Ulysses and to have transcended even these in their particular aspects to stand in a fundamental relationship with his idea of the sources and functions of art and his concept of himself as Homeric avatar. In his exposition of Vico's ideas regarding the origins of poetry, Croce cites a paragraph from the Scienza nuova seconda on the metamorphoses of the human intellect and the kinds of mental activity appropriate to each which seems to prefigure in a theoretical and "ideal" setting the characters of Bloom and Stephen: "Men at first feel without being aware; next they become aware with a perturbed and agitated soul, finally they reflect with an undisturbed mind. This Aphorism is the Principle of poetical sentences which are formed by the sense of passions and affections, differing thereby from philosophical sentences which are formed by reflection through ratiocination; whence the latter approach more nearly to truth as they rise towards the universal, while the former have more of certainty the more they approach

the individual."⁴² When one attempts to create poetry in an age of rationality, says Croce, he returns in effect to a state of childhood, and "putting his mind in fetters" no longer reflects with his intellect but, following imagination, "loses himself in the particular."⁴³

Joyce's notion of himself as following an Homeric pattern of creative effort and the kind of effort represented by the epic qualities of Ulysses might have been formulated directly from another statement of Vichian principles quoted from La Scienza Nuova by Croce:

The studies of Metaphysics and Poetry are in natural opposition one to the other, for the former purges the mind of childish prejudice and the latter immerses and drowns it in the same: the former offers resistance to the judgment of the senses, while the latter makes this its chief rule: the former debilitates, the latter strengthens imagination: the former prides itself in not turning spirit into body, the latter does its utmost to give a body to spirit: hence the thoughts of the former must necessarily be abstract, while the concepts of

⁴² Croce, Aesthetic, p. 221. The passage quoted is paragraph liii of the Elements. See Bergin and Fisch, pp. 33-34. Beckett (Exagmination, p. 10) explores the implications of Vico's theory of the origin of poetry while recognizing this dichotomy. "Before articulation," he says, "comes song, before abstractions, metaphors. The figurative character of the oldest poetry must be regarded, not as sophisticated confectionery, but as evidence of a poverty-stricken vocabulary and of a disability to achieve abstraction. . . . Metaphysics purge the mind of the senses and cultivate the disembodiment of the spiritual; Poetry is all passion and feeling and animates the inanimate . . . poets are the sense, philosophers the intelligence of humanity."

⁴³ Ibid.

the latter show best when most clothed with matter: to sum up, the former strives that the learned may know the truth of things stripped of all passion: the latter that the vulgar may act truly by means of intense excitement of the senses, without which stimulant they assuredly would not act at all. Hence from all times, in all languages known to man, never has there been a strong man equally great as metaphysician and poet: such a poet as Homer, father and prince of poetry.⁴⁴

Joyce, while recognizing that the technique and even the content of "Ithaca" might confront the reader with special difficulties, nevertheless must have written the episode with the conviction that even a general sense of the direction of the broad movements of theme within Ulysses would lead ultimately to one more or less specific kind of insight. The name "Ithaca" itself, in its native Homeric context, implies an ending, a homecoming, and a resolution of dramatic conflict; and whatever ironic connotations may actually exist in the convergence of narrative structure and thematic content of this segment of Ulysses which concludes its direct parallelism to the Odyssey, a resolution of sorts, however qualified, certainly does occur. Though the surface of "Ithaca" is one of almost painfully intense physicality, this is also the chapter of the mystical "heaventree" which for Stephen the poet is the metaphor which unifies the earthly and cosmic worlds, the known and the unknown.⁴⁵ Metaphysics, which Vico

⁴⁴ Ibid., p. 222.

⁴⁵ Bloom's version of the cosmic tree is perhaps the more prosaic though no less vital symbol, the plum tree.

would identify with spirit or intellect, and Poetry, which he would link with body, are present in the persons of Bloom and Stephen, characters "in natural opposition one to the other." The intent to emulate Homer, termed by Vico "strong man equally great as metaphysician and poet," or perhaps more correctly, to re-create on an esthetic level the conditions of the Homeric epic art, is a basic impulse of Ulysses. It must be understood, however, as an aspect of the work distinct, if not completely isolated, from the parallelism of incident the identification and labeling of which even now continues to consume so much effort by so many critics. Vico's presence is everywhere evident in Joyce's handling of his Homeric materials, an influence which compels the reader to see Ulysses much less as a "modern version" of the Odyssey and more as a complex re-creation and re-projection based on archetypal impulses of the artistic mind.

That poetry, linked in its most basic properties with "childish prejudice," with "the judgment of the senses," and material substance, "does its utmost to give a body to spirit" is an esthetic principle which is probed and manipulated throughout Ulysses. It is both confirmed and contradicted again and again in Joyce's treatment of the Aristotelian teleology, the heresies concerning consubstantiality, the Shakespeare theme, and the characters of the protagonists themselves. And once again, this time in an esthetic sense,

the nature and role of Stephen's "Little Harry Hughes" ballad emerges as a matter of importance. Embodying all of those qualities which Vico names as essential to poetry and closely tied as it is with the various and diverse legends and religious motifs having to do with sacrificial death and regeneration or reunion, it seems to represent a new perception to the dimensions of esthetic reality on the part of Stephen. Whatever form his future relationship with Bloom may take (and Bloom himself sees no reason to be particularly hopeful),⁴⁶ the fact that Stephen sings this kind of song to his host reveals an understanding of the imperatives of the artistic process which Joyce, if not Stephen himself, would label Vichian. As Homer, the master poet and metaphysician, strove to give a body to spirit by submerging his themes in physical detail and myth, so, in like manner though in the limited scope appropriate to his novice status, does the apprentice poet, Stephen Dedalus.

Though Vico makes poetry a kind of mental process emotional and particular rather than intellectual and abstract, ordinary conceptions of inferiority and superiority tend to lose their values in his philosophy. Croce comments that whereas Plato confines poetry to the lower level of

⁴⁶ It may be noted that the matter of the future of the relationship of Stephen and Bloom may actually be irrelevant insofar as Stephen's future growth as an artist is concerned.

consciousness, the animal spirits, "Vico re-elevates it and makes of it a period in the history of humanity. . . ." By conceiving history as an ideal progression of states of being for which not "contingent facts" but "forms of the spirit" have significance, he transforms poetry into "a moment in the ideal history of the spirit, a form of consciousness." Poetry, then, is history, a kind of mental experience that precedes intellect, but follows sense.⁴⁷

This is not to say that Vico was altogether consistent in his notions concerning poetry. Certain of his statements on the subject are clearly contradictory. Though he says, for example, that poetry "is composed of feelings of emotion; and that it is entirely imaginative and devoid of concepts and reflection," he also observes that poetry in contrast with history "represents reality in its best idea" and therefore sustains the justice which history does not always provide.⁴⁸ Such apparent inconsistencies, however, are transcended by the continuous emphasis in Vico's writings on the idea that poetry "is the primary form of the mind, prior to intellect and free from reflection and reasoning."⁴⁹

⁴⁷ Croce, Aesthetic, p. 221.

⁴⁸ Benedetto Croce, The Philosophy of Giambattista Vico, trans. R. G. Collingwood (London: Howard Lattimer, 1913), p. 132.

⁴⁹ Ibid., p. 55.

Vico, Croce says, initiated his study of history at the point where "historical flavor" is strongest, "that which is furthest and psychologically most different from civilized periods."⁵⁰ Such an approach is to be contrasted with that of historians such as Grotius, Selden, and Pufendorf, contemporary with Vico, who are described as having examined human nature in civilized periods only, thus beginning in the middle of historical development and confining themselves to intellect and to "the will under moral restraint" and ignoring the early epochs governed or influenced by imagination and the undisciplined passions--those qualities or states which are essential to poetry. In The New Science, the dominant idea--in Vico's words, the "master key" of the work --is the idea that primitive man is a poet and thinks in poetic images.⁵¹

Vico identifies a succession of perceptual states and their objects, progressing from the level of the primitive to that of the sophisticated mind. Thus the perception of imaginary classes of things leading to poetic universals is superseded in a more civilized social setting by that of intelligible classes the objects of which are rational universals. He maintains that given the inevitabilities of historical progression, as the minds of men develop, errors of myth must give way to the "truth of philosophy." Lest

⁵⁰ Ibid., p. 45.

⁵¹ Ibid., p. 46.

this latter assertion be read as another inconsistency in Vico's doctrine of poetry, however, it must be pointed out that he qualifies it by adding that there is no such thing as pure error--only the wrong association of ideas. Thus, once again in the words of Croce, "far from despising fables, Vico recognized their value as embryonic forms so to speak of stored up knowledge or of what will one day develop into philosophy."⁵²

Beckett, after having noted in the opening lines of his essay in the Exagmination Vico's insistence on a "complete identification between the philosophical abstraction and the empirical illustration, thereby annulling the absolutism of each conception,"⁵³ later states in emphatic terms what he views as the influence of Vico on the language of Finnegans Wake. "This reduction of various expressive media," he says, "and the fusion of these primal essences into an assimilated medium for the exteriorization of thought, is pure Vico, and Vico, applied to the problem of style."⁵⁴ This observation, directed as it is to the surface of the artifact itself--the complex punning language of Finnegans Wake--also concerns the perspective the artist himself assumes, presupposing a "reversion" to a state of psychological awareness in which the object of art is not to be apprehended as distinct from

⁵² Ibid., p. 69.

⁵³ Beckett, p. 3.

⁵⁴ Ibid., p. 16.

the medium of its expression. Though in Ulysses Joyce does not attempt in so extreme a manner the poetic fusion of subject and object, the impulse and the idea of doing so are fully realized in the experiences and actions of his two central characters.

Though Joyce's intent is apparent throughout Ulysses as he sets up basic opposites of character and has them circle about each other constantly in a fabric woven of endless variations of the themes of "sundering" and "reconciliation," the obvious conclusion, and the climax (if not the Aristotelian peripety, which may be better placed in the "Oxen" episode, since this is where Stephen and Bloom actually encounter each other face to face for the first time), occur in "Ithaca" precisely and in the purest Vichian sense at the moment when Stephen sings his "Sir Hugh" ballad to Bloom.

"Little Harry Hughes," as an authentic variant of Child's "Sir Hugh, or The Jew's Daughter," may be labeled "basic poetry." As an embodiment of a very old tradition, growing out of what Vico called the "Christian barbarism" of the middle ages, it is the antithesis of the abstract, dealing in explicit and non-analytical terms with themes of seduction, murder and revenge. Its style is as grimly economical and direct as Homer's battle-scenes, while its subject, true to the nature of the true folk ballad, grows out of primitively lurid and sensational emotionalism. Why

does Stephen sing such a song to his host? Is he succumbing to the deadening crassness of the majority of the Dublin populace in mocking and spurning the Jew? Even given the conditions of extreme fatigue, the hangover-malaise, and boredom, this seems unlikely. What is rather to be observed is the phenomenon of a highly rational and creative mind reaching out for Bloom's more simple and "physical" idiom in an effort to communicate--communication in this case being a term susceptible, given the action of both "Eumaeus" and "Ithaca," of a number of different meanings.

Moreover, the fact that the content of the Hugh ballad is such as to offend Bloom in no way negates or weakens Joyce's Vichian justification for the ballad's appearance in "Ithaca." This content is, after all, quintessentially true to the requirements of the ballad genre, which is to say, those of Vico's "poetric" historical epochs. Whatever its other functions may be in the episode, it is ideally suited to establish the ironic qualification of what might otherwise produce a too absolute interpretation of the scene which is enacted in Bloom's kitchen, thus defining more precisely the highly unstable equilibrium of the "union" of Stephen and Bloom.

And should the connection of Vico with Joyce's "Little Harry Hughes" still seem tenuous, even given the philosophical principles which serve to link the ballad mentality of

Vico's Age of Poetry with the poetic mind in any historical period, there is further direct evidence that Joyce may have derived the idea of the use of the ballad from Vico. Croce describes Vico as a man of "an extremely affectionate disposition" and as deeply moved by the ordeals of victims of history such as Priam and Polyxena. He cites Vico's Aphorism Number XL of the Elements section of The New Science, to the effect that witches, in order to "solemnize" their rites "slay without pity and cut in pieces most lovely and innocent children." Vico is depicted as "quite upset, in the most opportune but significant way, by the fate of these little persons, whom his excited imagination adorns with a superlative loveliness."⁵⁵

This "superlative loveliness" must have been that which Bloom apprehends in the vision of his consubstantial son Rudy at the end of the brothel scene, and that for which he is reaching with so little apparent effect in "Ithaca," where Stephen, Ulysses' final reincarnation of the victim of history, surrounded by an intricately contrived web of associations hinting connections with both holy and black Masses, death and resurrection, sundering and reconciliation, goes consenting to meet his fate.

⁵⁵ Croce, Giambattista Vico, p. 253. Bergin and Fisch, in The New Science of Giambattista Vico, p. 29, give Aphorism XL in its entirety: "Witches, who are full of frightful superstitions, are also exceedingly savage and cruel. Indeed, if it is necessary for the solemnizing of their witchcraft, they do not shrink from killing and dismembering innocent children."

In Vico's system, both poetry and history stand in a special relationship to myth, poetry in that its creation is to be identified with the same historical and psychological conditions as that of myth, and poetry and history together in that, in their most fully realized and perfect forms, they share, as does myth, in the "ideal and universal." Vico takes issue with the belief that history concerns the particular and poetry the universal. Poetry, he claims, resembles science, even though it does not involve the contemplation of concepts, in that, like science, it is ideal.⁵⁶ The greatest poetry is that which most nearly approaches the achievement of the idea. Vico insists that it is "by means of idea (that) the poet breathes reality into things otherwise unreal." "The Masters of poetry," he says, "claim that their art must be wholly compact of imagination, like a painter of the ideal, not imitative like a portrait-painter: whence, from their likeness to God the Creator, poets and painters alike are called divine."⁵⁷

Though spoken in what was, at the time at least, a different frame of reference--that of a somewhat ironic discussion of transubstantiation--a statement Joyce made to his brother Stanislaus in the early Dublin period reveals a like preoccupation with the notion of the poet "by means of idea

⁵⁶ Croce, Gambattista Vico, p. 224.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

breathing reality into things otherwise unreal." "Don't you think," he asked Stanislaus, "there is a certain resemblance between the mystery of the Mass and what I am trying to do? I mean that I am trying in my poems to give people some kind of intellectual pleasure or spiritual enjoyment by converting the bread of everyday life into something that has a permanent artistic life of its own. . . ?"⁵⁸ The constant reference in Ulysses to the sacrificial myth of pagan and Christian cultures in its various forms and to the symbolism of the Mass linked with the figure of the victim of history, so pronounced in the degree of its emphasis and visibility, is a continuation, and perhaps a culmination, of the development of this idea of the poet's creative function which was taking place in Joyce's mind. That the ideal world of spirit may meet and unite with the physical world of history and "everyday life" to give it vitality and meaning that the poet's creation is analogous to or derived from the same impulse as that of God comprise dual themes in Ulysses which Joyce must have seen as ultimately one. Whether or not he had encountered Vico at the time he was speaking to Stanislaus of poetry and the mystery of transubstantiation, the germ of an idea was obviously present in his mind and would be fostered and strengthened during the time in Trieste,

⁵⁸ Stanislaus Joyce, My Brother's Keeper: James Joyce's Early Years (New York: Viking Press, 1958), pp. 103-04.

when he was re-reading Vico and working on the early episodes of his second major work.⁵⁹

One problem encountered in reading Vico is that though he refers to poetry and myth as separate things, he does not establish the difference between them.⁶⁰ The task he assigns to poetry, the idea to which Joyce found himself so attracted to in the formulation of his own esthetic creed, that of giving life to the inanimate, may be more properly viewed as belonging specifically not to poetry, but rather to myth. Vico rejected the theory of myth as allegory of philosophical truths since allegory as a poetic genre or technique implies a belief in content but not in form. Myth he held to be "uni-vocal," insisting that "the makers of myths believed fully and ingenuously in their own work." He also declined to accept the derivation of myths from particular nations or from the work of individual philosophers or poets. In his opinion myth is "an essential part of poetic or barbaric wisdom . . . a spontaneous product of all times and places"⁶¹ which cannot be attributed to any single source, either

⁵⁹ Ellman, James Joyce, p. 61, points out that as early as the University College days Joyce was reading extensively in numerous Italian writers including especially Giordano Bruno. Though no mention of Vico is made in Ellman's account, the incident reported by Stanislaus is of the same period, that is, 1898-1900, so it is not entirely unlikely that Vico was among the Italians encountered by Joyce at this time.

⁶⁰ Croce, Giambattista Vico, p. 65.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, p. 66.

individual or collective. Closest to Vico's system is a third theory which holds myth to be "the history of actual persons and events adorned by the fancy which made heroes into gods,"⁶² but even this falls short of his conception by failing to penetrate the deeper psychological and social implications inherent in it. For Vico, stories of myth are not fanciful distortions of the facts of history, but are "essential history," ideal and universal. The poet, then, is not to be considered as an individual maker following specific rules to create poetry out of airy nothing, but rather as a representative of a certain period in the evolutionary sequence of human psychological and social development. Neither is the poet's subject rational and individual, but, to the contrary, emotional and general.

Croce speaks of the "imaginative universal," "whose introduction into aesthetic as the explanatory principle of poetry causes so many insuperable difficulties" as in reality the definition of mythology. An example of this phenomenon, he explains, is to be found in an idea such as that of accomplishing great labors for the common good, which if not capable of being isolated from the idea of a particular man who accomplished them becomes the myth of Hercules. Croce concludes: "The contradictions we have seen in the imaginative universal which make it incapable of acting as the

⁶² Ibid., pp. 62-64.

foundation of an aesthetic doctrine are quite in keeping with the doctrine of myth: for myth consists precisely in these contradictions: it is a concept trying to be an image and an image trying to be a concept, and hence a kind of poverty, or even a powerful impotence. . . ."63 [The italics are mine.]

The description of myth as "a concept trying to be an image and an image trying to be a concept," though in Croce's Vichian analysis an abstract statement of general principle, when related to Joyce's interest in Vico becomes a specific point of critical concern. The symbolic value of Stephen, youthful philosopher and esthete, as "conceptual" rationalist and of Bloom, commercial traveler in Dublin's world and "humane materialist," must be interpreted within an all-inclusive context which is Ulysses itself. Such a conclusion is a natural outgrowth of the idea of myth as a "powerful impotence" which, basing his judgment on the esthetic doctrines Stephen espouses in the Portrait and elsewhere, with their emphasis on the imperative for a static art, and on the pronouncements of Joyce himself in various letters and other documents, the reader of necessity finds closely linked with the ambiguous resolution of Ulysses. Stephen and Bloom, far from being two-dimensional figures restricted to the narrowest of time-frames--the single day of June 16, 1904--assume, as figures in the Joycean-Homeric

⁶³ Croce, Giambattista Vico, p. 66.

myth, the qualities of universal archetypes, personifying as father and son, host and guest, priest and victim, those human characteristics common to all societies and every historical epoch.

In Dublin's Joyce, Hugh Kenner quotes a statement of Vico's which not only serves to confirm the relevance of myth to Ulysses and to verify the significance of Bloom and Stephen as figures in a kind of universal myth, but also legitimizes Joyce's use of local, common, and folkloristic varieties of mythical materials: "There must in the nature of human things be a mental language common to all nations, which uniformly grasps the substance of things feasible in human social life, and expresses it with as many diverse modifications as these same things may have diverse aspects. A proof of this is afforded by proverbs or maxims of vulgar wisdom, in which substantially the same meanings find as many diverse expressions as there are nations ancient and modern."⁶⁴

If there is a common symbolic concept in Ulysses, a thematic principle which underlies, supports, and shares in the total body of the work's symbolic substance, it must be that of death and resurrection, or as Stephen would have it, sundering and reconciliation.

⁶⁴ Kenner, p. 331. See also Bergin and Fisch, p. 60.

The story of "Little Harry Hughes" at once captures the imagination of Bloom. His perception of it is immediate and personal, as opposed to that of Stephen, which is analytical and ironic. But paradoxically, Bloom's narrow and personal frame of reference generalizes and universalizes the ballad's significance, because Bloom is the common man, representative of the primitive state of the collective intellect which is typical of and in fact defines Vico's "poetic" periods. Stephen, whose intellectual development is at a level far more complex and sophisticated than that of Bloom, belongs to a much later stage of Vico's historical process. In singing his ballad, however, he seems to understand that he must reach downward and backward for Bloom's poetic idiom, which in whatever form--ballad or epic--is a distillation of human experience as apprehended by the popular mind. Joyce does not make Stephen sing the ballad merely to humiliate Bloom; his purpose is much more basic and profound. In effect, he is proposing a hypothetical unification of diametrically opposed stages of Vico's history, collapsing the cycle into what may be conceived as a single coherent point embracing all time and reconciling all antagonisms. At this critical juncture of two contrary human principles depicted in "Ithaca," a Vichian drama unfolds, in which "Little Harry Hughes," as sung by Stephen Dedalus, exemplifies the historical process.

Chapter V

THE HUGH MOTIF AND RELATED THEMES IN ULYSSES

The extent to which "Little Harry Hughes" is linked thematically with the overall development of Ulysses and the significance of the relationship of the ballad to the work as a whole are problems which may be examined objectively in terms of the frequency and the distribution of what has been termed in this study the Hugh motif. Some specific questions related to these general problems present themselves at once. Where are the direct references to the ballad? What form do these references take and to what thematic ideas are they connected? In a more general sense, in what alternate but equivalent forms does the motif appear and what are the contexts of those appearances?

Though this segment of the study is not intended to establish the existence of any kind of hermetically systematic symbolism, an attempt will be made to identify component motif forms associated coherently around certain major thematic ideas. This effort will involve first an examination of Bloom's and Stephen's thoughts and remarks relating explicitly to the ballad situation and to the ballad itself,

of ritual murder in the ballad context with its persistently recurring associations with the sacrificial themes of "sundering" and "reconciliation," and of the theme of consubstantiality and the related and perhaps most basic Vichian theme of history. In addition to the ritual murder themes, three complementary "facilitating" motifs, namely color, tonality, and modality, are inherent in the Hugh context and will be dealt with in connection with certain variant motif forms.

From this point emphasis will be shifted to the "alternate equivalent forms" of the motif--other appearances of Hugh as found in various related contexts in the book. The final stage of this part of the analysis--justified by certain of Mr. Best's contributions to the Shakespeare discussion in "Scylla and Charybdis"--will deal with some homophonic variations of Hugh and a brief look at some related etymological facts.

In brief, this part of the study is intended to point out, in as precise a manner as possible, the location of the Hughs in Ulysses and, in the process of placing them, to develop some increased understanding of the associative conceptual structure of the motif.

About 11:45 A. M., at Glasnevin Cemetery in the "Hades" episode, Bloom, reflecting on the vegetative growth of burial grounds, muses: "It's the blood sinking in the earth gives new life. Same idea those jews they said killed the

christian boy" (107.12-14). This is the single direct reference in Ulysses to the death of a Christian child at Jewish hands prior to "Ithaca," but appearing as it does early in the book it serves not only as a unifying device but acts to sensitize the reader to some of the implications of the ballad Stephen sings to Bloom some thirteen hours later on "killing day" in Dublin. Bloom, accepting the reality of the savagery inherent in life, sees a paradoxical duality in the irrevocable human reality of death: that death is a pre-condition of life and that life grows out of and sustains itself off the corpses of the dead.¹

Child killing, however, is by no means limited in Ulysses to Christian-Jew conflicts of the Sir Hugh type, though all forms of the motif reinforce each other and ultimately lead to the same conclusion in "Ithaca." Mulligan begins Ulysses with a parody of the Mass, and it must be observed that the black Mass, with its innocent sacrificial victim and perverted rites, seems never far submerged beneath the narrative surface, even in those parts of the book dealing with the Mass in its normal state. The child-killing motif appears time and time again in an apparently endless variety of forms, and the richness of the recurrence suggests strong affinities with the black Mass--suggests in fact that

¹ S. L. Goldberg, The Classical Temper: A Study of James Joyce's "Ulysses" (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1961), p. 172.

Ulysses, the story of Bloomsday, is in one of its major aspects itself a black Mass. This idea need not be pursued at this time, since the problem has been amply if not definitively dealt with by a number of scholars,² except to point out that the opposite is also true--that the holy Mass in its uncorrupted state is also present, and that seeing the simultaneity of the two, the holy and the profane, is one of the chief difficulties in reading Ulysses.

A hair-raising description of the black Mass is given by Montague Summers in his History of Witchcraft and Demonology. The ceremony, he says, is performed by "some apostate or renegade priest who has delivered himself over to the service of evil."³ It is accompanied by the burning of "certain heavy and noxious weeds"--the Devil's incense. The leader consecrates the host and chalice "with the actual words of the holy Mass," but instead of kneeling at the altar he turns his back on it and, cutting and stabbing the host with a knife, he deliberately spills the sacramental wine.⁴ (Neither substance, then, is actually consumed by the communicants.)

² See Ruth M. Walsh, "In the Name of the Father and of the Son . . . Joyce's Use of the Mass in Ulysses," James Joyce Quarterly, 6 No. 4 (Summer, 1969), 321-47; also W. Y. Tindall, A Reader's Guide to James Joyce (New York: The Noonday Press, 1959), pp. 220 ff.

³ Montague Summers, History of Witchcraft and Demonology (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1926), p. 147.

⁴ Ibid., p. 156.

In accordance with the belief that the guiding spirit of the Sabbat--the devil--sometimes shows himself in the shape of a beast, a traditional disguise of the leader may include hairy skins, horns, hoofs, claws, and a tail. Also mentioned in this account is the witches' supposed practice of riding broomsticks to get from place to place during their periods of activity.⁵

Summers goes on to say that the murder of children as sacrificial victims is also a part of the practice of the black Mass and names Gilles de Rais (d. 1440) as a "classical example of child sacrifice." This eccentric nobleman, protector of Joan of Arc until her capture by the English, is especially notorious for having reputedly killed as many as two hundred orphaned or kidnapped children in ceremonies involving devil-worship.⁶

Joyce's Sabbat in "Circe" offers some obvious parallels to the version of Montague Summers while adding some interesting twists of its own. The "field altar" of Joyce's Mass is that of Saint Barbara, patron of gunsmiths, the ceremonial candles are black, "Father Malachi O' Flynn" (a combination of Mulligan and "Father O'Flynn," a typical Irish priest in a popular song)⁷ wears the chasuble reversed, his feet are

⁵ Ibid., p. 160.

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ The song "Father O'Flynn," by Alfred Perceval Graves, appears in 1000 Years of Irish Poetry, ed. Kathleen Hoagland (New York: Devlin-Adair, 1953), pp. 555-56.

not only reversed (a hint of the reversed faces of the diviners in Canto XX of the Inferno?) but are both left (sinister) feet, and his recitation of the litany is backward.⁸ The host, "elevated" from the chalice, drips blood, and the chalice itself rests on the swollen belly of the victim of the sacrifice, Mrs. Mina Purefoy (purefaith).

The ritual dramatized by Joyce, however, though opposite to the true Mass in ways supported by the tradition, is not simply a reversal of it, but is rather carried out contrapuntally. Thus "John O'Leary" fights "Lear O'Johnny" (583.18), "The Voice of All the Blessed" (584.10) responds to "The Voice of All the Damned" (584.5), and from on high Adonai announces resoundingly not only "Dog," but "God." The same complementary opposition derived from the same tradition of folk belief is implicit in Stephen's ballad on the theme of ritual child-murder.

The following list, rather arbitrarily constructed and to which many additions will no doubt be possible, should nevertheless provide some idea of the extent and the distribution of child-killing in Ulysses:

⁸ Instead of the broomstick of Summer's celebrants, he is "mounted" on a carrot.

Child-Killing Motif

<u>Episode</u>	<u>Page.Line</u>	<u>Incidence</u>
"Telemachus"	5.8 and throughout (30 occurrences)	"Kinch" ⁹
"Hades"	94.36,37ff.. 95.17 98.35ff. 99.34 107.12-14	dead child, Rudy "infanticide" Child's murder case "child's funeral" "Its the blood sinking in the earth..."
"Aeolus"	121.33 137.36	"the twelve brothers, Jacob's sons" Child's murder case
"Lestrygonians"	169.26	"slaughter of innocents"
"Scylla and Charybdis"	197.26,28,33	Mulligan repeatedly sug- gests "murder" of Stephen
"Sirens"	278-282	"Croppy Boy" ballad
"Cyclops"	304.7	"central figure of the tragedy" in "Rumbold" narrative
"Nausicaa"	397.9-11	"Babes in the wood.... I'll murder you...."
"Oxen of the Sun"	382.42, 383.1 383.33 384.16-31 389.39-42 398.40 403.32	Argument--mother to live and child to die? Lilith--"Patron of abortions" death of Rudy "stout shield of oxengut ...named Killchild" umbrella (21 references in complete novel) Child's murder (case)

⁹ This nickname given Stephen by Mulligan from the sixteenth-century tramp's argot which appears elsewhere in the "white thy fables" quatrain in "Proteus" means "a little child." See W. Y. Tindall, James Joyce, as previously cited, p. 139; also OED, V, 697.

Child-Killing Motif (Cont'd)

<u>Episode</u>	<u>Page.Line</u>	<u>Incidence</u>
	403.36	infanticide
	405.17-18	Haines: "I am the murderer of Samuel Childs."
	411.25	"infant mortality"
	412.6-7	"abortion...infanticide"
	416.28-29	"Herod's slaughter of the innocents"
"Circe"	448.18	"Childs fratricide case"
	482.4	T. Purefoy in "oilskin jacket"
	491.21	"waterproof"
	509.19-23	smothered child
	513.29	"waterproof"
	533.13-14	"Rubber goods. Neverrip. Brand as supplied to the aristocracy."
	583.29-30	Haines holding umbrella in black Mass
"Eumaeus"	617.9-18	Greek tattoo artist "eaten alive"
"Ithaca"	710.19-20	"umbrella"

Moreover, the child-killing theme is incorporated into Ulysses in many ways other than the completely explicit, in a variety of instances involving sources such as mythological background, traditional religious practices, and popular figures identified with historical or contemporary political movements.

The Daedalus myth itself provides an example of child-killing other than that of the fall of Icarus in the airborne escape from Crete. In a story told by Ovid in his Metamorphoses, the "fabulous artificer" himself is guilty of

the murder of his young nephew Perdix. Jealous of the boy's inventive ingenuity, Dedalus throws him down the steep stairs of Minerva's temple. He is saved from the murderous intent of his uncle, however, when the goddess, who admires his quick wit, transforms him in mid-air to the low-flying bird which bears his name.¹⁰ In the "Sirens" episode, Ben Dollard performs a "trenchant rendering" of the ballad "The Croppy Boy." The ballad story is one of a young Wexford rebel who confesses "I love my country above my king" to an English captain disguised as a priest and is subsequently executed.¹¹ Stephen's name itself has associations with a folk practice of the British Isles according to which, in a reversal of the child-killing theme, the "son" becomes the slayer and the "father" the slain. On Christmas Eve, in British folklore, the Robin Red Breast as "Spirit of the New Year" goes out armed with a birch rod (Compare the "punishing" birch rod carried by mother in search of son in Irish Sir Hugh variants) to kill his predecessor, the Gold Crest Wren, the "Spirit of the Old Year," whom he finds hidden in an ivy bush. The Robin, whose ceremonial hunt was actually until recent times carried out by human participants, is said to "murder his father," which supposedly accounts for the bird's

¹⁰ Ovid, The Metamorphoses, trans. Horace Gregory (New York: Viking Press, 1958), p. 222.

¹¹ See Hoagland, pp. 540-41.

red breast.¹² Sir James Frazer describes the hunting of the wren in The Golden Bough and adds that in Ireland, on Saint Stephen's Day (the day after Christmas), the bird-victim is carried about in a procession "of men, women, and children, singing an Irish catch, importuning him to be the king of all the birds."¹³ In "Circe," as part of the fantasy in which Bloom becomes "Lord Mayor of Dublin," "Bloom's Boys" both hunt the wren and sing the catch: "The wren, the wren, / The king of the birds, / Saint Stephen's his day. / Was caught in the furze" (471.39-40, 472.1-5).

In Ulysses, Perdix, the Croppy Boy, and the wren of Saint Stephen's Day participate together in the myth of the child (or father) victim with others such as the Lycidas of Milton's elegy or historical figures like Silken Thomas, Davitt, and Parnell. Obvious and rather drastic differences prevail between many of these, but categories such as literature and history become increasingly indistinct as all are deliberately mythologized by Joyce through continuous juxtaposition of their similar features. Myth and actuality, the

¹² Robert Graves, The White Goddess: A Historical Grammar of Poetic Myth, amended and enlarged ed. (1948; rpt. New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux, 1966), p. 186. Graves, in his version of the ceremonial hunt for the wren, states that the tradition is still acted out in Ireland and on the Isle of Man.

¹³ Sir James Frazer, The Golden Bough: A Study in Magic and Religion, abr. ed. (1922; rpt. New York: Macmillan, 1951), p. 622.

ancient and the contemporary, are in effect identified in a Vichian synthesis of the form of the sacrificial legend and the contingent and incidental facts of history, so that it becomes ever more difficult to distinguish the one from the other.

Child killing, extensive as it is in terms of its own occurrences in the book, is also linked with other specific Hugh-type motifs. Another such related motif is that having to do with attempts of the murderer or murderers to dispose of the victim's body. In the Child A variant of "Sir Hugh," as has already been seen, the murderous Jews cast the body of the slain child into "Our Lady's draw-well" to prevent discovery of their crime.¹⁴ In the Anglo-French variant mentioned by Child in his commentary and in The Prioresses Tale, the hiding place is described as a privy or "jakes."

The word "drawwell" occurs only once in Ulysses, in the "Circe" episode when Zoe applies it to Bloom as he maneuvers to conserve Stephen's rapidly dwindling money:

Bella (admiringly): "You're such a slyboots, old cocky. I could kiss you."

Zoe (points): "Hum? Deep as a drawwell."
(544.23-26)

To insist on any kind of symbolic "absorption" of Greek by Jew on the basis of this fragment of dialogue would no doubt

¹⁴ Francis J. Child, ed. English and Scottish Popular Ballads, III, Part 1 (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1888), 237-38.

be unjustified, but the appearance of "deep" and "drawwell" in such a context, being unmistakably as they are one of the "hiding" motifs of the Sir Hugh tradition, leads to the speculation that Joyce may have indeed had something of the sort in mind.

The more frequently occurring and hence more likely parallel with the Sir Hugh stories is that of the jakes or watercloset as a hiding place or place of burial. (This motif is, in a general way in Ulysses, always associated with isolation, alienation, and death.) Bloom, it will be recalled, begins his day in the "Calypso" (etymologically "hidden") episode in the jakes. Stephen, on more than one occasion, ponders the death of the arch-heretic Arius in a watercloset. Professor MacHugh, in the newspaper office scene, while expounding on the incongruity of himself, a Celt, speaking English and teaching the Roman language, rails against the "cloacal obsession" of these two "imperial, imperious, imperative" peoples. In "Circe," Bella Cohen, in her male "Bello" aspect, makes pointed reference to jakes and cesspool. "Little Harry Hughes" contains no mention of the burial of the child's body, but by the time the ballad is sung none is necessary. A concatenation of related thematic elements including murder, burial, revivification, and reunion of parent and child has already been established

as an operative part of the symbolic mechanism of the meeting of Stephen and Bloom.

Some three hours after Bloom has sat in the makes reading "Matcham's Masterstroke" by Mr. Philip Beaufoy, Stephen is walking on the beach at Sandymount pondering the modalities of time, space, and the principle of form. The question of the unity of creator and creation occurs to him, as does the name of one who denied the doctrine of the identity of Father and Son: "Where is poor dear Arius to try conclusions? Warring his life long on the contransmagnificand-jewbangtiality? Ill-starred heresiarch. In a Greek watercloset he breathed his last: euthanasia. With beaded mitre and with crozier, stalled upon his throne, widower of a widowed see, with upstuffed omophorion, with clotted hinderparts" (30.16-21). Arius (d. 336), described as "the great heretic who denied the divinity of Christ,"¹⁵ maintained that the Father alone, "unbegotten and unoriginate," can be the true God, and that the Logos or Son, a created being, can only participate in divinity by grace or by adoption.¹⁶ Much later, at the brothel, Stephen is still thinking of Arius and his great denial, now linking him (in a "warning" to Zoe) with the Greek cynic Antisthenes: "But

¹⁵ F. G. Holweck, "Arius," A Biographical Dictionary of the Saints (1924; rpt. Detroit: Gale Research, 1969), p. 105.

¹⁶ Victor C. DeClercq, "Arianism," New Catholic Encyclopedia (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967).

beware Antisthenes, the dog-sage, and the last end of Arius Heresiarchus. The agony in the closet" (512.1-3).¹⁷

Professor MacHugh, who orates at length in the inflated style of "Aeolus" on the oppressive rules of the Roman and the British states, contrasts the crude pragmatism of these peoples with the "spirituality" of Hebrew, Greek, and Celt: "What was their civilization? Vast, I allow: but vile. Cloacae: sewers. The Jews in the wilderness and on the mountaintop said: It is meet to be here. Let us build an altar to Jehovah. The Roman, like the Englishman who follows in his footsteps . . . gazed about him in his toga and he said: It is meet to be here. Let us construct a water-closet" (130.3-10). Once again, here expressed in MacHugh's elocutionary mode, is seen a negation of divinity this time by brute force--the tyranny of body over spirit which, intellectually in the case of the one and socially in the case of the other, so preoccupies the day of Stephen and Bloom.

Harry Blamires mentions a speech by Bella (as Bello) Cohen in "Circe" in which, he says, Bloom's sense of

¹⁷ The dog is another frequently occurring presence in Ulysses, appearing perhaps most dramatically as "Dooooooooooooog" in Mulligan's and Haines' black Mass, where in the reversed liturgy it is the mirror-image of "Goooooooooooood" (584.9,14). Stephen's over-the-shoulder comment to Zoe thus links the rejection of consubstantiality with the perversion or negation of divinity and with the death of the sacrificed child.

rejection and humiliation reaches a high point.¹⁸ Having ordered him to prepare his will and die, Bello, swaggering arrogantly over the prostrate victim, declaims: "We'll bury you in our shrubbery jakes where you'll be dead and dirty with old Cuck Cohen, my stepnephew I married . . . and my other ten or eleven husbands, whatever the buggers' names were, suffocated in the same cesspool" (531.21-25).

Blamires goes on to observe that it is relevant that the boy murdered by the Jews in The Prioresses Tale was also thrown into a privy and that Bloom has thought about this story earlier in the day.¹⁹ It might also be added that Bloom goes to his "death" "broken, closely veiled for the sacrifice" (532.3), a detail which gives a sacrificial character to the entire scene and links it even more closely with elements of ritual murder and hidden burial in the "Sir Hugh" tradition.

The "jakes" motif, therefore, is one which, though absent in the text of "Little Harry Hughes" itself, is a functional part of a larger "Sir Hugh" composite in Ulysses, a conceptual structure which, as will be seen, comprehends most of the major themes of the book.

Though it is the conclusion of the Odyssey parallel in Ulysses and the culmination of the narrative dealing with

¹⁸ Harry Blamires, The Bloomsday Book: A Guide Through Joyce's "Ulysses" (London: Methuen, 1966), p. 195.

¹⁹ Ibid.

the experiences of Bloom and Stephen in their day in Dublin, the communion scene in the kitchen with Stephen's singing of "Little Harry Hughes" may be regarded in many ways as the thematic center of the book. In this scene the conversation of the two central characters, Stephen's rendition of the ballad with his commentary on it, and Bloom's reaction to song and comment, provide in sharpest focus a view of motif concepts which to this point have been dealt with almost exclusively by association and inference. Death and resurrection as in the ballad itself, or as the philosophical Stephen would have it "sundering and reconcilition," history, myth, and unobtrusive but pointed references to "ineluctable modality" all appear in this thematically central meeting of two dissimilar beings.

Before Stephen sings his ballad, both he and his host cite fragments of verse in the Hebrew and Celtic tongues "with modulations of voice and translation of texts" (672.9-10). Then, a few moments later, contemplating the "future careers" (or modalities) which might have been possible for him in earlier times, the host urges his guest to chant "in a modulated voice a strange legend on an allied theme" (674.21-22), which, of course, turns out to be "Little Harry Hughes." Without the elaborate theorizing about modalities which Stephen has been engaged in throughout the day (especially in "Proteus" and "Circe") the appearance of

the modality concept in "Ithaca" might be regarded as nothing more than an incidental compositional detail. In the light of what has gone before, however, it must be recognized as a repetition of a motif key, in this case contiguous with an artifact embodying its previously mentioned "mixolydian" aspect.

The dialectical response to the question about Bloom's encouragement of his guest to change his "strange legend" incorporates other familiar thematic threads into the "Little Harry Hughes" fabric. The emphasis (as in many "Sir Hugh" variants) on the isolation of the participants and the secrecy of the drama to be played out in the Jew's hidden inner chamber, and the lingering, even if in the naturalistic style of "Ithaca," on the drinking of the cocoa prepared by host for guest confirm further associations between "Little Harry Hughes" and its folk background and between the communion scene generally and the idea of the Mass.

The first part of Stephen's "chanted legend" (labeled "major") ends with the line: "He broke the jew's window's all" (674.33). Leopold, "the son of Rudolph," receives this first part "with unmixed feeling" (675.7-8). Obviously identifying himself with the Jewish proprietor of the premises in the song, "Smiling, a jew, he heard with pleasure and saw the unbroken kitchen window" (675.8-9). This process of identification continues on the parts of both Bloom and

the effaced narrator of the episode as Bloom reacts to the second ("minor") part of the ballad, or "legend," as it is repeatedly called. "The father of Millicent," as Bloom is now identified, receives the second part "with mixed feelings." "Unsmiling, he heard and saw with wonder a jew's daughter, all dressed in green" (676.9-10). From an architectonic point of view, the significance of Bloom's reflections on what he has just heard is critical. What these thoughts do, in fact, is confirm and document the functional aspect of "Little Harry Hughes" in the episode. Bloom is the Jew of the legend; Milly is the Jew's daughter, dressed in green. Bloom recognizes this himself, and the narrator, with his "son of Rudolph" and "father of Millicent," verifies it on a more impersonal level.

Stephen's commentary, dealing with both first and second parts of the ballad, reveals a similar, though no doubt more premeditative and conditional awareness of the identity of himself and his child-victim, while at the same time it reveals the extent to which the ballad provides a medium for his day-long sundering-reconciliation preoccupation: "One of all, the least of all, is the victim predestined. Once by inadvertence, twice by design he challenges his destiny. It comes when he is abandoned and challenges him reluctant and, as an apparition of home and youth holds him unresisting. It leads him to a strange

habitation, to a secret infidel apartment, and there, implacable, immolates him, consenting" (676.12-17).

The story of a child who, once "by inadvertence" and again "by design" challenges his destiny to discover finally that destiny itself has become the agent and he a passive victim and who then goes "consenting" to meet his fate in a "secret infidel apartment," looks much like a not-too-ironic version of Stephen's own day. He has met Bloom by what must appear to him as inadvertence, though Bloom, the embodiment of destiny, has gone to some pains to effect a meeting; he is led by his own agreement into the isolated confines of the "apart-ment" of Bloom, who is himself now significantly described by the insistent narrator as "secret infidel"; and once there he partakes submissively of both the cocoa and the conversation of his host.

Though many "Hugh" variants, on the model of the Irish Child F, do have the protagonist-victim make statements demonstrating a kind of hopeless acceptance of the inevitable, the "consenting" phrase in Stephen's explication represents a definite extension of the textual realities of the ballad as it is sung. This "consenting" seems rather to be a subjective or intuitive addition by Stephen and, as such, it shows the degree to which he identifies himself with his ballad character. Moreover, the presence of the word seems intended to serve another function in a way external to the

ballad itself. Little Harry's (or Stephen's) consent, as a concept not altogether compatible with the "Ithacan" text of the ballad, and Bloom's later-appearing "equanimity" with respect to Molly's infidelity have a good deal in common. They reveal a basic similarity in the psychic states of host and guest, and in doing so suggest a common acceptance of the conditions of life (with which Stephen would incorporate art). This aspect of the total relationship of Stephen and Bloom--a unifying factor among numerous antithetical ones--is illustrative of a unity of contrary states, an idea which assumes increasing importance in the progression of the events of the day.

Whatever degree of unity the two characters may have achieved at this point, however, Stephen's "secret infidel apartment" passage obviously has different connotations for narrator and listener. Stephen has uppermost in his mind the setting of his ballad-drama--the sequestered living quarters of the infidel Jew. Bloom's reaction, again very subjective, follows a different course, obviously isolating "secret infidel" from its object and associating the phrase (somewhat incorrectly with respect to the first term) with the "infidel" Molly. After "unmixed feelings" following the first part of the ballad and "mixed feelings" after the second, now he is "sad" (676.18).

Bloom's oddly garbled rumination on the content of the ballad as it might correspond to his own predicament reinforces the impression that it is the unification of contrary states which is the dominant thematic impulse of the episode. To the question "Why was the host (victim predestined) sad?" appears the response: "He wished that a tale of a deed should be told of a deed not by him should by him not be told" (676.19-20). This reflection by Bloom seems to be a kind of wish-projection of an overt deed to be done by him (that is, "told") reacting to "a deed not by him," perhaps Boylan's adultery, which would remain secret and unknown, or possibly even undone ("not . . . told"). But the construction of the sentence is such as to imply a kind of grammatical and therefore psychological equilibrium --indicating in fact that though Bloom is aware of the reality of the deed he will not respond openly to the invasion of his household, but rather with the secret weapon of equanimity (his own form of "consent") which unifies all conflicting impulses by accepting and thus containing them.

The use of certain key words or phrases in the "Little Harry Hughes" sequence to describe or identify two or more characters simultaneously is by no means limited to these two different applications of "secret infidel." Stephen may have been singing about himself, but within the framework provided by his analysis there is room for an almost endless resonance

of parallel and coincidence. He might have been singing as well about Bloom in his equanimity, described in the following lines as "victim predestined" (676.18) and "reluctant, unresisting" (676.21) or even about Boylan, whom Molly (the Jew's wife) has already begun to "kill" by rejection. Ultimately the paradigm of the ballad's sacrificial story might be that of Christ or the Eleusinian year-king.²⁰ There is, in fact, a pervasive ambiguity inherent in Stephen's commentary, involving all the major characters of the book. An effective fusion of personae and even philosophical abstractions is created under the rubrics "violator" and "violated." At first glance this sort of interpretation might seem logical as following most closely the details of Stephen's analysis:

VIOLATOR	VIOLATED
Stephen (as Little Harry Hughes)	Bloom
Boylan	Bloom

Then other alternatives, on different levels, begin to present themselves:

Bloom, Boylan, Stephen	Molly (as cruel women of "Sir Hugh" legend, or Eleusinian queen-mother)
Guest	Host

²⁰ Compare Molly's "I'm always like that in the spring I'd like a new one every year. . ." (745.1-2).

or, with etymological inversion:

Host	Guest
and finally:	
Hamlet	Shakespeare
The Victim	History
The Son	The Father

It may be unnecessary to justify placing the male Bloom in the role usually assigned the Jew's daughter or the Jew's wife in the "Sir Hugh" variants which contain the motif of the deadly woman, but some readers, even while recognizing the ease with which one state of being blends with or is metamorphosed into another in the "Little Harry Hughes" scene, might demand a more objective rationale for this supposition. Perhaps not altogether objective since it requires acceptance of a special kind of autobiographical link between Bloom and Joyce himself but very much to the point insofar as the implications of "Little Harry Hughes" are concerned is the statement Richard Ellman attributes to Marie Jolas to the effect that "Joyce talked of fatherhood as if it were motherhood."²¹ According to Ellman, expanding on this idea, "(Joyce) seems to have longed to establish in himself all aspects of the bond of mother and child. He was attracted, particularly by the image of himself as a weak

²¹ Richard Ellman, James Joyce (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959), p. 303.

child cherished by a strong woman, which seems closely connected with the images of himself as victim, whether as a deer pursued by hunters, as a passive man surrounded by extroverts, as a Parnell or a Jesus among traitors. His favorite characters are those who in one way or another retreat before masculinity, yet are loved regardless by motherly women."²² Joyce also liked to maintain to his friend Ottocaro Weiss that Jews were "womanly men."²³ Bloom, it will be remembered, has already taken on a subservient female role before "Bello" Cohen at one point in the brothel scene. Such details, whether biographical or artistic, point in the direction of the theme of the cuckold or the sexually inadequate or incomplete man as it appears throughout Ulysses.

Another device used by Joyce in "Ithaca," again apparently with the idea of blurring the distinctions between the individual modalities of his characters and thematic abstractions, is that of the etymological identity of the words "host" and "guest."²⁴

²² Ibid. ²³ Ibid., p. 477.

²⁴ As early as Stephen Hero, Joyce, through his protagonist, gives a clear indication of an esthetic interest in the "hidden" qualities of words. Of Stephen as youthful scholar he writes: "He read Skeat's Etymological Dictionary by the hour and his mind, which had from the first been only too submissive to the infant sense of wonder, was often hypnotized by the most commonplace conversation. People seemed to him strangely ignorant of the value of the words they used so glibly." James Joyce, Stephen Hero, ed. Theodore Spencer (1944; rpt. with additional pages edited by John J. Slocum and Herbert Cahoon [Norfolk, Connecticut: New

It may first be noted that an insistent reiteration of the two words occurs in the text surrounding "Little Harry Hughes." In all of "Ithaca" eleven host-guest "couples" occur in which one of the words appears in the dialectical question and the other as part of the accompanying answer. Other more or less independent uses of one or the other of the words are also made, including three consecutive occurrences of "host" (describing Bloom in varying aspects) in the questions directly following Stephen's commentary. Blamires comments that this word is used ambiguously to apply simultaneously to Bloom's entertaining his guest, and to Stephen as "host" in the liturgical sense of victim and sacrificial offering.²⁵ This is certainly the case, but the situation is much more complex and far-reaching in "Ithaca" than Blamires indicates. In the 1911 edition of Skeat's dictionary three basic definitions of "host" are given. The

Directions, 1963]), p. 26. Professor Walter W. Skeat's dictionary, which Joyce has Stephen peruse, was first published in 1882, and in revised form it is still on library shelves. The edition consulted for this study was A Concise Etymological Dictionary of the English Language, new and corrected edition (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1911).

²⁵ Blamires, p. 235.

first of these is "one who entertains guests."²⁶ Accompanying the second of Skeat's definitions, "a body of armed men" (related to the "enemy" and "stranger" meanings given earlier) is the Russian cognate goste, especially interesting because it represents a kind of connotative inversion, meaning not only "stranger" but "guest."²⁷

The Oxford English Dictionary provides basically the same account as that of Skeat, expanding the analysis in the direction of the Germanic languages and verifying the historical sameness of "host" and "guest." OED, V, 408, lists the old French forms oste and hoste and notes the modern French hôte, which may be translated into English as either

²⁶ To this definition is added the comment that some opinion makes the Latin hospit a combination of hostis, "a stranger or enemy," and the stem -pot of potens, meaning "lord." Referring to the Sanskrit pati, "a master," Skeat then relates the Latin hospes to a hypothetical hostipotis, "a guest-master" or "master of a house who receives guests." He finally suggests the Russian gospode, "lord," as a cognate form, a fact that would be totally unremarkable with respect to Ulysses except for the speech of the "Ancient Mariner" of the cabman's shelter: "I seen Russia. Gospodi pomilooy. That's how the Russians prays" (609.33-34). Though this host-related word seems so far removed from the context of "Ithaca" as to be essentially insignificant, there is still in it an echo of the etymological researches of Joyce's first Stephen.

²⁷ Skeat, p. 247. The final definition given by Skeat is the obvious one to which Blamires refers: "the consecrated bread of eucharist." To this is added the information that the Latin hostia, "a victim in a sacrifice," and the Old Latin fostia, literally, "that which is slain," are the contributory forms.

"host" or "guest." OED, V, 409, also gives "hostile," from the Latin hostilis, and hostis, "enemy," the definition "unfriendly in feeling, action, nature, or character; contrary, adverse, antagonistic." The last three terms of this definition might have been specifically chosen to describe the antithetical mental qualities of the host and guest of "Ithaca." The degree to which Joyce exploited the oddity of the two "opposite" words having a common etymological basis is demonstrated in that, having brought together his two antagonistic character types, the practical man and the rationalist, he refers to them constantly in describing their encounter with an ironic succession of the labels "host" and "guest." In the sacrificial atmosphere of Bloom's kitchen is heard an echo of John Eglinton's critique of Stephen's theory that the artist Shakespeare is to be identified with the ghost of Hamlet--with the dead father rather than with Hamlet the living son. "The truth is midway," affirms Eglinton, "He is the ghost and the prince. He is all in all" (210.1-2). If this interpretation is to be accepted (and Stephen says he does accept it), the condition of unity-in-diversity is an attribute of the creative artist, who meets his own creation "midway," or of Bloom the hypothetical father, or of God. "Host-guest," then, must be recognized as another term of the series of unified

contraries, which as implied by Eglinton's remark, also includes the artist and his creation, father and son, God and The Word.

In the conception of the etymologically unitary dichotomy of his host-guest conceit deployed about "Little Harry Hughes" in "Ithaca," Joyce may have received some hints from a source more theoretical and philosophical than Professor Skeat. Croce points out that Vico was interested in "host," having noticed the error of Cicero who is said to have "admired the humanity of the early Romans in calling enemies in war 'guest': not realizing that the fact was precisely the opposite of this, and that guests were hostes, strangers and enemies"²⁸ (or perhaps "hostages").

Croce, in describing Vico's thought regarding etymology, makes another point which seems to touch directly upon Joyce's method in "Ithaca." The first of Vico's contributions, he says, is his idea that the etymology of language is "the first source for the knowledge of the earliest civilizations."²⁹ Since language develops with the society which is its medium, the "etymology of abstract words leads us into the heart of a purely rustic society"³⁰--a primitive

²⁸ Benedetto Croce, The Philosophy of Giambattista Vico, trans. R. G. Collingwood (London: Howard Lattimer, 1913), p. 156.

²⁹ Ibid., p. 159.

³⁰ Ibid.

culture whose history is recorded in the folk artifact, individual ballad-type or ballad compilation, "Little Harry Hughes" or Odyssey. Ultimately, Vico's quest was for the key to all speech, the "one science of etymology common to all languages. . . ."31 Though this statement of Vico's intent seems more pertinent to Joyce's effort in Finnegans Wake than to Ulysses, it must be recalled that the conversation of host and guest in "Ithaca" deals largely with linguistic as well as cultural traditions and that much of it, at least that part of it initiated by the host, seems calculated to establish the basis for a unifying frame of common human experience.

Vico, in his analysis in The New Science of various social phenomena in early Roman history, actually has a great deal to say about the etymological background of "host" and "guest" not directly connected with Cicero's interpretive lapse. In describing some of the original aspects of the "fierce religion of Vesta," he comments on the rigorous justice inflicted upon those who transgressed the most fundamental of Roman laws: "On these first lands Vesta sacrificed to Jove the impious practicers of the infamous promiscuity [of women and things], who violated the first altars (the first fields of grain). These were the first hostiae, the first victims of the gentile religious. Plautus called them

31 Ibid., p. 160.

Saturni hostiae, Saturn's victims . . . and they were called hostes because such impious men were held to be enemies of the whole human race."³² Somewhat later, in discussing the development of class divisions in Rome, Vico takes up the "host" theme again, blending consideration of historical and contemporary word forms with cultural substance drawn from mythology:

The second division was that between citizen and hostis, which meant both guest or stranger and enemy, for the first cities were composed of heroes and of those received in their asylums. . . . Similarly the returned barbarian times [the period of Dante] left in Italian oste for inkeeper and for soldiers' quarters, and ostello for inn. Thus Paris was the guest, that is to say enemy, of the royal house of Argos, for he kidnapped noble Argive maidens, represented by the [poetic] character of Helen. Theseus was the guest of Ariadne, and Jason of Medea. Both abandoned the women and did not marry them, and their actions were held to be heroic, while to us . . . they seem . . . the deeds of scoundrels.³³

The etymology of "host" as derived in these passages could be interpreted as a kind of archetypal original for Joyce's book. The crucial elements are present: violator and violated, sacrificial death at the hands of a dominant vengeful feminine figure, paradoxical linking of contrary and

³² Giambattista Vico, The New Science of Giambattista Vico, trans. and abr. Thomas Goddard Bergin and Max Harold Fisch, rev. ed. (1948; rpt. Garden City, New York: Anchor, 1961), para 549. Compare Bloom's characterization of Boylan: "Is there anything more in him that she sees? Fascination. Worst man in Dublin. That keeps him alive" (91.19-21).

³³ Ibid., para. 611.

inimical states of host and guest, of executioner and victim, all under the aspect of the historical development of language and culture.

While recognizing the danger of accepting any such correspondences as proof of direct influence, the reader must somehow come to terms with the fact that Vichian ideas such as those having to do with the origins of "host" do emerge continuously as developmental factors in that part of the text of "Ithaca" surrounding "Little Harry Hughes." The ballad itself reinforces the impression that Joyce was drawing from Vico. An unavoidable presence in "Ithaca"-- a folk creation growing out of primitive conditions of the human psyche as perceived by Vico--it presents in concrete form ideas developed in minute detail in The New Science. By doing so, it thus becomes an objectification of the theoretical--a living proof of Vico's "timeless and universal" history and something very much like the compounding of idea and body which Stephen, as aspiring artist, calls at times the entelechy. Joyce, in his manipulation of "host" and "guest" in the communion scene, would not have been unaware of the resemblance nor indifferent to it.

Bloom, having listened to Stephen's song, reflects silently on what he has heard: "He weighed the possible evidences for and against ritual murder: the incitation of the hierarchy, the superstition of the populace, the

propagation of rumour in continued fraction of veridicity, the envy of opulence, the influence of retaliation, the sporadic reappearance of atavistic delinquency, the mitigating circumstances of fanaticism, hypnotic suggestion, and somnambulism" (676.24-30). These thoughts, unpremeditated and unfolding by free association in Bloom's mind, reveal a cognizance of the isolated condition of the Jew which is intimately personal and which yet must be accounted as a part of the cumulative experience and wisdom of the race. Bloom is familiar with the story in all its details--its secret motives of ignorance, fear, and superstition and its overt manifestations of animosity and persecution. It is the story of his own existence amid the latter-day barbarism of Dublin and, in fact, the story of June 16, 1904, as he has lived it.

Bloom's extensively developed (and highly Latinate) inward response to the ballad indicates Joyce's own interest in the subject of the charge of ritual murder against the Jews, a subject which as has already been seen he was actively researching in 1919. The folk origins of the accusation certainly impressed themselves on his mind, and "Little Harry Hughes" as he knew or adapted it must for a number of reasons have seemed the ideal poetic vehicle with which to submit the tradition vividly to Bloom's imagination. While Bloom's perceptions of the ballad are personal and

direct, Joyce's (as those of Stephen) are much more complex. That Bloom identifies himself with the unseen Jew of the ballad while Stephen judges, analyzes, and holds himself apart is not only a matter of the consistency or decorum of character in Ulysses but also of the Vichian theory and intent underlying the book.

Vico speaks in his "Poetic Metaphysics" of what he calls "corporeal imagination,"³⁴ the quality of the first poets whose minds, not possessed of "the esoteric wisdom of great and rare philosophers" of later ages,³⁵ were to the contrary "not in the least abstract, refined, or spiritualized, because they were entirely immersed in the senses, buffeted by the passions, buried in the body."³⁶ This, with certain possible qualifications, is not only a prescription for the characters of Stephen as rationalist, possessor of "esoteric wisdom," and of Bloom, "buried in the body," but also points again in the direction of "Little Harry Hughes," a poetic fable the type of which Vico termed mythos and claimed the ancients defined as vera narratio, "true speech."³⁷ The ballad story of infanticide with its Christian victim and vengeful Jewess, which Stephen for all his understanding tends to view abstractly and rather ironically insofar as it seems to apply to himself and his host,

³⁴ Ibid., para. 376.

³⁵ Ibid., para. 384.

³⁶ Ibid., para. 378.

³⁷ Ibid., para. 401.

Bloom, without a trace of irony or any other kind of intellectual qualification, sees at once as a true history, in concrete, actualized and actualizing form, of himself in particular and of the generality of his race.

Bloom's final direct reflection on the ballad is one which is deeply personal, representing his most cherished wishes for the reconstitution of his family--a restitution of his lost son, the assurance of the security of his daughter, and the resumption of normal marital affairs between himself and his wife. Considering the "various advantages" of Stephen's taking a room at his house and teaching Molly Italian, Bloom ponders: "Why might these several provisional contingencies between a guest and a hostess not necessarily preclude or be precluded by a permanent eventuality of reconciliatory union between a schoolfellow and a jew's daughter?" and concludes, "Because the way to daughter led through mother, the way to mother through daughter" (679.32-37). "Reconciliatory," which is really Stephen's word, would be out of place here if its presence were not prompted by Bloom's certain knowledge of the disintegration of his household and of his own racially-motivated alienation from his Dublin milieu. His desire for a "union between a schoolfellow and a jew's daughter" is a matter of both individual and general ends, neither of which is abstract to any degree at all.

In the "Wandering Rocks" episode, Joyce has Lenehan tell McCoy: "There's a touch of the artist about old Bloom" (232.2). This bit of description contains a deeper truth than its speaker comprehends, for Bloom, though he lacks the creative energies of the poetic maker or artist, is indeed a representative of the mental type described by Vico as characteristic of the earliest and most basic state of poetry. Stephen, on the other hand, would be relegated by Vico to a later period of more advanced rationality. Stephen's ballad and Bloom's silent contemplation of it demonstrate an intention on Joyce's part to suggest, in microscopic focus and in a moment of time, not merely a reconciliation of opposite mental states, but an all-encompassing synthesis of the evolutionary epochs of history.

Giordano Bruno, Joyce's "other philosopher," complements and counterbalances the influence of Vico in the philosophical substructure of Ulysses in his assumption of a principle of unity which could be reconciled and identified with the modulated diversity of Vico's cycle. Bruno, termed by Joyce "the heresiarch martyr of Nola" and described as "Stephen's favorite heretic,"³⁸ lived from 1548 to 1600, when he was burned at the hands of the Inquisition. He is known for his philosophy of the "identify of opposites," which Joyce puts

³⁸ James Joyce, "The Bruno Philosophy," in The Critical Writings of James Joyce, ed. Ellsworth Mason and Richard Ellman (New York: Viking Press, 1959), pp. 132-34.

to use in Finnegans Wake as a primary thematic idea, and in the words of Adaline Glasheen, he is "comprehended in every Browne and Nolan reference" in the work.³⁹ Bertrand Russell states that Bruno's thought has similarities to that of Heraclitus, who regarded fire as the "fundamental substance" of existence and who believed that "everything, like flame in a fire, is born by the death of something else."⁴⁰ According to Russell, Heraclitus maintained that there is "unity in the world, but . . . a unity formed by the combination of opposites."⁴¹ "All things come out of the one," he is supposed to have said, "and the one out of all things."⁴²

A more immediate precursor to Bruno and a direct influence on him was an Italian like himself, one Nicolas Cusanus. Cusanus maintained that since finite nature is the creation of an infinite God, physical phenomena which seem contradictory to finite minds in reality coincide in the mind of God, who is both "maximum absolute" and "minimum absolute."⁴³ Bruno's doctrine, influenced by Cusanus, is

³⁹ Adaline Glasheen, A Second Census of "Finnegans Wake": An Index of the Characters and Their Roles (Northwestern University: Northwestern University Press, 1963), p. 38.

⁴⁰ Bertrand Russell, A History of Western Philosophy (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1945), p. 41.

⁴¹ Ibid. ⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ Giordano Bruno, The Expulsion of the Triumphant Beast, trans. and ed. Arthur D. Imerti (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1964), p. 35.

that "All contraries are resolved or coincide in one original and prime contrary."⁴⁴

Bruno rejected certain elements of Aristotle's thought, specifically the Aristotelian concept of form and matter as separate things which come together to create a kind of external combination. For Bruno material form is not inert, passive, or "deprived" but is identical with "the form which organizes all things."⁴⁵

Bruno also maintained that the universe itself was one--not subdivided as in any of the cosmological schemes proposed by individual philosophers or schools. It is not, he says, "the octave, stelliferous heaven, partitioned [into "spheres"] and called by the vulgar the firmament . . . ,"⁴⁶ but rather infinite and one. In his De Immenso he states, in effect equating infinite nature and God: "The one infinite is perfect, in simplicity, of itself, absolutely, nor can aught be greater or better. This is the one whole, God, universal Nature, occupying all space, of whom naught but infinity can give the perfect image or semblance."⁴⁷

⁴⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁵ Jack Lindsay, trans., Cause, Principle and Unity: Five Dialogues by Giordano Bruno (New York: International Publishers, 1962), p. 25.

⁴⁶ Bruno, p. 79.

⁴⁷ Dorothea Waley Singer, Giordano Bruno, His Life and Thought, with Annotated Translation of His Work, On the Infinite Universe and Worlds (New York: Henry Schuman, 1950), p. 61.

Defending the religion of the Egyptians with its animal divinities, Bruno observed that the Egyptians worshipped the Deity, "one and simple and absolute in itself, multiform and omniform in all things."⁴⁸ Relating what he saw as the truth of the nature of man, he claimed that man at times relies too heavily on the intellect while neglecting the natural instinct that he shares with the irrational animals. Only by integrating his rational aspect with his intuitive "physical" nature can he achieve the optimum realization of his capacities.⁴⁹ The perfect human society, he believed, was one in which the natural religion of the Egyptians and the speculative intellect of the Greeks would coincide to operate together in the body politic.

The innumerable parts of Bruno's infinite cosmos exercised no restraint on one another. Each part responded solely to its own inner motivations. All, however, were intimately related and unified in fact by the immanence of God permeating all and fusing all into a single universal being. The logical consequence of this was the conception of the identity of subject-object, which for Bruno was closely linked to the idea of the coincidence of contraries.⁵⁰

That Joyce had given much thought to the philosophical opposition of subject and object is evidenced by the radically

⁴⁸ Bruno, p. 44. ⁴⁹ Ibid., p. 307.

⁵⁰ Singer, p. 87.

opposing stylistic development of episodes such as "Circe" and "Ithaca," the one highly subjective and the other, as Joyce himself put it, "in the form of a mathematical catechism."⁵¹ Most compelling, however, is his steady manipulation of the rationalistic Stephen and the physical, intuitive Bloom to a point in "Ithaca" at which, if they do not unite as Father and Son, they at the least exhibit most fully the desire and whatever capacity they have to do so. In a Jungian interpretation of the relationship between the two characters, H. E. Rogers states that they are "opposing factors in a single personality in search of integration."⁵² Joyce, since he was acquainted with Jung and his work, would probably have agreed with this. His study of Bruno's philosophy of unified contraries, however, provided him with a conceptual medium of much broader and hence more absolute scope, encompassing not only the nature of the individual psyche, but that of the social order and ultimately, that of the cosmos itself.

Bruno's principles of a unitary cosmos, the convergence of opposites and the immanence of God in things are, at base, restatements of a more general inclusive principle--the

⁵¹ James Joyce in Letters of James Joyce I, ed. Stuart Gilbert (New York: Viking Press, 1957), pp. 159-60 (to Frank Budgen, February, 1921).

⁵² H. E. Rogers, "Irish Myth and the Plot of Ulysses," ELH, 15 (1948), 306-327.

oneness of the creating mind and the object of its thought. The testing of this idea, from numerous vantage points and levels and involving most of the circumstances and events of Bloomsday, constitutes the real substance of Ulysses. Bloom's loneliness and sense of loss at the death of his son, Stephen's denial of his consubstantial (or as Mulligan would have it, "unsubstantial") father, the Hamlet effusion in the library, the constant reappearance in Stephen's thinking of the heresiarchs Arius, Sabellius, Valentine, and Photinus, and even such a small and diverting detail as Mulligan's "Ballad of Joking Jesus," itself concerned with the relationship of begetter and begotten, all move the narrative of Ulysses forward to the climactic convergence and brief interaction of two contrary beings in "Ithaca."

Bruno's "Heracleitian affinity," the notion of the universality of change, "that nothing steadfastly is," may be manifested in the instability of the union of Stephen and Bloom, a function of the states of "centrifugal departer" and "centripetal remainder" (688.13-14) ascribed to them soon after Stephen's song and commentary, to which are joined the modality theme and its octaves, fifths, modes, and keys.

Thus the meeting of contraries in "Ithaca" links Brunian concepts of unity and change or modulation, themselves a fundamental opposition, and the meeting and parting are balanced about a central point of equilibrium--the singing of

a ballad which is a kind of thematic condensation of all of Ulysses. In his dissertation on Hamlet and fatherhood, Stephen holds that the "unliving son" may be seen "through the ghost of the unquiet father." Using an image from Shelley, he continues: "In the instant of imagination, when the mind . . . is a fading coal that which I was is that which I am and that which in possibility I may come to be" (192.17-20). At the still center of the kinetic conflicts of Ulysses, "Little Harry Hughes" may be such a luminous point of revealed truth, a microcosm containing past, present, and future time and all places and modes of being: subject and object, Father and Son, creator and creation. Bruno's contraries--Stephen's sunderings--are in any case inherent in it, as are the circumstances for their reconciliation.

While the singing of the "Hugh" ballad may be most conspicuous, placed as it is in the climactic scene of Ulysses and seeming to unite at a discrete point in the narrative the most obvious thematic ideas of the book, Joyce's use of "Hugh" as a motif element is by no means restricted to this final and essentially consummatory appearance.

Four actual characters in the book are called "Hugh" or "Hughes." These are: Professor Hugh MacHugh, whose name is a repetition of itself, the Reverend John Hughes, Hugh C.

Love, and Hugh E. (Blazes) Boylan, who in the preliminary Rosenbach text was simply "Edward Boylan." In addition to these are the hypothetical "Mr. Willie Hughes" of Mr. Best and Oscar Wilde and the "Little Harry Hughes" in Stephen's song.⁵³

The name, in various forms, appears a total of forty-four times in Ulysses, nine times as "Hugh," eleven times as "Hughes," once as "Hughie," once as "Hugo," and on twenty-two occasions in the compound "MacHugh." "Huguenot" occurs ten times, and the homophonic forms "hue," and "hew" with occasional minor inflectional changes, a total of nineteen. The syllable "hu" (as an imagined exclamation from Bloom's stuffed owl in "Hades" and the laughter of Lynch in "Circe") is found seven times in the text. In all, this represents a total of eighty occurrences of "Hugh" itself and of words identical in sound. What is perhaps most interesting about Joyce's use of the name, however, is not so much the frequency of its repetition, though Miles L. Hanley's Word Index to James Joyce's Ulysses reveals this to

⁵³ The name "Harry," though not a pivotal motif word in the same sense as "Hugh," nevertheless occurs quite often --some twenty-three times, including three times in Stephen's ballad. External to the ballad itself, "Harry" appears in the names of some especially distasteful types. Rumbold, the "demon barber" of the Cyclops" episode is called Harry as is the Private Carr who strikes Stephen at the end of "Circe." Molly uses the name, rather indistinctly, three times in her monologue.

be exceptionally high--far above ordinary usage--but rather the coherent quality of the contexts in which the various "Hughs" are found.

In "Ithaca," Bloom and Stephen compare, as best they can, given their limited knowledge of the subject, the qualities of the Hebrew tongue and the speech of the native Irish. Much earlier in the day a similar kind of linguistic comparison has taken place in a setting in which both characters appear and play a part, though they do not yet meet. This is the scene in the newspaper office in which Professor MacHugh gives his account of the response made by the orator John F. Taylor to a speech critical of attempts to revive the Irish language. MacHugh, a teacher of Latin, recites from memory the words of Taylor which liken the role of the Irish in history to that of the Greeks. The intent of this florid piece of oratory is to convince its hearers of the superior "spirituality" of the Irish language in comparison to the worldly and pragmatic character of English.

The Professor speaks ironically of his own situation as an Irishman victimized by circumstance, teaching the vulgar Latin which overwhelmed the culture of the Greeks and speaking the language of the vulgar and brutal civilization which overwhelmed the Celts.⁵⁴ He and his companions in the newspaper office see history as an unending conflict between

⁵⁴ Blamires, p. 50.

the ideals of the Greeks, the Hebrews, and the Celts and the thirst for worldly power and empire which they attribute to the Romans and the English.⁵⁵ MacHugh describes the Greek general Pyrrhus as the last great leader of the ancient world, himself a victim of history who, "misled by an oracle, made a last attempt to retrieve the fortunes of Greece"⁵⁶ (132.17-18).

From the subjects of language and history, the discussion in "Aeolus" turns very naturally to the "Invincibles," a group of men who murdered the government officials in a Dublin park on May 6, 1882, and the Childs murder case, an incidence of fratricide. This unconscious shift in the conversation from its former topics to assassination and murder, in what seems an entirely unpremeditated kind of associative progression, has been described as deriving from the "assumption of unending violence."⁵⁷

Bloom is at times painfully impressed with the same idea. Compare his "Justice it means but its everybody eating everyone else" (121.27-28). He is different from MacHugh and his associates, however, in that his attitude toward history

⁵⁵ Goldberg, p. 163.

⁵⁶ Blamires notes (p. 50) that Daedalus may have had a son named Pyrrhus. This was also a name of Achilles' son, also known as Neoptolemus, who slew Priam at the fall of Troy.

⁵⁷ Goldberg, p. 163.

is not one-dimensional. In his argument with the Citizen and the other patrons of Barney Kiernan's pub he says, "That's not life for men and women, insult and hatred. And everybody knows that it's the very opposite of that that is really life" (327.13-15). Most of the characters in Ulysses whom Stephen and Bloom encounter show themselves in some way to be anti-Semitic. This anti-Semitism--in effect "anti-Bloomism" (by extension, a denial of paternity)--is itself a recurring motif-device. MacHugh is one of the important male personae who does not overtly demonstrate this anti-Semitism, and, in fact, he speaks (or quotes) favorably of the Hebrews in their confrontation with the physical power of the Egyptians. He nevertheless turns up in "Circe" at Bloom's "trial," in which he briefly participates. This appearance may be justified by the assumption and the acceptance on his part of the inevitability of injustice, oppression, and violence in history, all of which Bloom recognizes but refuses to be reconciled with.

Professor MacHugh's recreation of Taylor's speech and his part in the general conversation of the "Aeolus" episode contain, in a more loosely organized pattern, all the themes made explicit in the "Little Harry Hughes" scene in "Ithaca," plus a number of external features parallel to it. The frequency of the appearance of MacHugh's name and the substance of the speeches introduced directly by his name, both within

and without "Aeolus," may be easily appraised from the following chart, "The MacHugh Element in the Hugh Motif."

THE MACHUGH ELEMENT IN THE HUGH MOTIF

Name	Location	Topic	Key Phrase
MacHugh	122.18	Money (<u>Hamlet</u>)	"The ghost walks . . ."
	123.3-4	Rhetoric	"I don't want to hear any more . . ."
	123.19-20	Politics	" <u>Our lovely land</u> "
	125.2	<u>Hamlet</u>	"He forgot Hamlet."
Professor MacHugh	125.12-13	Politics, Rhetoric	"Doughy Daw!"
	125.26	Politics	"And here comes the sham-squire himself."
	126.22	Communication (Rhetoric)	"What about that leader this evening?"
	127.05, 6...11	Child punishment	"seized the cringing urchin. . . . Throw him out and close the door."
	127.19	Child punishment	"Out of this with you."
	129.06	Drunken editor (Rhetoric?)	"He's pretty well on . . ."
	129.17-18 (22)	Politics, History	Crawford: "You bloody old Roman empire." (22)
	129.34	History	"We think of Rome, imperial, imperious, imperative."
	130.8	"Sir Hugh?" (?)	"cloacal obsession"
130.16	History; Its Victims	(Roman Law) "And Pontius Pilate is its prophet."	

	131.29	Domestic Affairs (Deasy as grass-widower)	Crawford: "A Hungarian one day . . ."
("the professor" only)	132.1-3	(Language)	"I teach the blatant Latin language. . . ."
	132.6- 18	End of Greek Era: Language, Politics, Cloacal obsession	"The Greek!"
MacHugh	132.27	History	Lenehan: "There's a ponderous pundit MacHugh . . ."
Professor MacHugh	134.23	Murder	Crawford: Phoenix Park murders; Skin-the-goat
	136.16	Murder (Phoenix Park)	"Talking about the invincibles . . ." (17)
	139.13 140-41	Rhetoric, Language, Politics, History	Taylor's speech: "The Language of the Outlaw"
	143.24	(Irish) History	"Wise Virgins"
("the professor" only)	147.7	Stephen's kinetic state	"bitterer against others or himself"
End of "Aeolus"			
"The ponderous pundit, Hugh MacHugh"	258.39 ("Sirens")	Paternity	(Stephen in company of McHugh) Lenehan to Simon: "Greetings from the famous son of a famous father." (23)
Professor MacHugh	454.12 ("Circe")	Language--at Bloom's Trial (Anti-Semitic in this guise)	"Cough it up man. Get it out in bits."

What may be abstracted from this analysis, other than the fact of the relatively large role played by Professor MacHugh in "Aeolus," is his connection, by means of his own pronouncements or by the inference of other characters, with the Hamlet-paternity (father-son) theme and its explicitly negative corollaries: anti-Semitism, child killing, and in a broader sense, history and its victims. Another, no less important, thematic idea associated with MacHugh with his windy rhetoric and his cryptic comparison of the "bitter" Stephen with Antisthenes the Cynic is that of kinesis in art. The rhetoric of "Aeolus" is a quality opposed to the stasis demanded by Stephen's esthetic as it is described in Stephen Hero and Portrait of the Artist and which his ballad of "Ithaca" seems to wake in the reactions of the "still" and "silent" Bloom (676.21,23). This evidence indicates that Joyce's development of the character of Hugh MacHugh in "Aeolus," linked by the common feature of the name itself and by a clear parallelism of theme, was intended to be a kind of thematic introduction and a preliminary casting of the "communion" of Stephen and Bloom.

Another of the Hughs of Ulysses is one Hugh C. Love, who appears in the book four times, three times in the "Wandering Rocks" episode and once, in spectacular fashion, in "Circe." Love, whom Joyce gives two addresses, Rathcoffey and St. Michaels, Sallins, makes his first appearance at St. Mary's

Abbey, where he has gone to consult Ned Lambert for information for a book he is writing on the "Geraldines"⁵⁸ (227-28). He then walks "past James and Charles Kennedy's, rectifiers" (241.26), and is, in the "wandering" style of the episode, immediately thereafter the subject of the conversation between Ben Dollard and "Father" Cowley, in the company of Simon Dedalus (241.31 . . . 242.14). A landlord, "the reverend Mr. Love," is suing Cowley for unpaid rent, an action Cowley hopes to resist through the efforts of Dollard. Somewhat later, Love sees the procession of the Lord Lieutenant's party which takes place in this episode, bowing unseen with true antiquarian spirit, "mindful of lords deputies whose hands benignant had held of yore rich advowsons" (249.10-11). Love is not seen again until the enactment of the black Mass in "Circe," in which he, somewhat transformed, becomes "The Reverend Hugh C. Haines Love M. A." (583.28-29).

This transformation is one in which Love becomes, in the words of one critic, "a composite of the sexual, cultural and property owning usurpers,"⁵⁹ as seen not only in himself, but in (Hugh) Boylan and in Haines as well. Haine, of course, means "hate" in French and its juxtaposition with "Love" creates an effective negation, an idea further emphasized by

⁵⁸ This is the name given the "gaelicized Fitzgeralds," a Norman English family whose residence in Ireland dates from the twelfth century and which produced the rebel known as "Silken Thomas."

⁵⁹ Blamires, p. 205.

the fact that in tennis terminology "love" means "zero."⁶⁰ The effect of Love's appearance in the Mass is heightened by his holding an umbrella, an object which has already appeared a number of times in Ulysses as a symbol of contraception.

Robert M. Adams poses questions about Joyce's establishment of the character of this particular "Hugh." Why did he give Love both the Rathcoffey and the St. Michael's, Sallins addresses, and why did he have him working on a history of the Geraldines, a circumstance which does not fit the case of the living prototype of Love? The partial answers he provides seem (as he says) elaborately obscure, and this is no doubt true, but they are nevertheless interesting.

Rathcoffey is the site of a ruined castle, former home of a family named Wogan. This family traced its origins back through a Cavalier Ughi of Florence to Ugus, a Roman noble of the Augustan period. Both Rathcoffey and St. Michaels are close to Maynooth, the site of a religious college where Hugh MacNeil, the model for Professor MacHugh, taught. Maynooth is also the ancient home of the Fitzgerald family.⁶¹ Joyce,

⁶⁰ W. Y. Tindall, in James Joyce, p. 214, comments on the meaning of the name. See also Robert M. Adams, Surface and Symbol: The Consistency of James Joyce's "Ulysses" (New York: Oxford University Press, 1962), p. 31. Adams further points out that in Finnegans Wake (FW 324), "Clontarf one love one fear" gives the name of the battle and its date-- "love" equating to zero and "fear" (compare German vier) to four.

⁶¹ Adams, pp. 31-32.

of course, knew his Irish geography and history, and what he seems to have intended in using the particulars mentioned by Adams is to at once extend the "historicity" of the Hugh theme by pushing it back as far as Roman times, to link Hugh Love with Hugh MacHugh and to tie both, through their proximity with the Fitzgeralds, with certain other basic Hugh-related concepts.

The most obvious of these motifs are those of child-killing and the victim of history, and the key to their connection with the two Hughs and the larger Hugh theme is the figure of the Fitzgerald "Silken Thomas." The most tragically romantic and appealing of the Fitzgeralds, Silken Thomas is famed for leading a promising but ultimately unsuccessful revolt against the English. After some initial successes, the rebellion was crushed and Silken Thomas and many of his kinsmen taken captive. He was held in prison for some sixteen months after which time, on February 3, 1537, he was executed at the age of about twenty-four.⁶² This young leader of the Geraldines thus provided Joyce with an ideal example of the victim of history and the killed child.

In the British Museum's "Cyclops" notesheets, Joyce wrote "[?] Pardon Maynooth all put to the sword, Drogheda S.

⁶² Seumas MacManus, "The Geraldines" in The Story of the Irish Race: A Popular History of Ireland, 4th ed. (1941; rpt. New York: Devlin-Adair, 1970), pp. 353-61.

Mary's Abbey, summer day 1534."⁶³ St. Mary's Abbey in Dublin was where Silken Thomas made his declaration renouncing allegiance to England. Maynooth was the Fitzgerald castle which in 1535 fell to English forces led by Sir William Skeffington. The subsequent execution of all the survivors of the garrison at the command of Skeffington came to be known as "the Pardon of Maynooth." Drogheda, which also has a St. Mary's Abbey--that of St. Mary d'Urso--is the site of another such massacre of Irish insurgents. In 1649 Oliver Cromwell attacked Drogheda and put all of its two thousand defenders to the sword when the town was captured. Herring says, "Why Joyce associated Drogheda and Maynooth I don't know," but the relationship, certainly based on the historical bloodbaths associated with the places, seems obvious. The victim of history is the common element.

Joyce based the character of his Hugh C. Love on an actual person of his acquaintance. The original Love was, according to Adams, not a clergyman, but a civil servant, and as property owner he was once responsible for the eviction of John Joyce from his quarters at 29 Windsor Avenue in Dublin.⁶⁴ Stanislaus, James' brother, verifies this in a

⁶³ Phillip Floyd Herring, "A Critical Edition of James Joyce's Notesheets for Ulysses in the British Museum," Diss. University of Texas 1966, p. 411.

⁶⁴ Adams, p. 32.

gentle way, calling Love "a long-suffering Christian" and expressing the hope that he "had other sources of income."⁶⁵

Adams questions Joyce's reasons for associating Love with villains such as Haines and Mulligan, insisting that he does not seem bad enough, even given his hard-heartedness with respect to "Father Cowley's" non-payment of his rent, to merit such unsavory anti-Semitic and child-killing company. In Adams' negative view, Joyce, influenced by external factors, has falsified the esthetic integrity of his book. In his opinion, "Autobiography has evidently usurped over narrative; at least by exerting a subsurface influence, it has allowed a disparity to be felt between two different parts of the novel."⁶⁶ This analysis, well-researched and perceptive as it is, however, misses the point by trying to explain too much in terms of extratextual information. The background is helpful, but the evolving thematic structure in the text itself provides the key to Joyce's handling of this character.

Joyce must have had Love writing the history of the Geraldines because he wanted to isolate the figure of Silken Thomas against the panoply of Irish history, with its

⁶⁵ Stanislaus Joyce, My Brother's Keeper: James Joyce's Early Years, ed. Richard Ellman (New York: Viking Press, 1958), p. 75. Stanislaus differs from Adams, however, remembering Love as indeed a clergyman.

⁶⁶ Adams, p. 33.

centuries of injustice and violence. He called Love "Hugh" perhaps because he wanted the object of historical studies to blend by association with the tradition of the murder of "Sir Hugh" and in the process to enlarge the mythic figure of the sacrificed child. Love is a priest, or rather a businessman-priest (as Cowley his adversary is a penniless failed priest) because such a complex character, containing the opposite aspects of spirituality and prosaic materialism, is at the same time an affirmation and a denial, itself a kind of equivalent of the black Mass, mirror image of its original, and a restatement of the story of the sacrificial murder in "Little Harry Hughes." The subtly detailed manner of the depiction of the Reverend Love and the fact of his bearing the name Hugh both expand the scope of the Hugh motif and strengthen the inner relationship of its component parts.

A somewhat less conspicuous but nevertheless interesting representative of the Ulyssean Hughs is "the reverend John Hughes, S. J.," a cleric who is in the process of leading a service for a men's temperance retreat while Bloom is on the beach indulging in "assumed dongiovannism" with Gerty MacDowell. The progression of the service, simultaneous with the development of the action of the episode, provides an ironic counterpoint to what happens on the beach, and the final scene, with the cuckoo clock striking nine as the

reverend father and his associates have their substantial evening meal, underscores Bloom's cuckoldry in conclusive fashion.

This ceremony is introduced in the syrupy style of Nausicaa, in terms which nevertheless emphasize the sacramental imprint of the proceedings: "And then came out upon the air the sound of voices and the pealing of the organ. It was the men's temperance retreat conducted by the missionary, the reverend John Hughes S. J. rosary, sermon and benediction of the Most Blessed Sacrament" (347.34-38). Though references to the service from this point appear almost continuously until its conclusion near the end of the episode, only one of these includes the name of the reverend Hughes. The passage, though typical, is worthy of note because of the nature of its subject: ". . . for the reverend father had told them what the great saint Bernard said in his famous prayer of Mary, the most pious Virgin's intercessory power that it was not recorded in any age that those who implored her powerful protection were ever abandoned by her" (350.22-26).

Then, at the end of the episode, the three clergymen Canon O'Hanlon, Father Conroy, and "the reverend John Hughes, S. J." are seen: "taking tea and sodabread and butter and fried muttonchops with catsup and talking about/ Cuckoo./ Cuckoo./ Cuckoo" (376.1-5). With an accentuation of one of

its aspects--the state of Bloom's domestic relations--this scene is re-enacted in "Circe," where as O'Hanlon "elevates and exposes" a marble cuckoo-clock and Conroy and Hughes bend low in obeissance, the timepiece duly cuckoos while the brass quoits of Bloom's bed are heard "jingling" in sympathetic identification of Blazes Boylan's own motif.

The thematic material in these passages dealing with the reverend Hughes is somewhat different from that of some of the other "Hugh" characters, and it would not be profitable to attempt to force it to conform with any kind of general pattern of meaning when it is not in its nature to do so. There are no explicit associations with bloody historical convulsions and no apparent emphasis on philosophical motions such as modality or the metaphysical identity of opposite states of being. It should be obvious, however, that this kind of subject would be inappropriate to the style of the episode, which is a gentle, "popular" (that is, unintellectual), and kinetic medium. Such difficult issues would not be consistent with the character of Nausicaa/Gerty MacDowell.

A review of the themes and motifs contained in the "reverend Hughes" segments is informative, however, in that, though some variation, including the cuckold motif, is evident, certain other elements visibly parallel features seen in connection with the other Hugh characters.

First, the introduction of the reverend Hughes into the narrative is coupled with the function of administration of the sacrament, a sacrificial act. This in itself is noteworthy, even though in "Nausicaa" the sacrificial victim does not openly present himself as he does by association or otherwise in other instances, unless it is possibly in the person of Bloom, victim of Molly's indifference. There are perhaps muted evocations of "child-killing" in the gradually unfolding but increasingly convincing implication that Gerty will never find the ideal man she dreams of--or any other--and in Bloom's "rite of Onan," but these are obviously less important to Joyce at the moment.

Secondly, after being introduced in his sacramental-sacrificial role, the reverend Hughes is next seen, or heard, describing eloquently with learned allusion the qualities of the ever-faithful, beneficent (and accessible) Virgin. In the setting of this episode, the irony, as well as the pathos of this, is considerable. Bloom, however, though a fit subject if irony and pathos due to his cuckoldry, is not in this respect an isolated figure in Ulysses as it has progressed to this point. It is necessary to put his situation in perspective by going outside the confines of this episode.

In the exposition of his Hamlet theory to the librarians, AE, and Mulligan, Stephen has already outlined the classic features of the cuckold and his plight as he recognizes them

in Shakespeare. At the library he tells his listeners: "Two deeds are rank in that ghost's mind, a broken vow and the dullbrained yokel on whom her favor has declined, deceased husband's brother. Sweet Ann I take it, was hot in the blood. Once a wooer twice a wooer" (200.9-12). Of the plays, he says: "The note of banishment, banishment from the heart, banishment from home, sounds uninterruptedly from The Two Gentlemen of Verona onward till Prospero breaks his staff, buries it certain fathoms in the earth and drowns his book" (209.21-25). These statements are advanced by Stephen as steps in the proof that Shakespeare's life followed a "modal" pattern of recurrences in which the poet perpetually meets himself in his own creations. The pattern, he says: "doubles itself in the middle of his life . . . repeats itself. . . . It repeats itself again when he is near the grave, when his married daughter Susan, chip off the old block, is accused of adultery" (209.25-29). Then, as recapitulation, after Eglinton's summary "He is all in all," Stephen cites a statement of Maeterlinck which encompasses modality, paternity, and considering the lives of the persons alluded to, history and its victims: "If Socrates leave his house today he will find the sage seated on his doorsteps. If Judas go forth tonight it is to Judas his steps will tend" (210.29-31), and moments later he adds, "That lies in space which I in time must come to, ineluctably" (214.34-35). But his most

inclusive and coherent formulation of the complex idea which throughout the day he turns over and over in his mind does not appear until "Circe," when to Lynch's cap he says: "What went forth to the ends of the world to traverse not itself. God, the sun, Shakespeare, a commercial traveler, having itself traversed in reality itself becomes that self. . . . Self which it itself was ineluctably preconditioned to become" (494.14-18).

The real meaning of the cuckold motif in Ulysses may be that God, the artist, and even "a commercial traveler" are by the inner consistency of their natures compelled to create, each in the "modality" appropriate to his own being. This looks very much like the neoplatonic doctrine of emanation, which in its simplest terms is that expansion of some sort is an aspect of God's essence. Charles A. Dubray and William A. Wallace provide the following description of emanation as conceived by the neoplatonic philosopher Plotinus (d. 270 A.D.): "Emanation is the essence by which all things are derived from the One. The infinite goodness and perfection overflows, as it were, and while remaining within itself and losing nothing of its own perfection, it generates other beings, sending them forth from its own superabundance. Or again, as brightness is produced by the rays of the sun, so everything is a radiation from the

infinite light."⁶⁷ Moses Maimonides, the Jewish philosopher named by Bloom in "Ithaca" as "one of the three seekers of pure truth" (671.28), is also known for his use and development of the idea. That emanation is not an accepted principle of Church dogma constitutes no real problem insofar as Ulysses is concerned. Joyce makes great use of various heretical ideas, such as those of Arius, in dealing with the question of paternity.

Though this seems to have come a long way from "Nausicaa" and the reverend Hughes, the progression is both logical and inevitable. The image of the cuckold is one of the devices by which Joyce draws Stephen and Bloom toward their confrontation in "Ithaca," and both it and the themes compounded with it are necessary to make the meeting intelligible.

The continuing presence of the Hugh motif and the synthesizing process by which it associates a variety of by now familiar related themes--primarily though not exclusively in terms of Bloom in his aspect as cuckold--is illustrated by its appearances in the text of the "Nausicaa" episode. Here, the reader must be impressed with the sacramental (if saccharine) atmosphere generated by the intrusive presence of the priest (the reverend Hughes), the sustained orchestration of Mass with narrative (including the part of Hughes'

⁶⁷ Charles A. Dubray and William A. Wallace, "Emanationism," New Catholic Encyclopedia (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967).

sermon which introduces the Virgin as ironic counterpart of Molly), the real if minor hints of child killing (subject of "Little Harry Hughes") and the ironic and even crudely emphatic portrayal of Bloom's cuckoldry (specifically related to Stephen's paternity theorizings and signalled definitively by the cuckoo clock during the hearty dinner, itself having a slight air of the black Mass about it--perhaps because of the mutton chops with catsup--of the reverend Hughes and his assistants).

Richard Ellman, whose biography is predicated on searching out parallels between Joyce's life and his works, especially Ulysses, claims to have found the origin of the name of Hugh Boylan, lover of Molly Bloom, in the person of Hugh Boyle Kennedy. Kennedy, a classmate of Joyce at University College, is described as a "prim and proper" type who later went on to become Chief Justice of the High Court. Joyce, it is said, "must have keenly enjoyed his little private joke."⁶⁸ Certain facts, however, would seem to call for some rather serious qualifications of Ellman's theory that Kennedy was a kind of ironic prototype of Hugh Boylan.

It is interesting to note, for example, that in the fair copy of "Ithaca," the preliminary text completed in the fall of 1921, the "preceding series" of Molly's suitors

⁶⁸ Ellman, p. 389.

contains as its last term "Edward (Blazes) Boylan."⁶⁹ It is only in Ulysses' published form that this single appearance of Boylan's complete name becomes "Hugh E. (Blazes) Boylan" (716.26-27). In all previous references to Boylan in the text, he is called either by only his last name, or by the nickname "Blazes," though after this, in her monologue, Molly thinks of him twice as Hugh, once as "Hugh Boylan" (743.30) and then simply (in "rejecting" him) as "Hugh" (761.26). It thus seems possible that Joyce may not have thought of giving Boylan the name Hugh until he had reached a very late stage in the composition of his book, at a point where the character was not only fully developed, but had already played his role in the action. None of this is consistent with Ellman's assumption.

Since he makes Boylan appear as Hugh only in the last two episodes, that part of Ulysses in which he is finally bringing together and unifying not only his two central actors but all the diverse thematic materials of the book, it may have been that Joyce, synthesizing as he was, began to see in the character a different order of complexity. Boylan, in his relationship with Bloom, is the violator of the Jew's household. In his relationship with Molly, he is the current lover, but as she indicates quite clearly, he is

⁶⁹ Richard Eastman Madtes, "A Textual and Critical Study of the Ithaca Episode of James Joyce's Ulysses," Diss. Columbia University 1961, p. 230.

not likely to be the last. Though not finished with him, she already has her mind set on something better. The second time she uses the name Hugh in thinking of Boylan, she is already in the process of rejecting him, "killing" him in fact, because of his ignorance and shallow crudity.

Hugh Boylan, as Stephen, and as the mythic "Little Harry Hughes," violates the premises of the Jew. Having acted thus, he discovers (or will discover) himself to be irrevocably the victim of his own action. He, as the latest member of a series "originating in and repeated to infinity," exists only to serve, and when his term of service is complete, his demise--a sacrificial sundering preparing the way for his successor--will be definitive and complete. He is thus incorporated into and becomes a figure in the myth, a fact which justifies and requires, as Joyce came to realize, attributing to him the name Hugh.

In addition to its four characters called Hugh or Hughes, Ulysses abounds with other less obvious manifestations of the name, and Joyce's preliminary notesheets provide evidence that he considered using even more. The lengthy catalogue of Irish "heroes" whose images are graven on the belt of the citizen-cyclops in Barney Kiernan's pub includes the name of "Red Hugh O'Donnell" (291.35). "Red Hugh," or Hugh Roe O'Donnell, as "Silken Thomas" Fitzgerald, is known in Irish history for his role in an abortive revolt against

the English in reprisal for the rebellious activities of his father "Black Hugh" (compare "Hugh MacHugh"). The younger O'Donnell escaped, was given the title of "The O'Donnell" by his father and was soon involved in a campaign of resistance against the English.⁷⁰ In the so-called "Tyrone War," he joined with his brother-in-law Hugh O'Neill, Earl of Tyrone, and together they achieved considerable military success in a number of encounters with English forces. On Christmas Eve, 1601, a decisive battle was fought at Kinsale, in the vicinity of Cork, in which the Irish, assisted by about two thousand Spaniards, suffered a disastrous defeat which effectively ended opposition to the rule of Elizabeth in Ireland, Hugh Roe fled to Spain, where he soon died, possibly by poisoning, in his thirtieth year.⁷¹

Following directly after the name of O'Donnell in the long list of real or imaginary Irish heroes is that of one "Red Jim MacDermott." Herring in his comments on the notes identifies this MacDermott with Hugh Hyacinth O'Rorke MacDermot, "a great liberal politician" and in 1892 Attorney General of Ireland.⁷² If this association were correct, it would represent a striking juxtaposition on Joyce's part of

⁷⁰ Emily Hahn, Fractured Emerald: Ireland (New York: Doubleday, 1971), pp. 123-24.

⁷¹ Cyril Falls, Elizabeth's Irish Wars, 2nd ed. (1950; rpt. New York: Barnes and Noble, 1970), pp. 304-318.

⁷² Herring, p. 143, n. 42.

two historical personages having the name Hugh. But though reference to Hugh Hyacinth and the MacDermots does appear twice in the British Museum "Cyclops" notes as well as once in the child-killing "Oxen of the Sun,"⁷³ Herring seems mistaken in his identification of this particular MacDermott as "Red Jim." Robert Kee, in his history of the Irish national movement, names one "Red Jim MacDermot" as a British secret agent in the Fenian movement in America who for some years sold the movement's secrets to the British consul in New York.⁷⁴ That this is probably the man to whom Joyce is referring is indicated by the note for "Cyclops": "Parnell, Jim MacDermot, Davitt . . . Fenian tells secrets--shouts."⁷⁵

The only actual justification for mentioning the contiguity of MacDermott's name with one of Ulysses' Hughs, other than to correct Herring's mistaken identification, is

⁷³ Ibid., pp. 140 and 205.

⁷⁴ Robert Kee, The Green Flag: The Turbulent History of the Irish National Movement (New York: Delacorte, 1972), p. 321.

⁷⁵ Herring, p. 155. MacDermot, or MacDermott, as Joyce spells the name in Ulysses, is identified by Malcolm Brown, in The Politics of Irish Literature from Thomas Davis to W. B. Yeats (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1972), p. 272, as author of the rhyme: "Not a cent for blatherskite/ But every dollar for dynamite." Referred to as "a very colorful man," his method of operation included recruiting young Irishmen in New York as "dynamitards," accompanying them overseas as their demonstration leader, and then betraying them to the police (Brown, p. 223).

that while it at once strikes an oddly contradictory note it also brings to mind the sinister pattern of violence imposed by history against its youthful victims which is one of the characteristic themes surrounding the Hugh motif. Red Jim's recruits, as Red Hugh O'Donnell and Silken Thomas before them, play out the same grimly recurring role as does the boy of Stephen's fable--that of the innocent sacrificed to the bloody exigencies of history.

Other Hughes who shared similar fates for reasons other than political appear both in Joyce's notes and in Ulysses itself. The name of the English protestant martyr Hugh Latimer, who was burned for heresy in September, 1555, occurs in the notesheets for the "Oxen" episode,⁷⁶ though Joyce did not incorporate it into the episode itself. "Huguenot," the designation of the French protestant group of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, is encountered at least ten times in Ulysses.⁷⁷ The relative frequency of Joyce's reference to the Huguenots keeps before the reader the historical realities of the sustained religious persecution and the sacrificial ordeals they suffered and, as the hint given by the

⁷⁶ Ibid., p. 199.

⁷⁷ OED, V, 440, states that the word is "of disputed origin" while noting that it is thought to be somehow related to the name "Hugues" (Hugh) and to the German eidgenoss, "confederate." Another standard source, Webster's New International Dictionary, 2nd ed. (Springfield, Massachusetts: G. and C. Merriam, 1934), suggests that the Hughes involved is Bezanson Hugues, "Syndic and party leader at Geneva."

unused note concerning Latimer, reveals the tendency of his thinking. These Hughs, not perhaps as organic in Ulysses as some of those already examined, nevertheless reinforce by persistent suggestion the same thematic ideas, and it is very likely that Joyce thought of them as integral parts of a larger thematic whole.

The Hugh motif appears in another, quite different, context in Ulysses--that of the horserace. The Ascot Gold Cup, a race held on Bloomsday, is won by Throwaway, a "dark horse" about which Bloom unwittingly tips Bantam Lyons when he meets him on the way to the bathhouse in the morning. In the sporting edition of the Telegraph which Bloom scans in the cabman's shelter, this unexpected winner is compared to that of the 1892 Derby "when Captain Marshall's dark horse, Sir Hugo,⁷⁸ captured the blue riband at long odds" (631.27-28).

W. Y. Tindall, who makes several references to horse-racing as it appears in Ulysses in his Reader's Guide to James Joyce, states that "horses and riders establish the motif of the race, which centers in the Gold Cup." "Cyclical history," he continues, "is a kind of race."⁷⁹ "Cyclical history," is, of course, the history of Vico's New Science, in which humanity, in the generality of its existence, is

⁷⁸ "Hugo," as noted later in more detail, is a Germanic form of the name.

⁷⁹ W. Y. Tindall, James Joyce, p. 144.

depicted as providentially re-creating itself on eternal patterns.

Cycles and horses are found together in numerous locations in Ulysses, most often in contexts involving races. One of the most striking of these is in the "Lotos Eaters" episode where Bloom, as adman, evaluates a posted notice: "He eyed the horseshoe poster over the gate of college park: cyclist doubled up like a cod in a post. Damn bad ad. Now if they had made it round like a wheel" (85.6-8). In the "Lestrygonians" segment Bloom's eye is again caught by a sign, this time that of the "Rover cycleshop." His observation at this point, "Those races are on today" (153.13) suggests both cycle and Gold Cup races. The indefinite quality of this seems to imply that Joyce may have wanted the reader, as Bloom himself evidently does, to think of both kinds of race without differentiation--essentially as if they are identical. Still another such reference occurs in "Oxen of the Sun" where the phrase "cycles and cycles of generations that have lived" is followed by the mention of "a mare leading her fillyfoal" and the surrealistic stampede of an antipaternal "ominous, revengeful zodiacal host" (407.5,8-9,19-20). Finally, in "Ithaca itself, after the departure of Stephen, Bloom, in his fantasy of bourgeois life in the country, considers as methods of conveyance "a chainless freewheel roadster cycle . . . or smart phaeton

with good working solidungular cob (roan gelding, 14h)" (699.16,18-19).

Tindall sees further evidence of the connection in Joyce's mind between the horserace and Vico's history in Finnegans Wake, insisting that a race on which H. C. Earwicker places a two-crown wager "is plainly the Viconian (sic) cycle ('from spark to phoenish') and the human race."⁸⁰

Directly after reading about the Gold Cup and the dark horse Sir Hugo, Bloom sees, "New York disaster, thousand lives lost. Foot and mouth. Funeral of the late Mr Patrick Dignam" (631.29-30). Though it would perhaps be stretching the point too far to imply any kind of direct connection, the juxtaposition of race and extinction of life seems to add another dimension to the newspaper's account of the day. Not only is there an intimation of recurrence in history, derived from the circularity of the race track itself from the reappearance of the dark horse winner, but an immediate association of this idea with the deaths of the victims of the General Slocum disaster in America, the cattle destroyed either by disease (Mr. Deasy's concern) or by "the necessity . . . to procure alimentary sustenance" (681.23-24) (Bloom's concern in "Ithaca"), and the sudden and unexpected demise

⁸⁰ Ibid., p. 255. Tindall also thinks of the Gold Cup, in an extension of the horserace motif, as a chalice in which Bloom brings "Light to the Gentiles" (660.30). The tip regarding Throwaway is Bloom's, of course, though it only benefits others.

of a citizen of Dublin. An interpretation (legitimate even if hypothetical) of the passage might then be, "History returns upon itself, immutably impelled by and through a never-ending cycle of sacrificial disasters." Sir Hugo, dark horse metempsychosed as Throwaway, carries with him the same burden of ideas as do the other manifestations of the Hugh motif in Ulysses. Modality and sacrifice as conditions of history are as much part of the motif of the horserace with its own version of the mythic Hugh-type figure as in the culminating appearance of the theme in "Ithaca."

In the library episode, "Scylla and Charybdis," Mr. Best makes a statement which introduces the Hugh motif directly into the discussion of the question of paternity and also serves to expand the motif by making possible a number of transformations of it. As various theories concerning the bard are mockingly recalled or proposed by Eglinton, Mr. Best declares: "The most brilliant (theory) of all is that story of Wilde's. . . . That Portrait of Mr. W. H. where he proves that the sonnets were written by a Willie Hughes, a man of all hues. . . . I mean for Willie Hughes. . . . Of course it's all paradox, don't you know, Hughes and hews and hues the color, but its so typical the way he works it out. . ." (196.13-22). Though defined by Stephen to himself as "Tame essence of Wilde" (196.25), the story to which Mr. Best refers offers some interesting

parallels to what Stephen is trying to do with his own Shakespeare theory, and the overall impression received from reading it is that Joyce must have taken it quite seriously, at least as a kind of theoretical point of reference and as a source of supplementary concepts and details.

The story, though it deals with a conjectural account of the identity of the person to whom the sonnets are dedicated as opposed to Stephen's father-son speculation based on Hamlet, is concerned significantly with paternity, incidentally with the kidnapping and murder of children, and its hypothetical subject, a child actor, is "Willie Hughes," a name identical with that of the boy in two of the "Sir Hugh"-type ballads.

After noting line 7 of Shakespeare's sonnet XX: "A man in hew, all Hews in his controwling . . . ," Wilde's persona states that in the original edition of the sonnets "Hews" is printed with a capital letter and in italics, showing that a play on words is intended.⁸¹ He goes on to point out the "curious puns" made in a number of the sonnets on the words "use" and "usery," all of which he cites as evidence that "Willie Hughes" was the name of the "only begetter of these ensuing sonnets" as designated in Shakespeare's dedication.

⁸¹ Oscar Wilde, "The Portrait of Mr. W. H.," in The Artist as Critic: Critical Writings of Oscar Wilde, ed. Richard Ellman (New York: Random House, 1968), pp. 152-220.

Somewhat later, Wilde has his theorizer, Cyril Graham, speculating on the sense of the word "beget" as used in the dedication. The marriage that Shakespeare proposes for Willie Hughes, he says, is a "marriage with his muse" and the children he asks him to beget "are no children of flesh and blood, but more immortal children of undying fame."⁸² Here, in its apparent spiritualization of paternity, Wilde's theory begins to sound somewhat like Stephen's--a development which continues to the point where fatherhood, or parenthood generally, is defined in terms altogether non-physical. Diotima is quoted as telling Socrates: ". . . friends are married by a far nearer tie than those who beget mortal children, for fairer and more immortal are the children who are their common offspring."⁸³ This quotation recalls not only Stephen's rejection of his consubstantial father and his statement that paternity may be a "legal fiction" (205.7), but also Bloom's pathetic vision of his dead son Rudy as he stands hopefully over a new-found spiritual "son" at the end of "Circe."

"The Portrait of Mr. W. H." shows another affinity with Joyce's Hugh motif in its references to the kidnapping and murder of children. As Cyril Graham proceeds in his search for proof of the existence of Willie Hughes, he comes upon a story from Star Chamber records of a Norfolk gentleman who moved to London so that his son might attend school in the

⁸² Ibid., p. 172.

⁸³ Ibid., p. 184.

city. On the way to Christ Church cloister one morning the boy was abducted by a group of men associated with the Blackfriars Theater and given "a scrolle of paper, conteyning parte of one of their said pleyes and enterludes," which he was instructed to learn by heart. The father first approached the theater people and demanded that his son be released, but this proved to be of no avail. He then notified the authorities, and the boy was returned to him the next day.⁸⁴ The remarkable thing about this account is that it is a near-perfect parallel to stories such as The Prioresses Tale, minus the miraculous element and with "lewde and dissolute mercenarie players" substituted for sinister and bloodthirsty Jews.

A final point of resemblance between the story and Joyce's theme has to do with the suppositious death of the Willie Hughes of Wilde's researcher. It is not improbable, he states: "that Willie Hughes was one of those English comedians (mimi quidam ex Britannia, as the old chronicle calls them), who were slain at Nuremberg in a sudden uprising of the people, and were secretly buried in a little vinyard outside the city. . . ." ⁸⁵ These similarities speak for themselves and show something of the reasons for Joyce's interest in "The Portrait of Mr. W. H." His interest did not

⁸⁴ Ibid., p. 193.

⁸⁵ Ibid., p. 208.

confine itself to textual parallels, however, since he was able to use the story, given Mr. Best's remarks, in other quite different ways.

Mr. Best's statement drawing attention to Wilde's story and the theory developed in it achieves the effect of extending the Hugh context into hitherto unexplored territory. The homophonic equivalents of Hugh: "hews" and "hues the color," each with connotations of its own, not only suggest parallels to the motif as defined to this point but also provide possibilities for new variations on the theme.

Best's (or Wilde's, or Shakespeare's) word "hew" is found in four inflectional forms in Ulysses. It is seen in close order twice as "hewing" (14.19,24) and once as "hewed" (15.06) in reference to Mulligan's cutting slices of bread for Stephen, Haines, and himself as the three are having breakfast in the tower. It is later encountered twice as "hewn," once in the description of the phallic stone obelisk of Mulligan's proposed "Omphalos" fertilizing farm (396.07) and once in connection with the gravestones viewed by Mr. Bloom in passing the stonecutter's yard in "Hades." Mr. Best's key use of the word is, of course, as "hew" (196.21). Four of the occurrences, then, come from Mulligan, one from Bloom, and the other from Mr. Best.

"Hew" means "to cut with hard blows with a heavy instrument such as a sword or axe." It is thus appropriate to

describe Mulligan's vigorous cutting of the breakfast loaf, in consonance with his character, as well as being from a somewhat more distant perspective, reminiscent of the fate of the various Hughs akin to Stephen's Little Harry. In a connotatively opposite sense the word is defined as "to shape, form, or create with hard blows," a meaning suitable to the context of Mulligan's description of his "national fertilizing farm," where he will "offer his dutiful yeoman services for the fecundation of any female of what grade of life soever" (396.8-9). This passage, however, is in the "Oxen" episode, the theme of which is "anti-fecundation," and Mulligan's proposal is really a mockery of creation rather than an affirmation of it--a kind of preliminary intimation of the black Mass yet to come in Circe. Mr. Bloom's view of the funerary sculptures at the approaches to the graveyard, "white, sorrowful, holding out calm hands" (98.25-26), is frankly a vision of death, but it is wiser and more sympathetic than Mulligan's shallow, if funny, sarcasm.

Two characters and two contrary attitudes toward life and death are thus associated with the word "hew." They are represented in ironic reversal in the images of Bloom's gravestones and Mulligan's phallus-stone and are connected by Mr. Best's use of the word in his reference to Wilde's story about Willie Hughes. In self-contradictory terms they

are concerned with sundering and reconciliation, thereby conforming to and reinforcing the thematic construct organized around the "Little Harry Hughes" of "Ithaca."

Joyce employs the other of Mr. Best's homophones, as "hue," "hues," and "hued," a total of thirteen times, either in the expression "hue and cry" or to denote the color concept. The contexts in which these words are found may be isolated in the following manner:

OCCURRENCE OF "HUE" FORMS* IN ULYSSES

Episode	Phrase Appearing In	Page. Line	Subject
"Telemachus"	"hued like pale oak"	5.17	Mulligan's hair
"Nestor"	"Faint hue of shame"	29.22	Stephen's pupil Sargent
"Aeolus"	"hue and cry"	128.26	Newsboys after Bloom
	"ebony hue"	132.28	MacHugh's glasses
"Scylla and Charybdis"	"hue and cry"	191.11	Pursuit of Stephen as Christfox
	"a man of all hues"	196.16	Wilde's Shakespeare theory
	"Hughes and hews and hues and color"	196.20- 21	
"Cyclops"	"hue . . . similar to the mountain gorse"	291.10	Cyclops' hair
	"same tawny hue"	291.12	Hair of Cyclops' nostrils
"Nausicaa"	"a goldenbrown hue"	346.5	Gerty's griddle- cakes

"Oxen of the Sun"	"the virtue of the chameleon to change her hue"	405.42-406.1	An attribute of the soul
"Circe"	"hue and cry zigzag gallops in hot pursuit"	571.8-9	Citizens after Bloom
	"The Hue and Cry"	571.37	Personification of pursuers

Total Occurrences -- 13

*As "hue," "hues," and "hued"

As this analysis shows, "hue and cry," descriptive of a chase, is used three times in the book, once in connection with Stephen as "Christfox" and three times with Bloom. In its color sense, however, the word not only occurs more often, but seems to be far richer in connotative meanings, many of which, as will be seen, extend in the fullest sense of their development to Finnegans Wake. Once again, moreover, it is Mr. Best's linking of it with "hew" and "Hugh" which provides the key to Joyce's intentions in the matter.

Bloom, who likes to find applications for his rather basic and limited knowledge of scientific principles, thinks in "Nausicaa" of the teacher who once instructed him in the colors of the spectrum: "Roygbiv Vance taught us: red, orange, yellow, green, blue, indigo, violet. A star I see, Venus? . . . Land of the setting sun this. Homerule sun setting in the southeast" (369.42-370.1). Later, under the

spell of Circe, Bloom at the height of his powers "performs juggler's tricks, [and] draws red, orange, yellow, green, blue, indigo and violet silk handkerchiefs from his mouth" (477.4-6). In the same episode Elijah as "A. J. Christ Dowie" declaims, "Have we cold feet about the cosmos? No. Be on the side of the angels. Be a prism. You have that something within, the higher self"⁸⁶ (497.9-11). In spite of the irony implicit in Joyce's reproduction of the evangelistical rant of this American Bible thumper, the exhortation, "Be a prism," seems to give evidence of intentions other than purely ironic, and especially so when it is recognized as a continuation of a series of spectrum references already begun in Bloom's ruminations. That Joyce did have such intentions is clear, but the best evidence of them lies outside the text of Ulysses itself. The full significance of "hue" as a symbolic idea involving not only color, but sound, philosophical aspects of unity and diversity, and even traditional notions of the configuration of the heavens, all as a part of its relationship with the Hugh motif, may be observed in a number of its specific manifestations in Finnegans Wake. The presence in Finnegans Wake of a complex though clearly outlined "hue" symbolism is significant.

⁸⁶ The entry "roygbiv" is also found in the notesheets for "Ithaca;" indicating that Joyce considered incorporating it somehow into this episode. Since it does not appear here, however, it is obvious that he decided against it. For the note and its context see Herring, p. 433.

Closely approximating in meaning and, indeed, linked directly to that of the Hugh motif of Ulysses, it further objectifies the motif and confirms its existence as a coherent thematic structure in the earlier book.

In their Skeleton Key paraphrasing Joyce's last work, Campbell and Robinson make the statement that the rainbow, "the sign of God's promise and man's hope, with its seven hues of beauty, is one of the dominant images of Finnegans Wake."⁸⁷ It is, they say, the "sign of the promise of renewal."⁸⁸ These critics are not alone, moreover, in the perception of the importance of the rainbow symbol. Glasheen points out the fact that H. C. Earwicker, Joyce's archetypal father-figure in Finnegans Wake, on one occasion wears all the colors of the rainbow, "like a rudd yellan gruebleen orangeman in his violet indigonation. . ." (FW 23.1-2). She then identifies HCE in this condition with Wilde's Mr. W. H., citing Sonnet XX, line 7, "a man in hue all hues in his controlling" as a basis for her contention.⁸⁹ As part of her

⁸⁷ Joseph Campbell and Henry Morton Robinson, A Skeleton Key to "Finnegans Wake" (New York: Harcourt Brace, 1944), p. 31.

⁸⁸ Ibid., p. 35. This immediately brings to mind Stephen's repeated assertion in Ulysses, "Where there is a reconciliation, there must first have been a sundering" (191.7-8).

⁸⁹ Glasheen. p. 273.

analysis of this idea she goes on to classify, under the headings "Seven Rainbow and/or Gamut 'Girls'" and "Mr. W. H.," three pages of punning variants and combined forms of "hue" and related words such as "arc," "rainbow," and others.⁹⁰ In Ulysses, of course, though "roygbiv" does occur to Bloom twice during the day, the rainbow colors remain for him largely a subject of mnemotechnic. Renewal for him means the assumption of fatherhood.

Glasheen recognizes, given these and other thematic clues, "an important strand in FW's theme of unity and diversity" in the form of "our battered old friends, the many colored glass [of the temporal world] and white radiance of eternity."⁹¹

The second paragraph of Finnegans Wake begins with the phrase, "Sir Tristram, violer d'amores . . . ," proceeds through seven clauses, and ends "and rory end to the regginbrow was to be seen ringsome on the aquaface" (FW 3.4-14). If, among other meanings, "violer" may be read as "violet" and "rory" as "red," the structure of the paragraph may be seen as a backward progression through the

⁹⁰ Ibid., pp. 231-33 and 273-74. These include not only "hue"-words directly associated with color and the rainbow, but also Hugh, Hughes, huguenot, huge, and hew.

⁹¹ Ibid., p. 231.

spectrum in the configuration of an inverted rainbow.⁹² The seven clauses of the paragraph may also be equated to the seven strings of the viole d'amour (or of the Greek cithera) or what Kepler, the seventeenth-century German astronomer, called "the seven-stringed harp of the creator's wisdom." The spectrum and the gamut are thus identified here, as they continue to be throughout Finnegans Wake.⁹³ Though in Ulysses no such equation is made explicit, both color and sound are present in "Proteus" and in other places as important aspects of the modality theme.

Typical of Joyce's blending of these various concepts are the phrase "iridescent huecry" (FW 68.20-21) and "For

⁹² Ibid. Glasheen suggests that the reason for this inverted secondary rainbow is that "It has all happened before." The implication is that Finnegans Wake is cyclic or "modal" in its entirety.

⁹³ Joyce is certain to have read a passage from Bruno's The Expulsion of the Triumphant Beast in which Sophia, describing the origins of the Egyptian religion, speaks of the organization of all kinds of diverse things into groups of seven: "Then they attributed the life that gives form to things to two most important principles, that is to say, to the two bodies that are most important in the neighborhood of our globe and maternal divinity, the sun and the moon. Afterward they construed that life according to seven other principles, distributing it among seven lights called wandering lights. . . . So it is with parts, with characters, with signs, with images, which are distributed into seven species. But they did not fail, because of this, to construe that there is found in all things, Divinity, who since she diffuses and imparts herself in innumerable ways, has innumerable names. . . ." See Giordano Bruno, The Expulsion of the Triumphant Beast, trans. and ed. Arthur D. Imerti (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1964), p. 239.

hugh and guy and goy and jew" (FW 273.13-14), the latter implying hue as color through "hugh," the musical scale through "guy" which in Italian is "Guido," first name of Guido d'Arezzo, originator of "solmization" (ut-re-mi-fa-so-la), and other more familiar modalities such as "you and I" and the self-explanatory "goy and jew," recalling Stephen and Bloom.

In the last pages of Finnegans Wake occurs a scene, called "The Grand Natural Mooting" by Campbell and Robinson, which may be seen as a realization of the complex idea in Ulysses labeled the Hugh theme in its ultimate and most abstract form. In an obvious way it corresponds with the communion scene in "Ithaca" except that its philosophical basis has been generalized from a concern with the confrontation and synthesis of antithetical qualities (that is, those embodied by Stephen and Bloom) to a broader and more patently metaphysical idea involving, as is implicit in the many rainbow and spectrum metaphors in the work, the ideas of diversity and unity. Glasheen's "many-colored glass and white radiance of eternity," representing phenomenal existence and "noumenal" or ideal being, are important recurring symbols in Finnegans Wake, as is the image of the child reunited with parent in Ulysses.

This "mooting" is preceded by a conversation between "Muta" and "Juva," avatars of Shem and Shaum, the antagonistic

sons of H. C. Earwicker, near the end of which Muta asks: ". . . so that when we shall have acquired unification we shall pass on to diversity and when we shall have passed on to diversity we shall have acquired the instinct of combat and when we shall have acquired the instinct of combat we shall pass back to the spirit of appeasement?" (FW 610.23-27), and Juva responds: "By the light of the bright reason which daysends to us from the high" (FW 610.28-28). After this bit of dialogue dealing with reappearing impulses of "combat" and "appeasement" the action proceeds to an encounter, in the form of a debate, between "pidgen fella Balkelly," archdruid, nighttime man, and idealist (as one of his components, Bishop Berkeley) and "Patholic," saint, daytime man, and pragmatist.⁹⁴ The scene is set with a pidgen English description of the apparel of the two adversaries. Balkelly, "in the his heptachromatic seven hued septi-colored roranyellgreen-lindigan mantle finish he show along the his mister guest Patholic with alb belongahim. . ." ⁹⁵ (FW 611.5-8). Balkelly's argument, given here in the paraphrase of the Skeleton Key, is an interpretation of the human perception of the forms of nature: "The phenomenal forms beheld by mortal eyes are comparable to refracted hues into which sunlight is broken by a prism. The mineral, vegetable, animal and common man

⁹⁴ Campbell and Robinson, p. 350.

⁹⁵ Patholic's alb, of course, is in stark black and white.

inhabitants of the world are incapable of experiencing the whole source-light. But the true seer, in the seventh degree of the Wisdom of Being, knows the inwardness of reality, the Ding an sich, the essence of each thing; and for him all objects shine with the gloria of seed light which is within them. The entire world, for him, is an epiphany."⁹⁶

The white light of eternity, he says, in effect, is a simple or "monadal" state of pure and unitary being. Since it is one and fully comprehended within its own existence, it has no real relationship with anything other than itself. In the temporal world of becoming and multiplicity it is symbolized --not actualized--as having passed through a prism to produce the multiple hues of the rainbow. Balkelly thus denies the immanence of divinity in the created world, which logically becomes for him only a fragmented and confused image of the One. In the framework of Ulysses, Stephen would think of this kind of philosophical denial as "antipaternal," associating it with other rejections of fatherhood such as that of the heretic bishop Arius.

Patholic, who rather understandably has been woolgathering during the archdruid's discourse, "no catch all that preachybook," but uses the occasion to respond that the higher understanding or essential knowledge of which Balkelly speaks is the same as essential being; that at the highest

⁹⁶ Campbell and Robinson, p. 350.

level of wisdom the knower and the known, subject and object, become one: to know becomes to be. Man must therefore act, he says, as if he knows of the existence of the white light, seeing in the rainbow (Balenoarch)⁹⁷ (FW 612.27,28), the "sound-sense symbol" of it (FW 612.29-30).

The spectators of the debate, common men themselves, cheer Patholic, indicating that the field is his and that his rational daylight philosophy will succeed that of what Campbell and Robinson term "the self-contemplating mythological age of dream."⁹⁸ The irony of all of this, however, is that the issue is not actually resolved, and that though a new age is about to begin, it will do so only as one aspect of a pattern encompassing intuitive as well as rational modes of intellection.

In "Scylla and Charybdis" AE says that the purpose of art is "to reveal to us ideas, formless spiritual essences" (183.14). This idealistic view is much like that of the archdruid Balkelly, who insists that the pure white light of unity has a self-enclosed and separate existence, ineluctably

⁹⁷ Glasheen calls this word "a mixed-up Italian rainbow" (Census, p. 22), having seen in it the Italian arco baleno. Joseph Tindall, in A Reader's Guide to 'Finnegans Wake' (New York: Farrar, Strauss, and Giroux, 1969), p. 320, provides the derivation "a whale of a God." "Noah" and "patriarch" also seem to be involved, implying ancient fatherhood and thus perhaps the hero of the book, H. C. Earwicker himself.

⁹⁸ Campbell and Robinson, p. 351.

alienated from the created world, with its seven wandering planetary lights, its spectrum of hues, its octave of tonalities, and all its other oppositions and multiplicities. To maintain that AE and Balkelly are saying the same thing, however, may require that one impute to Stephen the position of Patholic, a position that may entail a kind of arbitrary "practical" decision to see the white light as somehow residing in the fragmentary hues of the rainbow without attempting to identify the symbol with the thing itself. This would be more typical of Bloom. Stephen's argument is that the Son is in the Father and the Father in the Son and that God is indeed, as he tells Mr. Deasy, "a shout in the street." It is perhaps not profitable to interpret "The Grand Natural Mooting" too concretely, but it appears that the view of Patholic, if it is truly somewhat equivocal in this respect, falls short of Stephen's determined attempt to unite Son and Father. However this may be, the implication is here, as it is in "Ithaca," that the intuitive and the rational are necessary and continuous aspects of the human cognitive experience, that by necessity, or at the urging of Providence, they encounter one another and interact, but before and after all, they persist in "ineluctable modality."

Virtually all the important elements of the Hugh motif in Ulysses are in some manner reconstituted in the light

symbolism of Finnegans Wake, this symbolism itself being at base a further realization of the "ineluctable modality" theme. The seven distinct tones of Stephen's cyclic octave ~~are~~ equated symbolically in both works with the seven colors of the spectrum. The seven-hued rainbow is a visible heavenly promise of renewal and continuity in a sense not unlike that of the perennial human renewal of the unquiet father in the living son--of Bloom, as it were, in Rudy or in Stephen. The rainbow is itself an interrupted circle with a symbolic promise of completion (or of "modality") and of riches at its "end."

The Muta and Juva (change and regeneration?) episode in Finnegans Wake prepares the way for the "Grand National Mooting," dramatizing the modal progression of the relationship between the antagonistic and mutually destructive or negating synthetic and analytic impulses, cosmic or human, again prefigured in Ulysses by the "centripetal" Bloom and the "centrifugal" Stephen. The cyclic movement described by Muta and Juva from "the instinct of combat" to "the spirit of appeasement" and from "unification to diversity," taking place under the aspect of "the light of bright reason which daysends to us from the high," seems the very model of the wanderings of the two very unlike travelers of Ulysses who for a few moments commune, chant ageless "hymns" to one another and then part company, while in the bedroom upstairs,

Molly Bloom's lamp casts on the ceiling "an inconstant series of concentric circles of varying gradations of light and shadow" (721.21-23).

The debate between "pidgen fella Balkelly" and "Patholic" which follows the conversation of Muta and Juva, appearing as Joyce's final treatment of the conditions of providential reality, once again employs the symbols of white light and refracted hues. And here, once again, opposite psychic types are pitted against one another in a combat which will supposedly resolve the question of the unity and identity of creator and creation, subject and object, ideal and real (or, as in Ulysses, Father and Son). A resolution of sorts is reached in the victory of the practical Patholic, the daytime man, over the idealistic, night-oriented Balkelly, but it seems a hypothetical victory at best--capable of being explained on one level by the fact that Earwicker is waking from his dream. Patholic's conclusion that man can "assume" the identity of white and colored lights is reassuring, but only momentarily so, for the reader is aware that Earwicker, as he has always done, must sleep again. Such a tentative conclusion is really no conclusion at all, but actually rather the beginning of a new cycle of activity. This final scene of Finnegans Wake, then, seems much like a re-enactment of what has gone before--Bloom's problematical communion with Stephen, and the age-old story

of separation and reunion of parent and child which is the "strange legend" of "Little Harry Hughes."

At this late point in the analysis of the forms and variations of the Hugh motif it will perhaps be regarded as an afterthought to examine such a basic aspect of the linguistic history of the name. This is not really the case, however, since the "stratified" quality of Joyce's writing--extending through multiple levels of meaning and contributing in complex antitheses of symbol and metaphor the most basic attribute of its irony--becomes obvious to a serious reader long before he approaches Finnegans Wake. This is not a method which was developed overnight. The description of Stephen poring over the pages of Skeat's Etymological Dictionary is a valuable clue, and all the more so in that it is an early one, to Joyce's own idea of the function of words. An awareness of the importance of the evolution of word meanings, of levels of meaning, of ambiguities and contradictions is not a quality the value of which is restricted solely to deciphering the linguistic puzzles of the last word. That Ulysses poses problems of the interpretation of individual words and of larger constructs with multiple and multi-layered meanings has been one of the fundamental premises of this study, and consistency if nothing else requires some examination, even if brief, of the etymologies of the name "Hugh" and of some of its counterparts.

"Hugh" and "Hughes" are of French derivation, the Old French nominative form being Hue and the accusative Huon. The name is described as being ultimately of Teutonic origin, the Old High German form being Hugi (compare "Hugo," the dark horse of '92),⁹⁹ which is related to Hugh, meaning "mind," "soul," or "thought."¹⁰⁰ This brings to mind the names of Odin's raven-messengers in the Eddas, Hugin and Munin, or "mind" and "memory."

Mr. Best's first equivalent, "hew," is given as from Middle English hewen, "to cut with blows, etc.," cognate with Swedish hugga, with a similar meaning.¹⁰¹ Skeat compares, without connecting, this latter form to the Icelandic hugga, which has an opposite connotation of "to soothe or comfort," suggesting some kinship with the modern English "hug," "to embrace closely."¹⁰² OED defines hug as "to squeeze tightly in the arms, usually with affection," but adds, "also said of a bear squeezing a man, dog, etc., between its forelegs." This authority cautions that the word, which appeared late in the sixteenth century, is not to be confused with hugge, "to shudder, shrink, shiver; or

⁹⁹ Webster's, p. 1211.

¹⁰⁰ Ernest Klein, A Comprehensive Etymological Dictionary of the English Language (New York: Elsevier, 1966), I, 97.

¹⁰¹ Skeat, pp. 239-40.

¹⁰² Ibid.

shake with fear or with cold" and "to abhor, abominate."¹⁰³ "Hug," incidentally, with "huge," is frequently associated with the rainbow motif in Finnegans Wake. "Hew," "color, shape, form," provides no real surprises except in one obsolete meaning as "a ghostly form or apparition."¹⁰⁴

The remarkable thing about the etymologies of these words is that they seem to contain, in a way preliminary even to the text of Ulysses itself, the themes identified in the book as components of the Hugh motif. The opposites of "abhorrence" and "affection" as seen in Bloom and Stephen with their dominant psychic traits of intuition and reason; the ghostly reappearance of Bloom's Rudy and that of Hugh of Lincoln (not, however, of "Little Harry Hughes") and of other sons in other contexts; and finally the "mind," "soul," and "memory" of the early Germanic origins of "Hugh," the triad in terms of which Stephen's paradox of the perception of the ideal in the real must be resolved--the seeds of all this are in the words themselves. Joyce is not likely to have been unacquainted with much of this. Ulysses begins with words, which are symbols of ideas. "Little Harry Hughes," as the medium and the objectification of an idea, and Hugh as a motif were chosen with a purpose, and Joyce

¹⁰³ OED, V, 439.

¹⁰⁴ Webster's, p. 2116.

studied to exploit their ambiguities and possibilities of metamorphosis as contributing factors in the expression of a dominant sacrificial theme. In this sense, the book not only begins with "Sir Hugh," but ends with it as well.

Chapter VI

CONCLUSION

In a letter to Robert McAlmon dated 29 October 1921, Joyce wrote, "'Ithaca' is very strange. I wonder will you like it."¹ The strangeness to which he refers is a quality commented upon by most critics who write about Ulysses, and the assumption is widespread that because of it the episode is somehow less intelligible, more "boring," or otherwise less successful than other parts of the book.

Many readers apparently experience problems with the style, which Joyce himself described as "dry rocks,"² through which the thoughts and actions of Bloom and Stephen are depicted in the most objective and externalized fashion their creator could muster. Joyce's own version of his intentions was that he wanted to transform the two characters into "heavenly bodies, wanderers like the stars at which they gaze."³ Gilbert Stuart speaks of the "deliberate deflation

¹ James Joyce, Letters of James Joyce, I, ed. Stuart Gilbert (New York: Viking Press, 1957), p. 175.

² Ibid., p. 172 (to Harriet Shaw Weaver, 7 October 1921).

³ Ibid., pp. 159-60.

of sentiment⁴ in Ulysses, a process which obviously reaches a peak of intensity in "Ithaca."

Joyce's intention at this point in his book, however, is neither antipathetic nor destructive insofar as his characters are concerned. In Gilbert's words again, the technique of detachment is a function not of "callowness but remoteness, an instinctive standing back from the details of experience so as to see the pattern into which they fall."⁵ The device, then, is basically one of irony, an irony that is described as critical, cold, and objective, which does "the worst that can be done to the characters and yet in doing so reveals their human validity."⁶ Joyce does not attack his characters to diminish them per se, but rather to broaden the scope of the reader's understanding of them. The prevailing attitude of Ulysses may be skeptical, but it is rightly characterized as "a very humane skepticism."⁷ The irony of the episode must be recognized as one of a

⁴ Stuart Gilbert, James Joyce's "Ulysses": A Study (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1952), p. 10.

⁵ Stuart Gilbert, "James Joyce," Writers of Today, ed. Denys Val Baker (London: Sidgwick and Jackson, 1946), rpt. in James Joyce: Two Decades of Criticism, ed. Seon Givens (New York: Vanguard Press, 1948), pp. 450-67.

⁶ S. L. Goldberg, The Classical Temper: A Study of James Joyce's "Ulysses" (London: Barnes and Noble, 1961), p. 291.

⁷ Gilbert, "James Joyce," p. 467.

juxtaposition of separate but equal contrapuntal opposites-- sentiment and detachment, the human and the objective-- neither of which is to be accorded ascendancy over the other in a mature esthetic judgment. What Joyce actually attacks with the "dry rocks" of the style of "Ithaca" is the narrowness of the fragmented and particularized apprehension of experience by the individual human mentality. What he indeed affirms is "the timeless validity of Stephen's struggles toward maturity and of Bloom's suffering, integrity, and superiority to circumstance."⁸

Richard F. Kain, citing Stephen Leacock in his Fabulous Voyager, asserts that the highest level of "humorous detachment" is achieved: "only when men are able to view all of human life sub specie aeternitatis. Then all the ills of life, faded into the distance, mellowed by retrospect, would become humor in the finest sense of the word."⁹ To the extent that Ulysses is a work composed of humorous as well as ironic elements which reveal something of Joyce's personal vision and of his larger purpose, this statement is significant. But Kain's point is fundamentally one concerning perspectives or levels of awareness, and, with respect to Joyce and Ulysses, more than even a very profound realization

⁸ Goldberg, p. 213.

⁹ Richard Kain, Fabulous Voyager: A Study in James Joyce's "Ulysses" (New York: Viking Press, 1959), p. 236.

of the implications of the humorous mode is involved. There are other equally basic and philosophical considerations of the inherent nature and motivations of the imaginative intellect--considerations of the active impulses of creativity as well as passive ones of perception.

Joyce's reading of Bruno is especially important as a factor in the theory of the artist and his creation expressed in Ulysses. Bruno, discoursing on the condition of the one who has power in knowledge in his Expulsion of the Triumphant Beast, seems to attribute to his possessor of the highest wisdom both perceptive and creative mastery. He who understands unity, he says: "the one and the number, the finite and the infinite, the end and goal of all intelligence, and the abundance of all things . . . is able to perform all things, not only in the universal but also in the particular."¹⁰ The content of many such statements by Bruno is found to be in one form or another compounded with Joyce's treatment of Stephen and Bloom, and also with his anterior theorizings concerning the nature and function of the artist, which is to say himself, or Shakespeare, or God.

Bruno used the term "Magic" in a sense which makes it directly applicable to what Joyce was doing in many ways in

¹⁰ Giordano Bruno, The Expulsion of the Triumphant Beast, trans. and ed. Arthur D. Imerti (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1964), p. 136.

"Ithaca," stylistically, dramatically, architechtonically and otherwise. In the Brunian philosophical lexicon, Magic was "the grasping of the point where united opposites meet."¹¹

Jack Lindsay, who comments on Bruno's magia in his analytical introduction to certain of the philosopher's dialogues, insists that "(Bruno's) whole theory of Magic is concerned with the problem of change and transformation, and the function of opposites in bringing about a new unity."¹² As early as Bloom's and Molly's discussion of metempsychosis in "Calypso" and as "Proteus," the episode of changes, the reader is aware of Joyce's preoccupation with form and changes of form, and on reaching "Ithaca" he encounters a barrage of opposites confronting each other in a state of obviously unstable and temporary equilibrium. In the meantime, localized in "Scylla and Charybdis," but everywhere visible, are repeated references to the creative aspect of fatherhood, the formative power of synthesis and control in which Bruno would have recognized the active component of his Magic.

In Degli Eroici, Bruno speaks of "the supreme wisdom whereby the thinker gains consciousness of the changing course of things."¹³ The specific activity of mind which

¹¹ Jack Lindsay, trans., Cause, Principle and Unity: Five Dialogues by Giordano Bruno (New York: International Publishers, 1962), p. 35.

¹² Ibid., p. 34.

¹³ Ibid.

both leads to and grows out of this "supreme wisdom" is described in yet another work, De la causa, principio et uno, Dialogue V, where he writes: "he who would know the greatest secrets of nature should regard and contemplate maxima and minima of opposed bodies. For profound magistry [magia] it is to be able to reach the contrary, after having found the point of union."¹⁴ Coupled with the idea of Vico's providential modality, this statement might well be considered as the philosophical germ of Ulysses, describing as it does a state of mind and a process of intellection which is acted out not only by Joyce's personae, Stephen and Bloom, but by Joyce himself as the "father" of his work¹⁵ and by the reader who is drawn into the momentary encounter of opposites at the "point of union" in "Ithaca."

¹⁴ Dorothea Waley Singer, Giordano Bruno, His Life and Thought, with Annotated Translation of His Work On the Infinite Universe and Worlds (New York: Henry Schuman, 1950), p. 86.

¹⁵ A Homeric incident involving the elements of transformation, a union of father and son, and the "magic" intervention of a divine hand is found in Book XVI of the Odyssey, when Odysseus momentarily sheds the rags of his beggar's disguise, and having been made even more physically imposing than usual by Athena, reveals his true identity to Telemachus. The boy exclaims: "You cannot be my father Odysseus! Meddling spirits conceived this trick to twist the knife in me! No man of woman born could work these wonders by his own craft, unless a god came into it with ease to turn him young or old at will." [See Robert Fitzgerald, trans., The Odyssey (Garden City, New York: Anchor Books, 1963), p. 295.]

Joyce is described in Herbert Gorman's biography as continually judging the literary efforts of others by the degree to which they seemed to be expressions of things their creators really understood. By "understanding," Gorman continues, "he meant to see the thing, the situation, the emotional resolution exactly for what it was, to catch it in its static perfection, to apprehend it at the instant of its completeness and so convey it to the reader."¹⁶ This interest in an intuitive grasp of the essential quality of an esthetic object in a moment of time in which the object seems most fully and completely itself is typical and perhaps definitive of Joyce's esthetic credo. The insight identified by Gorman as Joyce's criterion of judgment is actually the epiphany, the "showing forth" of which the outlines were laid down as early as Stephen Hero in terms which, as is the case with Bruno's Magic, seem to lead irrevocably toward "Ithaca."

In this preliminary casting of Portrait of the Artist Stephen describes the epiphany to a coarsely indifferent Cranly as the moment when the "whatness" (Aquinas' claritas and Stephen's own quidditas) of a thing "leaps to us from the vestment of its appearance," the instant in which the "soul

¹⁶ Herbert Gorman, James Joyce: A Definitive Biography (London: John Lane, 1941), p. 182.

of the commonest object . . . seems to us radiant."¹⁷ In Portrait of the Artist itself, the experience is, as in the earlier work, one of instantaneous realization of the three requisite qualities of the esthetic object according to Stephen's system: wholeness, harmony, and radiance. It is the "instant wherein that supreme quality of beauty, the clear radiance of the esthetic image, is apprehended luminously by the mind which has been arrested by its wholeness and fascinated by its harmony in the luminous silent stasis of esthetic pleasure. . . ."18

Richard Ellman, in treating the subject of the epiphany, claims that Joyce felt the true artist to be "charged with such revelations" and that he might best find them "not among gods, but among men, in casual, unostentatious, even unpleasant moments." He might find "a sudden spiritual manifestation whether in the vulgarity of speech or of gesture or in a memorable phase of the mind itself."¹⁹ Epiphanies might be "eucharistic," he believed, moments of "fullness or of passion."²⁰

¹⁷ James Joyce, Stephen Hero, ed. Theodore Spencer, new ed. (1944; rpt. Norfolk, Connecticut: New Directions, 1963), p. 213.

¹⁸ James Joyce, A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man (1916; rpt. New York: Viking Press, 1958), p. 213.

¹⁹ Richard Ellman, James Joyce (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959), p. 87.

²⁰ Ibid.

Ellman's description of the commonplace quality of the medium of the epiphany, the key phrases of which are again drawn from Stephen Hero, shows Joyce in effect codifying his rules for the creation of the scene enacted at Bloom's kitchen altar. Bloom is the common man: his life the common life, conditioned in and by the dull drudgery and spiritual deadness of the modern metropolis. Stephen's song, in the timeless aspects of its long history really either about himself, or Bloom, or both, is in terms of the very definition of its genre an expression of vulgar or popular knowledge and life. But the smallness and commonness of the superficial appearances of the daily life of Dublin and even of the kitchen scene itself was perceived by Joyce as the basic raw material and source for the sudden spiritual manifestation in which beauty is fleetingly encountered. From the tedious and the commonplace, as he implied to Stanislaus long before, he wanted to distill a vision of sacrificial passion and reconciliation which would be both true and universal in import.

In the second act of Joyce's play Exiles, Richard Rowan and Robert Hand are talking of their relationship with Rowan's wife Bertha. Robert insists that he cannot pursue his affair with Bertha because of his friendship and admiration for Richard himself. Richard responds to this by saying that Robert will experience as a result "a death of the

spirit." "Eagerly," Robert counters this with: "A death. No, its affirmation! A death! The supreme instant of life from which all coming life proceeds, the eternal law of nature herself."²¹ This speech reveals the character's understanding of a complex sacrificial relationship through which the exigencies of self may be suppressed in the certainty of a resulting rejuvenation and regeneration of the powers of the personality. It seems to presage the mocking statement of Lynch's Cap (mocking because the cap is an "anti-paternal" figure), "Death is the highest form of life. Bah!" (493.26), and to look forward ultimately to the sacrificial image of the murdered child of "Little Harry Hughes."

This image is one of dual aspect, one which presents, as Madtes says of Bloom's final garbled thought, "Darkinbad the Brightdayler" (722.17), a "negative affirmative."²² It is precisely this phenomenon of simultaneous affirmation and

²¹ James Joyce, Exiles, Act II, in The Portable James Joyce, ed. Harry Levin, rev. ed. (1947; rpt. New York: Viking Press, 1972), p. 582.

²² Richard Eastman Madtes, "A Textual and Critical Study of the Ithaca Episode of James Joyce's Ulysses," Diss. Columbia University 1961, p. 142. This phrase is one which perhaps grows out of Madtes' interpretation of Ulysses as having a dual resolution--either happy or unhappy depending on the interpretation of certain details. Critics have overlooked a very important contradiction inherent in Joyce's two basic myths which seems to lend weight to this thesis. Odysseus found a son and Telemachus a father, but Daedalus lost his own son and killed a son by adoption.

negation which, on a larger scale, gives meaning to Bloom's and Stephen's search for son and father, justifying both the central event, the meeting, of "Ithaca" as well as the style of the episode. The meeting within the context of the day and the ballad within the framework of the meeting constitute the dramatic and hence objective realization of Joyce's epiphany. "The tragic emotion," Stephen tells Lynch in Portrait of the Artist, "is a face looking two ways, towards terror and towards pity, both of which are phases of it. You see I use the word arrest. . . . The mind is arrested and raised above desire and loathing."²³ Bloom's kitchen stands in the eye of the hurricane. It is the still center from the perspective of which Bloomsday is comprehended, unified, and given form. But it is in Stephen's "Little Harry Hughes" that the vision of "Ithaca" achieves its final static configuration. The ballad's distillation of the scene itself into the ideal and universal forms of history, themselves a kind of static entity, is one the singer would recognize as being, like Bruno's Magic, the essence of tragedy and of art.

Joyce needed a device to draw together all his themes and to epitomize them--a microcosm capable of holding in compact spatial and temporal form the innermost meanings of his book--to provide the moment of stasis, the epiphany

²³ Joyce, Portrait, p. 205.

which he saw as the end of the artist's creative effort. He understood, moreover, in the fullest and most complete sense, the paradox of the static vision of Ulysses--that while the focus of the individual and personal drama of the book narrows as it approaches "Little Harry Hughes," the significance of that drama expands in universality. As perhaps the single point of stasis in Ulysses, the singing of the ballad represents the juncture at which life and art, content and form, subject and object coincide and are reconciled and all creation is contemplated under the aspect of eternity.

Something solemn and profound happens at the place where the ballad with the hundreds of years of its tradition and Joyce's depiction of the epic meet. Glossing "Ithaca" because of its style or some other supposed difficulty, critics have sought narrow and exclusive resolutions of the conflicts of Ulysses, and by identifying one or another of its features as such have falsified the work by making it what Joyce clearly believed was a contradiction in terms--a piece of kinetic art. Readers of this sort wish the book to move and to mean rather than to be still and to be. There is a kind of resolution implicit in the meeting of Greek and Jew and in the song which seems both to link and sever them by its story of the murder of a child, but it is of a different order. It does not concern Bloom's finding a son, or a wife, or a bourgeois cottage, nor does it involve Stephen's

finding a father or "maturing into an artist." It is rather a matter of seeing, if only for the briefest of moments, life in its totality, with all its multiplicities and oppositions, as God sees it, creates it, is it--a view of the world from the eye of the ultimate artist, at once transcendent to and immanent in all.

And finally, there is the observation of Samuel Beckett concerning the providential continuity of things which, drawing from both Vico and Bruno, essentially captures the motivating insight of Ulysses, "Ithaca," and "Little Harry Hughes":

On this earth that is Purgatory, Vice and Virtue-- which you may take to mean any pair of large contrary human factors--must in turn be purged down to spirits of rebelliousness. Then the dominant crust of the Vicious or Virtuous sets, resistance is provided, the explosion duly takes place and the machine proceeds.²⁴

²⁴ Samuel Beckett, "Dante . . . Bruno. Vico . . . Joyce" in Our Exagmination Round His Factification for Incamination of Work in Progress, ed. Samuel Beckett, 2nd ed. (1929; rpt. New York: New Directions, 1962), pp. 3-22.

APPENDIX A

"Sir Hugh, or The Jew's Daughter"
 (Child No. 155, Variant A)

Four and twenty bonny boys
 Were playing at the ba,
 And by it came him sweet Sir Hugh
 And he played oer them a'.

He kicked the ba with his right foot,
 And catchd it wi his knee,
 And through-and-thro the Jew's window
 He gard the bonny ba flee.

He's doen him to the Jew's castell,
 And walkd it round about;
 And there he saw the Jew's daughter,
 At the window looking out.

"Throw doen the ba, ye Jew's daughter,
 Throw down the ba to me!"
 "Never a bit," says the Jew's daughter,
 "Till up to me come ye."

"How will I come up? How can I come up?
 How can I come to thee?
 For as ye did to my auld father,
 The same ye'll do to me."

She's gane till her father's garden,
 And pu'd an apple red and green;
 'Tas a' to wyle him sweet Sir Hugh,
 And to entice him in.

She's led him in through ae dark door,
 And sae has she thro nine;
 She's laid him on a dressing-table
 And stickit him like a swine.

And first came out the thick, thick blood,
 And syne came out the thin,
 And syne came out the bonny heart's blood;
 There was nae mair within.

APPENDIX A (Cont.)

She's rowd him in a cake o lead,
 Bade him lie still and sleep;
 She's thrown him in Our Lady's draw-well,
 Was fifty fathom deep.

When bells were rung, and mass was sung,
 And a' the bairns came hame,
 When every lady gat hame her son,
 The Lady Maisry gat nane.

She's taen her mantle her about,
 Her coffer by the hand,
 And she's gane out to seek her son,
 And wanderd oer the land.

She's doen her to the Jew's castell,
 Where a' were fast asleep:
 "Gin ye be there, my sweet Sir Hugh,
 I pray you to me speak."

She's doen her to the Jew's garden,
 Thought he had been gathering fruit:
 "Gin ye be there, my sweet Sir Hugh,
 I pray you to me speak."

She heard Our Lady's deep draw-well,
 Was fifty fathom deep:
 "Whareer ye be, my sweet Sir Hugh,
 I pray you to me speak."

"Gae hame, gae hame, my mither dear,
 Prepare my winding sheet,
 And at the back o merry Lincoln
 The morn I will you meet."

Now Lady Maisry is gane hame,
 Made him a winding sheet,
 And at the back o merry Lincoln
 The dead corpse did her meet.

And a' the bells o merry Lincoln
 Without men's hands were rung,
 And a' the books o merry Lincoln
 Were read without man's tongue,
 And neer was such a burial
 Sin Adam's days begun.

APPENDIX B

"Little Harry Hughes"
(Joyce, Ulysses, p. 675)

Little Harry Hughes and his schoolfellows all
Went out for to play ball.
And the very first ball little Harry Hughes played
He drove it o'er the jew's garden wall.
And the very second ball little Harry Hughes played
He broke the jew's windows all.

Then out came the jew's daughter
And she all dressed in green.
"Come back, come back, you pretty little boy,
And play your ball again."

"I can't come back and I won't come back
Without my schoolfellows all.
For if my master he did hear
He'd make it a sorry ball."

She took him by the lilywhite hand
And led him along the hall
Until she led him to a room
Where none could hear him call.

She took a penknife out of her pocket
And cut off his little head,
And now he'll play his ball no more
For he lies among the dead.

APPENDIX C

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CHILD A AND IRISH-TYPE ANALOGUES

Plot	Jew's Daughter, Wife, etc.	Death of Father Motif	Tempting Objects	Punishment (mother, mast etc.)
11 "through- i-thro the w's window"	Jew's daughter	". . . as ye did to my old father, the same ye'll do to me."	apple red and green	---
1st ball . . . cond ball, roke the jew's ndows all"	jew's daughter . . . all dressed in green	---	---	"my master 'd make it sorry ball"
11-"the very rst kick" oke the ke's windows l	youngest duke's daughter . . . dressed in green	---	apple	"my mother she'd make the bloody --"sally ro
1st little p . . ." econd little p" broke the ndow all ne	a Jewess . . . all dressed in green	---	apple so red cherry so sweet	"For if my came to kno she would . (incomplete line)
ne explicit-- llad begins medias res th "Mamma" ocking on or of Jew's use.	Jew's wife	---	apple	mother, "a rod;" "Sir if I fin yo here, / I wi you for sta so long . .
ne	a lady gay	---	apples	a little bi switch (Mot kills child herself.) "I dare not . . . you'l my red bloo (Compare Ch

LOGUES

Tempting Objects	Punishment by mother, master, etc.	Drawwell	Speaking or Singing Corpse
/ apple red and green	---	Our Lady's draw-well	yes
---	"my master . . . 'd make it a sorry ball"	---	no
apple	"my mother . . . she'd make it the bloody ball" --"sally rod"	a little draw-well	yes (See Newell's remarks.)
apple so red cherry so sweet	"For if my mama came to know/ she would . . ." (incomplete line)	Saint Simon's well	yes
apple	mother, "a little rod;" "Sir Hugh, if I fin you here,/ I will bate you for stayin so long . . ."	the deep draw-well	yes
---	---	Boyne Water	yes
apples	a little birch switch (Mother kills child herself.) "I dare not come . . . you'll make my red blood fly . . ." (Compare Child S.)	"yonder well/where the water was cold and deep."	yes--Child speaks to accuse mother of murder

APPENDIX D

STATISTICAL SUMMARY OF OCCURRENCES OF VARIANT MOTIFS*

Victim's Names; Variant Motifs	Number of Occurrences
Victim's Names	
(Sir) Hugh	11
Sir William (Willie)	3
Harry Hughes (or Huston)	2
Hew(ie)	5
(Son) Hugh	7
Pretty little boy (etc.)	35
Other	5
Special Day-Holiday, Easter, etc.	10
Violation	
Ball in Jew's garden	44
Broke Jew's windows (all)	4
Ball through window	3
Ball over wall	3
Tempress; Tempter	
Jew's daughter dressed in green (also maiden, Jewess, Jew's wife, etc.)	52
Others noted were pretty miss, lady gay, etc.	no count
Jew (masculine)	1
Red-Green (Explicit)	12
Red-Blood	14
Father mysteriously harmed	1
Punishment (Birch rod, etc.)	21
Threatening or murderous father	1
Mother kills child (more distinct than "Sir Hugh")	1
Drawwell, deep well, Boyne water, other	31
Child speaks after murder (explicit)	23

*Does not include Joyce's variant.

A total of 82 variants or fragments were observed.

REFERENCES CITED

- Adams, Robert Martin. Surface and Symbol: The Consistency of James Joyce's "Ulysses." New York: Oxford University Press, 1962.
- Apel, Willi, ed. Harvard Dictionary of Music. 2nd ed., 1944; rpt. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1969.
- Beckett, Samuel, ed. Our Exagmination Round His Factification for Incamination of Work in Progress. 2nd ed., 1929; rpt. New York: New Directions, 1962.
- Blamires, Harry. The Bloomsday Book: A Guide Through Joyce's "Ulysses." London: Methuen, 1966.
- Blom, Eric, ed. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians. 5th ed., 1954; rpt. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1961.
- "Blood Accusation." The Jewish Encyclopedia. Ed. Isidore Singer, et al. 12 vols. New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1911.
- "Blood Accusation." The Universal Jewish Encyclopedia. Ed. Isaac Landman. 10 vols. New York: The Universal Jewish Encyclopedia, Inc., 1940.
- Bronson, Bertrand Harris. The Traditional Tunes of the Child Ballads. 3 vols. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1959.
- Brown, Carleton F. "Chaucer's Prioresses Tale and Its Analogues." PMLA, 21 (1960), 486-518.
- Brown, Malcolm. The Politics of Irish Literature from Thomas Davis to W. B. Yeats. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1972.
- Bruno, Giordano. The Expulsion of the Triumphant Beast. Trans. and ed. Arthur D. Imerti. New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1964.
- Burgess, Anthony. Re Joyce. New York: W. W. Norton, 1965.

- Campbell, Joseph, and Henry Morton Robinson. A Skeleton Key to Finnegans Wake. New York: Harcourt Brace, 1944.
- Child, Francis J., ed. The English and Scottish Popular Ballads. 10 parts in 5 vols. Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1882-1898.
- Collingwood, R. G. The Idea of History. 1946; rpt. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1951.
- Connolly, Thomas E. The Personal Library of James Joyce: A Descriptive Bibliography, University of Buffalo Studies, Vol. 22, No. 1; Monographs in English No. 6. Buffalo: University of Buffalo, April, 1955.
- Conway, K. E. Handbook of Christian Symbols and Stories of the Saints. 1866; rpt. Detroit: Gale Research, 1971.
- Croce, Benedetto. Aesthetic as Science of Expression and General Linguistic. Trans. Douglas Ainslie. London: Macmillan, 1922.
- _____. The Philosophy of Giambattista Vico. Trans. R. G. Collingwood. London: Howard Lattimer, 1913.
- DeClercq, Victor C. "Arianism." New Catholic Encyclopedia. Ed. William McDonald, et al. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967.
- Dougherty, F. K. "Atonement." New Catholic Encyclopedia. Ed. William McDonald, et al. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967.
- Dubray, Charles A., and William A. Wallace. "Emanationism." New Catholic Encyclopedia. Ed. William McDonald, et al. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967.
- Duncan, Joseph E. "The Modality of the Audible in Joyce's Ulysses," PMLA, 72 (1957), 286-95.
- Ellman, Richard. James Joyce. New York: Oxford University Press, 1959.
- Falls, Cyril. Elizabeth's Irish Wars. 2nd ed. 1950; rpt. New York: Barnes and Noble, 1970.
- Farmer, David Hugh. "St. Hugh of Lincoln." New Catholic Encyclopedia. Ed. William J. McDonald, et al. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967.

- Fitzgerald, Robert, trans. The Odyssey. Garden City, New York: Anchor Books, 1963.
- Fitzmorris, Thomas J. "Vico Adamant and Some Pillars of Salt." Catholic World, 156 (February, 1943), 568-77.
- Frazer, James. The Golden Bough: A Study in Magic and Religion. Abr. ed. 1922; rpt. New York: Macmillan, 1951.
- Gilbert, Stuart. "James Joyce." Writers of Today, ed. Denys Val Baker, London: Sidgwick and Jackson, 1946; rpt. in James Joyce: Two Decades of Criticism, ed. Seon Givens, New York: Vanguard Press, 1948, pp. 450-67.
- _____. James Joyce's "Ulysses": A Study. 2nd ed., 1930; rpt. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1952.
- _____, ed. Letters of James Joyce, I. New York: Viking Press, 1957.
- Glasheen, Adaline. A Second Census of "Finnegans Wake": An Index of the Characters and Their Roles. Northwestern University: Northwestern University Press, 1963.
- Goldberg, S. L. The Classical Temper: A Study of James Joyce's "Ulysses". New York: Barnes and Noble, 1961.
- Gorman, Herbert. James Joyce: A Definitive Biography. London: John Lane, 1941.
- Graves, Robert. The White Goddess: A Historical Grammar of Poetic Myth. Amended and enlarged ed., 1948; rpt. New York: Farrar, Strauss, and Giroux, 1966.
- Grove, George. "Tonic." Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Eric Blom. 5th ed., 1954; rpt. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1961.
- Hahn, Emily. Fractured Emerald: Ireland. New York: Doubleday, 1971.
- Hamell, P. J. "Monarchianism." New Catholic Encyclopedia. Ed. William McDonald, et al. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967.
- Hanley, Miles L. Word Index to James Joyce's "Ulysses". Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1953.

- Hart, Clive. Structure and Motif in "Finnegans Wake." Northwestern University: Northwestern University Press, 1962.
- Herring, Phillip Floyd. "A Critical Edition of James Joyce's Notesheets for Ulysses in the British Museum." Diss. University of Texas, 1966.
- Hoagland, Kathleen. 1000 Years of Irish Poetry. New York: Devlin-Adair, 1953.
- Holweck, F. G. A Biographical Dictionary of the Saints. 1924; rpt. Detroit: Gale Research, 1969.
- Homer. The Odyssey. Trans. Robert Fitzgerald. Garden City, New York: Anchor Books, 1963.
- Joyce, James. "The Bruno Philosophy." The Critical Writings of James Joyce. Ed. Ellsworth Mason and Richard Ellman. New York: Viking Press, 1959.
- _____. Exiles. The Portable James Joyce. Ed. Harry Levin. Rev. ed. 1947; rpt. New York: Viking Press, 1972.
- _____. Finnegans Wake. 1939; rpt. New York: Viking Press, 1964.
- _____. A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man. 1916; rpt. New York: Viking Press, 1958.
- _____. Stephen Hero. Ed. Theodore Spencer. New ed. 1944; rpt. Norfolk, Connecticut: New Directions, 1963.
- Joyce, Stanislaus. My Brother's Keeper: James Joyce's Early Years. Ed. Richard Ellman. New York: Viking Press, 1958.
- Kain, Richard M. Fabulous Voyager: A Study in James Joyce's "Ulysses." New York: Viking Press, 1959.
- Kee, Robert. The Green Flag: The Turbulent History of the Irish National Movement. New York: Delacorte, 1972.
- Kenner, Hugh. Dublin's Joyce. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1956.
- Killham, John. "Ineluctable Modality in Joyce's Ulysses." University of Toronto Quarterly. 34 (April, 1965), 269-89.

- Klein, A. M. "The Black Panther." Accent. 10 (1950), 139-55.
- Klein, Ernest, ed. A Comprehensive Etymological Dictionary of the English Language. New York: Elsevier, 1966.
- Levin, Harry. James Joyce: A Critical Introduction. Rev. ed. 1941; rpt. Norfolk, Connecticut: New Directions, 1960.
- Lindsay, Jack, trans. Cause Principle, and Unity: Five Dialogues by Giordano Bruno. New York: International Publishers, 1962.
- Litz, A. Walton. "Vico and Joyce." Giambattista Vico, An International Symposium. Ed. Giorgio Tagliacozzo and Hayden V. White. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1969.
- Lyons, John O. "James Joyce and Chaucer's Prioress." ELN, 2 (1964-65), 127-32.
- MacManus, Seumas. The Story of the Irish Race: A Popular History of Ireland. 4th ed., rev. 1941; rpt. New York: Devlin-Adair, 1970.
- Madttes, Richard Eastman. "A Textual and Critical Study of the Ithaca Episode of James Joyce's Ulysses." Diss. Columbia University, 1961.
- Martin, L. C., ed. Religio Medici and Other Works. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964.
- McKeon, Richard, ed. The Basic Works of Aristotle. New York: Random House, 1941.
- Newell, William Wells. Games and Songs of American Children. Unabridged republication of 2nd (1903) ed., 1893; rpt. New York: Dover Publications, 1963.
- Ovid. The Metamorphoses. Trans. Horace Gregory. New York: Viking Press, 1958.
- Paterson, Antoinette Mann. The Infinite Worlds of Giordano Bruno. Springfield, Illinois: Charles C. Thomas, 1970.
- Percy, Thomas. Reliques of Ancient English Poetry. 3 vols. Facsimile ed., 1886; rpt. New York: Dover Publications, 1966.

- Plato. The Dialogues of Plato. Trans. Benjamin Jowett. 2 vols. 1892; rpt. New York: Random House, 1937.
- Robinson, F. N., ed. The Works of Geoffrey Chaucer. 2nd ed., 1933; rpt. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Houghton Mifflin, 1957.
- Rogers, H. E. "Irish Myth and the Plot of Ulysses." ELH, 15 (1948), 306-27.
- Russell, Bertrand. A History of Western Philosophy. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1945.
- Singer, Dorothea Waley. Giordano Bruno, His Life and Thought, with Annotated Translation of His Work On the Infinite Universe and Worlds. New York: Henry Schuman, 1950.
- Skeat, Walter W. A Concise Etymological Dictionary of the English Language. Rev. ed., 1882; rpt. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1911.
- Stamper, Frances C., and Wm. Hugh Jansen. "Water Birch: An American Variant of Hugh of Lincoln." Journal of American Folklore, 71 (1958), 16-22.
- Strunk, Oliver, ed. Source Readings in Music History: From Classical Antiquity through the Romantic Era. New York: W. W. Norton, 1950.
- Summers, Montague. History of Witchcraft and Demonology. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1926.
- Thompson, James Westfall. A History of Historical Writing. 2 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1942.
- Tindall, Joseph. A Reader's Guide to "Finnegans Wake". New York: Farrar, Strauss, and Giroux, 1969.
- Tindall, W. Y. James Joyce: His Way of Interpreting the Modern World. New York and London: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1950.
- _____. A Reader's Guide to James Joyce. New York: Noonday Press, 1959.

- Vico, Giambattista. The New Science of Giambattista Vico. Trans. and abr. Thomas Goddard Bergin and Max Harold Fisch. Rev. ed., 1948; rpt. Garden City, New York: Anchor, 1961.
- Walsh, Ruth M. "In the Name of the Father and of the Son . . . Joyce's Use of the Mass in Ulysses." James Joyce Quarterly, 6, No. 4 (Summer, 1969), 321-47.
- Webster's New International Dictionary. 2nd ed. Springfield, Massachusetts: G. and C. Merriam, 1934.
- Wilde, Oscar. "The Portrait of Mr. W. H." The Artist as Critic: Critical Writings of Oscar Wilde. Ed. Richard Ellman. New York: Random House, 1968.
- Woodall, James R. "Sir Hugh: A Study in Balladry." Southern Folklore Quarterly, 19 (1955), 77-84.